

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Jeremy Stern <sterno2008@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 3:44 PM
To: City Clerk; Richard Montgomery; Steve Napolitano; Amy Thomas Howorth; David Lesser; Joe Franklin
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Resolution of Apology - Bruce's Beach

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Montgomery and Honorable Members of the City Council:

I am so proud that our city is finally going to come to grips with the racially motivated condemnation of the Bruce family's property and the property of other African American landowners in the 1920s and issue the apology that is long overdue.

As you consider Resolution No. 23-0037, I respectfully request that you revise Recital f, which currently reads:

The City condemned properties included those of Black property owners Willa and Charles A. Bruce, Major George Prioleau and Mrs. Ethel Prioleau, Elizabeth Patterson, Mary R. Sanders, Milton and Anna Johnson. Twenty-five other properties owned by White property owners were also condemned as part of the action.

Specifically, I request that the last sentence of Recital f be deleted in its entirety. While referencing the 25 White property owners whose properties were also condemned at the same time as the Bruce family is factually correct, the sentence is both irrelevant and insulting. It greatly diminishes the strength and sincerity of the apology which is intended to recognize the violence and hate directed at these Black families.

An apology cannot change the past, but it can set a new direction for the City and define our future. Please make this apology meaningful and sincere.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeremy H. Stern

--

+1 (310) 920-2163
sterno2008@gmail.com

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Jen Jenkins Dohner <jendohner@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 3:13 PM
To: Richard Montgomery; City Clerk; Amy Thomas Howorth; David Lesser; Steve Napolitano; Joe Franklin
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Advocating for an Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Council Members:

I write today to advocate for an apology to the Bruce family as well as the other Black families in Manhattan Beach who were wronged by our city nearly 100 years ago.

To apologize is simply to say "I'm sorry." To be "sorry" means to be filled with sorrow. It expresses the empathy, the humanity, and the compassion of saying "this pains me too." Leaving our status at acknowledgement and condemnation, while declining to apologize is akin to saying "Yes, it happened, and yes, it was wrong, but, no... we don't empathize."

Sometimes when we ask one kid to apologize to another, it is for pain they did not personally intend to cause. We focus on the impact to the injured party and not the intent of the one who caused the harm, and an apology is still given. It's also standard practice in our society to apologize to people for hardships you sympathize with but had nothing at all to do with causing. As such, an apology is not an admission of guilt.

The Manhattan Beach Board of Trustees of the 1920's was the predecessor of the Manhattan Beach City Council of today. As part of the same longstanding institution, if it were to defend or conceal past racist policies, it would be taking part in "institutional racism." Because it is also part of our system of government, this could also be called "systemic racism." While I'm heartened by those moments our community spontaneously rallied in support of local targets of racism, these responses were not initiated by the City, so they do not provide cover against the charge of institutional or systemic racism.

Some of you might still harbor concerns that an apology would increase the city's responsibility for restitution. In reality, and as we've already seen, the success of any such claims would be independent of the status of an official apology. Additionally, an acknowledgement and condemnation is already an admission: not of guilt, but merely of the truth. No additional margin of responsibility is granted at this point by an apology.

Officials sometimes engage in "memory politics" as they attempt to deny, minimize, whitewash, or "balance" the truth of history. I hope in MB we've learned by now that those efforts tend to oppose their intended effect because part of what perpetuates racism is the denial that it exists. By neglecting to apologize two years ago on behalf of its own institution, the City Council created a public relations problem for our City by parlaying our racist past into a present day national reputation. An apology from this new council would create a clean break from that racist past by separating from it in almost every aspect, including that which is most important: our humanity.

I know these things take time. Things happen in degrees to allow our community to think them over and process them. 99 years has certainly been enough time for a simple apology. Just know that a real apology comes with the resolve to do better. Regardless of whether that part happens today, I hope Manhattan Beach can further signal it's humanity with the promise to do better, not just in its words and resolutions, but in its actions as well.

Thank you for your consideration.

Jen Dohner

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Laura H. Kainsinger <lalysix@aol.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 2:28 PM
To: List - City Council; City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Apology to Bruce Family and others

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Manhattan Beach City Councilmembers:

I wanted to express my continued support for a resolution of apology to the Bruce family and other families affected by the racially motivated condemnation of properties at Bruce's Beach. As a former member of the Bruce's Beach Task Force, I'm glad to see the reconsideration of this important motion. I want to particularly thank Councilmember Steve Napolitano for his initiative in asking the City Council to apologize for what the city did almost a century ago. The key point here is the city. Please don't embrace a misleading narrative that equates the city's apology to a resident's apology. Looking forward to the city of Manhattan Beach finally being on the right side of history with regards to this issue!

with gratitude,
Laura Kainsinger

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: ThinkPad <fishandgametim@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 2:26 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology discussion..

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Elected Representatives,

I've lived in Manhattan Beach for over 18 years. I am very pleased to hear that our City leaders are now beginning to understand that we want a strong and confident community that can apologize for city misdeeds and/or transgressions that occurred before many of us were born. We are confident because we know that the past does not define our future. In fact, we have used open and honest discussion generated by this experience to create a more united and welcoming community. Manhattan Beach is where hate, racism, and anti-Semitism are not tolerated. Thank you...

