

**DRAFT**  
**CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH**

*MINUTES OF THE CULTURAL ARTS COMMISSION*

*January 11, 2005*

6:00 P.M.

CONTENTS

- I. CALL TO ORDER  
The Cultural Arts Commission (CAC) of the City of Manhattan Beach, California met on Tuesday, January 11, 2005 at 6:03 p.m. in City Hall.
- II. ROLL CALL  
Present: Commissioners Greco (Chair), Wright (Vice-chair), Powell, Duncan, and Phillips
- Richard Gill, Parks and Recreation Director  
Juanita Purner, Cultural Arts Manager
- Public Arts Advisory Committee  
Walt Dougher, Zipporah Lax, Ellen Tarlow, Laura Moore,  
Lieutenant John Dye, Captain Tim O'Brien
- III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES  
September 14, 2004 minutes were approved with no changes.
- IV. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION  
None.
- V. GENERAL BUSINESS  
07/13/04.1 – Artist Presentations – 9/11 Memorial Proposals
- a) 15 minute presentation by each finalist followed by a Q & A session (#3, #7, #9 And #15)
  - b) Public Comments – Non-artist/designer participants (3 min. each)
  - c) Process of ranking the four proposals
  - d) Forward recommendations to the City Council

Cultural Arts Manager Juanita Purner expressed appreciation to the PAAC members for their commitment and dedication to the 9/11 memorial project. The presentation process was explained. The Commission and PAAC will begin the process of ranking the four proposals and prepare to forward their recommendations to the City Council. City council will convene on February 1<sup>st</sup> with the finalists making a final presentation.

The intention for this project as stated in the RFP was read: “Upon receipt of the two beams from the World Trade Center, the City of Manhattan Beach has initiated a project to honor the sacrifice, courage and devotion to duty of those in community services, as well as all those who lost their lives in the three terrorist attacks on that day. The focus is to pay tribute to the heroism and strength of the human spirit while providing the community a place to come together for reflection.”

It was announced Robert Kramer is presently working in Rome and is scheduled to call around 6:30 p.m. Milena Frieden is involved in a project in Belize and she has prepared a CD presentation.

### **Milena Frieden**

#### **Proposal, *untitled – assisted by Gary Suisak***

Mr. Suisak stressed Milena’s meticulousness and dedication to the projects she undertakes. He also mentioned the massive amount of research with respect to this project. Milena consulted with architectural professors at Cal Poly Pomona, local landscape contractors, masonry experts, and environmental designers.

#### **Video Highlights:**

- A visited to station #2 to view beams and to hear Fire Chief Groat explain how the beams were obtained and how two local fire fighters participated in rescue effort at Ground Zero (Tim O’Brien and Jeff Sanders). Additional research was conducted to learn about the local history.
- It is suggested the beams could be part of the top floor exoskeleton
- Inspiration came from the water surrounding the island of Manhattan and Manhattan Beach.—“not only is water an essential resource and element but it also signifies rebirth, purity and vitality.”
- Reference to the role water has played in public and private spaces throughout world history were mentioned: Berlin’s Potsdamer Platz once the home of the former Berlin Wall and the largest body of urban water in Europe. Two local sources included: the Children’s park in San Diego and Noguchi’s, *California Scenario* in Costa Mesa is located in an office park
- The steel-beam design symbolizes the former twin towers and the fountain is an abstract representation of the island of Manhattan. The fountain’s stepped surface supports a constant flow of water mirroring the local shoreline. The fountain and its surroundings are constructed of gray-green slate and reddish flagstone; the material was chosen for its textured surface and the effect created by the surface when water runs over it. Water signifies life, rebirth and energy.
- The brass fire hose nozzles represent the Manhattan Beach fire fighters. The benches along the perimeter of the fountain emphasize its shape and provide the visitor the opportunity for contemplation.. In the evenings the steps and the memorial beams will be illuminated.
- The educational component of the design will be the plaque at the head of the fountain. This plaque will be made of bronze and will describe the history of the 9/11 attacks and how people got together to help in the rescue efforts at ground Zero.

- The fountain steps begin at 6” below the walking level and drop 1/4” for each step thereafter creating a sheeting effect. The water will spill down to the next level ending in a holding tank where the water will be circulated by two pumps. The pumping system will include a filter and a chlorine injection mechanism to purify the water. A mechanism will regulate overflow during our rainy season and compensate for evaporation during the summer months. There will be two access points for routine maintenance.
- The benches will alternate in size and be made of concrete covered with a slate veneer. The benches will be slightly raised to allow rain water to flow underneath them. .
- The cost of the fountain is flexible and to attain a more refined look and feel the slate and flag stone would be the ideal materials.

A lengthy discussion followed pertaining to the proposal cost that exceeded the \$60,000 amount specified in the RFP.

**Questions and Answers:**

Q Did Milena expect the \$60,000 commission be supplemented?

A: She feels strongly about the design and proposes that potential donors are an option, and taking away features is not an option.

Q: Are other funding sources being explored?

