

Martha Alvarez

From: S M <talewinds@yahoo.com>
Sent: Thursday, March 18, 2021 3:53 AM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Adding a note: Bruce's Beach, and racism in MB

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear Dedicated Councilmembers -

I watched Tuesday's meeting with great interest, and no small pride, as you handled the issue of Bruce's Beach kindly and honorably. I would have supported all five suggestions, and more besides.

I sent this first to Steve Napolitano and Hildy Stern, and then found your general email. Better late than never, I hope!

I wrote the following in response to comments on Next-Door regarding your brave and thorough discussion of the Bruce's Beach issue.

—
Alas, racism has indeed been alive and well in Manhattan Beach for decades upon decades. I lived here for 40 years and experienced it personally.

In the 70s and 80s, our Manhattan Beach house, as well as that of our neighbors, was often bombarded by flyers from the KKK informing our neighbors of the evils of Blacks and Jews. As a Jewish 9-year old, I was shocked to learn that we supposedly drank the blood of Christians. 😊

Anonymous callers would threaten to abduct me from school if my parents (Bev and Steve), who were involved in many social and political causes, attended meetings on freedom and equality. 😊 All sorts of things were done to our house, the walkway and the sidewalk in front of it. Kids and adults made trouble for me (yes, adults!) on my way to and from school daily, fighting with me, threatening me, and calling me names. 😊 We made reports, took pictures of the damage and graffiti and gave them to the police station.

Our trouble abated temporarily when a Black family with a girl my age moved into a house on the corner. Someone burned a cross on their lawn. The family left soon after. A Korean family lived a couple of houses farther up the street, but apparently the KKK mainly had it in for the Blacks and the Jews at that time.

In elementary school, the principal admonished me, saying, "A nice Jewish girl shouldn't swear," after I hurled epithets at a boy who had kicked me in the chest and called me a "kike." A high school math teacher infamously gave a test on Martin Luther King Jr. Day, saying, "I refuse to celebrate the birthday of my enemies." (Neither I nor my friends showed up to the otherwise closed school for the test.) A social studies teacher asked me to explain keeping kosher to the class. "What if someone threatened your life if you didn't eat pork?" she asked. I answered that I would eat it, since our religion believes life is sacred. She barked, "Hypocrite!" at me in front of the class. I was a freshman in high school.

Years later, as an adult, I house sat when my parents traveled. I returned one evening to find that our walkway had once again been gifted with racist and anti-Semitic commentary. I took pictures, but this time, I brought the photos to the police station myself, to add to our file of evidence. Imagine my surprise when the policeman told

me that no such file existed, either by name or address. Interesting how 30 years of racism and anti-Semitism evidence could have “disappeared.” Just like that.

In the 90s, I lived at home during graduate school. My boyfriend worked as a cop at the school where I was teaching. We felt hounded by Manhattan Beach police whenever we were in the car. My boyfriend might be a policeman, he was also Black, and was made to feel VERY unwelcome in the area. They would even move us along when we were parked in front of my own house. They would ask me, the passenger, if everything was OK, ignoring my boyfriend entirely (even though he had a police KMA number on his license plate).

Happily, in the 70s, my family had been one of eight families who joined together to create a synagogue, to help support and comfort other Jewish folk, and to support the greater MB community. That synagogue is now Congregation Tikvat Jacob Beth Torah. It was built on social action and fighting negativity with positivity. (It’s pretty great.)

Just wanted to share this because as you know, some are blissfully unaware of the hidden history of our oh-so-never-racist beach city. I guess I’m glad if they’re unaware. I’m glad this has never happened to them.

I hope you’ve never been threatened, followed, or made uncomfortable... in your own home, school, yard, or streets. But if you had, you would want to know when your City had finally woken up and decided to admit to being imperfect, and commit to being better.

If we forget the past, we die. When we improve, we thrive.

“All it takes for evil to prosper is for Good men to do nothing.” -John Stuart Mill, 1867

—

I appreciate your time and dedication!

Feel free to email, call or text to respond. I’m sorry I did not get this to you earlier.

Respectfully,

Stacey Abigail Morse
Teacher, Tutor, Editrix and Cantorial Soloist
Redondo Beach, CA and *virtually Everywhere!*
310-963-7664

“He has a right to criticize, who has a heart to help.” -Abraham Lincoln
Everyone has a challenge, and
EVERYONE has a super power.

Martha Alvarez

From: Reggie Wong <reggie.dsa.la@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 6:10 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fwd: item J-12

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Reggie Wong <reggie.dsa.la@gmail.com>

Date: Tue, Mar 16, 2021 at 4:33 PM

Subject: item J-12

To: <snapolitano@citymb.info>, <rmontgomery@citymb.info>, <jfranklin@citymb.info>, <hstern@citymb.info>, <shadley@citymb.info>

To the City Council:

I support following the Bruce's Beach task force recommendation and give them a sincere apology to the Bruce family, the original owners of the land. Keep the task force around because this issue isn't going away anytime soon.

Reinstate Allison Hales to her subcommittee positions. Stop silencing women of color and stop listening to all the gaslighting. If you're against seeking racial justice yet keep claiming you aren't racist then guess what? You are racist. Seriously how much of Manhattan Beach has not been stolen from people of color?

Let me remind you the New York Times, LA Times and other major publications are covering this issue so the world is watching Manhattan Beach.

Cheers,

Reggie

Martha Alvarez

From: Nana Tatiboit <nanatatiboit@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 6:09 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Public Comments - Bruce's Beach Task Force Recommendation of Apology to the Bruce Family

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I would like to request that the members of the City Council vote YES for the Bruce's Beach Task Force Recommendation of Apology to the Bruce Family. This is a vital step in moving forward in making amends in this matter.

Thank you.

Martha Alvarez

From: Madhu Chatwani <mchatwani@outlook.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:56 PM
To: City Clerk
Cc: Madhu Chatwani
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear City Council,

I am writing in support of the recommendations put forth by the BBTF. By doing the right thing, this city is proving that we are not racist. We must do better and work towards a more just and inclusive community – this is our opportunity to take a step in the right direction!

Sincerely,
Madhu Chatwani

Martha Alvarez

From: Stephanie Neal <stephanie.neal123@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:40 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force- Support

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello,

I apologize I missed the public comment period by a few minutes but I believe this is a very important issue that I must express my support. The Task Force's effort to educate fellow Manhattan Beach citizens is a noble undertaking. It should not be viewed as shameful to drag one's skeletons from the closet but rather a sign of growth. It does not make us racist now to have a racist past. Not allowing the Task Force to continue to advocate for making Manhattan Beach a more welcoming place for all would be a detriment to all.

Thank you for your time,
Stephanie Neal
1560 5th St

Martha Alvarez

From: Laura Santos <laura.santos@earthlink.net>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 11:36 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Thank you

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Mayor and Council,
Thank you for demonstrating wisdom regarding the task force issue.

Martha Alvarez

From: GWPOP Talk <gwpopstalk@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 9:48 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Bruce's Beach

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear Council Members,

I do not know how last eve's City Council meeting went as my computer was disabled and I could not log in. Having said that, I was quite prepared to speak forth on the outstanding character and solid humanity that has thrived in the South Bay for a good century and more. It pained me deeply to be on a mission yesterday to disconnect a phone line that has not been used for over a year and while waiting to be served at the phone store I sat in the car and a NPR program was running a story on our beautiful little beach town. It was hard to listen to as there was rampant folk lore being touted and really no hard facts in place. It is shameful grandstanding journalism that surprised me from a nonprofit radio station that purports to have integrity and fact based reporting.