Tim Jones
Morningside Drive
Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Leanne Meyers <leannemeyers@mac.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 2:23 PM
To: List - City Council
Cc: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

City Council members,

It was refreshing and important to hear Mayor Steve Napolitano issue an apology at the dedication of the BB plaque. This is an issue the previous council neglected to do. I sat for hours on end on Zoom meetings where the community made their wishes known time after time of the importance of this declaration. Please make this an official action of THIS City Council.

Thank you,

Leanne

Leanne Meyers |
1601 N. Sepulveda Blvd. #635
Manhattan Beach, CA 90266
| C: 310-500-7417

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Kristin Long <klongs@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 9:56 AM
To: List - City Council; City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Support for Resolution of Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Honorable Mayor and Esteemed Members of Council:

I want to express my support for a resolution of apology to the Black Property Owners and visitors who were unjustly harassed and discriminated against by the City of Manhattan Beach in the 1910s and 1920s. Just as Mayor Montgomery said in 2006: “A resolution would send a message that discrimination that happened back then has not and will not continue.”

As a member of the Bruce’s Beach Task Force History Committee and History Advisory Board as well as a board member for the Manhattan Beach Historical Society, I offer the following suggestions for historical accuracy:

a. In the exact parameters mentioned here, there were 5 Black families, who are named in this paragraph. Adding the “in and around the area”, would add AT LEAST 4 more (McCaskills, Irvins, Slaughters and Leggetts), but maybe more. The “roughly a half a dozen” doesn’t really work.

Suggested change:

During the years from 1912 to 1927, in the area bordered by Highland Avenue, the Strand, 26th Street, and 27th Street, **five Black families purchased property as residences or visitor-serving businesses**, including Willa and Charles A. Bruce, Major George Prioleau and Mrs. Ethel Prioleau, Elizabeth Patterson, Mary R. Sanders, and Milton and Anna Johnson.

c-ii. The story about air being let out of tires was a second-hand story and it’s unclear who did the act (i.e. the City or a random citizen). ***Suggest deleting this as it’s uncorroborated.***

c-iii. There isn’t clear proof who did the “cording off” of the property in front of the Bruces’ – whether it was “an adjacent property owner” or an employee of a real estate firm or a random citizen. ***Suggest removing this for its ambiguity.***

c-iv. The city enacted a number of ordinances aim to thwart growing Black resort community:

- Prohibiting new public bath houses east (Ord. 273)
- Requiring a special license to operate a bathhouse in the city of Manhattan Beach. (ord. 274)
- Prohibiting dressing in an automobile or other “conveyance” on the public street or temporary changing rooms or tents; regulating “the appearance of bathers” on the street (Ord. 275)
- Creating 15-minute parking zones on the streets in and around Bruce’s Beach and the Black-owned cottages. (Ocean Drive, Manhattan Avenue, Highland Avenue, Unnamed Alley Running North and South Through Blocks Nine, Ten, Twelve, Thirteen, Fourteen, Fifteen and Sixteen of Peck’s Manhattan Beach Tract and Block B of Tract 3451, Twenty-Third Street, Twenty-Fourth Street, Twenty-Fifth Street, Twenty-Ninth Street, and Thirtieth Street) (Ord. 311)

Suggested revision:

The City Council enacting ordinances sharply limiting the creation of new bathhouses and other visitor-serving facilities, creating obstacles for traditional beachgoing experiences i.e. changing into bathing suits, and making

parking difficult in the area around Bruce's Beach, in direct response to the popularity of Bruce's Beach among the Black American community; and

2. The role that the City played by tolerating racial discrimination and harassment by City residents that went unpunished, causing terror and intimidation among the Black community, **including other nearby Black property owners John McCaskill, Elzia Irvin, James and Lula Slaughter, and James and Anna Janet Leggett, as well as the Black visitors who sought beach access here.**

This is meant to include the property owners that we know of at this moment as well as the visitors such as Elizabeth Catley and Dr. H.C. Hudson who faced harassment.

Thank you for your time dedicated to, consideration for and commitment to making this world and community better.

Kristin Long Drew

Manhattan Beach Resident since 2007

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Diana Skaar <dianaskaar@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 12:04 PM
To: List - City Council; City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Support for a formal apology (RESOLUTION NO. 23-0037)

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Thank you for considering a formal apology under RESOLUTION NO. 23-0037.

It is understood by many in our City that while no current resident is responsible for actions of the City from nearly 100 years ago, we should all take responsibility for how our present-day Manhattan Beach is welcoming and inclusive. This formal apology by the City is a step in the right direction.

--

Diana Skaar
MB Resident and Parent

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Lana Rizika <lanarizika@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 11:22 AM
To: List - City Council
Cc: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Councilmembers,

I urge you to please adopt the Resolution of Apology based on Councilmember Naplitano's 2021 version. I urge you to take this opportunity to make a long-overdue formal apology to the families that were impacted by the racially-motivated act of eminent domain 100 years ago.

