CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
WWW.CITYMB.INFO

STAFF REPORT

1400 Highland Avenue | Manhattan Beach, CA 90266
Phone (310) 802-5000 | Fax (310) 802-5051 | www.citymb.info

Agenda Date: 6/21/2016

TO:
Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

THROUGH:
Mark Danaj, City Manager

FROM:
Mark Leyman, Parks and Recreation Director

SUBJECT:
Pilot Sunscreen Dispenser Program Recommended by the Parks and Recreation Commission (Parks and Recreation Director Leyman).
DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

RECOMMENDATION:
City Council discuss and provide direction on a proposed pilot sunscreen dispenser program recommended by the Parks and Recreation Commission.

FISCAL IMPLICATIONS:
The Commission has solicited sponsorships to offset the sunscreen dispenser program. The proposed budget is $7,500 which will be offset by sponsorship revenue of $7,500.

BACKGROUND:
The City Council discussed the pilot sunscreen dispenser program at the May 17, 2016 City Council meeting. The City Council requested additional information to include:

- No carcinogens in the sunscreen or harmful ingredients
- Contact manufacturer regarding formula
- Risk to children
- Long term funding options
- Sponsorship during the 90 day trial period
- Written criteria for the program
- Shelf life of sunscreen
- Liability

The City council directed staff to return as quickly as possible so that a pilot program could be rolled out during the summer to properly evaluate the program.

DISCUSSION:
The Parks and Recreation Commission discussed the City Council follow up items at their May 23rd Commission meeting. After evaluating each of the items, the Commission recommended Brightguard as the preferred sunscreen dispenser vendor. Each of the vendors offer proprietary re-fill products, therefore, the sunscreen dispenser is tied to the sunscreen product. In reviewing the ingredients for each of the vendors, Brightguard, Sun Shield, and Miami Beach Suncare all offer mineral based sunscreen, which provides the safest option for all ages (Attachment 1). Although Miami Beach Suncare provides mineral based sunscreen, the product is too thick to be pumped from its manual dispensers. Brightguard and Sun Shield also offer mineral based sunscreen, however the Brightguard dispensers offer a 6 month battery life, while Sun Shield dispensers have to be charged weekly. The Commission also sited Brightguard's successful track record in providing sunscreen and dispensers for over a year in Boston.

The ingredients that have raised concerns with dermatologists include: oxybenzone, retinyl palmitate, octinoxate, homosalate, octocrylene and paraben preservatives. These chemicals could potentially cause health issues including: allergic reactions, hormone disruption and developmental and reproductive toxicity. Some dermatologists recommend sunscreen containing these ingredients as they are within the FDA guidelines for safety and provide protection from the sun which is carcinogenic.

The active ingredients in the Brightguard sunscreen are zinc oxide and titanium dioxide. They are both mineral based and considered safe, as they are not absorbed and reflect the sun's rays. The ingredients are also non-irritating, hypoallergenic, broad spectrum and stable UVA and UVB protection. An additional benefit of the Brightguard dispenser is that Brightguard is an Irvine based company, so no shipping costs will apply and they will be close by to replace units if there are any maintenance issues. The Commission was initially concerned about the battery life for the motion dispensers, however the company guaranteed 6 months of operation without replacing the batteries. One drawback to the mineral based sunscreen is that it comes off more easily, especially for highly active people or swimmers.

In selecting Brightguard, the Commission provided the following information for the City Council's request for additional information:

1. No carcinogens or harmful ingredients in the sunscreen
    - Brightguard's product does not contain any of the harmful ingredients that were discussed at the City Council meeting.
2. Contact manufacturer regarding formula
    - The Commission reached out to the manufacturer, Miami Beach Suncare, but the product could not be used in the dispensers, as it is too thick.
3. Risk to children
    - The mineral based sunscreen is the safest sunscreen for all over the age of one. It is the general recommendation to consult with a physician for sunscreen use under the age of one. The Commission reached out to the contact with the Boston program that is sponsored by the Melanoma Foundation of New England. They provided full support of the Brightguard's product and safety.
4. Long term funding options

- If the Council approves the pilot program, the Commission will immediately begin reaching out to further potential sponsors. The Commission has received further interest and is confident that they will find sponsors to support the program long term.

5. Sponsorship during the 90 day trial period
   - The sponsorship recognition on the Brightguard dispensers will be smaller in size (4X6) than the Miami Beach Suncare dispenser.
6. Written criteria for the program
   - The criteria for the program to gauge success or failure will be to track the refill schedule at each of the proposed locations. In addition, the local press coverage and community feedback will also help gauge the success.
7. Shelf life of sunscreen
   - The sealed bags are good for a minimum of 12 months.
8. Liability
   - The City's risk manager suggested that the preferred vendor provide indemnification and that a disclaimer be added to the dispenser indicating that use is encouraged, but voluntary, and at the user's own risk.

