

ROUGHLY EDITED COPY
MANHATTAN BEACH CITY COUNCIL
REGULAR MEETING
REMOTE BROADCAST CAPTIONING
TUESDAY, April 4, 2023

Services provided by:
QuickCaption, Inc.
4927 Arlington Avenue
Riverside, CA 92504
Telephone - 951-779-0787
Fax Number - 951-779-0980
quickcaption@gmail.com
www.quickcaption.com

* * * * *

This text is being provided in a rough draft format.
Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in
order to facilitate communication accessibility and **may not be
totally verbatim record of the proceedings.**

* * * * *

>> Mayor Montgomery: OPEN SESSION.
CLOSE DOLLARS SESSION ANNOUNCEMENT.
OPEN SESSION ANNOUNCEMENT, THE CITY ATTORNEY QUINN BARROW.
>> EARLIER THIS EVENING THE CITY COUNCIL WEPT INTO CLOSED SESSION TO
DISCUSS THE ITEM IDENTIFIED ON THE 5:00 AGENDA PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT
CODE SECTION 54,956.9D2E5.
THERE WAS NO REPORTABLE ACTION TAKEN.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, MR. BARROW.
WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN THAT MEETING AND GO TO REGULAR MEETING.
HERE WE ARE.
WELCOME TO OUR REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING, TUESDAY, APRIL 4th, 2023.
BEFORE WE BEGIN I'M GOING TO HAVE EVERYBODY GET READY FOR THE NEXT
FUN PART.
CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER AND PLEDGE TO THE FLAG, LED BY JOHNNY GOSSER,
AMERICAN MARTYR.
JOHNNY, COME ON DOWN.
>> I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA.
AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WELL DONE.
DON'T GO ANYWHERE, JOHNNY.
ANYONE FROM YOUR FAMILY YOU WANT TO PULL OUT AND YOU TWO GENTLEMEN
COME ON DOWN.
>> MY MOM AND DAD.
MY TEACHER AND MY PRINCIPAL AND MR. COURTNEY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GENTLEMEN, YOU START OFF.
>> GOOD EVENING.
JOHNNY GOSSER IS A REMARKABLE STUDENT WHO HAS BEEN SIGNIFICANT
CONTRIBUTIONS TO HIS COMMUNITY AND BEYOND.
HIS OUTSTANDING ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENTS INCLUDE BEING A CONSISTENT
HONOR ROLL RECIPIENT AND PRINCIPAL'S LIST AWARD WINNER.
JOHNNY'S DEDICATION TO COMMUNITY SERVICE IS IMPRESSIVE.
HE HAS PARTICIPATED IN NUMEROUS PROJECTS INCLUDING COORDINATING AN
EIGHTH GRADE EVENT THAT RAISED OVER \$700,000 FOR CHILDREN'S CANCER
RESEARCH AND DONATING 75 COATS TO A SHELTER IN NEED THROUGH HIS COATS
FOR KIDS CAMPAIGN.
HE'S ALSO VOLUNTEERED HIS TIME AT THE SALVATION ARMY, THE ST. FRANCIS
CENTER AND THE FOOD PROJECT.
HE PLAYED FLAG FOOTBALL, BASKETBALL AND VOLLEY AT AMERICAN MATTERS
EARNING AN AWARD FOR PLAYING THREE VARSITY SPORTS.
HE WAS INDUCT INTO THE BCS HALL OF FAME AND HIS VOLLEYBALL TEAM WAS
RANKED NUMBER THREE IN THE COUNTRY.
JOHNNY'S ACTIONS ARE A TESTAMENT TO HIS COMMITMENT TO LEARNING AND
HIS DESIRE TO BE A WELL-ROUNDED INDIVIDUAL.
HIS OUTSTANDING ACHIEVEMENTS EXEMPLIFIES WHY HE IS BEING RECOGNIZED
TONIGHT AT CITY HALL.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YOU MAKE US ALL PROUD, NOT JUST THE MARTYRS BUT

ALL OF US HERE.
DO YOU WANT TO GIVE A SHOUT OUT TO MONSIGNOR WHY YOU'RE HERE?
>> HI, MONSIGNOR.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WE'RE GOING TO SEE YOU AGAIN.
COUNCIL ELECTION IS '24.
WE'RE GOING TO GIVE YOU A CITY PIN ON BEHALF OF CITY COUNCIL.
>> Councilmember Franklin: SO WE ACTUALLY MET ON THE STREET.
HE WAS RIDING E-BIKES WITH HIS BUDDIES.
A COUPLE OF THEM NEEDED TO SORT OF FIND THE RIGHT WAY TO DO THINGS,
RIGHT?
A HELMET, EVERYTHING.
BUT WHAT WAS GREAT IS HE LISTENED WELL AND THEY UNDERSTOOD AND THEY
LEARNED AND HOPEFULLY THEY'LL RIDE SAFELY BECAUSE GREAT ACHIEVEMENTS
WE WANT TO SEE MORE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: DON'T GO ANYWHERE.
NICE TRY.
ON BEHALF OF THE CITY COUNCIL WE RECOGNIZE YOU, JOHNNY GOSSER,
AMERICAN MATTER EAR SCHOOL, TODAY'S DATE, APRIL 4, 2023.
CONGRATULATIONS.
>> THANK YOU.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PHOTO SHOP ME IN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: SO FUNNY TO SEE.
>> Councilmember Lesser: SO TRUE.
>> Councilmember Howorth: I'M SURE HE'S GOING TO GET A HELMET ON NOW.
>> Mayor Montgomery: ROLL CALL PLEASE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: HERE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: HERE.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: HERE.
>> MAYOR NAPOLITANO.
>> Mayor Montgomery: HERE.
>> WE USED TO DO THIS PRECOVID, BABY PASSPORTS.
ANY BABY BORN IN THE CITY LIMITS WOULD GET A PASSPORT AND WE BROUGHT
THAT BACK THIS YEAR, A LOT OF E-MAILS SAYING RICHARD, CAN YOU BRING
IT BACK.
MARTHA, DO WE HAVE THE FIRST TWO WITH US TONIGHT?
THOSE OF US WHO DON'T KNOW WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WE HAVE THESE,
OFFICIAL MANHATTAN BEACH PASSPORTS.
SEE THOSE?
THE FLIP SIDE SHOWS THE PICTURES AND THE SEAL OF MANHATTAN BEACH.
BOTH OLIVER PASQUALI AND COOPER.
LET'S SEE IF THEY'RE HERE.
>> HI, THIS IS THEIR MOTHER, KIMBERLY PASQUALI.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WE'RE GOING TO SHOW YOU LIVE, KIM.
>> THE LITTLE ONES AREN'T ACTUALLY WITH ME.

THEY'RE GETTING READY FOR BED.
IT'S AN EARLY BED NIGHT.
>> Mayor Montgomery: ALL RIGHT.
WELL, HEY, ON BEHALF OF CITY COUNCIL WE'RE PROUD TO OFFER BOTH OLIVER
AND COOPER THEIR FIRST MANHATTAN BEACH PASSPORTS.
CAN YOU SEE THESE?
>> YES.
THANK YOU SO MUCH.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YOU'RE WELCOME.
WE'RE GOING TO GIVE THEM TO YOU IN PERSON OR COME TO CITY COUNCIL AND
I'LL GIVE THEM TO YOU WHEN I SEE YOU NEXT.
CONGRATULATIONS.
>> GREAT.
THANK YOU SO MUCH.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YOU'RE WELCOME.
BYE, KIM.
HAVE A GOOD NIGHT.
>> YOU TOO.
TAKE CARE.
>> Councilmember Lesser: NOT AS MUCH FUN WHEN THEY'RE NOT IN PERSON.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THIS IS HARD ONE FOR ME TO DO.
PRESENTATION OF COMMENDATION TO OUTGOING COMMUNICATIONS AND CIVIC
ENGAGEMENT MANAGER JESSICA VINCENT LED BY OUR OWN CITY MANAGER BRUCE
MOE.
BRUCE.
>> YES.
HAVE YOU STOPPED CRYING YET?
OKAY.
I'LL WAIT.
OKAY.
SO MANY OF YOU KNOW JESSICA VINCENT.
SHE IS OUR COMMUNICATIONS AND CIVIC ENGAGEMENT MANAGER AND SHE'S BEEN
WITH THE CITY FOR OVER 12 YEARS.
SHE STARTED IN THE PARKS AND REC DEPARTMENT AND WORKED HER WAY UP TO
BE NUMBER TWO IN PARKS AND REC BEFORE I SNAG HER OUT OF PARKS AND REC
ALONG WITH HER TEAM TO BE OUR NEWLY-APPOINTED COMMUNICATIONS AND SIC
GROUP.
IN PARKS AND REG DAYS YOU LED THE BRANDING FOR THE NEW CITY LOGO ON
THE BABY PASSPORTS THAT ARE SEEN IN OTHER PLACES INCLUDING SHOPS IN
TOWN.
YOU WERE INVOLVED IN THE MANHATTAN BEACH OPEN VOLLEYBALL TOURNAMENT.
ALL OF THAT PLANNING WAS ALL OF YOUR GUIDANCE AND EXPERTISE.
ALWAYS A SUCCESSFUL EVENT.
YOU LED THE PARKS MASTER PLAN, COMMUNITY OUTREACH WHICH WE COULD HAVE
USED AN OUTSIDE VENDOR DO THAT BUT NO WE HAD IN-HOUSE EXPERTISE AND
TOOK ADVANTAGE OF THAT.
BUT AS I SAID MORE RECENTLY -- THERE WERE MANY AWARDS THROUGHOUT THE

PARKS AND REC SOCIETY THAT WE ACHIEVED BECAUSE OF JESSICA AND HER TEAM. MORE RECENTLY YOU'RE OUR COMMUNICATIONS AND CIVIC ENGAGEMENT THAT GREATLY ENHANCED OUR COMMUNICATION WITH THE RESIDENTS AND WITH OUR OWN CITY EMPLOYEES IN THE FORM OF SOCIAL MEDIA RELEASES, PRESS RELEASES, WEBSITE UPDATES, ANYTHING YOU CAN THINK OF ONE NEWSLETTERS THAT GO OUT ON A MONTHLY BASIS.

TREMENDOUS IMPROVEMENT ON WHAT WE WERE DOING.

