

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Didi Rea <didirea@d2management.net>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 10:11 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I definitely want to add my name to the list to vote for an apology and reparation to the Bruces.

Respectfully,  
Didi



Didi Rea | D2 Management

Los Angeles, CA 90025  
Office (310) 288-3040

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Kavon Ward <kward1025@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 10:09 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Kavon Ward's Public Comments to The Bruce's Beach Task Force

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

The City of Manhattan Beach forced Charles and Willa Bruce out of Manhattan Beach and pillaged their land. Now the City of Manhattan Beach claims they want to make amends. But ironically, members of the City Council have set forth to do that without input from the Bruce family.

Instead, they've created this task force, the one you all sit on today, with a legacy of white supremacy rearing its ugly head. It is this white supremacy that gives them the audacity to task you all, instead of the living descendants, with figuring out what is best for the family. The living descendants have made it clear what reparative justice means to them, and that is restoration and restitution.

We know the City of Manhattan Beach cant give the land back to the Bruces, but the City of Manhattan Beach can pay the family restitution for lost business wages, for stripping them of the opportunity to possess and pass down wealth and for violating their human and civil rights.

It is evident that this task force will not recommend either so at the very least, recommend that a public apology remain a priority.

The City of Manhattan Beach silenced the Bruce Family, Black people, when they excluded them from helping create and develop the task force.

The City of Manhattan Beach silenced me, a Black woman, when they denied me access to the task force despite my former task force and policy experience.

And now members of the city council are silencing Allison Hales, a Black woman, by stripping her of her subcommittee assignments because she was courageous enough to speak up and challenge members of the task force, for there not being enough black representation.

This silencing of Black voices is clearly a pattern of practice and it must stop here!

Get on the right side of history! Listen to what the Bruce Family is demanding and strongly urge members of the city council to make restitution and a public apology to the Bruce family, its main priority as this is the true path to reconciliation.

--

... And Through Her Words, She Has Spoken!

[Learn](#) · [Watch](#) · [Follow](#) · [Like](#) · [Support](#)

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Alison Chavez <coffeychavez@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 9:51 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Come back together

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please prioritize a formal apology to the Bruce Family. Why haven't we done so already? Weren't you asking Alison Hales for an apology for being aggressive? But we can't as a city apologize to a family who is still very much present over a racially motivated travesty of the law? For the shameful harassment of Black folks who just wanted to swim in the ocean? We don't own the ocean, btw.

It seems childish to take Allison Hales off committees because of her behavior. Wah wah. Maybe now those committee members can understand what it feels like to be bullied for the color of their skin.

If they can't handle a heated argument in a committee meeting, resign. Did they think this would hugs and flowers?

How do you think we appear to the outside world when we refuse to apologize? Guess what? We look like racists. Admitting that we were wrong then, shows we've changed. That we are NOT racists! That we care. And we need to do a lot more!

This will never go away until we have a population and city council who is willing to step up and do the right thing. Your actions tonight will be remembered.

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** James Saxon <james@saxon.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 9:23 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Redress, truth, reconciliation, apology.

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I have learned the shameful past of the theft of Bruce's Beach.

I urge the community to take action to satisfactorily redress the harm.

Truth and reconciliation for the racist past of our nation has never happened as the confederate flags still fly.

We have an opportunity to lead through example.

Please take this opportunity to restore our integrity so that we can move forward as a community with a clear conscience.

Thank you,

Sincerely,  
James Bennett Saxon  
South Bay Resident

--

JAMES BENNETT SAXON [james@saxon.com](mailto:james@saxon.com)

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Ben Rempel <benrempel93@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 9:19 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Public Comment for Today's Meeting

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello,

I am a citizen of LA County, and I urge the task force to take meaningful steps to repair the city's harmful actions against the Bruce family and other Black residents. Historical education markers are important, but they do not go far enough.

I demand that the City of Manhattan Beach: publicly apologize to the Bruce family for the City's racist past, pay restitution to the Bruce family, and reinstate Allison Hales' subcommittee assignments.

Thank you,  
Ben Rempel

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Annie Stein <msannieos@yahoo.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 9:13 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Please do the right thing today

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please apologize and make the fair and just reparations to the family and people of Bruce's Beach. We , all of us , as a nation have got to become the ethical and moral people we can and should be.

With Hope  
Annie Stein

Msannieos@yahoo.com  
Writer  
( Huffington Post  
NYT's  
One For The Table)

[Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPhone](#)

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Bill Heuisler <billheuisler@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 5:49 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Public Comment

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Good morning,

This email is for the public comment portion of the Bruce's Beach Task Force meeting tonight, March 3rd.

