

**Martha Alvarez, MMC**

---

**From:** Garraway, Isla P. <IGarraway@mednet.ucla.edu>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, April 4, 2023 8:27 AM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk; Alexandria Latragna; Steve Napolitano  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Resolution NO. 23-0037  
**Attachments:** Resolution No Apology.pdf

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear City Councilmembers,

I am writing to express my support for the City of Manhattan Beach to adopt the resolution of apology for the racially motivated eminent domain proceedings and the harassment of Black residents and their guests at Bruce's Beach that occurred in the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. As a former member of the Bruce's Beach Task force and History Advisory Board, council may want to consider a couple edits to the apology to ensure accuracy and inclusivity:

1. Recitals Section a: add John McCaskill, Elzia Irvin, James and Lula Slaughter, James and Anna Janet Leggett **OR**, remove "in and around the area" and remove "roughly a half dozen Black families" - must re-word to be more accurate about who was affected.
2. Apology Section 2: Change language as follows: *The role that the city played by tolerating racial discrimination and harassment by City residents that went unpunished, causing terror and intimidation among the Black community, including other nearby Black property owners John McCaskill, Elzia Irvin, James and Lula Slaughter, James and Anna Janet Leggett, as well as the Black visitors who sought beach access here.*

I understand some in our community are concerned about issuing an apology when none of the current residents of MB took part in the acts against those named in the apology. However, apologies are not solely an admission of guilt - they are also an admission of responsibility and accountability. I am proud to be a part of a community that affirms a responsibility to ensure that this type of action will never again be taken by residents and leaders of our beloved Manhattan Beach. I am deeply sorry for the harassment that occurred and want to do what I can to build bridges, find common ground, and nurture empathy so that our community feels welcoming, inclusive, and safe. This is the accountability that will make our city stronger.

Isla P. Garraway,  
MB resident since 1994

---

UCLA HEALTH SCIENCES IMPORTANT WARNING: This email (and any attachments) is only intended for the use of the person or entity to which it is addressed, and may contain information that is privileged and confidential. You, the recipient, are obligated to maintain it in a safe, secure and confidential manner. Unauthorized redisclosure or failure to maintain confidentiality may subject you to federal and state penalties. If you are not the intended recipient, please immediately notify us by return email, and delete this message from your computer.

## RESOLUTION NO. 23-0037

### A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH ACKNOWLEDGING AND APOLOGIZING FOR THE CITY'S ROLE IN THE RACIALLY MOTIVATED CONDEMNATION OF PROPERTIES IN THE AREA KNOWN AS BRUCE'S BEACH

#### RECITALS

- a. During the years from 1912 to 1927, in and around the area bordered by Highland Avenue, the Strand, 26<sup>th</sup> Street, and 27<sup>th</sup> Street, roughly a half dozen Black families purchased property in the neighborhood as residences or visitor-serving businesses, including Willa and Charles A. Bruce, Major George Prioleau and Mrs. Ethel Prioleau, Elizabeth Patterson, Mary R. Sanders, and Milton and Anna Johnson, ~~John McCaskill and Elzia L. Irvin, and James and Lula Slaughter.~~
- b. Willa and Charles A. Bruce established a resort known as Bruce's Beach, with a restaurant, dancehall, changing rooms, and showers. Bruce's Beach became a popular destination for Black Americans from the greater Los Angeles metropolitan area to recreate and enjoy the City's beautiful beach and ocean.
- c. Beginning in 1912, historians have documented that both the Black homeowners and visitors to this neighborhood suffered intimidation, harassment, and discrimination on the basis of their race by Manhattan Beach government officials, the police department, and other white residents. These acts consisted of:
  - i. Unknown persons setting residences on fire and causing other forms of property damage;
  - ii. Unknown persons letting out the air from tires of vehicles owned by Black visitors;
  - iii. An adjacent property owner cordoning off property so as to force Black beachgoers to walk one-half mile from this neighborhood to access the ocean;
  - iv. The City Council enacting ordinances sharply limiting the creation of new bathhouses and other visitor-serving facilities in direct response to the popularity of Bruce's Beach among the Black American community; and
  - v. The City endeavoring to privatize the beach by entering into a sham lease of the adjacent beach with a white property owner in order to exclude Black Americans, and then causing its police department to arrest Black Americans (and only Black Americans) who ventured onto the beach.

- d. The purpose of these racially motivated actions was to make Manhattan Beach inhospitable to Black American residents and visitors. Manhattan Beach residents at the time are on record expressing concern over the effect a Black population in Manhattan Beach would have on property values.
- e. When the acts of intimidation and harassment prior to 1924 did not have the desired effect of excluding Black Americans from the community, white residents, including realtors and civic leaders, pressured and persuaded the City Council to exercise its power of eminent domain to acquire the land for use as a public park.
- f. The City condemned properties included those of Black property owners Willa and Charles A. Bruce, Major George Prioleau and Mrs. Ethel Prioleau, Elizabeth Patterson, Mary R. Sanders, Milton and Anna Johnson. Twenty-five other properties owned by White property owners were also condemned as part of the action.
- g. As a result of the racially motivated condemnation proceedings undertaken by the City, a flourishing Black American-owned business was closed and a burgeoning Black neighborhood was scattered. This action, together with the now illegal practices of red-lining and racially restrictive property covenants, contributed to a lack of diversity within the community.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT THE CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH FORMALLY APOLOGIZES FOR:

1. The City's racially motivated and discriminatory condemnation action to dispossess Willa and Charles A. Bruce, Major George and Mrs. Ethel Prioleau, Elizabeth Patterson, Mary R. Sanders, Milton and Anna Johnson, and all other property owners of their rightful property. The City directly apologizes to these former property owners for unjustly taking their property under false pretenses.
2. The role that the City played by tolerating racial discrimination and harassment by City residents that went unpunished, causing terror and intimidation among the Black community, including John McCaskill, Elzia Irvin, and James and Lula Slaughter.
3. The role that the City played conspiring to exclude Black Americans from its beach and utilizing its police force to enforce such exclusion by way of unlawful and unconstitutional arrests and prosecutions.

4. The role that the City played enacting facially neutral ordinances with the well-documented intention to discourage the expansion of Black owned commercial hospitality enterprises and to stymie the increasing popularity of the City as a recreation destination for Black Americans in the greater Los Angeles area.
5. The City's overdue recognition of these events to the detriment of generations of Manhattan Beach residents.

The City Council hereby commits the City of Manhattan Beach to reject racism, hate, intolerance and exclusion. The Manhattan Beach of today is not the Manhattan Beach of one hundred years ago—our community and population is loving, tolerant and welcoming to all.

To that end, the City of Manhattan Beach unanimously adopted the Stand Up Inclusion Commitment on September 5, 2017, which states:

I commit to Stand Up against hate, prejudice, violence and bullying and STAND UP for respect and inclusion. I will:

- Speak out when I hear someone being targeted because of their race, ethnicity, sexuality, gender, religion, ability, gender identity, or any other factor. If it is difficult to speak out, then I will stand next to the person who is being targeted and offer my support;
- Talk about how stereotypes, prejudice, discrimination, and exclusion make people feel and how they harm our society;
- Ask myself, "How do I want to be treated?" Before acting or speaking, I will consider the other person's feelings and be kind, respectful and caring;
- Not allow a prejudiced slur to go either unchallenged or unreported.
- If I see something, I will say something;
- Denounce online hate, bullying, and discrimination, and report hurtful conduct whenever possible;
- Unite and engage with diverse communities and educate myself on how to be an effective friend and supporter;
- Protect my neighbors by being inclusive and building communities where everyone feels welcome.

We remain committed to these principles as a community, in deeds as well as words. We don't seek to condemn or divide, rather, we seek understanding and healing. An apology can't change the events of one hundred years ago, nor are today's residents responsible for the past actions of others. However, we offer this apology as a foundational act for Manhattan Beach's next one hundred years and the actions we will take together to Stand Up against prejudice and hate, and for respect and inclusion.