I WOULD SAY BEFORE JESSICA CAME HERE WE DID A PRETTY LOUSY JOB OF TELLING OUR STORY.

WE THINK YOU ALL KNOW WHAT GOOD GOES ON IN THE CITY.

CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW ALL OF THE BAD STUFF THAT GOES ON.

JESSICA HAS TAKEN IT TO NEW HEIGHTS AND WE'RE GOING TO MISS YOU. YOU HAVE MANY TALENTS, YOUR ENERGY, ENTHUSIASM, YOU'RE FUN TO BE AROUND, YOUR EYE FOR MARKETING AND PROMOTION.

YOU KNOW HOW TO PUT EVENTS TOGETHER, BIG AND SMALL.

IN FACT JESSICA PUT TOGETHER THE BRUCE'S BEACH EVENT A COUPLE OF WEEKS BACK.

AND YOU KNOW HOW TO COMMUNICATE MESSAGES EFFECTIVELY.

THAT'S WHY YOU'RE PERFECT FOR THIS ROLE.

BUT I THINK WHAT YOU DO BEST, I'VE SEEN IT AND WE'VE ALL SEEN IT IS BUILDING RELATIONSHIPS AND THAT'S SO IMPORTANT IN THE KIND OF WORK THAT YOU DO.

FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DON'T KNOW, JESSICA GOING ON TO WORK AT CHEVRON. DON'T BUY CHEVRON GAS ANYMORE.

WE'RE MAD AT THEM.

YOU'RE GOING TO TAKE THOSE RELATIONSHIP-BUILDING SKILLS AND PUT THEM TO GOOD USE THERE.

DON'T FORGET US HERE.

YOU'VE PROMISED TO INVITE US TO YOUR HOUSE FOR THE CHRISTMAS PARTY.

I'M GOING TO HOLD YOU TO THAT.

CONGRATULATIONS GOING TO CHEVRON.

WE'RE GOING TO MISS YOU TREMENDOUSLY.

WE'RE ALL STILL FAMILY HERE.

DON'T GO TOO FAR AND STOP BY AND SEE US.

>> I REALLY WASN'T READY TO SPEAK TONIGHT, BUT I DO JUST WANT TO THANK THE COUNCILMEMBERS, ALL OF YOU UP HERE HAVE PLAYED A SIGNIFICANT ROLE IN MY LIFE, INCLUDING COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO WHO IS ON THE VIDEO, COUNCILMEMBER HILDY STERN WHO IS ALSO HERE, SUZANNE HADLEY AND NANCY. I'M SO GRATEFUL FOR EVERYONE TRUSTING ME TO STEP INTO THIS ROLE AND BUILDING UP THE COMMUNICATIONS OFFICE.

I WANT TO THANK THE PARKS AND REC TEAM, MARK LEYMAN WHO GAVE ME WINKS AND LET ME FLY.

WITHOUT HIM THERE'S NO CHANCE I WOULD HAVE BEEN ABLE TO BE IN THIS ROLE.

I'M GRATEFUL TO MARK AND THE ENTIRE PARKS AND REC TEAM.

I'M SO FORTUNATE TO HAVE WORKED ALONGSIDE OF THEM.

THIS IS A VERY PASSIONATE GROUP OF INDIVIDUALS WHO ARE WORKING AS A

TEAM EVERY SINGLE DAY TO ENHANCE THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR ALL OF YOU, FOR THE VISITORS AND FOR THE BUSINESSES AND I'M SO GRATEFUL FOR THAT. AND I'M ALMOST DONE.

I DEFINITELY WANT TO THANK MY FAMILY, MY HUSBAND CHARLIE, MY SON CARTER, MY DAUGHTER DILLON OVER HERE WHO HAVE BEEN BY MY SIDE THIS WHOLE TIME WHEN I'M WORKING ON VACATIONS, THEY HAVEN'T MINDED AND BEEN THERE WITH A SMILE ON THEIR FACES, MISSING SOME OF THEIR EVENTS AND EVERYTHING BECAUSE I'VE BEEN WORKING.

THEY REALLY HAVEN'T MINDED AND THEY'VE STUCK BY ME.

LAST BUT NOT LEAST I HAVE TO RECOGNIZE MY FABULOUS COMMUNICATIONS TEAM, JOJO AND KRISTEN UP THERE WHO INSPIRE ME EVERY SINGLE DAY TO DO BETTER.

AND THEY MAKE ME LOOK GOOD.

THEY MAKE THE CITY LOOK GOOD.

WE DO THINGS THROUGH COMMUNICATION STRATEGY THAT WE ALL COLLABORATE ON TOGETHER.

AND I'M SO GRATEFUL FOR THEM EVERY SINGLE DAY.

THANK YOU ALL.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO, STEVE, YOU WANT TO SAY ANYTHING?

>> Councilmember Napolitano: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

I WOULD LOVE TO SAY SOMETHING.

IT'S A LOSS AND I'M VERY SORRY TO SEE JESSICA GO.

BUT I ALSO WANT TO CONGRATULATE HER ON TAKING THE NEXT STEP IN HER CAREER.

BUT SHE HAS REALLY REWORKED, REDONE AND REVITALIZED COMMUNICATIONS IN MANHATTAN BEACH.

WHERE BEFORE I THINK BRUCE TOUCHED ON IT, WE HAD SOME COMMUNICATIONS SOMETIMES, THEY WERE USUALLY AN AFTERTHOUGHT.

OTHER FOLKS WERE TELLING OUR STORY.

WE WEREN'T TELLING OUR OWN.

JESSICA CAME IN AND JUST OWNED IT.

THIS WAS AFTER A LONG TIME IN PARKS AND REC WHERE SHE JUST EXCELLED WITH ALL OF THE EVENTS THAT WE HAVE.

MANHATTAN BEACH HAS BEEN A BETTER PLACE BECAUSE OF JESSICA.

I KNOW THE CITY COUNCIL HAS BEEN BETTER BECAUSE OF HER WORK.

I CAN'T SAY ENOUGH GOOD THINGS ABOUT HER AND HER EFFORTS, HER DEDICATION.

I KNOW THIS WAS A VERY TOUGH DECISION FOR HER.

BUT SHE'S MAKING THE DECISION THAT'S RIGHT FOR HER AND HER FAMILY AT THIS TIME.

AND YOU KNOW, WE JUST WANT TO SUPPORT HER IN HER NEXT LIFE.

As BRUCE SAID, WE'RE HERE AND WE HOPE YOU COME BACK AND VISIT OFTEN.

WE KNOW WE'LL SEE YOU AROUND TOWN AT DIFFERENT EVENTS AND EVERYTHING.

AND CERTAINLY CHEVRON'S GAIN.

BUT JESSICA SET A NEW STANDARD FOR THE CITY IN TERMS OF COMMUNICATION AND SO MANY OTHER THINGS IN DEDICATION AND I REALLY JUST WANT TO FROM

THE BOTTOM OF MY HEART SAY THANK YOU, THANK YOU FOR ALL YOU'VE DONE FOR US AND FOR YOUR FRIENDSHIP.

>> Councilmember Howorth: THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR AND THANK YOU, JESSICA.

BRUCE MENTIONED YOU'VE BEEN HERE A LONG TIME -- NOT A LONG TIME BUT SINCE 2013, I THINK?

2010.

SEE.

SO SINCE 2011 WE'VE WORKED TOGETHER AND ISN'T IT GREAT TO SEE SOMEONE GROW AND EVOLVE IN A PLACE.

AND I THINK THAT'S A TESTAMENT TO OUR INSTITUTION AND ALL OF THE PEOPLE WHO WORK HERE AND THE PEOPLE WHO MANAGE IT.

BUT IT'S MORE A TESTAMENT TO YOU AND THIS NEXT STEP IS ALSO -- YOU KNOW, IT'S SCARY TO TAKE A STEP LIKE THAT SO KUDOS TO YOU FOR TAKING IT.

BUT YES, I'M MAD.

BUT IT SPEAK TO WHO YOU ARE AND WHERE YOU COME FROM.

LIKE YOU SAID, THE GROUP OF PEOPLE THAT WORK HERE IN THE CITY ARE SO DEDICATED.

AND YOU THANK YOU FAMILY FOR NOT MINDING WHEN YOU WERE HERE WORKING. AND I JUST NEED TO REITERATE TO THE PUBLIC HOW MUCH SHE'S HERE.

IT'S NOT JUST VACATIONS.

IT'S SATURDAYS AND SUNDAYS UNTIL 8:00 AND 9:00.

SHE AND JOJO WILL KEEP WORKING ON A BROCHURE OR A FLYER TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S REALLY GREAT TO GET PEOPLE THERE.

YOUR PASSION FOR THE CITY HAS JUST BEEN GOOD FOR ALL OF US.

YOU'VE TAUGHT US THAT WE HAVE TO REACH OUT TO TELL OUR STORY.

THAT WE CAN'T JUST SIT HERE AND EXPECT.

AND I'M REALLY GOING TO MISS YOU.

SO THANK YOU FOR ALL YOU'VE DONE AND I WISH YOU GREAT SUCCESS.

BUT YOU CAN ALWAYS COME BACK, YOU KNOW, COME BACK, YOU KNOW, AND SIT UP HERE.

BUT THANK YOU, JESSICA.

>> Councilmember Lesser: JUST BRIEFLY, JESSICA.

I'VE KNOWN YOU SINCE YOU WERE AT PARKS AND REC AND SAW THE SORT OF JOB YOU DID THERE ADVERTISING THEIR PROGRAMMING.

SO ONE OF THE SMARTEST THINGS THAT OUR CITY MANAGER DID IS TO BRING YOU AND YOUR TEAM INTO THE OFFICE TO TELL YOUR STORY AS A CITY.

YOU'RE GOING TO BE MISSED.

YOU REALLY WILL.

I WISH YOU ALL THE BEST IF YOUR NEXT JOB VENTURE.

>> Councilmember Franklin: JESSICA, I WANT TO SAY SOMETHING BUT YOU'D HAVE TO WRITE IT FOR ME.

WHAT IS IT YOU WOULD LIKE TO HEAR.

NO.