I am pleased to see that Manhattan Beach is attempting to address the city's historic wrongdoing in regards to the land currently designated "Bruce's Beach." I am equally frustrated and disappointed at the city and the task force for failing to properly consider the descendants of the Bruce family in this process. A full and public apology to the Bruce family from the city of Manhattan Beach is the obvious and easy first step - it costs you nothing. It is what every resident of Manhattan Beach (or any place for that matter) would expect if a similar crime was committed against them.

While the other steps are understandably more challenging, they are also more important to actually right the wrong that was done. The land should be restored to the Bruce family and restitution should be paid to the descendants of the Bruce family. Fortunately, it seems that LA County may be in a position to take lead on the restoration of the land and Janice Hahn has announced plans to work to make that happen. The Bruces Beach Task Force and the city of Manhattan Beach must also work to do what is right here after so many years of ignoring, denying or downplaying the city's role in America's racist past.

Bruce's Beach is not unique to this nation's history. Thanks to the work of historians and activists, cities across the nation are being exposed for incidents of racial violence, land theft and worse to our Black citizens. Manhattan Beach has the chance to get on the right side of history and can actually set the example for others to follow by apologizing to the Bruce family and committing to restoration and restitution.

I hope to see a transparent process and progress in the coming months as the Task Force addresses this horrific part of Manhattan Beach's past AND present.

Thanks for your consideration,

Bill Heuisler  
South Bay (Redondo Beach) resident and former employee in Manhattan Beach

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Siena Chiang <sienachiang@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 2, 2021 11:15 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Public comment from LA county resident in support of the Bruce family

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear MB City Council Task Force,

I, Siena Chiang, stand in full support of the Justice for Bruce's Beach demands of the Mayor Montgomery and the Manhattan Beach City Council, outlined below. Acknowledgment of the injustice that was done to the Bruce family and other a black families is not enough. Real accountability and justice require repair and restitution. The Bruce family and their supporters are clear and specific in what they feel are sufficient reparations for the harm they have endured financially, emotionally, psychically, socially and physically.

I request that the task force fulfill the entire list of demands below.

Provide Restoration and Restitution to the Bruce family for forcing them off their land:

- Restore the land to the Bruce family
- Provide restitution for loss of revenue for the past 95 years.
- Pay monetary damages for the violation of Charles and Willa Bruce's civil rights.

Provide Reparations for the Black and Indigenous residents of Manhattan Beach:

- demand the city pay reparations to Black and Indigenous residents of Manhattan Beach by partnering with Neighborhood Housing Services (NHS) of Los Angeles County and other coastal cities to provide affordable homeownership opportunities for Black and Indigenous families who wish to live in the community. Specifically, Black and Indigenous individuals and families who are low to moderate income should be eligible for downpayment and closing cost assistance funding to facilitate affordable homeownership opportunities.

Tell the Truth:

- Revise the text on the Plaque at Bruce's Beach.
- Create educational programs within the community and in schools that tell the truth about Manhattan Beach's racist past and the KKK's involvement in forcing the Bruces and other Black people out of Manhattan Beach.

Thank you for your consideration and review of my comment.

Watchfully,  
Siena Chiang  
Lifelong resident of LA County

--

Siena Chiang

  
[sienachiang@gmail.com](mailto:sienachiang@gmail.com)



## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Kenneth Landsman <gladyankee@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 2, 2021 8:57 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] comments regarding bruces beach task force

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please remain committed to pursuing justice for the Bruce family and restoring dignity to our beautiful city. My feelings, expressed in this poem are shared by many. Ken Landsman

The sordid tale of Bruce's Beach

Presents for us a truth to teach

The path we choose might still defuse

The simmering strains of racial bigotry

The putrid odor of past misdeeds

Befouls our senses, bravely pleads

To recognize and demonize

The hostile acts bequeathed to you and me

No pious plaque nor ceremony

Can stem the stench of rank baloney  
Ejected raw by hate's defenders,  
vile pretenders to the crown of White supremacy

With ball and chain bound to our limb  
Our shameful past emerges dim  
As childlike, we frolic  
in the foam of faithless waves which cannot cleanse  
repugnant acts

The T's were crossed the I's were dotted  
The KKK's were nowhere spotted  
Respectable and proper  
turned the turgid gears of government-sanctioned hacks

Unbroken trail despoiled with hate  
Continues to the present date  
Disguised and camouflaged

with windy legal terms and history distilled of awkward facts

No finer phrase could mark the weal

Had Willa Bruce cried “Stop the Steal”