Still haven't discovered the end results of last night's meetings and I just hope it ended well with a basic cease and let rest. The TF has made its review and the facts are the property in question is owned by LA County and reversal of public domain is a rare bird indeed. Most of all I want to say how lucky we all are to live here and to live here is to show respect for how long and hard people have worked to get here, for the most part. I know there are some newcomers and they are welcome, yet do not dictate how this City runs now or certainly not weigh in on "how things were a 100 years ago.

This was a cut and dried piece of history. Fair price accepted. Property sold. This has been pickled into a sour grape punch that has given everyone a stomach. Manhattan Beach has nothing to apologize for and nothing needs to be further discussed or commissioned from the City. The only real folks that would be benefiting from this debacle is the attorneys and distant relatives of a family that once owned property in Manhattan Beach. The Bruce Family Sold it. Were offered to buy elsewhere in the City and declined. Many of the families that once live in that 30 lot section of the City did relocate here and many are still here.

Okay, I have said enough. I want you all to know, I know and many citizens of Manhattan Beach know, this has not been an easy road to walk yet we must serve the common good of 35,000 residents that need protecting, clean streets, parks and beaches and schools to be opened safely. Good job to all that serve this City. This has been a challenging start to the new year. Together we will prevail in seeing our City continue to be a beacon of light in human kindness, respect and good health.

Cheers,

Amanda Hunter

1230 6th Street
Manhattan Beach, CA 90266
GWPOP, INC

[EMAIL](#) | [GWPOP.org](#) | [FACEBOOK](#) | [INSTAGRAM](#)

GWPOP, INC is a non profit tax exempt 501(c)3 corporation

On Thu, Mar 11, 2021 at 3:32 PM GWPOP Talk <gwpopstalk@gmail.com> wrote:

Hello City Council Members:

No more delay tactics. The BBTF report should be heard on 3/16/21 and considered final.

The "History Report" is not accurate. We are not a racist community and we do not need a Social Justice Commission.

The facts are, the 2 lot property in question was sold at a fair market value along with 28 other lots, owned by both white and black persons. The Bruce's agreed to sell and were fairly compensated for their property. If the Bruce's wanted to continue living in MB they could have bought another property in MB. They chose not to do so.

We do not need a Declaration of Apology because there is nothing to apologize for now and certainly not for a fair priced property sale 100 years ago that was readily agreed to by the Bruce family.

This is a waste of the City's taxpayers dollars, council time and good energy of it's citizens. MB has always been a friendly city and still is a great place to live no matter you skin color, religious beliefs or sexual preference. We are a diversified and tolerant little beach city, let's go forward, not backward in time.

Thank you and good luck bringing this challenging attack on the character of our citizens to a swift halt. If you want a good life and want to live in this beach city, you've got to work for it, just like everyone else. I think we all know that and it's time to stand up for our rights.

Sincerely,
Amanda Hunter
1230 6th Street
Manhattan Beach, CA 90266

[EMAIL](#) | [GWPOP.org](#) | [FACEBOOK](#) | [INSTAGRAM](#)

GWPOP, INC is a non profit tax exempt 501(c)3 corporation

Martha Alvarez

From: sheri ungar <sheriungar@hotmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 9:25 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Kids need to return to school

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear Madam Mayor and Honorable Members of the City Council, I am writing to urge you to do everything in your power to urge the School Board and MBUSD to allow our students to return to school as soon as possible and to the fullest extent possible. Our kids are missing out on so much and instead are being forced to watch electronic screens all day. While our fantastic teachers are working hard and doing their best to teach remotely, it is not even close to the same experience. I know that the City Council does not have jurisdiction over MBUSD, however, I would just like to implore you to do anything within your power to influence the MBUSD to immediately make plans to have all of our kids to return to school. Other districts all over the country have managed to do this all year. Our district is at least as capable as these other districts and there is no reason our district and community should not be able to manage this. Thank you very much for your service to our great community.

Best regards,
Sheri Ungar

Sent from my iPad

Martha Alvarez

From: Scott C. Chambers <mbchambers4@roadrunner.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 9:01 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] BBTF

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I want to thank the city council for doing what is right. You will be known as being on the right side of history. And as a resident who loves this city!

Regards,
Scott C. Chambers

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

Martha Alvarez

From: Stephanie Monash <smonash@hotmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 6:49 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: RE: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach (revisited)

Thank you very much to all who replied to me and for correcting my erroneous figure of 500K. 350K is still a lot of money. I am not at all versed in the nuance of municipal budgeting. I was just hoping that we could do something meaningful without prostrating ourselves before political opportunists and profiteers.

To Councilman Napolitano, I would like to provide my interpretation of context: I am the granddaughter of a concentration camp internee (who was not Jewish but spoke out publicly against the Reich) and the daughter of someone blacklisted during the McCarthy Era. To me, injustice is legion and authority should always be questioned and held to account. Micro-focus on one particular aspect of who's getting screwed over at a particular point in time seems to distract from the bigger picture.

But that's just my prism and perspective. Thank you for your service to the community and a good evening to all.

Stephanie

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

From: [Joe Franklin](#)
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 3:28 PM
To: [Stephanie Monash](#)
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach (revisited)

Thanks, Stephanie. Good points.

Joe Franklin
Councilmember, City of Manhattan Beach
310-200-8018 Call or Text
jfranklin@citymb.info

JOE FRANKLIN
COUNCILMEMBER



(310) 200-8018
jfranklin@citymb.info

CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH 1400 Highland Avenue Manhattan Beach, CA 90266
Office Hours: M-Th 7:30 AM-5:30 PM | Fridays 7:30 AM-4:30 PM | Not Applicable to Public Safety
[Reach Manhattan Beach](#) Here for you 24/7, use our click and fix it app
Download the mobile app now



On Mar 17, 2021, at 10:31 AM, Stephanie Monash <smonash@hotmail.com> wrote:

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Good morning Councilmembers,

Long night, huh? Despite the riveting subject matter, I couldn't manage to stay awake and focused for the entire CC discussion but was heartened to hear that (for the first round of statements from the dais at least) most of you appeared headed in a reasonable direction. I was especially appreciative of Mayor Hadley's inclusion of the horrific hostile governmental actions taken against a Japanese family during the 1940's.

It's important for context to understand that the Bruce's were hardly alone in being treated unjustly. In fact, as far as eminent domain compensation goes, they were dealt with far more generously than the Browns (a White family that owned the substantial acreage that is now Polliwog Park). The Browns received only about 1/3 of the appraised value of their property; the Bruces fared much better. I don't think we'll be hearing much about the Browns but would expect you all to be familiar or acquaint yourself with their story as well.

The primary reason that I am contacting you is because it's hard to understand how allocating 500K for an "art installation" on Bruce's Beach is an optimal use of funds for the intended purpose of promoting inclusivity. It will probably lead to more bickering, as beauty is in the eye of the beholder and apparently many don't see eye-to-eye these days. Moreover, I can't see how actually does anything to help the people you aspire to assist.