SERIOUSLY, I HAVEN'T BEEN ON COUNCIL LONG, FORTUNATELY YOU WERE THERE. BUT I HAVE KNOWN YOU IN MY CIVILIAN LIFE ALL THROUGH THE TIMES THAT

I WAS INTERACTING WITH PARKS AND RECREATION.
I THINK YOU AWARDED ME A TROPHY FOR MY TENNIS ACHIEVEMENTS.
BUT REALLY WHAT I WAS IMPRESSED WITH HERE IS YOUR PROFESSIONALISM,
YOUR WILLINGNESS TO TAKE INPUT ON MANY DIFFERENT OCCASIONS, AND YOU
INCORPORATED THAT INTO OUR COMMUNICATIONS WITH THE RESIDENTS OF
MANHATTAN BEACH AND THAT'S VERY, VERY POWERFUL AND VERY, VERY USEFUL
FOR EVERYBODY, TO GET OUR STORY OUT THERE, TO GET IT CORRECTLY IS
REALLY IMPORTANT TO EVERYBODY.
AND, YOU KNOW, OUR LOSS, CHEVRON'S GAIN.
GOOD LUCK.
>> Mayor Montgomery: FAREWELL TOUR.
I WON'T MAKE IT ANY LONGER.
I WANT TO SAY I'M PROUD OF YOU.
AND THOSE OF YOU WHEN THINGS GOT REALLY BAD WITH THE CITY, SHE WAS
UP WITH ME AT 11:00 WITH THE CITY MANAGER WRITING WHAT WE'RE GOING
TO WRITE TO THE PAPERS.
NO ONE KNOWS THAT UNLESS YOU'RE PART OF THE TEAM.
IT'S NOT MY WORDS OR JOE'S WORDS, SHE'S WRITING OUR COMMENTS, PUTS
THEM IN ONE STORY.
YES, THE MAYOR GETS THE NAME SIGNED IT TO BUT SHE'S THE SOMEONE THAT
WRITES ALL OF THAT.
I'LL MISS THAT PART OF IT TOO, GOING FORWARD.
I'M NOT TALKING TO JEFF WILSON.
AT LEAST A YEAR.
>> Councilmember Franklin: GIVE HER A CITY PIN.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YOUR LAST CITY PIN.
AND THERE'S A COMMENDATION.
I'M NOT GOING TO READ IT ALL.
WE'RE ALL PROUD OF YOU, WISH YOU THE BEST AND COME VISIT.
CONGRATULATIONS.
>> Councilmember Howorth: I'M JUST GOING TO DO THE REST OF THE MEETING
STANDING UP.
THIS WAS MINE, RIGHT?
>> Councilmember Franklin: OH, YEAH, THIS IS MINE.
THANK YOU.
MUSICAL CHAIRS.
WHAT DOES STEVE ALWAYS SAY, IT'S DOWN HILL FROM HERE.
NO MORE CEREMONIAL.
ITEM E, APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND WAIVER OF FULL READING OF ORDINANCES.
COUNCIL.
>> Councilmember Lesser: SO MOVED.
>> Mayor Montgomery: I SEE A FIRST BY COUNCILMEMBER DAVID LESSER AND
A SECOND BY COUNCILMEMBER AMY HO WORTH.
ROLL CALL.
>> MAYOR NAPOLITANO.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.

>> Councilmember Franklin: YES.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: YES.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: YES.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: YES.
>> Mayor Montgomery: COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION ANNOUNCEMENTS OF
UPCOMING EVENT.
ONE MINUTE PER PERSON FOLKS.
ONE MINUTE PER PERSON.
>> MR. MAYOR BEFORE WE GET INTO THAT I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE AN
ANNOUNCEMENT ABOUT THE CITY'S E-MAIL.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES, PLEASE.
>> YOU'RE PROBABLY AWARE WE HAVE HAD INTERMITTENT SERVICE OUTAGES.
IT'S HAPPENING ON A DAILY BASIS.
E-MAILS GET THROUGH EVENTUALLY BUT IT'S BEEN SPOTTY.
WE'VE BEEN TROUBLESHOOTING THIS FOR THE LAST SEVERAL DAYS AND WE HAVE
A SOLUTION TO IMPLEMENT IT.
I REALIZE THAT SOME OF THE RESIDENTS' E-MAIL THAT HAVE COME INTO THE
COUNCIL EITHER DIDN'T ARRIVE IN A TIMELY MANNER OR MAY NOT HAVE ARRIVED
YET.
IF RESIDENTS ARE WONDERING WHY THEY HAVEN'T HEARD BACK FROM COUNCIL
OR STAFF ON A PARTICULAR ITEM IT MAY BE THE INTERMITTENT OUTAGE THAT
WE'RE HAVING.
WE'LL KEEP YOU POSTED ON THE STATUS BUT I WANT YOU TO BE AWARE OF THAT.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YOU RECOMMEND THAT RESIDENTS CALL?
E-MAIL IS DOWN, CALL?
>> THEY DO EVENTUALLY GET THROUGH BUT IF IT'S SOMETHING URGENT, PLEASE
TO GIVE US A CALL.
>> Mayor Montgomery: JOSH, PLEASE.
>> HELLO, GOOD EVENING, MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL.
I'M JOSH MURRAY HERE ON BEHALF OF MANHATTAN BEACH LIBRARY.
ADULTS ARE INVITED TO PARTICIPATE IN THE EVENING BOOK CLUB ON MONDAY,
MAY 1st FROM 6:30 TO 7:30 P.M.
MAY'S BOOK IS "YOU'RE INVITED."
FROM THE AWARD-WINNING AUTHOR OF "MY SWEET GIRL" COMES A NEW THRILLER
ABOUT A WEDDING CELEBRATION THAT NOT EVERYONE WILL SURVIVE.
WE DO HAVE A LIMITED AMOUNT OF TITLES AVAILABLE FOR BOOK CLUB
ATTENDEES.
AGAIN THIS PROGRAM WILL TAKE PLACE ON MONDAY, MAY 1st, 6:30 TO 7:30
P.M. AT THE MANHATTAN BEACH LIBRARY AND THE TITLE IS "YOU'RE INVITED."
THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.
>> Mayor Montgomery: JOSH MURRAY IS YOUR ANSWER, MAN.
IF YOU'RE GOING TO THE LIBRARY, JOSH IS THE GUY TO SEE.
NEXT SPEAKER.
>> HI.

MY NAME IS VAL PADGET.

I'M HERE WITH MY COLLEAGUE TO ANNOUNCE THIS YEAR'S PROJECT WHICH IS AN INITIATIVE DEDICATED TO BUILDING A NUTRITION PANTRY FOR THE SINGLE MOM PROJECT.

OUR GOAL IS TO EXPAND THE REACH OF THE SINGLE MOM PROJECT AND ENABLE IT TO FEED 50 SINGLE PARENT FAMILIES A WEEK.

TO ACCOMPLISH THIS GOAL LNB2023 WILL TRANSFORM A ROOM AT RIDGESTONE INTO A NUTRITION PANTRY.

WE'RE PARTNERING WITH TRADER JOE'S TO PROVIDE NUTRITIONAL FOOD ITEMS, FRESH VEGETABLES AND STAPLES.

WE NEED YOUR HELP TO MAKE THIS PROJECT A REALITY.

OUR COMMUNITY IS KNOWN FOR COMING TOGETHER TO SUPPORT ONE ANOTHER AND WE BELIEVE WE CAN MAKE A MEANINGFUL DIFFERENCE IN THESE PEOPLE'S LIVES.

PLEASE CONSIDER MAKING A DONATION OF ME AMOUNT BY APRIL 350,2023 OR VISIT OUR WEBSITE.

THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, VAL.

WELL DONE, CHERYL.

OUR NEXT SPEAKER.

>> GOOD EVENING, MAYOR, MAYOR PRO TEM, HONORABLE COUNCILMEMBERS.

MY NAME IS [INDISCERNIBLE].

I'M YOUR LIAISON WHEN WM AND THE CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH.

WE INVITE ALL RESIDENTS AND BUSINESSES IN MANHATTAN BEACH TO PARTICIPATE IN THE FREE SHED EVENT TAKING PLACE THIS SATURDAY, APRIL 8th FROM 9 A.M. TO 11 A.M. AT MIRA COASTA HIGH SCHOOL PARKING LOT.

EACH HOUSEHOLD OR BUSINESS CAN BRING THREE BOXES FOR SAFE SHREDDING. WE ASK THAT YOU STAY IN YOUR VEHICLE AND OPEN YOUR TRUNK FOR OUR TEAM TO GRAB WHAT NEEDS TO BE SHREDDED.

THANK YOU ALL AND I HOPE TO SEE YOU ALL THERE BRIGHT AND EARLIER.

>> Mayor Montgomery: TELL THEM WHAT WM MEANS.

>> WASTE MANAGEMENT.

IT'S A CORPORATE REBRANDING.

>> Mayor Montgomery: WELL DONE.

>> NO PROBLEM.

THANK YOU SO MUCH.

>> Mayor Montgomery: OUR NEXT SPEAKER.

NO ONE ELSE HERE?

ON ZOOM, PLEASE, MARTHA.

DAVID ARCHER.

>> THANK YOU HONORABLE MAYOR MONTGOMERY.

I WANT TO INVITE YOU ALL TO COME OUT TO THE SOUTH BAY COMMUNITY COALITION AGAINST HATE.

WE HAVE A COMMUNITY CONVERSATION WITH FRANK MEEINK, A RECOVERING SKIN HEAD AND HE'S GOING TO TALK ABOUT HIS TRANSFORMATION AND TRIUMPH OVER HATRED.

AND ALSO WE HAVE OUR PHENOMENAL WOMEN EVENT COMING UP ON MAY 11th, THURSDAY, FROM 10 TO 2 AND IT WILL BE AT THE CONNECT A CAMPUS OVER OFF OF PARK AVENUE.

SO LOOK FORWARD TO SEE YOU ALL OUT THERE AND THANK YOU FOR ALL OF THE WORK YOU GUYS DO FOR THE CITY.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, DAVID.

ANYONE ELSE, MARTHA?

WILL YOU POST UP THE MAYOR'S COFFEE FOR A SECOND, PLEASE.

WHILE SHE'S DOING THAT, THOSE OF YOU WHO DON'T KNOW, I BROUGHT BACK THE COFFEE WITH THE MAYOR.

IT'S A ONE-ON-ONE, NO STAFF, NO ZOOM, THANK GOD, COFFEE WITH YOURS TRULY.

WE START AT EAST SIDE AT COFFEE BEAN, TEA LEAF AND MANHATTAN VILLAGE. TODAY WAS THE FIRST ONE.