While writs and wrecking balls

joined forces in concerted demolition of a noble life

Defying odds with bravery

Emerged at last from slavery

This family stood with stoic pride

Against the stealthy mob with sharpened knife

A century fouled by prejudice

Now forced to peer in the abyss

Where undead lay the crimes of

Unexamined racial strife

Confront the past? That’s too much trouble

For those protected by the bubble  
A bistro beckons, a nail salon  
A reckoning disturbs uneasy mind

The fault's not ours they feebly bleat  
Faux innocent heirs of rank deceit  
Reparations, restitution  
overwhelm the privileged kind

Half-hearted claims abet their fight  
Yet truth denied seeks out the light  
As history reinforces fact  
These are the ties that bind

No 'Cancel' shall obstruct this tale  
Of Founding Fathers we falsely hail  
They rest uneasily beneath  
The gaudy mansions cruelly sown

They've left their mark they couldn't know

A hundred years from then would grow

The fetid fruit descended from

These cultivated characters unknown

And now the final act begins

Redress is called for elders' sins

Truth will prevail we will atone

As curtain falls our past we own

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Priya Chatwani <priyachatwani5@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 2, 2021 6:26 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Public Comment for the Bruce's Beach Task Force meeting

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hi,

My name is Priya, and I was born and raised in Manhattan Beach. The atrocities that were committed against the Bruce family in the 1920s at the hands of our government are no different and no worse than the atrocities being committed today against Allison Hales and the Black folks of the South Bay.

It is evident that Manhattan Beach has only ever worked to benefit those who are already white, wealthy, and privileged. That is not how a city works. Cities are supposed to be livable, breathable, and inhabitable by all its residents. Cities are supposed to provide not just a shared understanding of dignity and respect to all its citizens, but also a shared access to advocacy and change.

This city can never make up for the harms and generational trauma it has caused. But it can make a step in the right direction by:

1. Publicly apologizing to the Bruce family,
2. Paying restitution to the Bruce family, and
3. Reinstating the subcommittee assignments of Allison Hales, a long-standing and dedicated community member who has tirelessly worked to uplift all voices of Manhattan Beach.

Take this opportunity to do what's right.

Sincerely,  
Priya Chatwani (she/her/hers)

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Nana Tatiboit <nanatatiboit@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 3:48 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force Comments - Comments for Submission for Tonight's Meeting

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

As a long time local neighbor, it was heartbreaking to find out the truth of the land and the beach that I love visiting so much with my children. Ever since, my heart has been heavy and I haven't frequented much at all. I can't bring myself to visit because it just doesn't feel right. In fact, coming to Manhattan Beach doesn't feel the same at all anymore. There is a stench. A very deep air of racism that is very thick ever since this summer of 2020. If the city does not rectify and do what is right by righting the wrongs of what has been done to the Bruce family, it will just get worse and I fear for what is to come for the City. We want Manhattan Beach to be a place of a safe, happy haven for everyone. We have to remove this ugly cloud from its head and the only way to do that is to right the wrong. Karma always wins and the evil of what has been done absolutely cannot continue.

I ask that Manhattan Beach please do the right thing and pay FULL restitution to the surviving members of the Bruce family for what is due to them to right this atrocity. Manhattan Beach must begin to address its problem of deep racism and this is one way to begin. PLEASE DO WHAT IS RIGHT!!!!

Nana Tatiboit

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Stephanie Kelly <stephanieck91@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 3:40 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello all,

I just want to say this Task Force is a step in the right direction. I agree with the proposals that include the history of MB particularly the events in regards to Bruce's family on the MBUSD curriculum. Children need to understand why their city is predominantly white, how the events of the past shape our lives today and how we can find reconciliation.

I really hope that the members of this council are predominantly African American. I find it interesting that there is an attorney included in the 13 members of the task force. It could be taken as Manhattan Beach wants reparations that are not too inconvenient for them. This calls for taking a step back and acknowledging how the intuitions protect some and leave others out. This is an ongoing issue in history and it's not going to change from one day to another.

Personally, I love Dr. Lee's proposals. "Leaders are readers". He seems to understand what people of color are really experiencing. Representation of people of color is needed in Manhattan Beach, pictures, statues, memorials. We don't want any hate in our community, we want love and inclusion. Let's not be afraid of telling what happened, it is the first step to make amends.

Thank you and much love,

Stephanie Kelly



## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Paige Hubbard <aphubba@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 12:46 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force Meeting

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello City of Manhattan Beach,

I'm a Hermosa Beach neighbor and I'm writing to demand that **justice be given to Bruce's Beach.**

I implore the city of Manhattan Beach to **publicly apologize** to the Bruce family and the marginalized black community as a whole. Though your officials that are in power today did not make these shameful decisions of the past, it is nevertheless their responsibility to restore justice.