As some of you have noted, Manhattan Beach is not a racist community; it's a relatively rich community. Our putative bars to diversity are not racial, they're economic. If you're going to invest a substantial sum of money in something to uplift an underserved segment of society, why not do something meaningful that will help people rise? As someone who feels zero guilt but wants to see an upwardly mobile citizenry of all races and believes a helping hand is far better than a hand-out, I'd like to suggest considering applying that money towards scholarships for (any minority) students of merit instead.

If I have missed or misinterpreted something here, I hope you will enlighten me. Submitted for your consideration... .

Stephanie Monash

Manhattan Beach

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

Martha Alvarez

From: denise berger <dberger710@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 5:53 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Bruce's Beach

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I would like to encourage you all to listen to this wonderful podcast by Brene Brown, a leader in leadership.

https://open.spotify.com/episode/7IZHKzX1opwipOzG45i9R7?si=qb6WUdDXSl-jd_Pfi_-OkQ&context=spotify%3Ashow%3A3oEPsPKDhPVoNNL7pH5db6

It is so good!

D Berger

On Mar 17, 2021, at 4:48 PM, denise berger <dberger710@gmail.com> wrote:

Well, that was a disappointing outcome for all those that spoke up and are on an anti-racist journey.

Please please please consider voting FOR an apology. It is the least we can do. And as you heard last night, if people are NOT racist, then why fear giving an apology....

Thank you for your consideration.

On Mon, Mar 15, 2021 at 10:34 AM denise berger <dberger710@gmail.com> wrote:

Hello City Council. I feel (yet again) it is important to speak out for human dignity, conscious / intentional / inclusive leadership, and decency. I have heard that there are many people in our town who oppose the task force, its findings, and any suggestion of racism in our history (and present, evidently). I saw the ad.

Unfortunately, many of these oppositional people are narrow-minded, unevolved, self-centered, ethnocentric, unaware of their being in the world, lacking in social and cultural intelligence, but they have a loud voice. And they know how to organize.... And they are entitled... at least to their opinions. So, they get noticed and they get heard. But listening to them only keeps us back in time and unprogressive, to say the least. They are advocating to keep the town the same, keep the same norms, lose us in time. I can't even blame them. They simply don't know what they don't know.

Instead, it is important to me and others that you all know that there are plenty of people in our community who care about the ancestral damage we did to people - as a town - as an organization - as a system - and appreciate the task force work. We hope we will see the results of the research, and I hope your findings lead us all to an amenable path forward.... a path that creates a flourishing community FOR ALL.

Keep steadfast. Change is not easy and communities can not afford to cater to the laggards. We are heading toward a tipping point in our society and in the world. Being a town of popularity, I'm pretty sure we want to be in the majority and not resistant to the inevitable change afoot. Personally, I'm excited looking ahead to a world where diverse talents are honored, people respect their neighbors, kindness and common courtesy prevail, and opportunities exist for ALL people to rise with this wave.

Lastly, I want to add what I hope this town is NOT: people stopping other people in the street to berate them for the work they do. I am hoping that it was an anomaly - and a rotten apple, amongst sweet fruit - that stopped council member, Hildy Stern, to inform her that she is an embarrassment to the city. It would be great if the city publicly spoke up for Hildy, diversity, tolerance, acceptance and belonging. Whoever that person is has a great deal of growth potential, and that growth begins with incentives in the system to see a different path than the one filled with hate and stress.

May we all rise to a better occasion and pull alongside us the majority and eventually those resisting change and realize a community with opening hearts and minds for generations to come.

--

Denise Berger

--

Denise Berger

Martha Alvarez

From: Jane Franklin <janehomemail@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 5:33 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce Beach

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please reject appendix 2 and 5. We need to move forward.

Martha Alvarez

From: denise berger <dberger710@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 4:48 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Bruce's Beach

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Well, that was a disappointing outcome for all those that spoke up and are on an anti-racist journey. Please please please consider voting FOR an apology. It is the least we can do. And as you heard last night, if people are NOT racist, then why fear giving an apology....

Thank you for your consideration.

On Mon, Mar 15, 2021 at 10:34 AM denise berger <dberger710@gmail.com> wrote:

Hello City Council. I feel (yet again) it is important to speak out for human dignity, conscious / intentional / inclusive leadership, and decency. I have heard that there are many people in our town who oppose the task force, its findings, and any suggestion of racism in our history (and present, evidently). I saw the ad.

Unfortunately, many of these oppositional people are narrow-minded, unevolved, self-centered, ethnocentric, unaware of their being in the world, lacking in social and cultural intelligence, but they have a loud voice. And they know how to organize.... And they are entitled... at least to their opinions. So, they get noticed and they get heard. But listening to them only keeps us back in time and unprogressive, to say the least. They are advocating to keep the town the same, keep the same norms, lose us in time. I can't even blame them. They simply don't know what they don't know.

Instead, it is important to me and others that you all know that there are plenty of people in our community who care about the ancestral damage we did to people - as a town - as an organization - as a system - and appreciate the task force work. We hope we will see the results of the research, and I hope your findings lead us all to an amenable path forward.... a path that creates a flourishing community FOR ALL.

Keep steadfast. Change is not easy and communities can not afford to cater to the laggards. We are heading toward a tipping point in our society and in the world. Being a town of popularity, I'm pretty sure we want to be in the majority and not resistant to the inevitable change afoot. Personally, I'm excited looking ahead to a world where diverse talents are honored, people respect their neighbors, kindness and common courtesy prevail, and opportunities exist for ALL people to rise with this wave.

Lastly, I want to add what I hope this town is NOT: people stopping other people in the street to berate them for the work they do. I am hoping that it was an anomaly - and a rotten apple, amongst sweet fruit - that stopped council member, Hildy Stern, to inform her that she is an embarrassment to the city. It would be great if the city publicly spoke up for Hildy, diversity, tolerance, acceptance and belonging. Whoever that person is has a great deal of growth potential, and that growth begins with incentives in the system to see a different path than the one filled with hate and stress.

May we all rise to a better occasion and pull alongside us the majority and eventually those resisting change and realize a community with opening hearts and minds for generations to come.

--
Denise Berger

--
Denise Berger

Martha Alvarez

From: Brad Helms <bradley_helms@mac.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 4:33 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] BBTF

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I am a voter and a tax payer in MB. I have read the BBTF's report and suggestions - all 49 pages - and I can support nothing that the BBTF has proposed. It is clear that the task force approached its mandate from a very specific political and sociological viewpoint, and the result is a document that has simply lost the plot. The task force should be immediately disbanded, it's recommendations rejected, and the council - who will face the voters at the next election - should take input from the entire community and do something appropriate and inspirational at Bruce's Beach. And that should be the end of it.

Martha Alvarez

From: Daniel Lambert <drlambert76@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 4:19 PM
To: List - City Council

Please reject appendix 2 (apology) and appendix 5 (making the task force permanent) and disband the task force.