ADOPTED on April 4, 2023.

AYES:  
NOES:  
ABSENT:  
ABSTAIN:

---

RICHARD MONTGOMERY  
Mayor

ATTEST:

---

LIZA TAMURA  
City Clerk

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** LAUREN BURTON <lauren.burton@me.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 5:04 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Honorable Councilpersons,

I am a 27 year Manhattan Beach resident and am writing this email to urge the City Council to unanimously reconsider a Resolution of Apology for Bruce's Beach, and to use the alternative motion brought by Councilmember Napolitano in 2021 (Resolution No. 23-0037), as a framework. I understand this item is to be considered on the April 4 agenda and urge your support for Councilmember David Lesser's motion.

As both a professional mediator and trainer of 100's of mediators for the Los Angeles County Bar Association for more than 20 years, I know the value of an apology in the resolution of disputes and the settlement of potential or actual litigation. An apology could go a long way to helping to heal those who were adversely affected by the City's past actions and allow us all to move forward toward an inclusive community that welcomes all residents, business owners, and visitors. I could not agree more with former Mayor Steve Napolitano's statement at the Bruce's Beach Plaque unveiling on March 18, "We have acknowledged and condemned, but we haven't apologized. It's a simple difference but with a much deeper meaning."

Thank you for your time and your public service to Manhattan Beach.

LAUREN BURTON  
1216 8th Street  
Manhattan Beach, CA  
90266

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Brenda O'Leary <brendajoleary@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 2:11 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Outdoor dining task force - Brenda O'Leary

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello Mayor Montgomery and Councilmembers Howorth, Napolitano, Lesser, and Franklin,

As you probably know, I've applied to be a member of our outdoor dining task force. As a 30-year resident of Manhattan Beach, I believe this is a very important undertaking for our city. While the pandemic was difficult for us all, a silver lining that came out of it locally was our newfound enjoyment of outdoor dining in our beautiful beach community. While it was a bit of a bandaid-style structure, the enjoyment our residents received was a message we can carry forward and use as a meaningful reason to create something more permanent, beautiful, economically feasible, and enjoyable.

I believe I can add value to the task force in many ways. First of all, I have an understanding of real estate development and design. About eight years ago, I helped my fiance start a real estate development company that focuses on the life sciences. The thesis behind this was we have eight major research universities here in Los Angeles, and we were losing both revenue and intellectual capital to life science hubs such as Boston, San Diego, and San Francisco due to lack of lab space locally. Building lab space for life science companies took ingenuity and creativity - there wasn't really a business model to follow. We worked closely with architects and engineers to create spaces that were functional, practical, and beautiful. We developed space for tenants such as Amgen throughout Southern CA and now across the US. More recently, our company was purchased by one of the largest healthcare development companies, and we are now its Life Sciences and Technology Division.

In addition, I've worked in investment management for 30 years, across bonds, stocks and private investments. Succeeding in corporate America requires the ability to work as part of a team, where people are encouraged to think outside the box and share their best ideas. I believe I could encourage that culture within the task force.

Finally, I'm respected in the community and I believe I could be helpful in driving community involvement. I would be happy to encourage people to share new ideas. There are no bad ideas as long as they create discussion and creative thought, and I'm always happy to discuss and debate ideas.

I would greatly value the opportunity to work with you and the task force on this important project.

Thanks for your consideration!

Brenda O'Leary

**Martha Alvarez, MMC**

---

**From:** Joanne Hadley <joanne@hadleybiz.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 1:43 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Yes on Bruce's Beach Apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear MB Councilmembers,

As you consider a "Resolution of Apology for the City's Role in the Racially Motivated Condemnation of Properties at Bruce's Beach"...

Please stand with our community and apologize for the city's wrongdoing of a century ago.

Regarding Bruce's Beach, I urge you to make an apology.

Thank you and best wishes,

Joanne Hadley  
763 33rd Street MB



## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Mary Helen Immordino-Yang <immordin@usc.edu>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 1:16 PM  
**To:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Fwd: Apologize for the wrongs of Bruce's Beach

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Re agenda item 16.

Mary Helen Immordino-Yang  
Professor of Education, Psychology & Neuroscience;  
Director, CANDLE.USC.EDU  
University of Southern California

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Mary Helen Immordino-Yang  
**Date:** April 3, 2023 at 1:15:00 PM PDT  
**To:** citycouncil@manhattanbeach.gov  
**Subject:** **Apologize for the wrongs of Bruce's Beach**

I would like to express my support for apologizing on behalf of the city for the wrongs committed with regard to Bruce's Beach a century ago.

Thank you,

Mary Helen Immordino-Yang  
Professor of Education, Psychology & Neuroscience;  
Director, CANDLE.USC.EDU  
University of Southern California

Sent from my iPhone

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Mary Helen Immordino-Yang <immordin@usc.edu>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 1:15 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Apologize for the wrongs of Bruce's Beach

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

I would like to express my support for apologizing on behalf of the city for the wrongs committed with regard to Bruce's Beach a century ago.

Thank you,

Mary Helen Immordino-Yang  
Professor of Education, Psychology & Neuroscience; Director, CANDLE.USC.EDU University of Southern California

Sent from my iPhone

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Audrey Judson <outlook\_805493C8D68D7CB9@outlook.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 1:01 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council Members,

We teach our children to apologize when a mistake has been made. The only way to learn from the past is to acknowledge it and try not to repeat it. I'm in support of a formal apology to all of the families that were hurt by the racist decisions of our city's past citizens.

Thank you.

Audrey Judson

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows

**Martha Alvarez, MMC**

---

**From:** Anthony A. Lee <member1700@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 11:18 AM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** Alexandria Latragna; City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Support for Bruce's Beach Apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Honorable Members of the City Council:

I strongly support the resolution of apology that will come before the City Council at tomorrow's meeting. My hope is that the resolution will pass unanimously, indicating the end of divisions over this matter and the intentions of the City to move forward.

Anthony A. Lee, Ph.D.  
Resident of Manhattan Beach

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Russell Noel <nnoel1943@aol.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 3, 2023 10:43 AM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] I'm Sorry!

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Come on folks, it's not that hard. Just say it, I'm Sorry. A wonderful opportunity to right the wrongs of the past.

Russell Noel

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Ricki Frand <rfrand@aol.com>  
**Sent:** Sunday, April 2, 2023 5:38 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

For the children in our community, for the legacy of our city moving forward, it is vitally important that our city apologize to the Bruce Family. Apologizing helps repair relationships. Acknowledging that the actions of our city a century ago caused hurt, unhappiness, damage to generations of the Bruce family is the right thing to do. As we've all experienced on a personal level, an apology gets people talking again, makes them feel a bit more comfortable with each other. It will be an important example of civility for our young people to witness.

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Larry Cimmarusti <larry@cimmarustiholdingsllc.com>  
**Sent:** Sunday, April 2, 2023 12:33 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL]

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

We as homeowners can't understand why the city of Manhattan Beach has to apologize to a family that recieved money a 100 years ago and again recieved 20 million dollars .Our city has never honored our soldiers families our firefighter families our life guards families we should have given these heroes family funds to help them also they say the people of Manhattan Beach are racist the mayor in 1974 was a black man our last chief was a Blackman and he was amazing for years we have a chief of police currently that's a female black woman who by the way is amazing and we as residence are proud of her and her military background so let's have the Bruce's do something of a thanks to this city for making them millionaires and giving to another state First the sign on the strand needs to be dedicated to our heroes and the 300,000 sign at the top of the hill is thanks enough and the Bruce Family did they attend the unveiling of a city that handed them a check for 20 million dollars any scholarships given by them in honor of their family I personally say thank you to the Greenberg family that has hired so many people and donated so much back to the community they have been giving no more thanks and one plaque is enough for the Bruce family let's move on

Sent from my iP

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Dawn Tamir <dawntamir@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Sunday, April 2, 2023 9:52 AM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council Members,

I am in favor of David Lesser's proposed "Resolution of Apology for the City's Role in the Racially Motivated Condemnation of Properties at Bruce's Beach." As former Mayor Steve Napolitano expressed at the Bruce's Beach Plaque unveiling on March 18, "*We have acknowledged and condemned, but we haven't apologized. It's a simple difference but with a much deeper meaning.*".