In order to right these wrongs, I firmly believe the City of MB should **grant the land back to the Bruce Family descendants** and **pay restitution** to help counter what has been lost. It is ultimately up to Bruce Family to decide what becomes of this land -- it is not Manhattan Beach's decision to make.

In addition, I recommend reinstating **Allison Hales' subcommittee assignments** to insure these requirements are met.

Thank you for your consideration.

Regards,  
Paige Hubbard

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Amy Wang <azwng18@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 12:09 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Return Bruce's beach to original owners and caretakers

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Good afternoon,

My name is Amy, and I am a Los Angeles resident in full support of Justice for Bruce's Beach. I demand that the Bruce's Beach Task Force pursue a public apology and financial restitution for the Bruce family. We will settle for no less.

Sincerely,  
Amy Wang

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** beth bowen <iambethbowen@yahoo.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 11:28 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Apology in order

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

A Public Apology to The Bruce's and Their Racist Past is the least the city can do. I'm not happy to hear that Allison Hales has been excluded from her subcommittees and has not been allowed to rejoin.

-Beth Bowen

Sent from my iPhone

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Luc Kleiner <luckleiner@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 11:10 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Written public comment submission by MB resident Luc Kleiner

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Greetings Task force,

Please submit my comment for the record:

The city of Manhattan Beach, of which I am a life-long resident, should issue a public apology to the descendants of Charles and Willa Bruce, founding community members of color who were forced off of their shoreline properties by the city itself using “legal” means to carry out racist ends. The city should right this wrong by paying restitution to the Bruce family, whose opportunity for prosperity in this community was shattered by the racist, systematic mechanisms of oppression executed by the city against these founding residents of color. Finally, in order to preserve a pluralistic, diverse, and broad scope of opinions and perspectives, I urge the task force to honor the inclusion of the voice of Allison Hales.

Thank you.

— Luc Kleiner

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** sharon young <sharonyoung264@yahoo.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 11:08 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Give Allison Hales a break

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

The optics look pretty bad from here. With all the attorneys in the room, I would think you would have better negotiating skills.

- Embarrassed MB Citizen

[Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPad](#)

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Gary Osterhout <garyosterhout@verizon.net>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 10:45 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Comment: Appendix 5 - Wording Often too Broad

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Task Force:

I would prefer you revise Appendix 5 to address the topics in a more general fashion. I realize this is only an "aspirational" document, but as can be derived from recent social media postings, often something meant for "discussion purposes only" takes on a different life of its own.

Similarly, were the Council to approve discussion of such a list, it conveys an acquiescence to all enumerated principles. One can say "we're just talking" until you are blue in the face, but public perception often takes a different turn, and perception often becomes reality.

As examples of a more generalized approach, in respect to inclusionary housing, you could just reference "Review local inclusionary housing policies or practices in respect to racial exclusion issues" instead of these specifics (and if you are going to list such, I would recommend you add the issue of the number of days homes are vacant either due to exorbitant pricing or not intention of occupancy).

Instead of this:

4. Facilitate and encourage development of affordable housing units and attendant entitlements within the City.
5. Incentivize City property owners to dedicate rental units and ADUs/JADUs for use as affordable housing.

In respect to educational assistance and incentives, I would prefer a description more to "Explore educational scholarship incentives for African American studies in general, and the expansion of information on the racial history of Manhattan Beach and the South Bay in specifics, for an appropriate (limited) amount of time.

Instead of this:

9. Sponsor an annual scholarship of \$1,500 to high school students who will study African American history in college, to be administered by the Task Force.
10. Sponsor a grant of \$1,000, administered by the Task Force, to graduate students who pursue the study of the racial history of Manhattan Beach.

I'm not necessarily saying that these shouldn't be final recommendations in the event the council expands your current brief.

Thank you for your consideration.  
Gary Osterhout  
Manhattan Beach

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Tanya Taylor <tanyatammaya@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 10:40 AM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force - Public Comments

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear Task Force & those who actually make the decisions regarding this group.

I'm extremely disgusted to discover how white washed both the task force and it's activities have been.

Firstly the minimal number of African-Americans and I mean actual Black people not people who claim that they "identify" as Black when an opportunity can be gotten from it, although their passports, IDs and job applications do not correlate with their recent adoption of Blackness since 2020.

Secondly, how is it that the only 2 clearly Black people on the task force have been disrespected, undermined, silenced and pushed out?