Sent from my iPhone

Martha Alvarez

From: Sylvia Simmons <sylviahawkdog@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 3:59 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fwd: How Racism Ruined Black Santa Monica: LAist

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Maybe what Santa Monica has done could help Manhattan Beach with the Bruce's Beach situation

Sent from my iPad

Begin forwarded message:

From: Sylvia Simmons <sylviahawkdog@gmail.com>
Date: March 17, 2021 at 11:58:16 AM PDT
To: sylviahawkdog@gmail.com
Subject: **How Racism Ruined Black Santa Monica: LAist**

https://laist.com/2020/12/23/black_santa_monica_history_vintage_los_angeles.php

Sent from my iPad

Martha Alvarez

From: Juliet Abelson <juliet@bhhsdp.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 2:58 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce Beach Commission

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please disband the BB task force immediately after it has accomplished the task for which it was formed. No additional powers were authorized, period

Sent via the Samsung Galaxy S8+, an AT&T 5G Evolution capable smartphone
Get [Outlook for Android](#)

Martha Alvarez

From: lisa mcdannold <lcmcdannold@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 1:58 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL]

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

you should not be posting crap about bruce's beach on next-door...it is political in my opinion

Martha Alvarez

From: Nadine Jackson <nadinejjackson54@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 11:41 AM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Bruce's beach task force recommendations

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear MB City Council,

I am saddened that the task force is ending. I keep asking myself if 2021 isn't the time for a task force/commission on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion - WHEN is. I feel like the bullies won on this. Please find a way going forward to help the city make an effort to be better- please don't give up!!

I think you're still voting on the apology today. I still support the apology!
I feel the world is watching.

Thank you for all your time and effort spent on this. It can't be easy to lead at a time of such division.

Sincerely,
Nadine Jackson

> On Mar 15, 2021, at 8:25 AM, Nadine Jackson <nadinejjackson54@gmail.com> wrote:
>
> MB City Council,
>
> I fully support task force recommendations and keeping task force on as advisory panel to City Council .
> I appreciate work done by task force
> and thought recommendations are
> a "no-brainer" - I am shocked this is so controversial! I think when
> you know you've done something wrong, apologize and make every effort
> to do better in the future.
>
> Thank you City Council and Task Force for your hard work on this!
>
> Nadine Jackson
>

Martha Alvarez

From: Stephanie Monash <smonash@hotmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 10:31 AM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach (revisited)

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Good morning Councilmembers,

Long night, huh? Despite the riveting subject matter, I couldn't manage to stay awake and focused for the entire CC discussion but was heartened to hear that (for the first round of statements from the dais at least) most of you appeared headed in a reasonable direction. I was especially appreciative of Mayor Hadley's inclusion of the horrific hostile governmental actions taken against a Japanese family during the 1940's.

It's important for context to understand that the Bruce's were hardly alone in being treated unjustly. In fact, as far as eminent domain compensation goes, they were dealt with far more generously than the Browns (a White family that owned the substantial acreage that is now Polliwog Park). The Browns received only about 1/3 of the appraised value of their property; the Bruces fared much better. I don't think we'll be hearing much about the Browns but would expect you all to be familiar or acquaint yourself with their story as well.

The primary reason that I am contacting you is because it's hard to understand how allocating 500K for an "art installation" on Bruce's Beach is an optimal use of funds for the intended purpose of promoting inclusivity. It will probably lead to more bickering, as beauty is in the eye of the beholder and apparently many don't see eye-to-eye these days. Moreover, I can't see how actually does anything to help the people you aspire to assist.

As some of you have noted, Manhattan Beach is not a racist community; it's a relatively rich community. Our putative bars to diversity are not racial, they're economic. If you're going to invest a substantial sum of money in something to uplift an underserved segment of society, why not do something meaningful that will help people rise? As someone who feels zero guilt but wants to see an upwardly mobile citizenry of all races and believes a helping hand is far better than a hand-out, I'd like to suggest considering applying that money towards scholarships for (any minority) students of merit instead.

If I have missed or misinterpreted something here, I hope you will enlighten me. Submitted for your consideration... .

Stephanie Monash

Manhattan Beach

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

Martha Alvarez

From: Lila Anderson <lila.margaret.anderson@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 10:06 AM
To: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force - Report and Res. of Apology

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello,

I'm writing in support of the Bruce's Beach Task Force's Report and Resolution of Apology.

Sincerely,

Lila

Martha Alvarez

From: The U Family <theugroup@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 5:49 AM
To: List - City Council; Jill Lamkin
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Sorry guys I tried to multi-task by copying and pasting on the cell with my earlier email. I know it's late but I wanted to share. This could have obviously been much longer

My name is John Uriostegui, I have been a resident of Hermosa Beach and Manhattan Beach for over 25 years. My 23 and me is very consistent with what my family has said my background is. I am 18% American Indian, 24% Mexican and 19% Spanish. I think it is safe to say black, white, asians, catholics, jewish faith and Muslims, and all "Americans" took all of California, Manhattan beach included from the Mexicans and American Indians. It is absolutely insane to think we should pick one moment in time to try and apologize for something that might or might not have happened 100 years ago to one particular skin color person or family. It is even more insane too that we would spend hours of time and money on this subject, knowing that racism does not exist in this community.

Over the past 25 years I have been on the Montessori of Manhattan Beach board and was president for 4 years. I have been an AYSO commissioner, coach and ref. I have been on the board and coached for both Hermosa Youth Basketball and Manhattan Beach Youth Basketball. I have been involved with the city and BCS helping to organize field space, and I coached and helped with the fields. I have been involved with swim and waterpolo programs, tee ball and softball, indoor and outdoor volleyball clubs and camps. I have been a financial advisor for 30 years the last 4 have been with BankAmerica/ Merrill Lynch. In this capacity I have helped hundreds of local families and businesses. In the past 25 years with every single one of these organizations I have never seen or heard and racial issues or tension. I deal with people's kids and their money and I have seen so many verbal and physical disagreements I can't even count and still never a racial issue.

It is amazing to me that some of your board members complain about racial issues. Allison Hales wants justice but she has only been in town 2 years and I have yet to see her do anything for the city. I don't see her on any boards or any philanthropic goals. There was another lady last week complaining about the police stopping her friend because of their skin color. Have any of these board members met our police department? I have personally bought dinner and lunch for the whole police force and I can tell you first hand knowledge, they are a diverse group of men and women that love and protect our city. Our chief of police has black skin but he doesn't have the job because of his skin color, he has the position because he's good at it and he earned it.

Martha Alvarez

From: bvbatbeach@aol.com
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 12:03 AM
To: List - City Council; City Manager
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: BBTF Report and March 16, 2021 City Council Agenda Item 12

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Thank you for listening to your constituents, and responding appropriately. With the exception of Hildy (who is certainly entitled to her own opinion), you are hearing your constituents - we greatly appreciate it.

Bill von Behren

-----Original Message-----

From: bvbatbeach@aol.com
To: CityCouncil@citymb.info <CityCouncil@citymb.info> <CityCouncil@citymb.info>; cm@citymb.info <cm@citymb.info>
Sent: Sun, Mar 14, 2021 2:30 pm
Subject: BBTF Report and March 16, 2021 City Council Agenda Item 12

Dear Council Members,

I have read the Bruce's Beach Task Force's ("BBTF") report and recommendations. While I appreciate the efforts of the BBTF on this topic, I believe that it has essentially ignored the directions of the City Council regarding its charges and role surrounding this matter.