WE HAD SIX RESIDENTS.

TWO OF THEM I KNEW.

NEXT ONE IS APRIL 25th ON THE EAST SIDE.

THERE IS LIFE EAST OF PCH.

IF YOU WANT TO SHOW UP THERE, JUST A VERY FORMAL, COME ASK WHATEVER YOU WANT AND WE'LL GO FROM THERE.

COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.

>> Councilmember Howorth: THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR.

MADAM CITY CLERK IF YOU CAN PUT UP THE FLYER WHICH JUST AMPLIFIES WHAT DAVID ARCHER FROM THE CHAMBER OF COMMERCE WAS SAYING ABOUT THE EVENT ON APRIL 20 '3 WITH FRANK MEEINK, THE REFORMED WHITE SUPREMACIST. I WANT TO POINT OUT, THIS IS A SOUTH BAY COMMUNITY COALITION AGAINST HATE PROGRAM.

THIS IS THE COALITION THAT WAS FORMED BY HILDY STERN WHEN SHE WAS ON THE CITY COUNCIL.

THIS SAN EFFORT THAT IS LED BY OUR CITY AND I THINK IT'S SO IMPORTANT THAT WE ARE COMMITTED TO THIS TYPE OF ACTION.

AND THESE EVENTS HAVE BEEN WELL ATTENDED AND I REALLY HOPE -- THIS IS AN INCREDIBLE SPEAKER AND I HOPE, YOU KNOW, THAT OUR POLICE WILL ATTEND AND OTHER POLICE WILL ATTEND, STUDENTS WILL ATTEND, PARENTS WILL ATTEND.

WE HAVE A CITY COUNCIL MEMBER FROM -- ACTUALLY THE MAYOR FROM HERMOSA BEACH, STAFF AND CITY FROM EL SEGUNDO.

THIS IS A COMMUNITY SOUTH BAY WIDE COALITION.

WE ARE DEDICATED TO EDUCATION, RAISING AWARENESS AND THIS IS GOING TO BE AN INCREDIBLE EVENT.

I HOPE EVERYBODY WILL ATTEND.

THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

>> Mayor Montgomery: ANYBODY ELSE?

ALL RIGHT.

AT THIS TIME WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO THE REGULAR PUBLIC COMMENTS. THREE MINUTES PER PERSON.

IF YOU'RE FIRST TIME SPEAKING TO COUNCIL, IF YOU SPEAK ON AND ITEM

ON THE AGENDA, YOU SPEAK NOW OR SPEAK THEN.
NOT BOTH ON THE ITEM ON THE AGENDA.
YOU HAVE THREE MINUTES TOTAL PER PERSON AND OUR NEXT SPEAKER -- I'M SORRY.
OUR NEXT SPEAKER WILL BE -- MARTHA, WHO IS THE FIRST SPEAKER UP?
ANYBODY ONLINE?
PUBLIC COMMENTS?
HERE'S OUR FIRST PERSON.
ALL RIGHT.
WE'LL DO ZOOM LAST.
>> HONORABLE MAYOR, ESTEEMED COUNCIL, MY NAME IS CHRISTINE.
I'M HERE TODAY TO SHOW SUPPORT FOR A FORMAL APOLOGY FOR THE BRUCE'S BEACH INCIDENTS AND THE INCIDENTS THAT HAPPENED HERE IN 1920.
IT'S OVERDUE, AS MAYOR MONTGOMERY SAID IN 2006.
17 YEARS LATER IT'S WELL OVERDUE.
WE WEREN'T HERE THEN, WE DIDN'T DO ANYTHING AND THEY'RE NOT WRONG.
BUT NOW IN YOUR CHANCE TO DO SOMETHING.
NOW IS THE CHANCE TO HAVE THE COURAGE TO ADMIT THAT JUDGING PEOPLE BASED ON THE COLOR OF THEIR SKIN IS WRONG, THAT WE ALL KNOW THAT.
WILL AN APOLOGY FIX EVERYTHING?
NOT A CHANCE.
AND APPARENTLY NEITHER WILL \$20 MILLION.
WHAT AN APOLOGY SHOWS THAT MONEY NEVER WILL IS WE'RE DIFFERENT AND BETTER THAN OUR FOREFATHERS.
IT'S IMPORTANT BECAUSE RIGHT NOW WE'RE NOT ACTING ANY DIFFERENT.
LET'S CHANGE THAT TONIGHT.
AND IF YOU STILL FIND IT INCOMPREHENSIBLE AND INCONCEIVABLE TO APOLOGIZE FOR SOMEONE YOU DON'T KNOW FOR SOMETHING YOU DIDN'T DO OR THAT YOU KNOW WAS WRONG, THEN I'M SORRY TO YOU.
I HOPE WE CAN SHOW YOU TONIGHT THAT IT'S NOT THAT DIFFICULT AND THAT IT ACTUALLY MIGHT DO SOME GOOD.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.
OUR NEXT SPEAKER.
>> GOOD EVENING, MY NAME IS ADAM GOLDSTON.
30-YEAR RESIDENT OF MANHATTAN BEACH.
IT'S IRONIC THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT OUTDOOR DINING TONIGHT ON A NIGHT THAT'S SO COLD AND WINDY TO NOBODY WOULD WANT TO SIT OUTSIDE.
I AM APPLYING FOR THE POSITION OF THE COMMITTEE AND HOPE I AM SELECTED THIS EVENING.
I WANT TO ECHO THIS COUNCIL'S IF NOT FIRST, ONE OF THE FIRST THINGS YOU DID WITH THIS NEW COUNCIL WITH PUBLIC SAFETY AND ADDITIONAL MONEY GOING TO THE POLICE DEPARTMENT.
THAT WOULD BE FOREFRONT IN MY MIND AS WE THINK ABOUT HOW TO PROCEED WITH OUTDOOR DINING, EMERGENCY ACCESS, VEHICLE/BIKE/PEDESTRIAN TRAFFIC, DINERS ON THE PLATFORM AND OF COURSE AN ISSUE NEAR AND DEAR TO MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN'S HEART, E-BIKES RACING UP AND DOWN THE SIDEWALK.

I SEE CREATIVE SOLUTIONS.
IN THE OUTDOOR DINING CONTEXT, I THINK THE OPTIMUM SOLUTION IS A
LONG-TERM SOLUTION THAT'S BEST FOR THE ENTIRE COMMUNITY.
THERE'S A LOT OF STAKEHOLDERS THAT MAKE UP THIS COMMUNITY.
I DO EMPATHIZE.
I SYMPATHIZE WITH THE STAKEHOLDERS.
AFTER 30 YEARS I REALLY DO BELIEVE I SYMPATHIZE WITH MANY OF THESE
DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS.
I'LL THROW OUT A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES.
NOISE.
I UNDERSTAND HOW OUTDOOR DINING CAN BE NOISY.
I LIVE ON A WALK STREET.
I WOULD NOT BE HAPPY IF ONE OF MY NEIGHBORS HAD OUTDOOR DINNER PARTIES
ON THEIR PATIO SEVEN DAYS A WEEK.
IT'S A SMALL TOWN.
WE NEED TO MAINTAIN THE SMALL-TOWN FEEL.
AESTHETICS ARE IMPORTANT.
AESTHETICS ARE IMPORTANT TO THOSE THAT DINE AND THOSE WHO DON'T DINE
INDOORS AND OUTS.
INFRASTRUCTURE AND CLEANLINESS WOULD BE ON THE TOP OF MY LIST AS WELL.
I LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING INTO THAT ISSUE BUT I DO BELIEVE WHEN WE
DO, THE COMMITTEE DOES, WE'LL FIND THAT THERE'S ENOUGH CHALLENGES
ALREADY WITH OUR INFRASTRUCTURE.
REVENUE, FORGONE REVENUE ARE IMPORTANT.
AND THE LAST THING I WANT TO SAY ABOUT THE DIFFERENT CONSTITUENCIES
IS NOT FORGETTING ABOUT THE CONSTITUENCIES OUTSIDE OF MANHATTAN
BEACH.
THERE'S A LOT OF FOLKS THAT DEPEND ON JOBS THAT MAYBE DON'T LIVE IN
MANHATTAN BEACH BUT THOSE FAMILIES ARE DEPENDENT ON IT.
I LOOK FORWARD TO REPRESENTING -- I THINK THERE ARE 118 -- SO THE 110
PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT GOING TO BE SELECTED THIS EVENING AS WELL AS THE
REST OF THE COMMITTEE.
THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, ADAM.
OUR NEXT SPEAKER.
>> THANKS YOU, COUNCIL.
MY NAME IS DAVE GREENBERG.
I'M ALSO A RESIDENT OF THE CITY AND HAD SUBMITTED AN APPLICATION TO
JOIN THE BOARD AS WELL.
WE'LL SEE WHAT HAPPENS WITH THAT.
AS WE KNOW, IT'S A LARGE LIST.
I'LL ECHO SOME OF ADAM'S SENTIMENTS.
I THINK THERE'S SEVERAL PROS AND CONSTITUENCY OF OUTDOOR DINING.
IT'S IRONIC THAT WE'RE ONE OF THE ONLY BEACH TOWNS IN ALL OF L.A. AND
ORANGE COUNTY THAT HAS ELIMINATED IT.
YOU KNOW, I'M A REGULAR PATRON DOWNTOWN.
I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WHOEVER IS INCLUDED IN THIS SHOULD BE