It would appear that at the end of your so called duties you stand with ZERO members who look anything like the Bruce's Family. That being B L A C K.

God forbid that you allow Black people to actually do the decision making in how the atrocity of Bruce's Beach should be handled. AND why was the representative for the Bruce's Family never included or consulted in any of your activities?

The answer is clear you never had any true intention of making real change, amending the wrong that was inflicted or showing respect for the continual struggle that Africans Americans face everyday due to racism. The same racism that robbed the Bruce's of their land and business and rob Black people of having a space on the coasts of California.

So now you have a white task force to make a white washed decision which will result in next to nothing being done. But I hope that you all feel better about yourself. Yahhhh for you and your social justice stamp.

The next time one of us gets murdered in the streets due to racism ask yourself did you really do enough to make a difference for us or just enough for a public show and a nice tag on your resume. And yes it does go that deep, because by not acknowledging or correctly respecting and compensating the Bruce's Family you uphold the racism that says that Black Lives and Livelihoods DON'T matter.

Disgraceful!!!!

Tanya Taylor

Sent from my iPhone

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Athena Tan <athena.m.tan@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 12:53 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Public Comment - Bruce's Beach Task Force 3/3/2021

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Good evening, task force members,

I urge you to take swift action to:

- Publicly apologize to the Bruce family for the City of Manhattan Beach's racist dispossession of their land.
- Pay restitution to the Bruce family.
- Reinstate Allison Hales's subcommittee assignments.

Although your responsibility, strictly defined, is to the community of Manhattan Beach, please keep in mind that a hundred years ago, Black residents from all around the LA area benefited from the existence of Bruce's Beach. Your ethical responsibility is to all who have been intergenerationally disadvantaged by the city's racist actions.

Thank you,  
Athena Tan



## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Susie Miller <susiemiller2222@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 1:00 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] PUBLIC COMMENT for 3/3 mtg - BRUCE'S BEACH Task Force

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear Manhattan Beach City Council Members,

I am respectfully writing to you to express my extreme disappointment and concern with regard to how the full history of Bruce's Beach is currently being handled.

While I appreciate that a task force has been assembled and appreciate each member's contribution, my understanding is that the city is pushing merely for a revised plaque and re-education of what happened, that still does not entirely reflect the accurate history of what actually happened. I believe that we, as white supporters and advocates, need to educate each other, our community and our children on what actually happened to the Bruce Family being forcibly removed from Manhattan Beach/chased out by the KKK.

I also understand that certain members of the task force have felt their voices have been silenced, Allison Hales in particular. As one of the black women on the task force, her voice is critical in this scenario. Her voice should not be silence, but be strongly encouraged, heard and considered in terms of solutions.

Ultimately, a formal apology needs to be made to the Bruce Family for being forced out of Manhattan Beach nearly 100 years ago - it is never too late to right a wrong. Not only this, but true reparations are owed. Though the Bruce Family was given a small amount for their suffering, it was not a fair market value amount and did not allow for the members of the Bruce Family to create and pass down wealth to their family for generations to come.

Thank you for your time - in 2021, it is not enough to be "not racist" - we must come together to be actively anti-racist and work together to right the wrongs of the past.

Thank you.

Susie Miller

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Lauren Bergloff <laurenbergloff@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 1:04 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force Meeting

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello City of Manhattan Beach,

I'm a Redondo Beach neighbor and I'm writing to demand that **justice be given to Bruce's Beach.**

I ask the city of Manhattan Beach to **publicly apologize** to the Bruce family and the marginalized black community as a whole. Though your officials that are in power today did not make these shameful decisions of the past, it is nevertheless their responsibility to restore justice.

In order to right these wrongs, I believe the City of MB should **grant the land back to the Bruce Family descendants** to help counter what has been lost.

Thank you for your consideration.

Lauren Bergloff

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Ken Wilton <kenneth.l.wilton@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 1:08 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Conduct of BBTF

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear BBTF:

I am writing for several reasons: to express both my admiration for the work done by each and every member of the Bruce's Beach Task Force, my support for the apology proposed by the Task Force, and my concern regarding the optics, and impact, of the public display of discord among the members.

On the positive side, the level of thought and discourse I have heard in the recorded meetings is quite impressive. The issues you are addressing are difficult, namely wrongs that are centuries, if not millenia, in the making. Like anything important in life, decisions regarding what to do to address past injustices are neither simple nor quick. And the fact that the Task Force has made the progress it has in its relatively short existence is commendable.