First, I do not believe it is the role of the BBTF to judge our community and imply that Manhattan Beach is a racist community. I disagree with any such suggestion. While there are certainly racist individuals in our community, as there are in every community, that does not mean that our city as a whole is racist. In fact, I believe that as a community, Manhattan Beach is an inclusive and understanding city and its residents are generally open minded and tolerant of all races and religions. So I take offense to any suggestion by the BBTF that the residents of Manhattan Beach, as a whole, are racists. And I believe that misguided premise has created a circumstance in which many of the so called BBTF "findings" are nothing more than unsupportable opinions of a few individuals, who are not well informed or in a position to judge our community as a whole. More importantly, with the exception of the BBTF co-chairs, none of the task force members have been elected by the residents of Manhattan Beach and have no right to speak on behalf of our city.

Second, the BBTF's suggestion that it remain an active group with the power to advise and assist our city employees and leaders in formulating future policy as to any city issue is an improper "power grab". The BBTF has been charged with a very limited purpose. How dare it attempt to perpetuate its role in matters for which it was not been authorized to act or even express unwanted opinions. Again, most members of this task force are not elected officials and they should have no right or role in speaking for our fine city.

Third, please disregard any suggestion that the City of Manhattan Beach should apologize for any acts or conduct of some residents of this city who are long gone. What happened 90 years ago is not the responsibility of our current residents. And any apology in 2021 is a very slippery slope. I have no doubt that if there is any apology from the city at this time, that apology will be misinterpreted by others in the future, will be used as a sword against the city in a manner that may not even seem possible today, and will turn out to be a huge mistake. Just look at the well-intended efforts of the city back in 2006 to rename Bruce's Beach and erect a plaque to honor the Bruce family and the history of the park site. Today, those well intended efforts have been characterized as further examples of racism in Manhattan Beach, and the plaque has been labeled by some as a "monument to white supremacy". We may not be able to predict how future progressives or antagonists may characterize a 2021 apology from the city regarding Bruce's Beach, but I suggest you consider the possibilities of how any such apology may be spun or used against the city in the future, perhaps many years after you have completed your term in office. And please be mindful that any such apology is extremely dangerous, and will likely be used against the city in the future in ways that you probably cannot even imagine today. And any such apology may end up being a negative legacy for this Council if it chooses to surrender to social pressures from a few outspoken residents to placate the views of a significant minority of our residents. Please reject any suggestion that the city must apologize for conduct that occurred long before any of us were born.

Finally, on the subject of reparations, I want to remind the City that the payments made to the Bruce family in 1929 was a result of a negotiated settlement of an eminent domain action. The Bruce family agreed to accept \$14,500 to settle any and all disputes with the city, including all known and unknown claims, arising out of or relating to the acquisition of the Bruce family properties as a result of this settlement. There was no reservation of rights to pursue future claims. The agreement was a negotiated compromise, which the Bruce family, with the advice of counsel, freely agreed to. Why would any responsible city representative ignore this legally binding agreement, and voluntarily agree to even consider further consideration for this negotiated settlement? I am sure the City Attorney will agree that this settlement has been fully satisfied, and the Bruce family and their descendants have zero legal right to seek or obtain reparations or monetary damages. It seems to me that any agreement by the current City Council to pay further reparations to the Bruce family at this time, would not only be dangerous precedent but would likely be a gross violation of the Council Members' responsibilities to their constituents, the current residents of Manhattan Beach.

In closing, please consider the BBTF's recommendations regarding a new plaque at Bruce's Beach, perhaps an art piece for the premises and perhaps the acceptance of a historical record of events, if one can be verified as accurately depicting such events. And nothing more! And, please terminate the BBTF and thank its members for their efforts.

Perhaps our community will then be able to move on and continue to be a proud, welcoming and inclusive city that is focused on building a bright future for our residents and guests.

Respectfully Submitted,

Bill von Behren
MB Resident since 1980

Martha Alvarez

From: Mike Kurz <AttorneyKurz@Verizon.net>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 11:45 PM
To: List - City Council
Cc: attorneykurz@verizon.net
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce Beach Public comment by Mike Kurz

Dear Council members,

I was not able to be called before the break to give my two minute comment so I write it here.

Thank you for your consideration of all the comments tonight. I, my family and friends want a complete rejection of the racist recommendations of the committee, that means everyone of them. We see them as destructive and divisive. Their basis is untruth and is a tyrannical power grab.

What was glaring tonight was there were those who spoke from the facts of the case, and those who spoke from inflamed emotional reactions to a false narrative. The facts they completely ignored, that both black and white families were evicted through Eminent Domain legal proceedings are important. Due process was given to all equally and without regard to race. All were awarded the Fair Market Value of their property, some, at the time saying they were overpaid. No one likes Eminent domain whether it be for building an airport that never gets done, a freeway that was never funded, or to build a shopping center for multimillionaires. Every evictee laments his property is worth so much more (especially 100 years later). But Government has that power, and its legal so long as fair Market Value is given to the owners for their property. There is so little evidence to support the allegation that racism was the motivation. If that was so, how is it most of the 'victims' were white families?? I think present greed the real culprit here? But, I really loved and respected Mr. Bruce's Biblical wisdom and blessings tonight. Very loving.

The committee did a revisionist history here, with flimsy evidence to support and promote its class warfare solution. Beware, please, a compromise from the Council could be devastating. As an attorney representing a "victim" of Manhattan Beach police brutality against the City, the very first thing I would march in front of the jury is the City's declaration/resolution apologizing for its racism. The "in the past" part, trust me, will not be noticed by the jury.

I ask the council not to fall for the false logic presented tonight. It was best expressed by former Council woman Howorth. She argued if one denies racism then they are racist, in other words just admit your racism. Without any factual basis we are all racist, ESPECIALLY IF YOU DENY IT! By her own logic she admits she is a racist. Why listen to her, or anyone who promoted that fallacious argument since they admit their racism. It seems clear they want to apologize for their own racism, but don't have the guts to do it alone. They want to drag the whole city into their morass. Howorth's quoting Shakespeare was accurate for herself, and "me thinks the lady protest too much".

The citizens of Manhattan Beach do not admit racism now or in any KNOWN past. We, like the vast majority of citizens everywhere, embrace Dr Martin Luther King's vision of judging a man by the content of his character. That is, judging a man by his behavior, not his skin. I wonder what behavior preceded the antidotal stories of "racism" experienced by some of the participants tonight. Was it racism? or simply human

reaction to behaviors??? It probably depends on whether you look at life through racist lenses like Ms. Howorth, or look at the content of a man's behavior.

We have become a post racial society in the last 50 -60 years. We know the truth. Police officers do not patrol the street looking for blacks or minorities. That's absurd on its face. Nearly every recent case of alleged racism was either contrived, with so called victims staging the incidents, or were caused by criminality, not racism. Anecdotal evidence is inadmissible in in any serious proceeding and this is serious business for the people of Manhattan Beach. So, is there anything to apologize for?? I don't see it.

Lastly, we all must stop misusing the term "systemic", which means "in the system, by law, code, or other official power". "Systemic racism" was outlawed in 1964 by the Civil rights Act. After decades of litigation it does not exist now. Private discrimination does exist in a few places. I don't support any of it. But everyone has the individual right to like or dislike others, for whatever reason they want. They just have to suffer the consequences of their attitude, and they do. But that is a private affair and the city has no business intrusively controlling peoples private affairs.

Thank you all for your consideration. I hope this helps you reason through this conundrum. Apologize only for what **you** did wrong.