*I could not agree more. This apology is long overdue. While I think it revealed a naive side and even at times an ugly side of MB, I am grateful that the controversy woke me up and I believe others in our community to become more involved and more informed about our local government.*

*I believe we have delayed this apology for far too long. It is the only way to fully move forward.*

*Thank you.  
Dawn Tamir  
East Manhattan resident*

Sent from my iPhone



## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Janet Anderson <janet.bell.anderson@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Sunday, April 2, 2023 7:17 AM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello, city council.

My husband and I attended the new plaque unveiling at Bruce's Beach in March. It was a lovely ceremony, and Mayor Steve Napolitano's words were so important.

We love Manhattan Beach and feel strongly that it's imperative that an apology for the way our predecessors treated the Bruce family, and the other black families who were their neighbors, to be publicly issued. Aren't we all truly sorry that this occurred? We can separate an apology from accepting responsibility for playing an active role in the atrocity. We don't feel remorse for OUR actions, although the failure to publicly apologize as a city feels shameful since we DO have the power to fix this.

We implore you to do the decent thing and formally, officially, and meaningfully apologize to the families who were wrongfully stripped of their property under false pretenses over 100 years ago. We know something like this wouldn't happen in our community today, but we must never forget that it did.

Thank you,  
Janet Anderson

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Brhadley <bret@hadleybiz.com>  
**Sent:** Sunday, April 2, 2023 2:36 AM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council

As a homeowner in Manhattan Beach for over 30 years, I urge the council to proceed with a formal apology On behalf of the citizens of Manhattan Beach, regarding the disgraceful and embarrassing confiscation of the property from the Bruce family many years ago. Although no one alive today is directly responsible for this sad affair, we have the opportunity to stand up and rehabilitate the reputation of our fine community for the benefit of past, present and future residents. Thank you.

Best,

Bret Hadley

**Martha Alvarez, MMC**

---

**From:** lynn thompson <lynnmikami@hotmail.com>  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 1, 2023 6:08 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL]

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Please support an apology about Bruce's Beach. It is the right thing to do! It's about time! Thank you, Lynn Thompson, Formally in Manhattan Beach, now in Redondo Beach

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Laura Dotson <lauradotson@roadrunner.com>  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 1, 2023 5:37 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

As a longtime resident of Manhattan Beach, I urge you to take the long overdue step of offering an official apology to the Bruce Family for the racist actions of the city in seizing their family's property.

Respectfully submitted,

Laura Dotson  
575 35th Street  
Manhattan Beach  
Sent from my iPad

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Allen Kirschenbaum <allen.kirschenbaum@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 1, 2023 5:03 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] CALL TO ACTION: Bruce's Beach Apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

It is time.  
Please don't let more time go by.

Thank you,  
Allen Kirschenbaum

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** aprilwayland@aol.com  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 1, 2023 4:30 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] in support of an apology for Bruce's Beach

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Honorable Council Members:

My children's book, *NEW YEAR AT THE PIER*, winner of the Sydney Taylor Gold Medal for best Jewish picture book of the year, takes place on the Manhattan Beach Pier.

It's about tashlich, a Jewish new year ritual, in which we admit wrongs and apologize for them. At the pier, the rabbi says, *"Tashlich is the time we apologize for things we wish we hadn't done...Tashlich is like cleaning your heart's closet. A new year, a clean heart."*

As former Mayor Steve Napolitano said at the Bruce's Beach Plaque unveiling, *"We have acknowledged and condemned, but we haven't apologized. It's a simple difference but with a much deeper meaning."*

**Do the right thing.** Our community deserves it; country needs it.

As author Kevin Hancock said, *"Apologies aren't meant to change the past, they are meant to change the future."*



Remember to breathe

Sincerely,

April Wayland

<https://www.aprilwayland.com/> April Halprin Wayland: ½ poet, ½ author, ½ not good at fractions

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Diane Hembacher <diane.hemb@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 1, 2023 3:45 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council Members,

We understand that the City Council will be considering a "Resolution of Apology for the City's Role in the Racially Motivated Condemnation of Properties at Bruce's Beach." We would like to express our support for this apology.

Thank you,

Diane and Brian Hembacher  
Manhattan Beach

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Joan Engelhaupt <edandjoan@roadrunner.com>  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 1, 2023 9:13 AM  
**To:** List - City Council; City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Apology for Bruce's Beach

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Councilmembers:

While my city has recently done much to foster inclusivity, it remains an embarrassment, noted by people far, far removed from the bounds of our city, that our City Council has thus far refused to extend an apology for what happened at Bruce's Beach. We now have the opportunity to correct this grievous error, and it is my fervent desire that we do so. It is as true in public relations as it is in inter-personal relations that a sincere apology can go a long ways toward healing the hurt.

Respectfully,

Joan Engelhaupt  
1751 Gates Ave., Manhattan Beach



## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** stacy barrows <smartroller1@me.com>  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 1, 2023 8:28 AM  
**To:** List - City Council; City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] resident from Manhattan Beach for over 40 years, I want to apologize

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Madams and Sirs,

I urge you to stand with our Manhattan Beach community and apologize for the city's wrongdoing of a century ago with regards to the Bruce's family.

As Mayor Steve Napolitano expressed at the Bruce's Beach Plaque unveiling on March 18: *"We have acknowledged and condemned, but we haven't apologized. It's a simple difference but with a much deeper meaning."*

It is time to do this now. Please accept my voice in this manner and do the right thing.

Warmly, Dr. Stacy Barrows, she, hers PT, DPT, GCFP, NCPT Smart Somatic Solutions, Physical Therapy, Inc. [www.smartroller.net](http://www.smartroller.net) [www.smartsomaticsolutions.com](http://www.smartsomaticsolutions.com) Confidentiality Notice: This email and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and contain information that may be confidential and/or legally privileged. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender and delete the message. Any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of this communication by someone other than the intended recipient is prohibited

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** ERIC GRAY <egray123@verizon.net>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 8:48 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Re: Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Sent from my iPhone

> On Mar 31, 2023, at 11:42 PM, ERIC GRAY <egray123@verizon.net> wrote:

>

> Dear Council:

>

> After paying the Bruce family \$20 mm and erecting a monument, I think Manhattan Beach has addressed this issue. I think a pause and reflection period is warranted, and it is not necessary to continue to focus on Bruce's Beach. Surely you have other issues to focus on.

>

> Eric Gray

>

> Sent from my iPhone

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** ERIC GRAY <egray123@verizon.net>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 8:43 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Council:

After paying the Bruce family \$20 mm and erecting a monument, I think Manhattan Beach has addressed this issue. I think a pause and reflection period is warranted, and it is not necessary to continue to focus on Bruce's Beach. Surely you have other issues to focus on.

Eric Gray

Sent from my iPhone

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Sally Peel <sallypeel@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 3:50 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Thank You - Apology for Bruce's Beach

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear wonderful council,

Thank you for reconsidering a resolution of apology for Bruce's Beach. I encourage you to continue in this direction and I fully endorse an apology.

I can speak with some authority that this is meaningful not only to the homeowners in our community, but also to people who work here, including staff at our schools. It is meaningful to students in our schools, both those who live in Manhattan Beach and those who permit in from neighboring communities. An apology will be consistent with who we are and hope to be as a city. I am glad that this is again under consideration.

Thank you for your service to our community! Thank you for constantly trying to do the right thing. You know that I appreciate you and all that you give to our great town.