Regarding the apology, an apology by the City will go a long way to helping us grow as a more welcoming and diverse community. As the Northeastern School of Law's Civil Rights and Restorative Justice Project notes, "apologies can be meaningful moments to victims of historical wrongs and an important step toward validating an unpleasant moment in history." Apologies are not signs of weakness, but rather recognition. The City of Glendale issued an apology last year; the City of Manhattan Beach should do the same.

Finally, it is unfortunate that all the good that has been accomplished by the Task Force is being derailed by the actions of its leadership. It should come as no surprise that certain members of the Task Force, such as Allison Hales, would feel passionately about the topics being discussed. And the fact she is assertive in her positions is not a negative; if race relations were an easy, polite topic we would have been living in a post-racial society decades ago. But we're not. Everyone who signed up for the Task Force should have known that their discussions would be hard, and personal, and pointed.

The leaders of the Task Force have enough experience to know that disputes within a group are best resolved within that group. Yet they decided, for reasons that are not entirely clear, to directly attack Ms. Hales both by discussing Task Force issues at a public City Council meeting and by making statements to be published in the echo chambers of NextDoor and Patch.

I hope the Task Force can get back on task, reinstate Ms. Hales, and move forward with helping make a positive change in our community.

Best,  
Ken Wilton

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Maria Crisanta Castro Naoe <crisa.castro@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 1:51 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] I don't want to be disappointed

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello Taskforce.

I understand there is so much context and commentary, but my comments are simple:

Please do the right thing for the Bruce family.

I love this town- our schools, my church here, our general community...and do not want to be disappointed by excuses.

Sincerely,  
Crisa Castro-Naoe

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Z. B. <zuribella@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 2:25 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Regarding Bruce's Beach Task Force Meeting

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hi Bruce's Beach Task Force,

We have the opportunity to right a grievance wrong by apologizing to the Bruce family for seizing the Bruce family's land and subjecting them to cruel racist abuse designed to force them out of the area. The way to make this a true apology is by providing restitution for this theft. We have historic wrongs in our history, we have actively segregated ourselves through actions like this one. When we address these wrongs and atone for them, we heal our past, present, and future.

Please consider creating a better, kinder future for the next generation by apologizing and providing reparation for the Bruce Family.

This is a moment in history.

Where will you stand?

Best,  
Zurit Horowitz

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Heart of Life Collection <shereenlavi1@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 2:25 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] BBTF

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello all,

I have been discussing the subject of the objectives of the task force for the last two weeks on next-door. To me it seems the residence don't have all the information, and a lot of the same people keep insisting that all the task force was supposed to do from the beginning was pick art I am come up with an apology maybe. But when I applied to be part of this task force the mission was, in my recollection, to study the history make sure it's accurate and then come up with different ideas and recommendations to rectify the situation.

I'm shocked at how many residence or people commenting on next-door, that truly have no empathy or understanding of systematic racism, and the effects it had on our society and most importantly how are city looks to everybody outside of our city. I can tell you from experience and talking to people we look like a racist town, much like Huntington Beach with all their anti-maskers. We have to think about, Commerce as well or businesses make money off all the visitors to come here and we cannot exclude certain races from feeling comfortable or wanting to come to our city and spend money.

I won't feel happy or satisfied with just another apology, or another plaque, or art it's not enough. And I don't know where the money comes from if it comes from Los Angeles county or a mix of Los Angeles county and Manhattan Beach but I believe the Bruce's and all the other black families who were forced out of Manhattan Beach should be compensated for the difference of what they were paid and what they asked for which was probably fair. That said it needs to be confirmed and assessed and then brought today's value with inflation along with some damages within reason.

With out anything like what I suggested this will always be an issue. And we will look like a racist town who doesn't care about equity and inclusion.

A lot of education is needed from children through to our elders, they don't even understand their words fall into the white privilege category.

My two cents, and I don't know what Allison said but I'm hoping that the people of color on the TF get a huge voice more than others because they understand most what these families experienced

Thank you  
Shereen Lavi

--

Best Wishes,  
Shereen Rayan Lavi



## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Alissa Marquis <alissamarquis@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 2:43 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Public comment March 3, 2021

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I am so excited to see the final report of the Bruce's Beach Task Force! You all have brought such wonderful energy to the work, along with your amazing gifts and talents. I along with so many of us in MB thank you from the bottom of our hearts for your commitment and love for our City.

In watching the meetings, I'm aware of the conflict that arose around the appointments to the Arts in Public Places. It saddened me to see this escalate to the degree that it did and I wish the Co-Chairs had given you the opportunity to discuss it in the moment. The result was that one member was removed from her Committee assignments and felt silenced, and the grievance has been aired in the public square in a back-and-forth of letters between her and the Co-Chairs.