Respectfully yours

Michael Kurz

18th Street
Manhattan Beach

Martha Alvarez

From: Alison R. Jefferson <alisonrosejefferson@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 11:33 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Response to March 16, 2021 MB City Council Mtg., Item 11
Attachments: Jefferson_book-front-cover-small.png; ATT00001.htm;
ARJ-2CommentsMBMar162021.pdf; ATT00002.htm

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please see attached letter and other materials to comment section for the City Council meeting on March 16 for item 11.

Thank you,

alisonrosejefferson, m.h.c. | ph.d.

historian and more

alisonrosejefferson@gmail.com

323.931.6745 tel

213.509.2515 mobile tel

www.alisonrosejefferson.com

"Optimism is the faith that leads to achievement. Nothing can be done without hope and confidence." — *Helen Keller, author*

"Well behaved women seldom make history." — *Laura Thatcher Ulrich, historian*

5482 wilshire boulevard
number 199
los angeles, california 90036
U S A

323.931.6745 tel
323.933.2447 fax

alisonrosejefferson@gmail.com

alisonrosejefferson

March 16, 2021

To: Manhattan Beach City Council

Comments: Manhattan Beach City Council Meeting
Item 12: Bruce's Beach Task Force

In 2007 Manhattan Beach recognized its African American city pioneers with re-naming of the park area Bruce's Beach where their small resort community existed until it was razed by eminent domain proceedings due to anti-Black racism in the 1920s.

In 2020 it is wonderful to see that the City of Manhattan Beach citizens as represented by the Bruce's Beach Task Force and the City Council are beginning to address re-writing and correcting the text existing on the plaque at the park describing the history of the displaced early twentieth century Bruce's Beach, African American resort community.

Thanks to the Bruce's Beach Task Force members for the work to verify the chronology of the historical facts of the Bruce's Beach community development and destruction, and developing all the measures intended to educate, enlighten, and engage the citizens in a dialog to combat racial injustice.

It is commendable and courageous that the City of Manhattan Beach City Council supported establishing the Task Force and engaging the community in the conversation around equity, inclusion and anti-racism. This is an active learning moment for everyone in Manhattan Beach and beyond.

The decisions the Council makes regarding the Task Force recommendations will impact how the city can move forward to help build a broader, richer and more accurate understanding of our shared history and identity in our global, national, regional, and local identity and sense of belonging.

I have a few comments to make on the Bruce's Beach Task Force Recommendation Report.

- No new findings were discovered by the History Subcommittee that changes the historical interpretation that the Bruce's Beach community was pushed out due to anti-Black racism and white supremacist actions of economic sabotage and abuse of public power.

Comments: Manhattan Beach City Council Meeting

Item 12: Bruce's Beach Task Force

- When new information is discovered by historians they revise their findings and interpretation of history to reflect the new information they have learned. Some materials cited are newly available in the last few years which were not available in 2007 at the re-naming of the park, Bruce's Beach. For example, the African American periodical from the early twentieth century, the Liberator, just became available in early 2019. Several items at the Manhattan Beach Historical Society have only become available in the last few years because Gary McAuley (president) and other volunteers of the group have been organizing the materials so they are usable.
- Appendix 3, Recommendations to the Cultural Arts Commission
 - A historian who has subject matter expertise on Bruce's Beach and region's history and has done work in interpreting history in public display places needs to be engaged as a consultant on the team the artist to produce the public art installation.
- Appendix 4, Wording of the New Plaque at Bruce's Beach
 - A historian should be hired as a consultant to work on developing the wording of the interpretative panel (plaque) that includes narratives about all the families disposed of their land in the 1920s due to anti-Black racism.
 - The historian consultant fee will need to be higher and this consultant should be the same one who works on the public art installation. The interpretative panel and the public art installation history interpretation are interrelated.
 - A historian consultant working with the citizens committee to create the wording is going to take longer than the recommendations suggests.

I hope the Council and the citizens of Manhattan Beach will consider engaging me, Alison Rose Jefferson, author of *Living the California Dream: African American Leisure Sites during the Jim Crow Era, 2020* which includes documentation of Bruce's Beach, to help with the Bruce's Beach project going forward.

Best wishes,



Biography and resume attached

Alison Rose Jefferson

alisonrosejefferson@gmail.com

323.931.6745 hard line tel

213.509.2515 mobile tel

Alison Rose Jefferson | | Short Biography

A third generation Californian, Alison Rose Jefferson, M.H.C, Ph.D. is a historian and heritage conservation consultant. She reconstructs the stories of the African American experience which have been left out or marginalized in the telling of American history as a tool in the struggle for social justice. She is currently working on Applied History projects dealing with the African American experience during the Jim Crow era. Working with Santa Monica's Belmar History + Art project and the Central Avenue heritage trail with Angels Walk L.A, Jefferson is drawing on her research to guide and enrich these public programs at these Southern California locales that feature historical significance as well as contemporary consequence. Both projects are arriving for public to experience in early 2021.

In 2021, Dr. Jefferson is Scholar in Residence with the Institute for the Study of Los Angeles at Occidental Colleges. In virtual campus and public programs she will share her work to re-center the African American experience in local history and heritage conservation efforts. Also in 2021, she joins the new Advisory Council for The Trust for Public Land's Black History and Culture Program.

Her recent book, *Living the California Dream: African American Leisure Sites during the Jim Crow Era* (University of Nebraska Press) was honored with the 2020 Miriam Matthews Ethnic History Award by the Los Angeles City Historical Society for its exceptional contributions to the greater understanding and awareness of Los Angeles history. Her work has been noted in KCET-LA programming, LAIST.com, *Los Angeles Magazine*, the *Los Angeles Times*, *The New York Times*, CBS LA, KTLA and ABC LA news TV programs, among other media outlets. Learn more about Jefferson's work at: www.alisonrosejefferson.com.

Curriculum Vitae

Education

- PhD University of California, Santa Barbara, History, 2015
Fields: Heritage Conservation, United States History, African Americans in the West, Public History, Memory
MHP University of Southern California, Historic Preservation/Heritage Conservation, 2007
BA Pomona College, Sociology, 1980

Professional Activities

- 2021 Scholar in Residence, Institute for the Study of Los Angeles, Occidental College.
2019- Historian and Heritage Conservation Consultant for the Belmar History + Art Project,
present Santa Monica, California. Funded by the City of Santa Monica.
2017- Historian Sub-Consultant with Angels Walk LA. Funded by the City of Los Angeles and
present other.
2016- Historian Sub-Consultant/Co-Author with Galvin Preservation Associates Consulting
2017 team for the African American History Context Statement for the SurveyLA (Historic Resources Survey Report), Funded by the City of Los Angeles and other.

Publications, Multimedia Scholarship, Featured Lectures, and Conference Presentations

Book Publications

- 2020 Jefferson, Alison Rose. *Living the California Dream: African American Leisure Sites during the Jim Crow Era*. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 2020.
2006 Jefferson, Alison Rose with Christopher D. Jimenez y West, Matthew W. Roth and Morgan P. Yates. *Intersections of South Central Los Angeles: People and Places in Historic and Contemporary Photographs*. Los Angeles: Automobile Club of Southern California, 2006.

Other Publications

- 2017 Jefferson, Alison Rose with Galvin Preservation Associates Consulting. African American History Context Statement for the SurveyLA (Historic Resources Survey Report). City of Los Angeles Planning Department/Office of Historic Resources, publisher, 2017.