SOMEONE THAT IS ACTUALLY ACTIVE, RIGHT.
THAT THAT'S NOT JUST THERE EVERY ONCE IN A WHILE.
THAT UNDERSTANDS THE IMPLICATION TO STAFFING.
SOME OF THE RESTAURANTS HAVE ALREADY HAD TO LAY OFF STAFF.
TO TAX REVENUE FOR THE CITY.
I KNOW SOME OF THE RULES WERE TO CUT BACK ON THE NUMBER OF INDOOR DINERS
WHILE DOING OUTDOOR DINING.
WE ALL KNOW THAT THAT PROBABLY DIDN'T HAPPEN.
THE END RESULT WAS INCREMENTAL TAX REVENUE FOR THE CITY.
THERE ARE SEVERAL PROS AND CONS.
ONE OF THE BIGGEST CONS WE'VE SEEN ARE THE RODENT AS TEN NOISE THAT
WERE A NATURAL BYPRODUCT OF THE OUTDOOR DINING.
THOSE ALL CAN BE SOLVED WITH THE RIGHT APPROACH AND THE RIGHT WORK.
NEW YORK CITY, OTHER MAJOR CITIES THAT HAVE DINING ON A REGULAR BASIS.
I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE FAILED TO THE AND WE CAN DO A BETTER
JOB IS CLEANING THE SIDEWALKS AND DOING A BETTER JOB OF CONTROLLING
THE GARBAGE IN AND AROUND DOWNTOWN AS IT RELATES TO THIS.
BUT I WOULD HOPE THAT AS A COMMUNITY WE CAN SERIOUSLY CONSIDER BOTH
THE POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE, COME TO A GOOD RESOLUTION THAT BENEFITS
BOTH THE RESIDENTS AND THE CITY THAT HAS A COMMON AND APPEALING
AESTHETIC BUT THAT BENEFITS THE CITY AND ALL OF THE VISITORS THAT COME
TO THE CITY.
IT WOULD BE A SHAME TO SEE IT DISAPPEAR.
THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, DAVE.
OUR NEXT SPEAKER.
>> HI, I'M CARRIE.
I'M IN SUPPORT THE APOLOGY.
TO APOLOGIZE IS TO SAY I'M SORRY.
TO BE SORRY MEANS TO BE FILLED WITH SORROW.
IT EXPRESSES THE COMPASSION OF SAYING THIS PAINS ME TOO.
WHILE DECLINING TO APOLOGIZE IS AKIN TO SAYING YES, IT HAPPENED AND
YES IT WAS WRONG, BUT NO, WE DON'T EMPATHIZE.
WHEN WE FOCUS ON THE IMPACT TO THE INJURED PARTY RATHER THE INTENT
OF THE ONE THAT CAUSED THE HARM, IT'S POSSIBLE TO APOLOGIZE TO ANOTHER
FOR A PAIN WE DID NOT PERSONALLY INTEND TO CAUSE.
IT'S ALSO STANDARD PRACTICE IN OUR SOCIETY TO APOLOGIZE TO PEOPLE FOR
HARDSHIPS YOU SYMPATHIZE WITH BUT HAD NOTHING AT ALL TO DO WITH
CAUSING.
THINK OF WHAT YOU MIGHT SAY TO A FRIEND WHO IS EXPERIENCING LOSS.
AS SUCH AN APOLOGY IS NOT AN ADMISSION OF GUILT.
ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND CONDEMNATION IS ALREADY AN ADMISSION, NOT OF GUILT
BUT MERELY OF THE TRUTH.
I HOPE IN MB WE'VE LEARNED BY NOW THAT ATTEMPTS TO DENY, MINIMIZE,
WHITEWASH OR BALANCE THE TRUTH OF HISTORY TEND TO OPPOSE THEIR
INTENDED AFFECT BECAUSE PART OF WHAT PERPETUATES RACISM IS THE DENIAL
THAT IT EXISTS BY NEGLECTING TO APOLOGIZE TWO YEARS AGO ON BEHALF OF

ITS OWN INSTITUTION, THE CITY COUNCIL CREATED A PUBLIC RELATION PROBLEM FOR OUR CITY.
BY PARLAYING OUR RACIST PAST INTO A PRESENT-DAY NATIONAL REPUTATION.
AND APOLOGY FROM THIS NEW COUNCIL WOULD CREATE AN IMPORTANT BREAK FROM THAT RACIST PAST BY SEPARATING IT IN ALMOST EVERY ASPECT INCLUDING THAT WHICH IS MOST IMPORTANT, OUR HUMANITY.
I KNOW THESE THINGS TAKE TIME.
THINGS HAPPEN IN DEGREES TO ALLOW THE COMMUNITY TIME TO THINK THEM OVER AND PROCESS THEM.
99 YEARS HAS CERTAINLY BEEN ENOUGH TIME FOR A SIMPLE APOLOGY.
PLEASE NOTE THAT A REAL APOLOGY COMES WITH THE RESOLVE TO DO BETTER. REGARDLESS OF WHETHER THAT PART HAPPENS TODAY, I HOPE MANHATTAN BEACH CAN FURTHER DEMONSTRATE ITS HUMANITY WITH THE PROMISE TO DO BETTER, NOT JUST IN ITS WORDS AND RESOLUTIONS BUT IN ITS ACTIONS AS WELL.
THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.
WORDS BY JEN DONOR.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.
OUR NEXT SPEAKER.
COME DOWN TO THE BOTTOM IF YOU'RE GOING TO TALK HERE, FOLKS.
ANYBODY GOING TO TALK AFTER HER?
IF NOT I'M GOING TO ZOOM.
>> GOOD EVENING, MAYOR AND COUNCILMEMBERS.
MY NAME IS JULIE.
I'VE LIVED IN MANHATTAN BEACH FOR 30 YEARS.
IT'S BEEN A JOY AND A PRIVILEGE AND A JOY AND A PRIVILEGE THAT HAS BEEN DENIED TO SOME BECAUSE OF WHAT HAPPENED 100 YEARS AGO IN MANHATTAN BEACH.
THE COMMON THREAD THAT I'VE SEEN THROUGHOUT THIS HISTORY IS THE PRETEXT OF IT.
A HUNDRED YEARS AGO AN EMINENT DOMAIN ACTION WAS FILED UNDER THE PRETEXT THAT THE CITY NEEDED THE LAND FOR A PUBLIC PARK.
THE TRUE MOTIVE WAS RACISM.
TWO YEARS AGO WHEN THE CITY HAD BEFORE IT THE OPPORTUNITY TO APOLOGIZE, THE CITY USED A DIFFERENT PRETEXT IN DENYING AN APOLOGY BY SAYING THAT IT WOULD EXPOSE THE CITY TO LIABILITY.
THAT EXCUSE AND PRETEXT HAS BEEN REVEALED AS A MYTH.
NOBODY IS EVEN MAKING THAT ARGUMENT ANYMORE.
BUT I NOW AM HEARING A PRETEXT THAT WE DIDN'T DO ANYTHING WRONG PERSONALLY.
WE DON'T NEED TO APOLOGIZE FOR IT.
THAT'S A PRETEXT.
AND WE'VE JUST GOTTEN MORE SOPHISTICATED IN OUR PRETEXTS IN THE LAST HUNDRED YEARS.
AND I'M HERE TO ENCOURAGE THE CITY COUNCIL TO PLEASE MAKE THE ONLY PURE AND HONEST CHOICE THAT REFLECTS HUMANITY AND TO ISSUE A UNANIMOUS APOLOGY FOR ALL OF THE HARM THAT'S BEEN DONE AND THAT HAS PERSISTED OVER THE PAST HUNDRED YEARS.

THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

OUR NEXT SPEAKER.

>> YES, HELLO.

MY NAME IS LAURA KYLIE AND I'VE BEEN A RESIDENT SINCE 1994 AND I'M NOT GOING TO TAKE MY WHOLE TIME BECAUSE PEOPLE BEFORE WE HAVE SPOKEN SO ELOQUENTLY ON THE ISSUE OF APOLOGIZING FORMALLY TO THE BRUCE FAMILY.

AND I WOULD JUST LIKE TO SAY ON THE RECORD AS A RESIDENT OF OUR TOWN THAT I LOVE SO MUCH THAT I WOULD LOVE TO SEE CITY COUNCIL UNANIMOUSLY OFFER AN APOLOGY THAT'S LONG OVERDUE.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

ONE MORE TIME, ANYBODY ELSE?

PERSON?

SEEING NONE.

ZOOM.

ALL RIGHT.

HEATHER.

>> OH, YES.

SORRY.

HELLO.

HI.

MY NAME IS HEATHER AND I AM -- I DID NOT GET A CHANCE TO REALLY GO THROUGH ALL OF THE E-MAILS BY -- I FORGET HIS NAME BUT I THINK IT'S KENT CRAY JEWELL?

AND I BELIEVE THAT IT MIGHT BE AN ACTUAL LAWSUIT COMING TO THE CITY THAT WAS -- THAT IS BEING INITIATED BECAUSE OF THE APOLOGY THAT WAS MADE OR IS GOING TO BE MADE.

SO I WILL ADMIT I DON'T KNOW EVERYTHING ABOUT THIS.

I JUST GOT THE E-MAIL ATTACHMENTS LATE THIS AFTERNOON AND I HAVEN'T GONE THROUGH IT ALL.

BUT I JUST WANTED TO TELL YOU SOMETHING REALLY QUICK ABOUT APOLOGIES. MY HUSBAND AND I HAVE BEEN MARRIED FOR 20 YEARS, THREE MONTHS AND THREE DAYS.

I'M STILL MADLY IN LOVE WITH THIS MAN EVEN THOUGH WE WENT THROUGH A ROUGH PATCH MANY YEARS AGO.

WE ALL GO THROUGH TOUGH TIMES IN MARRIAGES, DON'T WE.

WE'VE HAD OUR SHARE OF FIGHTS.

BUT I WILL SAY SOMETHING KIND OF INTERESTING ABOUT OUR RELATIONSHIP IS THAT MY HUSBAND IS NOT AN APOLOGIZER.

HE HAS ACTUALLY NEVER ONCE UTTERED THE WORDS I'M SORRY TO ME IN THE 20-PLUS YEARS THAT WE'VE BEEN TOGETHER.

AM I SALTY ABOUT THAT?

NO.

AND THE REASON IS BECAUSE HE HAS SHOWN ME THROUGH HIS ACTIONS THAT HE IS TRULY SORRY FOR SOMETHING THAT HE HAS DONE AND I THINK THAT SPEAKS

LOUDER THAN WORDS.

AND I THINK WE HAVE TO BE, UNFORTUNATELY IN THIS DAY AND AGE, STRATEGIC ABOUT HOW AN APOLOGY CAN BE CONSTRUED IF IT OPENS OUR CITY UP TO LITIGATION.

THESE ARE JUST THINGS THAT YOU HAVE TO CONSIDER THESE DAYS.

SO I'M JUST GOING TO PUT IT OUT THERE.

MY HUSBAND HAS NEVER APOLOGIZED.

IT'S ON RECORD.