Best regards,  
Sally

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Kathleen Goldman <kjzlacrosse@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 3:10 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

I urge the city council to officially apologize to the Bruce Family for the injustice of that family's unjust loss of property. We cannot right all wrongs, but we can acknowledge that a wrong was perpetrated. It doesn't matter that it was many years ago. What matters is that we now accept and apologize that it happened.

Thank you,  
Kathleen Goldman  
1410-21st Street

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Clare Trueblood Gurbach <ctgurbach@verizon.net>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 1:52 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Apology For Bruce's Family

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear MB City Council,

I was brought to tears by Steve Napalitano's comments at the Bruce's beach plaque unveiling and given hope that our city can still apologize for what took place so many years ago to the Bruce Family. I urge our current city council to issue an apology - it is never too late.

Thanks,  
Clare

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** rambojack <rambojack@aol.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 1:07 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] No apology necessary for Bruce's Beach.

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

As stated in the subject, our city council has done nothing wrong, it has been over backwards to accommodate all these demands and pressures from outside groups regarding Bruce's Beach. Now, the family has decided to sell the property after finally getting control of it. As far as I'm concerned, there is no more issue. Therefore, there is no need to apologize. Stop this nonsense now.

Terry Watson  
Sent from my iPhone

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** ROY GONELLA <roygone@aol.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 1:08 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] April 4 meeting--Bruce Beach apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

To City Council

This is to add our names as residents of Manhattan Beach who are in support of City Council providing a full apology for Bruce's Beach. We believe it was a mistake not to offer that apology originally, and fully support Steve Napolitano's comments made during the Bruce's Beach plaque dedication on March 18.

Roy and Julie Gonella



## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Birkel, Julia L. <jbirkel@hfbllp.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 12:26 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology April 4, 2023

**EXTERNAL EMAIL:** Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Esteemed Counsel,

Kudos to former Mayor Steve Napolitano for opening his heart and the City's mind during the Bruce's Beach Plaque presentation to pave the way for the overdue apology to the Bruce family and the other residents harmed by the City's racially motivated condemnation. This is an opportunity to heal, and to show the world that we are not just offering platitudes, but that we really are a "welcoming city" to ALL. To those who oppose an apology on the grounds that people alive today weren't personally responsible for the racist actions 100 years ago, I say that people alive today ARE responsible to heal the racial divides in our city that persist today. The refusal to issue an apology at the last opportunity was in and of itself a racially charged moment that did not speak well for who we are as a community. Please, let's issue an apology and send the message that we embrace and welcome all people.

I am a 30 year resident of Manhattan Beach, and have brought my family up here. The town I want to live in celebrates and appreciates individual differences.

I ask for a unanimous apology.

Regards,

Julie Birkel



Julia L. Birkel | Partner | Hill, Farrer & Burrill LLP  
One California Plaza | 300 S Grand Ave, 37th Fl | Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Dir: 213.621.0721 | Main: 213.620.0460  
jbirkel@hillfarrer.com | www.hillfarrer.com | v card | 

===== The information contained in this electronic mail message is confidential information intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above, and may be privileged. The information herein may also be protected by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 USC Sections 2510-2521. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by telephone (213-620-0460), and delete the original message. Thank you.

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** John Randolph <johnrando@verizon.net>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 31, 2023 11:37 AM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Support Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

I support the City's apology with respect to Bruce's Beach. It's the right thing to do, as Steve indicated. John

John Randolph  
johnrando@verizon.net

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Laura Kiely <laurakiely@verizon.net>  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 30, 2023 4:07 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Cc:** City Clerk  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Outdoor dining

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear City Council,

Thank you for forming a committee to plan for the future of permanent outdoor dining opportunities in Manhattan Beach.

As a resident in the downtown area, I can say from experience that the outdoor dining decks enhanced our City, and I hope the newly formed committee will move quickly to plan successful permanent outdoor dining opportunities for Manhattan Beach.

Best,  
Laura Kiely  
Manhattan Beach resident since 1994

Sent from my iPhone

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** KENT KREH <kentkreh@yahoo.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 28, 2023 12:02 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Apology  
**Attachments:** BB - apology.jpg; BB MB 2.jpg; R.O.E.D. Memo.docx; Don Knabe - 12-3-16.docx; Mayor 1.jpg; MEMO 6-29-22.docx; Healthy Communities Challenge 11-6-14.pdf; White House 2019.pdf; White House -Biden 4-202-22.pdf; Memo 02-07-2016.docx; M.Waters Community Walk against Hate 3-26-22.m4a; Property 001.jpg

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Manhattan Beach City Council-

I hope you are doing well. Please again find associated documentation attached for your Administrative Review.

The feeling now is the deep need for sincere apology here first from Mayor Napalitano as the Manhattan Beach and Torrance Police have also been put on notice at this time for this lawful request.

The fact that Bruce Beach property has been wrongfully converted to Cash with the clear kickbacks and price fixing of Real Estate all while my Right of Eminent Domain has been denied and associated foul play that has led to worst of wrongful death again here and this time with all torture and desecration to my deeply loved family. I was taught the law says the Government does not need a reason to take one's property but must pay one fairly for it.

Again, the motive here is to find the long overdue protection and justice in all self -preservation, and I ask that you contact me now with this request for justice that the Mayor seems to feel is so important. Thank you.

Very Truly Yours,

Kent Kreh Jewell  


MANHATTAN BEACH

# New plaque unveiled at Bruce's Beach Park

## Mayor Steve Napolitano gives a long-awaited apology to the Bruces, other Black families

By **Tyler Shaun Evains**  
[tevains@scng.com](mailto:tevains@scng.com)

The recent rain clouds departed just in time for the sun to shine on a new monument that was unveiled in Manhattan Beach this weekend.

Manhattan Beach cut the ribbon on its new plaque at Bruce's Beach Park on Saturday. The new marker honors

Black entrepreneurs Willa and Charles Bruce, who ran a seaside resort for Black beachgoers in the early 20th century — between the city's 26th and 27th streets by what's now the Strand — as well as other Black property owners who had cottages on the now-park land.

City leadership in the late 1920s took the land through eminent domain for racially

motivated reasons, under the guise of needing more parkland. The deed to the Bruces' two parcels of land, below the park and right before the sand, was transferred to descendants of Willa and Charles last year, but the heirs sold the land back to L.A. County earlier this year for \$20 million.

The original plaque focused mostly on early, White developer George Peck's role in allowing Black people to buy beachfront land in Manhattan

**PLAQUE » PAGE 4**



Attendees of the dedication ceremony of the plaque honoring the history of Bruce's Beach view the bronze tablet Friday at Manhattan Beach.

PHOTO BY GIL CASTRO-PETRES

# Plaque

FROM PAGE 3

Beach. But now, finally, the city has set in stone its part in acknowledging this piece of its history.

The Black National Anthem, “Lift Every Voice and Sing,” was played before Mayor Steve Napolitano and a few members of the former history advisory board that compiled a report on Bruce’s Beach gave remarks.

“It’s been a long road, too long, to get here,” Napolitano said Saturday.

It had, in fact, taken nearly three years.

The event previously had been scheduled for February — during Black History Month — but was rescheduled because of weather. Before that, the city missed a few other target dates over the past year to install the plaque.

The national reckoning on systemic racism that exploded in 2020, in the wake of George Floyd’s murder by Minneapolis police, became particularly local in Manhattan Beach. A June-teenth celebration, organized by activist Kavon Ward, brought to light the history of Bruce’s Beach and the surrounding area.

A task force initially charged with planning the plaque redo in 2020 was turned into a history advisory board that then was set to rewrite the plaque’s language in 2021. But the City Council ended up taking over that job last year.

In lieu of postponing the unveiling one last time, it’s just as well, Napolitano said, to reveal the plaque during Women’s History Month



PHOTO BY GIL CASTRO-PETRES

Manhattan Beach Mayor Steve Napolitano, center, and a crowd of supporters cut the ribbon to officially unveil the plaque honoring the history of Bruce’s Beach on Friday at Manhattan Beach.

women who are at the center of the Bruce’s Beach story.