Multimedia Scholarship

- 2020 A Featured Historian in "Driving While Black: Race, Space and Mobility in America" documentary film by Gretchen Soren and Ric Burns || Steeplechase Films.

Awards, Honors, Grants, and Fellowships

Awards and Honors

- 2020 Miriam Matthews Ethnic History Award recipient for the book, *Living the California Dream: African American Leisure Sites during the Jim Crow Era* for its exceptional contributions to the greater understanding and awareness of Los Angeles history.
2019 Historical Society of Southern California (in conjunction with the Ahmanson Foundation) book publishing fund award.



Living the California Dream

African American Leisure

Sites during the Jim Crow Era

ALISON ROSE JEFFERSON



Martha Alvarez

From: keeverm@verizon.net
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 8:15 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] support of BBTF

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello,

I am listening to the city Council meeting - I support the BBTF and their recommendations. I have reviewed the online information, I feel that there was a lot of work put in to the historic review and compilation of information. The task force added their names to the work, clearly they are proud of their effort. Those opposed have been nameless

I was born here and have lived here 59 years - my thoughts are to accept the past, recognize the despicable actsreflect, apologize and with that move forward to a better, more inclusive future.

Kacha Novacek-Keever

Martha Alvarez

From: Juliet Geraci <julietgeraci@verizon.net>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 7:51 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I just want to say that, as a white resident for 58 years in Manhattan Beach, I support the work of the BB task force and do NOT believe that by apologizing, we are harming our reputation as a city. Rather, I think it will show strength and leadership in the South Bay by standing up for people of color. When I began the zoom meeting tonight, I didn't think the task force should continue, but I wanted the apology and the art piece and plaque. However, after listening to my black neighbors speak, I realize that I have no right to weigh in on this matter. It isn't my experience and I want to hear their experiences. I do know that, when I was younger, a real estate agent asked our neighbors if they minded a black family moving in across the street. I don't believe that would have ever happened to a white family in this City. There are many stories like this. Please support our black neighbors, and all neighbors (rich, poor, people of color, and white people) equally. The idea that it wasn't us, personally, who wronged the Bruce family, should make no difference in the city's decision to apologize.

Thank you,

Juliet Geraci

Juliet T Geraci

Martha Alvarez

From: Silverman, Rick <RSilverman@youstinka.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 6:29 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] City Council Meeting 3/16 (re: Bruce's Beach Task Force)

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

How do you sign up to speak. I would have assumed that they would have given instructions at the beginning of the zoom meeting. Not a fair way to allow residents to comment.

Martha Alvarez

From: Ken Haydis <ken.haydis@ibcrp.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 6:29 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Council members,

I and my family have been residence of Manhattan Beach for 42+ years. In fact, the first property I purchased around 1976, was located at 120-122 26th Street. Just on the southern boulder is now being discussed by the City Council (Bruce's Beach).

When I purchased the property there was a black family living and owned the property just to the West of me. He was an older gentleman(guessing 75+ years old) and his wife. I think they or their parents probably owned the property since the 20s. If the condemnation of the area was truly a racist move by the City of Manhattan Beach, why didn't they move the boundary south to condemn their lot?

I have read the committees report and there is not a lot of facts brought out to truly justify the recommendations. I don't see factual information as to why the city needs to apologize for actions that may or may not have been racist. One thing that struct me is all the hearsay about a burning mattress and **NO Trespassing** signs. The neighbor to the west of my property had **NO Trespassing** signs all along the Eastern property line. I think it was the thing to do back in the 20ies and 30ties. As far as compensation to ALL the owners if you do a present value of the \$14,500 per lot for 90 years at 7% you would get \$7,750,000 pretty near what the lots may be worth today. You might even argue that got paid to much in that they would have had to go thru the GREAT DEPRESSION and 2 World Wars!

Too much hearsay and not enough FACT to doing anything but thanking the committee and END the Task FORCE.

Kenneth Haydis

Martha Alvarez

From: Alison Wright <alisonwright1@me.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 6:13 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Support Bruce's Beach Task Force

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

City Council,

I support the continued work of the Bruce's Beach Task Force. Perhaps all involved both for and against should be encouraged to privately take one of the [tests](#) developed by Project Implicit to help us all understand our personal inner workings on these critical societal issues.

Thank you for taking this subject very seriously.

Alison Wright

Martha Alvarez

From: Ida VanderPoorte <idavan@earthlink.net>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 6:09 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's beach Task Force

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear council members;

As a resident of Manhattan Beach I support the Task Force continuing and also support the work they have done up to this point. An apology should be just the beginning.

Ida VanderPoorte
Cell: [310-994-6468](tel:310-994-6468)
idavan@earthlink.net

Ida VanderPoorte
Cell: 310-994-6468
idavan@earthlink.net

Martha Alvarez

From: Elise Johnson <elisejohnson5@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 6:59 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] In support of the BB TF

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Please extend our thanks to the Bruce's Beach Task Force. Whew! What a job!

We encourage you all to accept the recommendations brought forth by the TF including Appendix 2, an apology and Appendix 5 - making a DEI task force permanent.

If anyone wondered if it a DEI task force is needed, that offensive two-page, inaccurate ad (written by someone too cowardly to sign their name) in the Beach Reporter clarified that YES, MB needs a DEI task force.

Thank you all for everything that you do. We appreciate you!!

Elise, Grant, Miles, Cameron and Dain Johnson (my kids are all voting adults so they've asked me to include them.)

1904 Lynngrove Dr

Martha Alvarez

From: Nora Ming-Min Yang <norayang@stanford.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:55 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] In support of the Bruce's Beach task force and a strong, sincere apology

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

To whom it may concern,
I am writing to voice my support for the Bruce's Beach Task Force and for a strong, sincere apology. In addition, I believe that continuing the task force is important and necessary given the history of racial biases which have long gone unscrutinized. We must continue to challenge racism and to work towards a more equitable and inclusive Manhattan Beach. In this way, we can be the best possible version of our city-- a city that I will proudly call my home.

Sincerely,
Nora Yang

Martha Alvarez

From: Kaitlyn McQuown <kaitlynmquown@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:55 PM
To: List - City Council; Suzanne Hadley; Richard Montgomery; Steve Napolitano; Hildy Stern; Joe Franklin
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach - Approve the apology

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello City Council,

Thank you for your service to Manhattan Beach. I am writing today to urge you to issue the proposed apology created by the Bruce's Beach Task Force. I would like to extend a thank you to all who played a part in the creation and continued efforts of the task force, and the work they have been doing to document the history of Bruce's Beach so that the city, our surrounding neighbors, and beyond can have access to the facts of the past.

As I'm sure you've been informed, there is a campaign by an anonymous group in opposition to the work and existence of the task force. I believe the premises their campaign is based on are irrelevant to the work of the task force at best and at worse, are untrue. If we are committed to true unity and collective healing from events of the past (like Bruce's Beach) or the present (like racial slurs being used against surfers near the pier - <https://easyreadernews.com/localism-at-the-manhattan-beach-pier-triggers-racial-reckoning-for-surfers>), we must be brave enough to take a deep look at our city's history. There seems to be a focus in online forums, and now in print media, on whether or not an individual is a "racist" or what that means. I believe this detracts and distracts us from facing the objective truth that racism does indeed exist in our community and culture to this day. We can't work towards unity without embracing these difficult and uncomfortable truths. It's ultimately irrelevant if you or I or any individual can be defined as a "racist" -- it's far more important to figure out what we can do to fight against racism here at home, and commit to doing that.