A: Yes, two companies in the area are targeted for funding but there wasn’t time before leaving for Belize. There was a level of interest expressed by companies in the area who would be willing to donate their time and materials to the project. There are two cost options: slate fountain for \$118,000 and an option for a \$98,000 stamped concrete version.

Q: There is concern regarding the depth of the water, what is the deepest level?

A: The steps have a 3/8 to 1/2 inch drop and per the diagram the water at its deepest point is a foot.

Q: Will the beams standing in water erode?

A: the beams can be coated at the base to forestall corrosion.

Q: What is the long term effect on marble or slate?

A: Mr. Suisak was not able to provide an answer but knew from conversations with Milena that slate works well in water situations.

The panel expressed concerned with increased liability with the water element and the maintenance of this proposal

## **Nancy Mooslin**

### **Proposal - *Risen Memories/Rising Hopes.***

- The beams also speak of sorrow, heroic inspiration and the unselfish courage of the day.
- Glass was chosen to surround the beams. Natural light behaves very much like water, the way it reflects light and the way it changes with different atmospheric conditions.
- The tower of glass at its highest point is 18' 3" taller than the beams themselves.
- A sample of the slumped glass was provided. The glass walls surrounding the beams are set in 3' square wells. The wells contain tempered glass pebbles. The wells are oriented exactly like the two trade center towers.
- A concrete path traverses the site and the artist has provided a list of quotes and information for inscription.
- The 24 trees from the original plan were modified to 8-10 trees. The Artist has consulted with landscaping companies to research trees appropriate for this location. .
  
- The project can be done for that specified budget. I've taken very little for myself; the stainless steel framework will be done by John Wily. It is a maintenance free project:

### **Questions and Answers:**

Q: Will the glass sustain torrential rains? And was consideration given to viewing the columns from the street?

A: Yes the beams will survive the rains. When you're coming up Valley you see it from both directions. From 15<sup>th</sup>, the beams can be viewed through the glass.

Q: The light there's a beam of light, how is that reflected on the site?

A: There's a flood light the glass wells with a timer.

....

Q: And the benches?

A: The notebook contains details on the benches.

Q: The glass pebbles and the possibility of their disappearance?

A: Its just broken tempered glass and very easy to replace. Another material can be used if there are safety concerns...

Q: How about the glass walls being scratched or tagged?

A: The Company has a mold and is easy to replace. Or, there's plastic netting that can be adhered.

Q: What's the height of the facility and its relationship to the glass walls?

A Tim O'Brien responded: the two-story section (facility classroom) with a lip that sticks out about 3' has a roof line of 20.'

Q: I have concerns about the location of the beams so near the sidewalk.

A: If the beams are too close to the sidewalk they can be changed and the color of the path integrated to match facility and sidewalk surfaces.

Q: The one issue I had was potential glare from the sun, or glare from headlights.

A: The glass is not non-reflective but it was pointed out that cities are filled with windows which normally do not cause problems.

### **Robert Kramer (called from Rome)**

#### **Proposal, Monument to September 11**

- The columns stand by themselves as a testament to the magnitude and the violence of that event. This proposal lifts them up from the wreckage and places them back into a vertical position. This gesture of lifting them up is a resurrection, a kind of rebirth. The magnitude of this event defines our memorial and the west coast is also the transcendence of this tragedy.
- There is no narrative, the narrative are within each person who lived through this event. The event is part of personal and national history.
- The beams will be placed in tall grass standing in a reality in space. The grass compliments the beams rusted texture and three trees behind the beams serve as a foil or veiling to soften the columns.

#### **Questions and Answers**

Q: Is there only planning for one bench?

A: Yes, a circular seating area that evokes a sense of mediation.

Q: Is there a wall behind the seating area?

A: Yes, the wall lessens the impact of the memorial; I'm open to placing quotations or text there.

Q: Is there a budget?

A: Yes, there is a budget it's being put together now.

Q: Did you say the type of tree, or the tall grass you mentioned?

A: We're working that out with the contractor. Using the same type of trees planted on the street is an option.

Q: Are the trees assiduous?

A: I think that depends, over all I saw something soft and leafy behind the beams. I think the rendering of the project used assiduous trees.

Q: Is there hardscape between the seating area and the lower wall, and a second question what's the purpose of the lower wall..

A: There is a flagstone, or a bouquet canyon stone used to present a rural setting. The type of tall grass is used locally

Q: Can you explain the meaning of that low wall or the purpose behind the seating area?

A: The wall provides a screen, a sense of privacy from the building behind. It also carries the inscription of the date. Further definition was pending.

Q: People can walk on the grass, right?

A: It is possible, It's a very tall grass that you've seen the grass that wonderful grass that's on the strand and in various places in Manhattan Beach.

Q: With the tall grass you wouldn't be able to touch them.

A: That's probably true; I do see extending flagstone from seating area allowing people to approach the columns from behind on the flagstone.

Q: I'm looking at an elevation and I'm wondering what's under ground?

Is it a casing?