Proposed Budget (90 days)

City Labor for Installation	$ 600
Sunscreen Cost ($50 X 41)	$4,050
Dispensers ($70 X 5)	$ 350
Contract cost for refilling dispenser	$2,500
Total	**$7,500**

The proposed budget will include installation and replacement of sunscreen two times per week (as needed). The budget refill packages will provide sunscreen for up to 63 people per day, per location.

PUBLIC OUTREACH/INTEREST:

The Commission reached out to Manhattan Beach based Dermatologist, Dr. Glynis Ablon regarding sunscreen safety. The Commission asked Dr. Glynis Ablon to provide feedback on the proposed Bright Guard sunscreen with Zinc Oxide and Titanium Dioxide. Dr. Glynis Ablon provided a response stating : "While there is significant controversy over the carcinogenicity of avobenzone and other chemical products (and truly these are actually UV organic filters), the two products or zinc oxide and titanium dioxide provide full UVA and UVB coverage by sitting on the skin as an inorganic mineral compound, deflecting and absorbing UV rays. So yes this product is acceptable and safe for use over 1 year of age."

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The proposed dispensers on the Pier and comfort station are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requirements pursuant to CEQA guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) because it can be seen with certainty that the project will not have the potential for any impacts on the environment.

LEGAL REVIEW

The City's risk manager suggested that the preferred vendor provide indemnification and that a disclaimer be added to the dispenser indicating that use is encouraged, but voluntary,

and at the user's own risk.

Attachment:

1. Brightguard Sun Safety Education Fact Sheet

Brightguard Sun Safety Education Fact Sheet

It is important to realize that the FDA has recognized that the sun is a known carcinogen. Although some people have more natural resistance from damage from the sun, everyone will benefit from sunscreen. Sunscreen should be broad spectrum meaning blocks both UVA and UVB rays.

There are three types of sunscreen:

1. Chemical sunscreens. Many are aerosol and go on clear. They can be water resistant for up to 80 minutes and are geared for active people who sweat and are in the water. This product takes a minimum of 20 minutes to be activated once applied. Athletes and adults usually use this product. They can irritate the skin and cause eye irritation. Their mode of action is to absorb the sun's rays, both UV–A and UV-B. Many of these chemical sunscreens have ingredients that have potential to be absorbed and create problems systemically.
2. Mineral Sunscreens. Many have all natural ingredients which mean they have minimal, if any effect, systemically in the body. The two major ingredients are titanium dioxide and Zinc oxide. Both of these products reflect the sun's rays. They work as soon as they are applied. These products are not as effective for highly active people or swimming because they come off easily. The good is that they are very safe for everyone including young kids. Both ingredients work on UV-A and UV-B radiation by reflection.
3. Hybrids These have benefits of both. They start working immediately as they reflect and absorb the suns rays. Great for people who are active. Again, because some of the ingredients in this product can be absorbed and could alter the hormones in the body, this product is not recommended for kids.

Problem ingredients to be concerned with:

Oxybenzone This material helps other chemicals penetrate the skin. When this material enters our body, it can disrupt our natural hormone levels and create a eczema like skin allergy. penetration enhancer (i.e., chemical that helps other chemicals penetrate the skin) undergoes a chemical reaction when exposed to UV rays. When oxybenzone is absorbed by your skin, it can cause an eczema-like allergic reaction that can spread beyond the exposed area and last long after you're out of the sun. 97 percent of Americans have this chemical circulating in our bodies, as it can accumulate more quickly than our bodies can get rid of it.

Retinyl palmitate Nearly 20 percent of the products contain retinyl palmitate, a form of vitamin A. According to many studies, this ingredient can cause tumors and other skin pathology. It also can be drying to the skin with sun exposure even though without sun it can be a moisturizer!

Octinoxate This chemical is used widespread and is absorbed through our skin and has been seen in mothers milk. It has been associated with moderate rates of skin allergies and can have effects similar to natural hormones in our bodies.

Homosalate Widely used chemical Again, found in mother's milk and does penetrate the skin. It can disrupt hormones like estrogen, androgen and progesterone in the body.

Octocrylene Widespread, found in mother's milk and penetrates the skin. Relatively high rates of skin allergies

Paraben Preservatives Associated with both acute and chronic side effects, parabens (butyl-, ethyl-, methyl-, and propyl-) can induce allergic reactions, hormone disruption, developmental and reproductive toxicity.

Safe Ingredients

Zinc Oxide used a long time. Reflects suns rays. This product is not absorbed into the skin nor does it have systemic problems.

Titanium Dioxide Similar to above.