Ultimately I fear the voices of those of you who felt wronged have not been heard (at least three of you as far as I can tell).

As yet, I have not seen a good faith effort by the Co-Chairs to heal this conflict. To my mind it is their responsibility to moderate the discussion and make sure all voices are heard.

Would the Co-Chairs consider fitting such a discussion into the agenda tonight or at the next meeting?

Let the group decide, if they're comfortable with it, whether to reinstate the member's committee assignments and bring her back fully into the group.

Cordially,

Alissa Marquis



## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Isabella Kinkelaar <isbellakinkelaar@yahoo.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 2:51 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Support for Bruce Family

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello my name is Isabella Kinkelaar and I currently live in Hermosa Beach and have been a South Bay Resident my entire life.

I am calling on the City of Manhattan Beach to publicly apologize to the Bruce family for their racist past, pay restitution to the Bruce family, and reinstate Allison Hales' subcommittee assignments.

These beaches are for everyone and no one should feel excluded or uncomfortable from enjoying them.

Thank you,  
Isabella K

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Ian Schiffer <ischiffer94@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 2:58 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Taskforce Meeting

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

To whom it may concern on Bruce's Beach taskforce,

The Bruce family should be consulted in the taskforce and the city council should go far beyond making symbolic changes to instead make substantive remedies. The Bruce family has clearly stated that they want restoration and restitution. Manhattan Beach has a second chance to make repair for the harm that has been done to the Bruce family and Black residents of Manhattan Beach.

I demand that Manhattan Beach pay restitution, return the land to the Bruce's and issue a public apology to the family.

Thank you,  
Ian Schiffer

--

Ian Sam Schiffer

[Affirming Gender Pronouns](#): he/him/his

[Text Defend to 90975](#)

“Another world is not only possible, she is on her way. On a quiet day, I can hear her breathing.” - Arundhati Roy

*All land claimed by the 'united states' is Indigenous land. I'm a guest/[kuuyam](#) on*

*traditional, unceded Tongva/Gabrielino land. You can learn whose land you are on here: <https://native-land.ca/>*

Thank you for your patience in my response. If you need to reach me sooner than I respond, connect with me at

[REDACTED]

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Stefan Miller <smiller@employmentlawsolutionsgroup.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 3:18 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach

**Importance:** High

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear Manhattan Beach City Council Members,

I am writing to express my concerns about the City's long history of racism relating to Bruce's Beach – from the City's tacit approval of intimidation and threats by the KKK in the 1920s against the Bruces and other Black members of the Los Angeles area community, to the forced taking of the property from Charles and Willa Bruce in 1924, to ignoring and continually whitewashing the true history of what happened in our beloved beachside community with regard to Bruce's Beach. It is long past time for the City to meaningfully accept responsibility for its actions and inactions over the years, to issue a heartfelt, meaningful, and direct apology to the descendants to the Bruces and other Black members of the Los Angeles area community adversely impacted by the City's conduct, and to meaningfully educate current residents of the South Bay about what really transpired. The City's past conduct not only was racist and discriminatory but also deprived Charles and Willa Bruce and their descendants from amassing generational wealth associated with property ownership in a thriving and popular beachside community. Such conduct cannot stand.

And while each of the above-described actions are necessary to accept responsibility and begin to heal our community, much more can and must be done. LA County Supervisor, Janice Hahn, has called for consideration of having the portion of the property that is owned by LA County to be repurposed to tell the true story of Bruce's Beach and even returning the property to the descendants of Charles and Willa Bruce. The City can and must follow the lead of Supervisor Hahn and the City of Los Angeles by actively working to bring about these changes in relation to the remaining portion of the property still controlled by the City. And if the City is unwilling to return the land to the descendants of the Bruces, at the very least, the City should join with the City of Los Angeles in erecting a substantial educational outpost on the site to tell the true history of Bruce's Beach and allow the descendants of the Bruces to use the property to begin replacing the generational wealth opportunities that were taken from them by the City. In so doing, the City should commit to working directly and collaboratively with the descendants of the Bruces to ensure their voices are heard and properly amplified.

By doing so, the City can finally help put an end to this long and sad chapter in the City's history. On the other hand, if the City Council considers anything less than the rational and morally correct actions under consideration by the Los Angeles Board of Supervisors or if the City is unwilling to work collaboratively with the descendants of the Bruces towards a meaningful resolution, the City's sad legacy will only continue.