A: We'll get into that its casing that will support the steel beams will be lowered into the ground.

Professor Demitri Vergun, Structural Engineer, USC

Assisted Robert. Kramer:

- This structure is simple; there would be one footing which would be 12 cubic yards of concrete.
- The cost for concrete is approximately \$100 a yard. About \$1200 of concrete, but the labor and the reinforcing would increase that cost to \$5,000 for the footing. Then there's steel tube sections which would project from the footing and the columns would slip over them.
- They're grouted in place and they're designed to take several times the acceleration of any earth quake that would strike this area. Manhattan Beach is close to the Palos Verdes fault and to the Inglewood fault.
- The beams can with stand 5 times the acceleration that buildings are designed to handle. re that this is
- The proposal design can be completed w/o insurance for less than 20,000 dollars. But the insurance and the liability costs would raise the price. The hard construction costs are about \$20,000.
- AT present the costs of the wall, seating nor the flagstone are available.

#### Questions and Answers:

Q: The educational component—one of the requirements in the RFP is an educational component that documents the events, you don't present one.

A: I think the memorial itself is a powerful statement. To the west there's an addendum to the site along side the building a triangular zone where I'd like place a display of steel plaque. It would focus on the local history which contributes the on-going heritage of this particular place. I'd like to work with the fire fighters to develop that display. Its addendum and not part of the original composition package. So what I'd like to do work out something with the city where the material and the installation are paid for by the city

and I'll be happy to donate my time and design portion to the addendum as an information piece.

Q: Demitri mentioned the hard structure costs would be around \$20,000. Are you confident you can bring it in under the 60,000?

A: With no problem, absolutely.

### **Back to Nancy Mooslin:**

Q: Isn't there a street light at the corner, I'd like to point out there's also a sidewalk around the outside of the space—how would this impact the site?

A: Yes from the site plan it did look like a sidewalk ran between the memorial site and the street. The street light is on the sidewalk, the beams flood light would illuminate the immediate space.

Another possibility for the broken glass pebbles is a glass mosaic replacement. I like the broken glass better, but it could be replaced. It wouldn't catch the run-off as well.

### **Scott Yanofsky, Steve Oliker, Mark Brush and Studio 9One2**

#### **Proposal, *Untitled***

- To reduce the cost, their final proposal uses polished colored concrete with texture rather than pink and gray granite (originally used for the WTC).
- Contacted the landscape architect (name??) working for HOK at the Manhattan Beach Civic Center Project. The project design will consider a continuity of landscape including types of trees from the surrounding area.
- Indicated the difference of shadow effects (of the building on the memorial) by seasons, due to the change of the sun's position relative to the azimuth and declination
- Two columns set on the pedestals which will be led at night
- Education element will be on the wall next to the bench, which will discuss about the event of the 9-11, story behind the acquisition of the WTC columns, etc. Information of Chuck Keller, Manhattan Beach citizen who lost his life at the terrorist attack, could be included.
- Introduced an educator's view (Mira Costa High School) of memorials or monuments, which mission is to evoke emotions, spark the interest in the chosen subject, not exhaustively documented.

### **Questions and Answers**

Q. Would the walls invite skateboarders?

A. To discourage skateboarders, the wall design was changed from the original, making it undulated.

Q. Would alcove and niches give an impression of a tombstone by inviting people to dedicate flowers and candles?

A. Dedications are not necessarily morose; it could be uplifting. They are an expression of individuals about their feelings at the event.

Q. How much will the rust come off?

A. It would not be a significant amount because no water is involved in the project. To control it, a trap can be created.

Q. What is the material of chairs?

A. Chairs will be with sandblasted colored concrete with textures, and brushed aluminum.

---

---

The commissioners and the panel thanked the finalists for their hard work at the presentations. They also appreciated the sensitivities expressed in all of their proposals.

There was a discussion over treatment of entry #3, which was over budget, whether it would be open to the ranking and recommendation to the Council. Commissioner Powell indicated that this artist did not follow the rule which had been articulated in the RFP (not to exceed \$60,000). Mr. Dougher concerned about the equity issue, in which fairness should be kept to the other participants. Commissioner Greco also mentioned that the other presenters had adjusted their proposal to accommodate the budget. Mr. O'Brien felt that suggesting a project which was over budget somewhat irresponsible, rather than scaling back the project within the budget. Regarding additional funding, Mr. Gill stated that it was required to clearly show the commitment of additional sources before the initiation of the project. Commissioner Wright acknowledged that budget at this stage was an estimate, not a concrete proposal. Commissioner Phillips also pointed out that one of the finalists (#9) made only an oral commitment without submitting a written line-item budget. After a series of discussions, the commission and the panel decided to rank all the four finalists' projects with remarks of their concerns about the over-budget entry, which should be reflected in the minutes and staff report.

## **VI. REPORTS AND OTHER BUISNESS**

The Keller Bench Special CAC Meeting was confirmed for January 27 at 6 p.m.

## **VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Next meeting is January 27, 2005 at 6:00 p.m. in the City Hall Council Chambers.