“Willa Bruce opened Bruce’s Lodge as a place for Black Angelenos to enjoy the beach when there were few places for them to go, and there were few businesswomen — let alone Black businesswomen — at the time,” Napolitano said.

There was also Elizabeth Catley, then a UCLA student who was arrested in 1927 at 19 years old for swimming in the ocean near Bruce’s Beach Lodge, Napolitano said, inspiring the desegregation of California beaches. And Ethel Prioleau fought for the integration of Black nurses in county hospitals and the desegregation of public swimming pools in Los Angeles.

But the overall story of Bruce’s Beach parallels the story of racism in America in the early part of the last century, Napolitano said.

“As time passed and those most affected by it faded into history, it was a story that was known, but

he said.

Late resident Bob Brigham wrote a 1956 masters’ thesis that gave accounts of what happened to the Bruces and other Black families back then, he added, but that was just a glimpse of what historians and the city’s history advisory board members since have brought forth.

But it was the advocacy of Ward, a former Manhattan Beach resident, that initially brought this history to the city, county and state’s attention today.

“At best, (the history) simmered in the background until recent events and residents brought it to the forefront of our community’s consciousness,” Napolitano said.

History advisory board member Kristin Long-Drew on Saturday honored Willa Bruce’s tenacity in opening a pop-up stand in 1912 and building it up to a two-story lodge with a dance hall, restaurant and changing rooms, making the area hospitable and welcoming

“George and Ethel Prioleau, Milton and Anna Johnson, Elizabeth Patterson and Mary Sanders all bought and built cottages where we stand now; they were joined by the Irvings, McCaskills and Slaughters, who purchased land south of 26th Street,” Long-Drew said. “It was a burgeoning Black community, until it wasn’t.”

Although the eminent domain action was under the pretense of needing a park, Long-Drew said, the history board’s research found that it was actually due to White residents’ fear that an influx of Black neighbors would drive property values down.

“Despite challenging the condemnation, they were forced to sell, and that Black community dissolved,” she added. “Even though we have a ways to go, what we celebrate today is a very significant step in the right direction; we hope that this plaque, as well as the county’s and our history report, will help to inform people about what happened here, inspire them to ask ques-

to acknowledge our past.”

Fellow history board member Tyler St. Bernard said that by reckoning with the story of what happened, only then the Manhattan Beach community can begin to heal from it.

“While the (previous) plaque gave people a glimpse into the history of the land they were on, it failed to present the larger story,” St. Bernard said. “Only with greater context and the revelation of buried details is the full story told.”

And Isla Garraway, who was also on the history board, echoed the need for this new description of a part of city’s history that largely was covered up over time.

“The city’s new plaque affirms the historical significance of the resort that Willa Bruce envisioned,” Garraway said. “I am really grateful that the harms of past racial discrimination have been more accurately recounted in the city’s plaque. I’m grateful that we can move forward as a community with aspi-

Manhattan Beach literally set in stone.”

Gina Young, the great-great-niece of Elizabeth Patterson — who owned parcels on the condemned land — traveled from Glendale to attend the ceremony.

“I feel I needed to be here to honor my ancestor,” Young said.

Although Patterson had no biological children, Young said, she raised Young’s grandmother as her own. Young always had known that her family had owned property at a beach, she said, but she didn’t know where.

She was researching Patterson in 2021 and found out she was connected to Bruce’s Beach, Young said, then got in contact with the city, which led her to attend Saturday.

“I just feel that I’m glad my ancestor was honored today,” she said.

Napolitano also apologized on behalf of the earlier taking of the properties and invited his fellow councilmembers to eventually do the same.

“We have acknowledged and condemned but we haven’t apologized; It’s a simple difference, but with a much deeper meaning,” Napolitano said. “I personally apologize to the Bruces, the Prioleaus, the Pattersons, the Sanders, the Johnsons, the McCaskills, the Irvings and the Slaughters for the wrongful, racially motivated taking of their property by this city nearly 100 years ago.

“But I know it doesn’t mean much just coming from me; it needs to come from the city, and for that I want and need my council colleagues to join me in apologizing to these families because that does mean

December 3, 2016

**MR. DON KNABE**

**OFFICE OF LOS ANGELES COUNTY SUPERVISOR OFFICE**

**500 W. TEMPLE ST.**

**ROOM B-96**

**LOS ANGELES, CA 90012-2706**

**RE: COMPLAINT/GREIVANCE – STEVE NAPALITANO**

Dear Mr. Supervisor,

I want to thank you for your Legendary Service to the Community in your coming Retirement. However, there is a most serious issue that is in great need of a working solution that has been going on locally for the nearly 20 years now.

Please find attached letter communications with pertinent California Laws and guiding professional Ethics to the Crimes I have witnessed and repeatedly been victimized by with no protection to be found anywhere. Please help to cease this endless Obstruction of Justice I am experiencing.

Recently, I found help in understanding through your Consumer Affairs Division but was then completely abused again by the local representative of your Torrance Office, Mr. Steve Napalitano. (?) Here, Mr. Napalitano chose to seriously abuse and further challenge me after claiming my issue is a Civil Matter, when it clearly is Not. When I inquired into sending him the Laws of protection here, He declined to be willing to read. When I again inquired, If I were to be a victim of the worst of Fraud, Abuse, Embezzlement, Forgery, Undue Influence, Grand Theft, Robbery, Wrongful Conversion of Property, Racketeering, and Borderline Extortion. Who would I go to for protection and help? And he could not tell me. (??) He then told me how the Attorneys he hired for Public matters were not appropriate for me and worked by way of negligence to terminate the telephone call (???)

This must end. Mr. Napalitano operates as a local Landlord I now learn and receives the same Lawful protection if Tenants do not pay their rent and remain in the same Wrongful possession of other's property, the Law will evict them. There is no Court Trial here. I expect the same with my financial Services Licenses as documented by Law for the clear benefit and protection of ALL. Then Mr. Napalitano tells me that He is a Lawyer and now clearly is operating here in all professional and civil gross negligence. He is another person I believe who knows if he can break the Law and get away with it, all will in turn come to him in destroying our local Economy for his own selfish personal gain.

Again, this is most serious. Please contact me back with the help requested within and with due sincere apologies a working solution in upholding the lawful Government Plans here for all protection going forward. Please understand there is no other way here in that Laws and Lives Matter. Thank you again.

Sincerely,

Kent C. Kreh, CPA

---

**Subject:** Fw: White House Announces “Healthy Communities Challenge”

---

**From:** KENT KREH (kentkreh@yahoo.com)

---

**To:** info@healthfirstis.com;

---

**Date:** Tuesday, December 15, 2015 10:58 AM

---

Hi Everyone,

Thank you to those who were able to join Wednesday’s call! For those that were unable, I have included a transcript of the President’s remarks below.

I also wanted to be sure you saw the below exciting announcement about the launch of the White House Healthy Community Challenge. Please see below release and attached fact sheets and graphic (as well as new data on the eligible uninsured from HHS, which can be found [here](#)).

In other great news: HHS released new data this week that shows that the uninsured rate is now 8.8%, meaning, for the first time, more than 90% of Americans are covered.

Please feel free to amplify this great news far and wide, and thank you for all that you do!

Sincerely,

**Bess Evans**

Associate Director and Senior Policy Advisor  
White House Office of Public Engagement  
White House Domestic Policy Council

**HealthCare.gov**

[Sign up](#) for White House social media alerts  
[Get Covered](#) in the Health Insurance Marketplace

**From:** White House Press Office [<mailto:noreply@messages.whitehouse.gov>]  
**Subject:** White House Announces “Healthy Communities Challenge”

THE WHITE HOUSE  
Office of the Press Secretary

---

FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE  
November 6, 2015

**White House Announces “Healthy Communities Challenge”**



As the Affordable Care Act's coverage provisions have taken effect, 17.6 million Americans have gained coverage, and, since 2010, we've reduced the uninsured rate in this country by 45 percent. The nation's uninsured rate now stands at its lowest level ever. But still, in communities across the country, 10.5 million people eligible for Marketplace coverage remain uninsured.