The current City Council has the opportunity not only to finally right a horrible wrong and remove a deep and longstanding stain on our community but also to become part of the solution going forward. I understand that building consensus around some of the options being discussed will not be easy, but that's what leadership and being a leader is all about. As members of the Manhattan Beach City Council, each of you asked the citizens of this community for your vote and to give you the opportunity to lead. The ball is now in your court and history is watching. What will your legacy be?

Thank you for your time and consideration.



## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Vantina Bruce <vantinab@outlook.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 3:21 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] #JusticeforBrucesBeach

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

To whom this may concern,

My name is Vantina Bruce and I support justiceforbrucebeach. I ask that my comment be included in today's meeting.

A crime was committed against Charles & Willa Bruce in 1912 along with other indigenous copper colored American families who purchased property, resided, and made a living in Manhattan Beach community providing a needed service to the public.

Reading and watching the cover up of criminal acts against the Bruce's and the continued injustices faced by Charles & Willa's descendants is disheartening and continue to be criminal to say the least.

I stand in solidarity with the Bruce's in demanding Manhattan Beach pay restitution to the Bruce's descendants, Anthony Bruce, a fair restitution which should not be less than the 75 million, and should greatly exceed this amount just for lost revenue alone! Reinstate Allison Hales subcommittee assignments. Give the Bruce's descendants, the true heirs, the birth right stolen from them; Give the land back! Replace the lying words on the monument in the park, with an inscription that tells the truth and heals the land.

Thank you.

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Luc Kleiner <luckleiner@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 3:25 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Re: Written public comment submission by MB resident Luc Kleiner

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please include my comment in tonight's meeting. Thank you.

On Wed, Mar 3, 2021 at 2:10 PM Luc Kleiner <[luckleiner@gmail.com](mailto:luckleiner@gmail.com)> wrote:  
Greetings Task force,

Please submit my comment for the record:

The city of Manhattan Beach, of which I am a life-long resident, should issue a public apology to the descendants of Charles and Willa Bruce, founding community members of color who were forced off of their shoreline properties by the city itself using "legal" means to carry out racist ends. The city should right this wrong by paying restitution to the Bruce family, whose opportunity for prosperity in this community was shattered by the racist, systematic mechanisms of oppression executed by the city against these founding residents of color. Finally, in order to preserve a pluralistic, diverse, and broad scope of opinions and perspectives, I urge the task force to honor the inclusion of the voice of Allison Hales.

Thank you.

— Luc Kleiner

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Maria Crisanta Castro Naoe <crisa.castro@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 1:51 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] I don't want to be disappointed

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello Taskforce.

I understand there is so much context and commentary, but my comments are simple:

Please do the right thing for the Bruce family.

I love this town- our schools, my church here, our general community...and do not want to be disappointed by excuses.

Sincerely,  
Crisa Castro-Naoe

## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Maxwell Holland <maxwellpholland@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 3:59 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Demand for City Council Resolution for Public Apology and Acknowledgement

**CAUTION:** This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear Bruce's Beach Task Force,

I recently heard that the Task Force does not consider a public resolution with City Council acknowledging racial exclusion in Manhattan Beach as a priority for their work. However, this acknowledgement is the very beginning of a reconciling process with the Bruce family and our local Black community. As Manhattan Beach public officers, you must also know of the recent events in which a local Black surfer was harassed by a public pier. Clearly, anti-Black sentiment is embedded in the history and culture of Manhattan Beach and this needs to be addressed promptly and publicly. As a white person and native of the South Bay area, I stand with the Bruce family and my Black neighbors now to implore you make this acknowledgement your first priority as a task force. As long as you shirk this responsibility, our calls for your accountability will surely become more fervent.

**Now** is the time to create reconciliation and belonging in this community, not to protect a history of racism and exclusion. I urge you all to make this your first commitment to the Bruce's Beach Task Force. If I can provide any assistance to the Task Force, please feel free to reach out to me.

Sincerely,

### Maxwell Holland

pronouns: he/him  
Chair, Information Studies Student Governing Board  
Master of Library and Information Sciences | 2021  
University of California Los Angeles



## Alexandria Latragna

---

**From:** Alexis Cormier <alexismcormier@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 3, 2021 3:59 PM  
**To:** Bruces Beach Task Force  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Allison Hale

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I have heard (on separate occasions) and read in a recent article about the attempts to silence Ms. Hale and exclude her from the Bruce beach project for voicing her concern about the artwork project and the lack of the projects BLACK Representation. As an Black woman this really concerns me because she has put her heart and soul into this task force and speaks on behalf of many of us that reside and visit the the South Bay.

I am unable to attend tonight's meeting but I am hope you all come to a better resolution and find a more agreeable and inclusive way to let black voices be heard.

Sincerely,

Alexis Cormiér