Even further past an apology on behalf of the City of Manhattan Beach, I would like to see the council lead from the front. I'm not sure if any city reps attended the paddle out in support of Brick, the surfer in the aforementioned article, but things like that may encourage our neighbors to show solidarity in the face of hatred instead of shying away from it as the anti-BBTF campaign seems to imply.

Thank you again for your service and for your time in reading. All the best!
Kaitlyn McQuown

Martha Alvarez

From: Kyle Yang <kyang@alum.mit.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:54 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Support the task force

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

As a resident of Manhattan Beach, I am writing to support the Bruce's Beach commission. Please do not be intimidated by the ad in the Beach Reporter. That is not representative of our sentiments. We should do more to admit past failures and try to rectify things.

Sincerely,
Kyle Yang

Martha Alvarez

From: Sam Newman <hoyahouse@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:45 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fwd: URGENT NEED FOR AN APOLOGY

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear MB Council Members,

I was very frustrated by the Beach Reporter ad opposing the Bruce's Beach Task Force. The ad shows how discrimination and denial persist to this day, and does not reflect my views. I urge you to continue with efforts to obtain a strongly worded apology, and continue to support the task force in collaborating with the county to work toward reparations. The best way to address divisiveness in our town is to address the problems of the past, demonstrate accountability, and promote healing. To ignore this and declare that racism doesn't exist is naïve and hurtful. Please let me know if there is any way I can help support your further efforts.

Best,

Sam Newman

118 s poinsettia ave
Manhattan beach, ca 90266
3106580258.

Martha Alvarez

From: Mary Helen Immordino <immordin@usc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:44 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Reconciliation council

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear committee,

I am writing to express my ardent support for a reconciliation and social justice council, and for the strong apology and acknowledgement that our town and region wronged its Black members. Dealing with this racist history, rather than glossing over it, is the right thing to do and the only truly peaceful and just way forward. Thank you for launching this initiative, and I apologize on behalf of town residents who are unwilling to see that this history must be aired.

Sincerely,
Mary Helen Immordino-Yang
MB resident since 2006

Sent from my iPhone

Martha Alvarez

From: Heather Pecoroni Krueger <heathernsm@yahoo.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:39 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Task Force

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Hello City Council Members-

Thank you for all you do for our community. In regards to that, please protect our city from this unimaginable Bruce's Beach Task Force. The city residents of Manhattan Beach are not racist. People want to move here from everywhere because the people are nice, the weather is beautiful, schools are good, and we have a healthy active lifestyle.

This task force is trying to ruin our community by falsely labeling us racists and taking terrible measures to ensure our community is decimated. Please do not let this happen. Often times the angriest people are the most vocal, and even though a few are making a fuss about this, it doesn't mean any of their accusations are true or morally correct. Please stand up for our community as you always have, and protect our entire community by disbanding this task force and not issue an apology for something we aren't. We all love Manhattan Beach, and want to keep it a sweet, charming, friendly city and not be condemned for other people's angry feelings.

Heather

[Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPhone](#)

Martha Alvarez

From: Catherine Bergin <kate_bergin@mac.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:38 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Your Courage Is Needed Tonight

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

Dear City Council

Your courage is needed tonight. And how you choose to accept or reject the recommendations of The Bruce's Beach Task Force will send a strong message about Manhattan Beach's willingness to tolerate systemic racism in our community.

Thank you for forming the Bruce's Beach Task Force. Their report of recommendations is thoughtful and thorough. Following through will require leadership and strength, and I know each of you possesses these qualities when important choices are upon you. And this is one of those times.

I received a mailing from a group that opposes the actions recommended by the Bruce's Beach task force and goes as far as calling the task force partisan.

Racism and systemic racism are defined differently. Based on the anger in the communication I received in the mail, I urge City Council to educate our community, and not back down or water down what should be a meaningful apology.

The senders also believe that keeping the task force going continues the divisive atmosphere in the town. They think that apologizing sets up a legal standing for the Bruce Family in the future. In reality the senders are dividing our community and perpetuating the systemic racism that created the situation we are in today.

The Bruce's Beach Task Force was created in good faith, and as a non-partisan body. This must be reiterated and Council should not water down any recommendations based on partisan accusations. Secondly, the task force was designed to provide appropriate recognition and compensation. If this is not accomplished the work of the task force is for not. Lastly, we are not the first community to have to deal with racist actions. But we need to lead as, time and again, communities don't want to face this difficult reality of systemic racism.

The communications from those who oppose the recommendations say corrective and apologetic actions are divisive. But for who? Divisive because how people of color were treated is hard to look at head on? There is not enough time spent walking in the other person's shoes. As you think about apologies and "reconstruction" please ask yourselves if you would find the recommendations acceptable if your land had been taken.

In summary, I ask: 1) a strong and sincere apology must be made; 2) to continue the task force as an educative and guiding body; 3) Council rejects and clarifies disinformation on the city website so that our community has one set of facts they can rely on.

P.S. if you don't have enough people emailing or offering public comment in support of the task force recommendations, I assure you there are plenty of people who would have written if they had known there was opposition and known what a critical meeting tonight is.

Kate Bergin

310-658-3191

Sent from my iPhone

Martha Alvarez

From: Max Newman <maxknewman@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 5:30 PM
To: List - City Council
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: FW: Bruce's Beach Task Force Approval

CAUTION: This Email is from an EXTERNAL source. Ensure you trust this sender before clicking on any links or attachments.

I strongly support colleens argument.

Hello amazing City Council Members:

I am writing to thank you for the work that has been done by the Bruce's Beach Task Force. It is a thoughtful and well researched document that seeks to right the wrongs of those who came before us as Manhattan Beach residents and aims to create a partial solution to righting those wrongs through an apology and concrete anti-racist action steps for the city and its residents. I have heard complaints from Manhattan Beach citizens that apologizing sets up a legal standing for the Bruce Family in the future. I'm not a lawyer, but it does seem that whether the city apologizes or not, the Bruce's may have a legal standing to compensation - but that is another discussion.

Apologizing in a strong and meaningful way and taking responsibility for the city's historical actions is a very important step in welcoming those of different races and ethnic groups to our city and beach. Being recognized in LA as a welcoming city that is coming to terms with its racist past - and not so distant past - lifts our city up, both morally and economically. We should apologize because it is the right thing to do, but we should also realize that being stuck in the past with an ugly, racist societal construct will ultimately be very detrimental for our city.

I believe the work that the task force is doing is vitally important in moving Manhattan Beach forward to becoming a more welcoming and accepting city that we all would be proud to call home. Further, it is not the task force that is the cause of the divisiveness in the city that we have recently seen written about, but those residents who don't really want to accept that wrongs have been committed in our community, and the fact that we have not truly acknowledged our racist history and the privilege that allowed white families to pass down land and real estate to their children, while those same privileges were not extended people of color. We need to engage with the Black community to learn how this has affected those harmed and increase our understanding of how we can work together to make things right.

The plan that the Bruce's Beach Task Force and the City Council has laid out is one step in this direction, and I urge you to continue your work and engagement.

Best regards,

Colleen Soulis (Manhattan Beach)

Colleen Soulis Pachler

csoulpac@me.com

323.240.9229