I appreciate that there are some in our community who do not favor an apology, perhaps out of fear or out of a claim that we personally did not commit this act. However, the Manhattan Beach of today is strong enough to take a stand, speak out for those former residents and apologize on their behalf. By making an apology, we can agree that this gross act was committed, raise awareness that yes, we were once capable of such acts, and hopefully thereby become more inclined to never repeat them.

I appreciate your consideration and look forward to a lively discussion tonight.

Best regards,

Lana Rizika

Member of the Bruce's Beach Task Force

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Tina Shivpuri <tina@shivpuri.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 10:44 AM
To: List - City Council; City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Recommending Matthew Luce for Appointment

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Mayor Montgomery, Mayor Pro Tem Franklin, Council Member Napolitano, Council Member Lesser, Council Member Howorth,

I wanted to state my recommendation for appointing **Matthew Luce** to the Selection of Long-Term Outdoor Dining Ad Hoc Task Force. When I noticed his name on the list of 118 applicants, I felt inclined to email my recommendation.

For the past 4 years, I have had to opportunity to work with Matt as a fellow parent and member of the Mira Costa Bands Booster Executive Board. During the fall seasons, we would work together on a weekly basis. It was our responsibly to coordinate and care for 150 students during extended out of state competitions and local events. Under Matt's leadership the Band program achieved new heights, thriving through the pandemic years. I can attest to his professionalism, his ability to listen, his out of the box thinking, and his desire to contribute to solutions. He is a team player and collaborator. He is a reasonable, honest, and kind human. He is truly an upstanding member of our community and would be a valuable contributor to any committee.

In addition to his current role as Mira Costa Bands Booster Co-President, he previously served as the VP of Operations for the PTSA Board at Robinson Elementary and was on the Counsel for the South Bay Adventure Guides.

I will also add that Matt has been a practicing attorney for 30 years - his primary work has been in public works construction for the last 25 years.

Thank you for considering Matthew Luce for this appointment.

Sincerely,
Tina Shivpuri

tina@shivpuri.com email
1-415-336-5075 mobile

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: Tina Shivpuri <tina@shivpuri.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 9:53 AM
To: List - City Council; City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] We Support an Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Mayor Montgomery, Mayor Pro Tem Franklin, Council Member Napolitano, Council Member Lesser, Council Member Howorth,

I wanted to express my support for a vote in favor of an Apology for the City's Role in the Racially Motivated Condemnation of Properties at Bruce's Beach. Bringing this back to the agenda, approximately 2 years after the Council voted for an Acknowledgment, is a reflection of your leadership. It shows when we have the opportunity to correct our steps and build a stronger foundation, it is more than okay to do so. Changing the resolution from an Acknowledgement to an Apology is a step our city can make towards building a more just society.

We know this step will not halt all of the wrongs we continue to see, hear and feel today. We know this work is on going. My family supports this apology and the work ahead.

When I talk to my own children about the Apology and why we should support the act of an Apology, I explain to them when someone has lost a loved one, or someone is losing a battle of any kind, we say "I am sorry for your loss" or "I am sorry for what you are experiencing." ...Followed by "How can I help?" An apology does not admit guilt, it moves everyone to a better place.

I have also learned from my son, now living in a dorm room on the east coast with 5 other boys from other parts of the country, that one of his room mates comfortably uses racial slurs on a daily basis. This work is not unique to Manhattan Beach, but your Apology is a message to our residents and others that we stand for change.

Thank you for your service to our community,
Tina Shivpuri & Family

Sincerely,
Tina Shivpuri

tina@shivpuri.com email
1-415-336-5075 mobile

Martha Alvarez, MMC

From: LAUREN BURTON <lauren.burton@me.com>
Sent: Monday, April 3, 2023 5:04 PM
To: List - City Council
Cc: City Clerk
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bruce's Beach Apology

EXTERNAL EMAIL: Do not click links or open attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Honorable Councilpersons,

I am a 27 year Manhattan Beach resident and am writing this email to urge the City Council to unanimously reconsider a Resolution of Apology for Bruce's Beach, and to use the alternative motion brought by Councilmember Napolitano in 2021 (Resolution No. 23-0037), as a framework. I understand this item is to be considered on the April 4 agenda and urge your support for Councilmember David Lesser's motion.

As both a professional mediator and trainer of 100's of mediators for the Los Angeles County Bar Association for more than 20 years, I know the value of an apology in the resolution of disputes and the settlement of potential or actual litigation. An apology could go a long way to helping to heal those who were adversely affected by the City's past actions and allow us all to move forward toward an inclusive community that welcomes all residents, business owners, and visitors. I could not agree more with former Mayor Steve Napolitano's statement at the Bruce's Beach Plaque unveiling on March 18, "We have acknowledged and condemned, but we haven't apologized. It's a simple difference but with a much deeper meaning."

Thank you for your time and your public service to Manhattan Beach.

LAUREN BURTON
1216 8th Street
Manhattan Beach, CA
90266