Today, we are launching the White House "Healthy Communities Challenge" to engage key communities with large numbers or high percentages of uninsured in states across the country where strong federal, state and community collaboration can have a meaningful impact on reaching the uninsured. Through this challenge, we are calling on community leadership to build outreach efforts to reach these remaining uninsured and help them gain coverage.

At the end of this third open enrollment period, the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), along with State-based Marketplaces, will publish tallies of new Marketplace signups in participating communities. These tallies will be compared to HHS estimates of the number of eligible uninsured people at the start of open enrollment to see which communities made the most progress during the challenge.

The victorious community gets bragging rights, a healthier community, and a visit from President Obama to celebrate their success in helping ensure every American has health coverage.

### **Communities Participating in the "Healthy Communities Challenge"**

Based on particularly high opportunity for impact, the White House reached out to local officials in each of these 20 communities, who embraced the "Healthy Communities Challenge" to get their uninsured constituents covered:

- [Atlanta, GA](#)
- [Charlotte, NC](#)
- [Chicago, IL](#)
- [Dallas, TX](#)
- [Denver, CO](#)
- [Detroit, MI](#)
- [Great Falls, MT](#)
- [Kansas City, MO](#)
- [Las Vegas, NV](#)
- [Long Beach, CA](#)
- [Milwaukee, WI](#)
- [Nashville, TN](#)
- [New Orleans, LA](#)
- [Oakland, CA](#)
- [Philadelphia, PA](#)
- [Phoenix, AZ](#)
- [Richmond, VA](#)
- [Salt Lake City, UT](#)
- [Seattle, WA](#)
- [Tampa, FL](#)

###

REMARKS BY THE PRESIDENT

Via Telephone

2:36 P.M. EST

THE PRESIDENT: Hey, guys. Steve, thanks so much for everything you're doing. You're a great example of how folks across the country are directly changing people's lives. And I'm really, really grateful for your work.

For everybody who is on the call, I'm honored to be with you. We've got over 5,000 of you who are dedicated to helping your neighbors just like Steven. And I want to take a special moment to give a shout-out to our colleagues from the Exchange Operations, because I know they've been working hard to make sure healthcare.gov is working right. Your work doesn't go unnoticed. We are appreciative of everything that you've done to help connect people to coverage.

I want to take just a few minutes and speak with you right at the start of open enrollment because I know how hard everybody has been working, especially these first few days. And when I listen to Steven and I think about a lot of you on the phone, it reminds me of my early days as a community organizer -- some really tough days, early mornings, late nights. You'd host events, perhaps people wouldn't show up. There were times when it was challenging to figure out whether you were making an impact. And I know that there have been days that you guys have had just like that.

But I want everybody to remember that you are changing people's lives with your work. Because of you, as the law's coverage provisions have taken effect, 17.6 million Americans have gained coverage, and the nation's uninsured rate now stands at its lowest level ever. We've reduced the number of uninsured adults by 38 percent. And that means you've helped people sleep easier, get the checkup or surgery that they need, in a lot of cases live longer and lead healthier lives. And that makes the country stronger.

So we're focused right now on making sure, number one, that folks who signed up last time stay covered and continue to have a good experience, and then we want to reach a lot of folks who still haven't signed up but are eligible. And we're anticipating we're not going to have the same amount of national media attention we had in the past, so we've got to be a little more creative and we've got to talk about the most important thing that those that are still eligible for insurance, and that is affordability.

According to our data -- and we've done a lot of research on this -- about six in 10 folks still don't know that financial assistance is available, or they're confused about what that financial assistance means. What we do know is that about eight in 10 people who've signed up for health care through HealthCare.gov are getting financial help to lower the cost of their monthly premiums. And more than seven in 10 marketplace consumers are able to buy a plan for \$75 or less a month after tax credits -- 70 percent, seven in 10.

So that's where you come in. You've got to get that information out. You guys are out there dispelling information, helping to provide more Americans with the tools they need to access affordable health insurance; helping those who have coverage understand how to use it; reenrolling those who have enrolled in the first two years -- or first two open enrollment periods. And this is going to take every effort you gave in the last two open enrollment periods.

And I don't want us to ever lose sight of why we got involved in this fight in the first place, or why we're continuing to fight for it now. I know that a lot of you have had a person you think about when

the days get hard, somebody who didn't have health care in your family, somebody who got sick, somebody who you know who suffered a really bad financial burden because of an illness.

The person that I always think back to is a woman named Natoma Canfield, because in 2009, she wrote me a letter and told me that for years she had done everything right, bought health insurance, paid her premiums on time. Then 18 years ago, Natoma was diagnosed with cancer. And even though she had been cancer-free for more than a decade, her insurance companies kept on jacking up her rates year after year. Finally she had to give up her health care because she couldn't afford to lose her house.

And her story just captured situations that my mom had found herself in when she got sick, having to try to figure out finances alongside with getting better. Every one of you have a similar story. And those are the stories that carried me in the fight to pass Affordable Care Act. It reminded me of all the Americans all across the country who have had to worry not only about getting sick, but the cost as well.

Now, the good news is Natoma is well today. I just saw her a few months ago. And because of ACA, because of the work you guys have put in to make sure that health care in America changes, there are sons and daughters, and brothers and sisters, moms and dads who don't have to hang their fortune on chance. And when you think about that person or persons that you know in your own lives who've been impacted, that will help you get through the days and the calls and the knocked-on doors and going to sites to get people signed up.

I want you to remember there are millions more folks out there in that same situation. And they've been fed a lot of misinformation, and this has become, unfortunately, this political issue that it should never have been. And so that's, in a lot of circumstances, scared them off. We've got to make sure that we reach them, and the best way to do it is by your efforts.

So you guys inspire me. I'm proud of you. Keep it going.

And with that, what I want to do is turn the call over to our Secretary of Health and Human Services, who is doing a great job making this thing work all across the country -- Sylvia Burwell.

END            2:43 P.M. EST

On Friday, November 6, 2015 12:11 PM, FN-WHO-GetCovered <GetCovered@who.eop.gov> wrote:

|

On Thursday, November 19, 2015 2:22 PM, KENT KREH <kentkreh@yahoo.com> wrote:

|

Hi Minerva,

Please find the message I received from the Office of the Whitehouse earlier this month.

Please understand, this is serious stuff.

I am being stolen from again to include investor fraud now, and I must have full cooperation with my now sizable Restitution at this time the CA Dept. of Insurance Investigations.

Please contact me as requested.

Sincerely,

Kent C. Kreh  
310 400-7088

On Friday, November 6, 2015 12:50 PM, KENT KREH <kentkreh@yahoo.com> wrote:

---

## Attachments

- hccLogo[1].jpg (68.61KB)
- uninsuredRate\_110615.jpg (90.47KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Detroit.pdf (189.17KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Seattle.pdf (187.77KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Philadelphia.pdf (189.16KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Chicago.pdf (189.16KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Dallas.pdf (189.36KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Atlanta.pdf (189.05KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_KansasCity.pdf (189.16KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Salt Lake.pdf (189.22KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Great Falls.pdf (188.96KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Tampa.pdf (229.17KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Richmond.pdf (189.06KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_LongBeach.pdf (188.80KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Denver.pdf (187.50KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Oakland.pdf (188.62KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Nashville.pdf (189.22KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_NewOrleans.pdf (188.97KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Milwaukee.pdf (189.11KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Charlotte.pdf (189.28KB)
- Healthy Communities Challenge\_Phoenix.pdf (189.30KB)
- image001.png (6.24KB)

# Mayor starts his fifth stint

## Napolitano thanks city staffers at meeting

By David Rosenfeld  
david.rosenfeld@tbrnews.com

Steve Napolitano became the mayor of Manhattan Beach Tuesday evening in a City Council ceremonial nomination and vote.