AND YET I KNOW HE HAS BEEN VERY SORRY FOR EVERYTHING THAT HE HAS DONE AND I HAVE APOLOGIZED TO HIM, AND I WILL SAY IT AND I WILL SHOW IT. AND OUR CITY CAN SHOW REMORSE FOR ACTIONS DONE IN THE PAST WITHOUT OPENING OURSELVES UP TO LITIGATION.

I HOPE YOU GUYS CAN CONSIDER ALL OF THE RAMIFICATIONS OF YOUR WORDS AND YOUR ACTIONS TONIGHT.

AND WE HAVE TO ALSO REMEMBER IT WAS THE BRUCE'S BEACH -- THE BRUCES ARE THE MOST FAMOUS FAMILY BUT MANY OTHER FAMILIES WERE IMPACTED BY THE EMINENT DOMAIN.

I ACTUALLY DO NOT BELIEVE BRUCE'S BEACH PARK LOCATED ON HIGHLAND SHOULD EVEN BE CALLED THAT BECAUSE IT'S SO CONFUSING TO PEOPLE. BUT THAT'S ANOTHER STORY.

THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, HEATHER.

ANYONE ELSE ON ZOOM?

WE'LL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND GO ON TO ITEM H, CONSENT CALENDAR COUNCIL ITEM 3 THROUGH 14.

NEED A MOTION UNLESS SOMEONE IS GOING TO --

>> Councilmember Lesser: MOTION TO APPROVE.

>> Mayor Montgomery: A MOTION TO APPROVE BY COUNCILMEMBER LESSER AND A SECOND BY COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN.

>> ROLL CALL PLEASE.

>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.

>> Councilmember Napolitano: YES.

>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.

>> Councilmember Lesser: YES.

>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.

>> Councilmember Howorth: YES.

>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANK.

>> Councilmember Franklin: YES.

>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.

>> Mayor Montgomery: YES.

>> MOTION PASSES 5-0.

>> Mayor Montgomery: ITEM J, PUBLIC HEARINGS, NONE.

ITEM K, WE'RE GOING TO GO ONE BY ONE EACH COUNCILMEMBER WILL PICK UP ONE PERSON YOU WANT TO NOMINATE UNTIL WE FILL ALL EIGHT SLOTS.

AFTER THAT SELECTION IS OVER.

WE'RE GOING TO PICK TWO ALTERNATES.

EACH ONE OF US AND STEVE BEING REMOTE WILL NOMINATE ONE PERSON THEN

WE GO THROUGH THE PROCESS.
WE HAVE EIGHT.
AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO SELECT TWO ALTERNATES.
ANY CONFUSION AT ANY TIME, ASK US.
AT THAT POINT IN TIME THE DAIS WILL ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS.
STAFF REPORT, PUBLIC COMMENT AND THEN COUNCIL WILL START.
WITH THAT, YES, HOLD ON.
COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: QUESTION.
JUST TO CLARIFY, AND WE ARE GOING TO HEAR FROM THE STAFF REPORT BEFORE
WE START THE PROCESS.
BUT WE NOMINATE AND WE GO THROUGH THE ROUND OF NARROWING DOWN EACH
SPOT.
WE DON'T SIMPLY SAY I CHOOSE JOE AND YOU SAY I CHOOSE JEFF AND
THAT'S -- SO JUST -- FOR EACH SPOT THERE'S A NOMINATION AND THEN TWO
ROUNDS AND THREE IF NECESSARY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THAT IS CORRECT.
ON NORMAL COMMISSIONER APPOINTMENTS, YOU'RE GOING TO WATCH IT LIVE
TONIGHT HERE AND ON STREAMING.
SO WITH THAT, OUR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR TALYN MIZAKHANIAN
IS GOING TO GIVE YOU THE PLAY BY PLAY.
>> GOOD EVENING, I'M THE ACTING COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR HERE.
READY TO INTRODUCE THIS ITEM AND WALK YOU BRIEFLY THROUGH THE PROCESS.
ON JULY 22nd CITY COUNCIL APPROVED THE FORMATION OF A 15-MEMBER AD
HOC TASK FORCE FOR OUR LONG-TERM OUTDOOR DINING EFFORT.
AND THE MAKEUP OF THAT TASK FORCE WAS ESSENTIALLY MIRRORING THE
COVID-19 BUSINESS SOLUTIONS SUBCOMMITTEE.
SO IN TERMS OF HOW THE MAKEUP CAME TO BE, IT MIRRORED THAT SUBCOMMITTEE
THAT WE MADE A COUPLE OF YEARS AGO.
SO THE 15 MEMBERS CONSISTED OF SEVEN SEATS THAT WERE PREDESIGNATED
AND EIGHT SEATS THAT WERE REMAINING TO BE DESIGNATED FOR AT-LARGE
MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.
WE HAD A PLANNING COMMISSIONER AND AN ALTERNATE SEAT AVAILABLE.
WE TOOK THIS TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION IN AUGUST AND THE PLANNING
COMMISSION VOTED TO HAVE CHAIR JOSEPH UNGOCO AS THE PRIMARY MEMBER
WHO WOULD REPRESENT THE PLANNING COMMISSION.
COMMISSIONER JERRY MORTON WOULD SERVE AS THE ALTERNATE.
BUT GIVEN THAT COMMISSIONER MORTON'S TERM IS TO BE UP IN MAY, THE
COMMISSION REQUESTED TO HAVE THE COUNCIL CONSIDER GERRY MORTON FOR
AN AT-LARGE SEAT.
IN THIS CASE, COMMISSIONER SISTOS WOULD SERVE AS THE ALTERNATE.
WE TOOK THIS TO PPIC IN JULY AND THEY ELECTED COMMISSIONER JOB.
AND FOR CHAMBER OF COMMERCE DOWNTOWN, DPBA NORTH MB BIDS AND
COMMERCIAL AND THE MVSC, WE ACTUALLY TURN TO THOSE ENTITY TO APPOINT
THEIR MEMBERS THEMSELVES AND THEY RETURNED BACK TO US WITH THE
APPOINTEES AND THOSE ARE LISTED IN THE STAFF REPORT FOR YOU.
WHICH LEAVES US WITH THE EIGHT SEATS THAT ARE SHOWN HERE IN BLACK FONT

WHICH ARE THE SEATS THAT REMAIN TO BE APPOINTED.
AND THAT'S WHY WE'RE HERE THIS EVENING.
SO ON FEBRUARY 1st STAFF RELEASED THE APPLICATIONS.
WE RELEASED THEM VIA E-MAIL, ON OUR WEBSITE, WE DID A SOCIAL MEDIA
BLAST SO WE HAD EXTENSIVE OUTREACH SO THAT FOLKS KNEW EXACTLY HOW TO
APPLY FOR THIS.
IT WAS THROUGH A SEAMLESS DOCS APPLICATION PROCESS.
THERE WERE NO E-MAIL EXCHANGES INVOLVED.
THAT WAY WE CAN GUARANTEE THAT IT'S NOT MISSED IN SOMEONE'S E-MAIL.
SO THE SEAMLESS DOC GETS DIRECTLY SUBMITTED TO A PROGRAM AND THE
APPLICATIONS ARE GENERATED THERE.
WE RECEIVED 118 APPLICATIONS.
SINCE THEN WE HAVE DISQUALIFIED A COUPLE OF INDIVIDUALS BASED ON NOT
BEING EITHER A RESIDENT OR A BUSINESS OWNER WITHIN MANHATTAN BEACH,
AND THEN A HANDFUL OF RESIDENTS HAVE ALSO WITHDRAWN OUR APPLICATIONS
SINCE THEN.
SO THIS EVENING WE WILL APPOINT THE EIGHT SEATS AND THEN WE WILL ALSO
ASK THE COUNCIL TO APPOINT ALTERNATES FOR THOSE EIGHT SEATS.
REASON BEING, IN THE EVENT THAT ONE OF THE PRIMARY APPOINTEES IS UNABLE
TO FULFILL THEIR ROLE, WE WILL HAVE TO HAVE AN ALTERNATE STEP IN IN
THAT SITUATION AND WE WOULDN'T WANT TO COME BACK TO COUNCIL AND GO
THROUGH THE PROCESS AGAIN.
SO WE'LL PREEMPTIVELY ASK YOU TO APPOINT THOSE ALTERNATES THIS
EVENING.
AFTER THE APPOINTMENTS ARE MADE OUR FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS WILL BE
TO DETERMINE WHAT THE MEETING DATES ARE GOING TO BE, HOW FREQUENTLY
WE'RE GOING TO MEET, WHAT WORKS FOR ALL OF THE APPOINTEES AND THE
ENTIRETY OF THE TASK FORCE AND UPON THEIR FIRST MEETING THE TASK FORCE
WILL BE CONDUCTING WHAT WE CALL A SLOT ANALYSIS, STRENGTHS, WEAKNESS,
OPPORTUNITIES, THREATS OF OUTDOOR DINING PROGRAM.
THAT'S THE INITIAL FEEDBACK WE WANT TO GAIN FROM ALL OF THE COMMUNITY
MEMBERS.
OF COURSE THAT WILL BE PRESENTED TO THE COUNCIL.
AND AS A REMINDER TO THE COMMUNITY, I DO WANT TO MENTION THAT THESE
MEETINGS ARE INTENDED TO BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC.
SO WE WELCOME PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT.
WE WILL BE POSTING NOTICES.
AND EVEN THOUGH NOT SEARCH GOING TO MAKE IT TO THE TASK FORCE, WE'RE
GOING TO ABSOLUTELY ENCOURAGE PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT AND CONTINUED
INVOLVEMENT THE PROCESS.
WITH THAT WE WILL TURN TO OUR VOTING SHEETS THAT WE'VE PRESENTED YOU
WITH.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY YOUR LAST POINT.
THESE MEETINGS ARE GOING TO BE OPEN THE PUBLIC, CORRECT?
>> CORRECT.
>> Councilmember Lesser: THEY WILL BE POSTED, NOTICES TO THE PUBLIC
THAT THEY CAN ATTEND AND THERE WILL BE INFORMATION ABOUT HOW MEMBERS

OF THE PUBLIC CAN ATTEND?

>> THAT'S CORRECT.

>> Councilmember Lesser: WHERE CAN THE MEMBERS FIND WHERE AND WHAT TIME AND WILL THERE BE OPPORTUNITIES FOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO SPEAK AT THESE MEETINGS?

>> YES.

WE DO HAVE AN OUTDOOR DINING WEB PAGE AND EVERYTHING WILL BE POSTED ON THAT WEB PAGE.

WE HAVE A SECTION DEVOTED TO AGENDAS.

AND SO AS SOON AS OUR MEETING DATES ARE READY, WE'LL MAKE THOSE PUBLICLY AVAILABLE ON THE WEB PAGE.

I ALSO ENCOURAGE FOLK TO SIGN UP ON OUR OUTDOOR DINING INTERESTED PARTIES' LIST IF THEY HAVE NOT DONE SO.

OUR WEB PAGE ALSO INCLUDES INFORMATION ON HOW TO BECOME LISTED ON THAT PARTICULAR LIST.

AND WE'LL DO E-MAIL BLASTS AS THE MEETING GET SCHEDULED.

>> Councilmember Lesser: THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: YOU BEAT ME TO IT.
PLEASE.

>> IN THE COUNCIL IS READY WE CAN GO FORWARD.

>> Mayor Montgomery: WE'RE GOING TO TAKE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND THEN MAKE OUR SELECTIONS.
COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.

>> Councilmember Howorth: YOU SAID INFORMATION IS ON THE OUTDOOR DINING WEB PAGE.

ON OR WEB PAGE ON THE CITY, IS THAT ON OUR HOME PAGE, OUTDOOR DINING OR DO YOU HAVE TO KNOW TO GO UNDER COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT?

WHERE WILL THAT BE?

>> UNDER COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT IT SHOULD BE ONE OF THE FIRST THINGS YOU SEE.

>> Councilmember Howorth: PEOPLE HAVE TO KNOW TO GO TO COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT.

WE MAY CONSIDER HAVING THAT SOMEWHERE ELSE ON THE HOME PAGE AS WELL IF IT'S SUCH A HOT TOPIC.

>> ABSOLUTELY.

>> Councilmember Howorth: THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OF COUNCIL?
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO, ANY QUESTIONS ON YOUR END?

>> Councilmember Napolitano: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR, THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: GOT IT.

WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT NOW ON THIS ITEM.

REMEMBER, IF YOU SPOKE EARLIER YOU CAN'T SPEAK AGAIN.

IF IT'S THE FIST TIME TALKING, SPEAK NOW.

>> HI, HONORABLE MAYOR AND ESTEEM COUNCILMEMBERS.

MY NAME IS JENNIFER JULIUS.

I'VE APPLIED TO BE ON THE OUTDOOR DINING TASK FORCE.

I AM VERY, VERY INTERESTED IN BEING ABLE TO HELP THE CITY COME TO AN

AGREEMENT BECAUSE I HONESTLY BELIEVE THAT THERE SHOULD BE A SOLUTION THAT WE CAN FIND THAT WILL BOTH ENCOMPASS THE NEEDS OF OUR RESIDENTS, OUR RESTAURANTS, THEIR PATRONS, THE PEOPLE THAT ARE EMPLOYED, OUR DOWNTOWN RESIDENTS WHO MAY HAVE CONCERNS AND SAFETY AND RISK. OTHER CITIES HAVE MANAGED TO FIGURE OUT A WAY TO DO THIS. IT PROVIDES PEOPLE WITH OPTIONS IN TERMS OF DINING, WHETHER THEY WANT TO BE INDOORS OR OUTDOORS. IT'S A COMPLETELY DIFFERENT ATMOSPHERE. IT ALLOWS RESTAURANTS TO HIRE FOR EMPLOYEES. IT ADDS TO THE TAX BASIS WITH THE REVENUE GENERATED. I UNDERSTAND WE'RE GOING TO LOSE PARKING REVENUE BUT I WOULD LIKE TO DELVE INTO THAT TO SEE IS IT A NET POSITIVE OR A NEGATIVE. HOW CAN WE MAKE THIS WORK TO THAT IT WORKS FOR ALL. I SERIOUSLY ASK YOU TO CONSIDER MY APPOINTMENT TO THE COUNCIL.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.
>> HI.

AUDREY JUDSON, A DOWNTOWN RESIDENT ANT A BUSINESS OWNER. I HOPE YOU WILL CONSIDER ME FOR THE OUTDOOR DINING PANEL. I HAVE BEEN ENJOYING THE OUTDOOR DINING. I REALLY ENJOYED IT. BUT I ALSO REAL LOUISIANA THAT THERE ARE SOME ISSUES TOO WITH IT. SO I'M HOPING THAT WE CAN COME TO SOME KIND OF RESOLUTION THAT WILL BE SAFE AND WILL ALSO TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION THE BUSINESSES DOWNTOWN. BECAUSE, UNFORTUNATELY, WITH THE PARKING, REMOVAL OF SOME OF THE PARKING, EVEN THOUGH IT DOES -- I'M SENSITIVE TO THE FACT THAT IT DOES TAKE AWAY FROM REVENUE FROM THE CITY. BUT IT ALSO HAS IMPACTED SOME OF THE BUSINESSES. AND I KNOW OF ONE BUSINESS THAT DID CLOSE AS A RESULT OF THE EMPLOYEES JUST NOT BEING ABLE TO PARK. THAT WAS ONE OF THE REASONS. ANYWAY, I HOPE YOU CONSIDER ME. THANKS.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, AUDREY.
>> MEMBERS OF COUNCIL, I THINK OUR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR, THE PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING, WE TALKED ABOUT, I THINK COMMISSIONER MORTON'S TERM IS ENDING. I DO THINK THERE ARE SOME OVERLAP ISSUES THAT I THINK ARE APPROPRIATE TO CONSIDER. AND I KNOW THAT THE PLANNING COMMISSION WAS LOOKING AT HAVING Y'ALL CONSIDER COMMISSIONER MORTON TAKING A DIFFERENT SEAT OR BEING THERE. IF HE DOES, I WOULD JUST ASK THAT THAT WOULD BE SEAT 13, 14 OR 15 OR NOT 11 AND 12. THANK YOU.

>> HELLO, MAYOR MONTGOMERY AND CITY COUNCIL. MY NAME IS BRENDA O'LEARY AND I'M HERE TONIGHT BECAUSE I'VE APPLIED TO JOIN THE OUTDOOR DINING COMMITTEE. I'M HERE IN PERSON BECAUSE AS A 30-YEAR RESIDENT THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT

TO ME.

I BELIEVE THAT OUTDOOR DINING IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO OUR COMMUNITY. I KNOW WE ALL SUFFERED THROUGH THE PANDEMIC AND ONE OF THE SILVER LININGS THAT REALLY CAME OUT OF THE PANDEMIC WAS WE DID HAVE THE OUTDOOR DINING.

PEOPLE COULD GET TOGETHER, SIT IN THE COMMUNITY, COULD SEE THE BEAUTIFUL DAYS, THE BEAUTIFUL SKIES AT NIGHT.

I BELIEVE THIS IS IMPORTANT.

BUT I ALSO BELIEVE THAT THE APPROACH THAT WE TOOK WAS JUST KIND OF AD HOC.

IT WAS A BAND AID APPROACH HERE AND THERE AND SOME THINGS WERE BORDERLINE DANGEROUS IN THE STREETS.

I BELIEVE THAT WE NEED A MORE CONSISTENT APPROACH, A MORE PERMANENT APPROACH, SOMETHING THAT LOOKS LIKE THE COMMUNITY, GOES WITH THE LOOK AND FEEL.

BUT AGAIN WE HAVE TO BE CAREFUL OF OUR BUSINESS OWNERS.

I SEE MAUREEN HERE TONIGHT.

WE WANT TO BUILD SOMETHING BEAUTIFUL AND FUNCTIONAL AND SPECIAL FOR OUR COMMUNITY BUT WE ALSO DON'T WANT TO TAKE REVENUE OR PARKING AWAY FROM THE BUSINESS OWNERS.

THIS IS SOMETHING THAT'S IMPORTANT TO DISCUSS WITH THE COMMUNITY AND HAVE THE COMMUNITY ON THE SAME PAGE.

I'VE WORKED IN BUSINESS FOR 30 YEARS.

I'M THE QUEEN OF SWAT ANALYSES.

MY FIANCEE AND I STARTED A LIFE SCIENCES REAL ESTATE DEVELOPMENT COMPANY AND BUILT TEN PROPERTIES IN CALIFORNIA AND THEN ACROSS THE U.S., SOLD IT TO A LARGER HEALTHCARE DROPPER.

I HAVE EXPERIENCE WORKING WITH DEVELOPERS AND ARCHITECTS AND DESIGNING THINGS THAT ARE ATTRACTIVE BUT ALSO FUNCTIONAL.

SOMETIMES THOSE THINGS DON'T GO HAND IN HAND.

YOU THINK SOMETHING IS FABULOUS BUT LOOK AT THE FUNCTIONALITY AND IT DOESN'T WORK.

I WOULD LOVE TO BE A PART OF THIS COMMITTEE AND I HOPE YOU SELECT ME. THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, BRENDA.

ANYBODY ELSE HERE IN THE AUDIENCE WANT TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

SEEING NONE, ZOOM, PLEASE, MARTHA.

NO ONE ON ZOOM.

CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

NOW, TALYN, YOU WANT TO COME BACK?

THE FLOOR IS YOURS AGAIN.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCIL.

WE'LL START WITH SEAT NUMBER 6, DOWNTOWN RESIDENT.

IF YOU WANT TO TAKE OUT YOUR SEAT NUMBER 6 SHEET.

WE DO HAVE ALL OF THE AVAILABLE APPLICANTS LISTED FOR YOU AND WE WILL COMMENCE THE NOMINATIONS.

>> Mayor Montgomery: BEFORE YOU START, FOLKS.