Nancy Hersman became mayor pro tem.



It is Napolitano's fifth time as mayor and his fourth term on the City Council. Steve Napolitano served on the council in 1992, 1997 and 2001.

Handing the gavel to the Manhattan Beach native was Council member Amy Howorth, who served as mayor for the past eight months. Napolitano thanked Howorth for her passion and joy. "You did it with passion not just for the community, but on issues that affect our greater world," Napolitano said.

During her time as mayor, Howorth made her opinions known on gun control, pushing for greater regulations, and she took part in the worldwide Women's March. She also wasn't afraid of controversy.

"When I became mayor, I promised my colleagues I wouldn't keep anything off the agenda even if I didn't agree with it, and I held that promise." Howorth said.

The position in Manhattan Beach of the mayor, which holds no special voting power, is filled on a rotating basis among five City Council members.

In accepting the role as mayor for the next eight months, Napolitano thanked city staff and encouraged more public participation.

"Volunteer. Come to a meeting. There are lots of ways to participate with your local government that are more productive than sitting behind your computer screen watching the Nextdoor feed," Napolitano said.

In 2016, Napolitano ran against Janice Hahn for county supervisor and lost. He worked under former Los Angeles County Supervisor Don Knabe and currently works as chief of staff to a city council member in Long Beach.

"Thank you for the peaceful transition of power," Napolitano joked with his characteristic dry humor. "Thank you to my colleagues," he quipped later. "I'll need their understanding and support now more than ever as my reign of terror begins."

Enough is Enough

Guilty of Capping & Under Influence several times over = prison

No humor going on over here

See what I'm saying I rest my case...

and He brags about it...

To Whom it May Concern:

02-07-2016

I am writing again in request for help. I am a licensed financial service professional and Health Insurance Broker upholding the Affordable Care Act, Medicare, along with the Insurance and Tax Codes and all related lawful Government Policies here in Torrance, CA.

Currently, I (in the amount of up to 125 or more historic active subscriber sales) and numerous others have been the victim of Grand Theft of Sales Commissions and Wrongful Conversion of Property with all associated Collusion, Capping, Undue Influence with wrongful threats of my and honest other's health insurance sales commissions by certain dishonest and unethical Licensed Brokers and dishonest Employees of Insurance Carriers for which I have witnessed to be hundreds of thousands of dollars and growing. In addition I have experienced along with this documented fraud, certain serious associated added abuse and now certain extortion my lawful reporting attempts despite repeated institutional oral and written assurances I receive otherwise.

I was taught as an honor student at the University of California in the Business and Economics Department that within the Financial Services, which are to be the most respected in all of Business, the Licensee must be paid fairly and as agreed upon at all times or else the whole Government Policy is a Sham (Obviously). My feelings are that myself (professional licensing and top tier education here in California) and far too many honest others have way too much at stake here to have anyone speaking, acting, and operating so negligently and defiantly with our Laws and those who are to uphold. Additionally, what needs to be reminded here also is what takes years to build and create in society can be destroyed in moments by way of inappropriate behavior which I have repeatedly experienced, and simply that I am following the Law here for which we are all to be rewarded not punished.

These teachings are also maintained with my continuing professional licensed education of 20 years and must be respected for the benefit of all consumers by Law. Please assist to bring lawful help as this fraud and gross negligence that has caused the very worst of Credibility Threats along with the endless Moral and Morale hazards all leading the worst of repeated Wrongful Death of friends, family, and peers here as this Obstruction, Resistance, Gross Negligence, & Lack of Due Professional Care has sadly proven all too lethal in my business.

At this time, I request my Lawful Restitution of all my stolen monies, lawful compensation for associated earnings losses as computed, willful and serious apologies from those individual workers who have acted so recklessly and negligently with our Laws of protection, and finally someone or some office in the future I can go to for help and assistance when issues like this arise as I need to know that I have lawful protection here at all times in order to operate.

DEAR GOD PLEASE HELP.

Kent Kreh Jewell

June 29, 2022

## MEMORANDUM

It needs to be memorialized at this time with the ongoing crisis and truly endless extreme Pain & Suffering experienced to now include the *Loss of Enjoyment of Life* I sadly know here and that has been unlawfully inflicted as further evidenced with the phone call I received from my Mother on Father's Day a week ago. At this time, my Mother told me over the phone that she received a call earlier in the Day from my eldest Niece of my Brother at her current age of 28 (who has now been married for three years to a wonderful man who asked my brother first for their hand in marriage) crying uncontrollably explaining how much she loved and misses my Brother on this Day of celebration for our Fathers. This deep emotional hurt would all be within human nature as again my Brother was THE MOST loving and caring of Fathers in ALWAYS being there and providing his very best for his wife and children.

This deep emotion of sorrow my Mother experienced from my loving and appreciative eldest Niece most certainly also comes with her own desire to start a family and has her now realizing just *How* or *What* she would ever tell her own children about her Father and her Sister in that she also experienced all the extreme hurt that has wrongfully occurred here with the unlawful circumstances involved that could and should have been avoided. With this, my Mother understandably feels this all to be the most of sickening & disgusting of circumstances as I do and now feels targeted and is citing Elder Abuse in addition to the need for certain Child Abuse protection and Sexual Assault committed now also being presented for new evidence. This all occurring now in addition to the Discrimination, Hate, Kidnapping, and Criminal Child Abduction as previously asserted and again documented.

Thus, in all moderation please help for settlement of made Claims as requested at this time and without any harmful and/or damaging delays. Again, please understand we hurt (with added ailments that can be confirmed by my Doctor) so much here and simply ask now for the healing to begin as best able for me & for my fallen family tree. Thank you.

Very Truly Yours,

Kent Kreh Jewell

## ACCOUNTANCY ACT

### Preparation of State Documents

Section 5036. Whenever any statute requires that any reports, financial statements, and other documents for any department, division, board, commission, or agency of this State be prepared by certified public accountants, such requirement shall be construed to mean public accountants or certified public accountants.

HISTORY: Added Stats 1953 ch 1311 Section 1 as Section 5133; Renumbered Stats 1959 ch 310 Section 29.

### Ownership of Accountants' Work Papers \*

Section 5037. (a) All statements, records, schedules, working papers and memoranda made by a licensee or a partner, shareholder, officer, director, or employee of a licensee, incident to, or in the course of, rendering services to a client in the practice of public accountancy, except the reports submitted by the licensee to the client and except for records which are part of the client's records, shall be and remain the property of the licensee in the absence of an express agreement between the licensee and the client to the contrary. No such statement, record, schedule, working paper, or memoranda shall be sold, transferred, or bequeathed, without the consent of the client or his or her personal representative or assignee, to anyone other than one or more surviving partners or stockholders or new partners or stockholders of the licensee, or any combined or merged firm or successor in interest to the licensee.

(b) A licensee shall furnish to his or her client or former client, upon request and reasonable notice:

(1) A copy of the licensee's working papers, to the extent that those working papers include records that would ordinarily constitute part of the client's records and are not otherwise available to the client.

(2) Any accounting or other records belonging to, or obtained from or on behalf of, the client which the licensee removed from the client's premises or received for the client's account. The licensee may make and retain copies of documents of the client when they form the basis for work done by him or her.

HISTORY: Added Stats 1945 ch 1353 Section 2 as Section 5130; Renumbered Stats 1959 ch 310 Section 30; Amended Stats 1986 ch 303 Section 3.

### Partial Invalidity of Chapter

Section 5038. If any provisions of this chapter or the application thereof to any person or circumstances is held invalid, the remainder of the chapter and the application of such provision to other persons or circumstances shall not be



To Whom It May Concern,

It is at this most difficult of time that I wish to invoke all *Right of Eminent Domain* and *Inverse Condemnation* for the endless *Theft, Fraud, Waste, & Abuse* with all extreme *Unfair Competition and Undue Influence* resulting in certain realized *Extortion* now on this law abiding end to my Licensed Financial Service Businesses of Independent Accounting and Health Insurance Broker. Here, with all working property Laws in effect as well as the overwhelming unlicensed and other unfair competition at all times proving in making to be the most impossible, crippling, paralyzing, and unacceptable of professional working environments is something I simply did not sign up for with my paid and dearly valued higher University Education and State Occupational Licensing. All proving to be the worst of Moral and Morale Hazards as well as all Credibility Threats to our deeply thought out Government Plans that is just not going away anytime soon as I can see.

Please understand with no repeated protection to be found anywhere under the Law with any formal effective Civil, Criminal, or Public Cooperation for over Twenty Years now with no assurance of any future protection as we are continually promised to be ever actually coming, and while working in a business of Government Compliance I possess a License to be Lied to and Stolen From proving to be of such low quality and endured health, I am just too old now to endure any further setbacks with my freedom and planned retirement and in acting as any reasonably prudent person would under these most difficult and unplanned circumstances I hope you can now see. I would request at this point in time that your Office please work to help in drafting a letter without delay explaining these basic and fundamental effective Civil Rights and serious Causes of Actions referenced above and previously documented for which I need immediate relief that I may include this time with written Claims to Departments and Institutions within the State of California as the cost of being in business now is much too great along to include the worst of repeated wrongful deaths of friends, family & peers as well.

Again, this most difficult of circumstance simply is what It is with all I have been explaining and documenting to your office for more than a year now and to other Local and State Offices now for several more. Please include with this letter my desire to sign confidentiality agreement with State and local Government not to refer to this wrongful unlawful circumstance any more so I may move on with my paid claims into some form of Business in which the Government has the working capability and means to provide due professional civil protection. Thank you.

Kent Kreh Jewell

He/ps - Need out of "No-Man's Land."

**THE WHITE HOUSE**

WASHINGTON

September 18, 2019

Mr. Kent Conrad Jewell  
3320 Redondo Beach Boulevard  
Torrance, California 90504

Dear Mr. Jewell,

Thank you for taking the time to write to President Donald J. Trump. He is honored to serve you and our Nation.

After carefully reviewing your correspondence, we have determined that this matter is a State and local issue. Please contact officials in your State, as they are best equipped to resolve this situation. Thank you again for taking the time to write.

Respectfully,

The Office of Presidential Correspondence

⇒ Please take this directive from top Executive Office Seriously.

↳ I agree. Should be able to resolve outside of Federal Jurisdiction.

## Response to Your Message

From: The White House (noreply@contact.whitehouse.gov)

To: kentkreh@yahoo.com

Date: Wednesday, April 20, 2022, 04:55 PM PDT



THE WHITE HOUSE  
WASHINGTON

April 20, 2022

Dear Mr. Jewell,

Thank you for taking the time to share your thoughts with me. Hearing from passionate individuals like you inspires me every day, and I welcome the opportunity to respond to your letter.

Our country faces many challenges, and the road we will travel together will be one of the most difficult in our history. Despite these tough times, I have never been more optimistic for the future of America. I believe we are better positioned than any country in the world to lead in the 21st century not just by the example of our power but by the power of our example.

While we may not always agree on how to solve every issue, I pledge to be a President for all Americans. I am confident that we can work together to find common ground to make America a more just, prosperous, and secure Nation.

As we move forward to address the complex issues of our time, I encourage you to remain an active participant in helping write the next great chapter of the American story. We need your courage and dedication at this critical time, and we must meet this moment together as the United States of America. If we do that, I believe that our best days still lie ahead.

Sincerely,



wants me NOT  
to give up.

"Move for Cancer  
Victims & Families"  
- 3/1/22 message to Congress  
He Also had Brother Die from Cancer  
- Making top Priority

*If you wish to receive regular email updates from the White House, please [click here](#). You may also follow President Biden and the White House on [Facebook](#), [Instagram](#), [Twitter](#), and [YouTube](#).*

[White House Website](#) | [Privacy Policy](#) | [Contact the White House](#)

## Martha Alvarez, MMC

---

**From:** Sabrina Johnson NO BLOOD or BLOOD PRODUCTS <give2bhappy@icloud.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 17, 2023 8:49 PM  
**To:** List - City Council  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] YES HighRose YES, Please proceed promptly

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

March 17, 2023

To The Honorable City Council Members:

Please move forward with this project without delay and please do not cower to the "chill the build" lawsuit.

Manhattan Beach is home to me. I have been a Manhattan Beach resident since 1995 and a City of Manhattan Beach employee for 20 of those years, however now that I am retired my pension from the City Of Manhattan Beach puts me in a "very low income" bracket as my gross amount each month from Calpers is only \$1651, after federal and state taxes my net income is much, much lower and now I'm priced out of living in my beloved Manhattan Beach home.

I'm so very grateful for Mr. Frank Buckley beautiful vision and proposal for this High Rose Building, it gives me hope to come home. Of course, not home to my 3 bedroom house by the beach which after 25 years I've grown accustomed to having for sure, but at least home to my neighborhood, to my friends, neighbors, coffee shops, restaurants, simply being able to take a walk on the strand, the pier and the green belt, go to the hometown fair, please understand I know every inch of the city, every street, all the nicks and favorite secret places to sit and watch the waves, i love our City of Manhattan Beach and even if that means I have to live in an apartment to come home I would be very honored to have one of the six affordable units so I can be back home, the only home I know. I do understand that there are only six units available for "very low income" so I may not even be selected, even so it's my only chance to come home so please move forward with approving the construction of this project without delay. It is a matter of quality of life. Please put yourself in my shoes, as you work for the same people I gave two decades of my life to.

As you are aware, The city of Manhattan Beach offers no other alternative for someone like me, even the two Senior buildings in town have higher rents than what I receive from my monthly pension from the City of Manhattan Beach. Mr. Frank Buckley is the only one offering a viable option for me to come back home to Manhattan Beach with his beautiful building. It is honestly the only viable chance I have to come home to Manhattan Beach thanks to the fact that it offers 6 units to "very low income" there is nothing like it in the city. As a retiree of the City of Manhattan Beach for 20 years of service to its residents, the sad truth is the amount of my pension is unlivable in Manhattan Beach and places me now in the "very low income" category. Of course, the most fair thing to do would be to use your leadership and authority to increase my pension to a livable amount so that I can pay market value rent in my hometown of Manhattan Beach and be able to eat. That would be the most human thing to do, the right thing to do, certainly the most fair thing to do being that I served the residents of the city of Manhattan Beach for two decades, certainly I should be fairly compensated with a livable pension to continue to live in my hometown of Manhattan Beach.

Please use your leadership position to help those who truly need help and who have served this city for decades as an employee and good neighbor and resident and as a local consumer and supporter of local small businesses. I truly love this city but does this city love me? I'm now priced out of living at home and now have to live in cold Minnesota, where it's 6° today, it's cold, plus I have no friends here, I don't know anyone, I'm from Manhattan Beach, I want to come home, getting one of the "very low income" units that this project offers would improve my quality of life and allow me to live out my days at home near friends and neighbors and familiar places and things that only the comfort of being home can provide. The High Rose is the only option I have to come home since the pension I get from my two decades of working for the City of Manhattan Beach is very low in deed.

Please move forward with this project without delay, I want to come home to my beloved city of Manhattan Beach. The High Rose is my chance to come home and live with dignity, and have a quality of life. it is an important project and that's likely why you have so much opposition, nevertheless move forward for the GOOD this building will bring to the City of Manhattan Beach and do not give into the opposition. Rise above it! Yes for High Rose!

Sincerely,

A very concerned longtime Manhattan Beach resident,

Sabrina R. Johnson