THIS IS WHAT WE'VE HAD TO GO THROUGH.
119 NAMES BROKEN DOWN BY WHERE THEY LIVE, APPLICATIONS AND WHAT ZONE
THEY'RE IN.
ONE OF FOUR ZONES, EAST SIDE, WEST SIDE, NORTH, SOUTH.
THEY BROKE IT DOWN.
THERE'S NO EXCUSE FOR US NOT TO KNOW ALL ABOUT YOU IN THIS LITTLE
PACKAGE RIGHT HERE.
ALL OF US DID OUR HOMEWORK.
TALYN, THE FLOOR IS YOURS AGAIN.
>> THANK YOU.
WE'LL START WITH THE NOMINATIONS FOR SEAT NUMBER 6.
COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: NOW, I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO MAKE A FEW
INTRODUCTORY COMMENTS IF I MAY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: PLEASE.
>> Councilmember Howorth: YOUR HONOR.
IT'S BEEN A MINUTE.
SO I WANT TO SAY THAT FOR ALL OF THESE SEATS I'M SURE, LIKE MYSELF,
THE REST OF YOU KNOW MANY IF NOT MOST OF THE PEOPLE WHO ARE APPLYING
PERSONALLY.
AND SOME VERY WELL, CORRECT.
SO THIS IS ONE OF THOSE SITUATIONS WHERE IT'S LIKE, OH, IT'S -- I KNOW
SO MANY PEOPLE AND SO MANY PEOPLE WHO WOULD BE QUALIFIED IT'S ALWAYS
A LITTLE AWKWARD TO DO THIS IN PUBLIC.
INSTEAD OF SAYING SO AND SO WOULD BE TERRIBLE AT THIS, I'M GOING TO
SAY POSITIVE THINGS.
BY THE WAY, NOBODY WOULD BE TERRIBLE AT THIS.
THAT'S JUST MY SENSE OF HUMOR.
SORRY FOR THAT.
BUT I GUESS I WANT YOU TO UNDERSTAND THAT AS I WAS READING THROUGH
THIS NOTEBOOK I WAS REALLY LOOKING -- IF I DIDN'T KNOW YOU AND HADN'T
TALKED TO YOU PERSONALLY OR HADN'T GOTTEN AN E-MAIL FROM YOU, I WAS
LOOKING TO SEE IF THERE WAS AN OPENNESS IN YOUR APPLICATION, THAT YOU
WERE OPEN TO AN IDEA.
IT DIDN'T HAVE TO BE -- THERE WERE SOME WHO SAID DON'T WANT OUTDOOR
DINING.
OKAY.
SOME SAY ABSOLUTELY HAVE TO HAVE IT WHICH I UNDERSTAND.
BUT I WAS LOOKING FOR PEOPLE WHO WERE MAYBE GIVING ME A REASON, WHAT
THEY WOULD BE LOOKING FOR, WHAT THEIR CRITERIA MIGHT BE.
ADAM MENTIONED PUBLIC SAFETY.
BRENDA MENTIONED WE HAVE TO TALK ABOUT THE OTHER RETAILERS.
I WANT TO SEE THAT YOU'RE THINKING ABOUT DIFFERENT THINGS.
BECAUSE YOU'RE NOT JUST GOING TO BE WORKING TO PROVIDE SOMETHING FOR
RESTAURANT OWNERS.
YOU'RE GOING TO WORK WITH THE FINANCE DIRECTOR TO FIND OUT, LIKE JENNEE
WAS TALKING WANT, WHAT'S THE DIFFERENCE THAT THE REVENUE THAT RETAIL

SHOPS GET VERSUS RESTAURANT, VERSUS PARKING.
IS THERE CRIME, IS THERE RATS, ET CETERA.
AND STAFF I WOULD HOPE WOULD ALSO PROVIDE SO MUCH INFORMATION THAT
YOU'LL BE OVERLOADED, STUFF LIKE THE URBAN LAND INSTITUTE STUDY FROM
A FEW YEARS AGO THAT'S BEEN MUCH ALIGN POLITICALLY BUT HAS TREMENDOUS
INVESTIGATION AND IT'S PAGES ABOUT THIS VERY ISSUE.
ENGAGED OVER 500 RESIDENTS BACK IN THE DAY.
ALL RIGHT.
SO I'M GETTING THERE.
I GOT A LOT OF FRIENDS HERE.
I DON'T WANT TO --
>> Mayor Montgomery: SEEING WHAT TIME IT WAS.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: THEY'RE STILL GOING TO BE MAD AT YOU NO
MATTER WHAT YOU DO.
>> Councilmember Howorth: OH, STOP.
YOU'RE NOT EVEN HERE.
SO THERE'S A LOT OF CRITERIA.
THERE'S A LOT OF THINGS TO CONSIDER.
WITH THAT I NOMINATE FOR MY DOWNTOWN DINING TASK FORCE RESIDENT PERSON
AUDREY JUDSON.
>> Councilmember Lesser: MY TURN TO MAKE MY COMMENTS.
I WON'T BE AS LONG.
I'LL SIMPLY SAY THIS IS GOING TO BE REALLY DIFFICULT.
AS COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH JUST INDICATED, I KNOW SO MANY OF THESE
APPLICANTS.
A NUMBER OF THEM HAVE REACHED OUT TO ME.
I'VE MET WITH SEVERAL.
THEY'VE BEEN PASSIONATE ABOUT BEING PART OF THE PART.
AND THE POSITIVE SIDE IS THERE ARE SO MANY RESIDENTS THAT WANT TO BE
A PART OF THIS PROCESS.
SO MANY RESIDENTS UNDERSTAND THIS BALANCE AND REALLY CARE AND I WANT
TO THANK YOU FOR ALL OF THOSE THAT APPLIED.
AND PLEASE CONTINUE TO BE MY FRIEND IF I'M NOT ABLE TO NOMINATE YOU
OR APPOINT YOU.
YOU HEARD THAT THESE MEETINGS ARE GOING TO BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC AND
INCLUSIVE.
PLEASE ATTEND.
EVEN IF YOU ARE NOT NECESSARILY ON THE COMMITTEE ITSELF.
WITH MY FIRST NOMINATION I WOULD NOMINATE JIM BURTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: NO NOMINATIONS.
COUNCILMEMBER LESSER NOMINATED MY NOMINEE.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: YES, THANK YOU.
A BRIEF COMMENT.
THIS IS A LOT OF WORK.
IT WAS REALLY GOOD GETTING TO KNOW YOU.

IF I DIDN'T KNOW YOU, TO GET TO KNOW YOU IN YOUR APPLICATION.
THESE COMMISSIONS AND TASK FORCES ARE VERY IMPORTANT.
I WAS ON SEVERAL BEFORE I CAME ON COUNCIL AND IT REALLY DID HELP ME
GET A GOOD GRASP OF WHAT'S HAPPENING HERE IN THE CITY.
SO THANK YOU FOR THE TIME THAT YOU HAVE GIVEN TO THIS PROJECT ALREADY
AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THE PROCESS.
I ALSO DON'T HAVE A NOMINATION BECAUSE I HAD SELECTED JIM BURTON AS
WELL.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MANY OF YOU I KNOW.
THANKS FOR THE E-MAILS AND COMMENTS.
YOU'LL SEE, LIKE COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH MENTIONED, I TRY TO FIND THE
CENTER OF THIS.
NOT THE RIGHT OR LEFT.
WITH THAT, NO FURTHER NOMINATIONS.
>> SO WE HAVE JIM BURTON AS THE APPOINTEE FOR SEAT NUMBER 6 DOWNTOWN
RESIDENT.
>> Councilmember Lesser: DON'T WE GO TO ROUND ONE?
>> Councilmember Napolitano: YEAH, WE NEED TO VOTE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YOU GO TO THE TWO THAT QUALIFIED MOVING FORWARD.
>> OKAY.
SORRY.
AUDREY JUDSON AND JIM BURTON.
SO THAT TAKES US TO ROUND ONE.
>> Councilmember Lesser: SO ROUND ONE I WOULD NOMINATE AUDREY JUDSON
AND JIM BURTON.
>> Councilmember Franklin: THERE'S JUST ONE?
>> Councilmember Howorth: IN THIS ROUND YOU GET TWO.
>> Councilmember Franklin: THAT'S RIGHT.
>> Councilmember Howorth: IT'S STEVE'S TURN NEXT ANYWAY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: YEAH.
THEY BOTH APPLIED.
SURE.
LET'S GO WITH BOTH FOR THIS ROUND.
>> Councilmember Howorth: IT WAS JUDSON AND BURTON.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: YES.
I WOULD NOMINATE JIM BURTON AND AUDREY JUDSON IN THIS ROUND.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: JIM BURTON, AUDREY JUDSON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: JUDSON AND BURTON.
>> THAT TAKES US TO ROUND TWO.
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: BURTON.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.

>> Councilmember Franklin: MR. BURTON.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: JIM BURTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> BURTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: JIM BURTON FOR THIS ONE.
WE'LL MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> BY VOTE JIM BURTON.
>> Mayor Montgomery: CONGRATULATIONS MR. BURTON.
NEXT ONE, SEAT NUMBER EIGHT.
>> Councilmember Franklin: I HAVE A QUESTION.
SO IF WE GO TO THE MEETINGS, CAN WE MAKE PUBLIC COMMENTS TO JIM BURTON?
>> Mayor Montgomery: IF YOU WANT TO GO TO THE MEETINGS, YOU CAN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: PAYBACK.
>> Mayor Montgomery: SEAT 8.
>> SEAT 8 NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH RESIDENT.
WE'LL START WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: NICOLAS FERGUSON.
>> Councilmember Howorth: I HAVE A 20-MINUTE COMMENT BUT I'M GOING
TO CUT TO THE CHASE AND NOMINATE MICHAEL COHEN.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I WILL NOMINATE KIMBERLEE KELLY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: NO FURTHER NOMINATIONS.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: SAMUEL BRAITMAN.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH FOR TWO NOMINATE
JIM NEIGHS.
>> Councilmember Howorth: COHEN AND KELLY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: KELLY.
>> WE NEED TWO.
>> Councilmember Lesser: THIS IS HARD.
MICHAEL COHEN.
>> I'VE BEEN CORRECTED.
YOU DON'T NEED TO INCLUDE TWO.
I'M LOOKING AT MY VERY EXPERIENCED COLLEAGUE TO THE LEFT.
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: KELLY.
>> Councilmember Howorth: WAIT.
DID HE SAY KELLY?
OKAY.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: YES.
KIMBERLEE KELLY.
>> THANK YOU.
MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: BRAITMAN AND KELLY.

>> AND MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> NIKLAS BRINGLESON AND SAM BRAITMAN.
>> ROUND TWO.
COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Howorth: ONLY BRINGLESON AND BRAITMAN MOVE ON.
>> Councilmember Lesser: TWO CHOICES FROM NOW ON.
>> Councilmember Howorth: COHEN DIDN'T MAKE IT BECAUSE DAVID ONLY
VOTED FOR KELLY.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I THREW IN COHEN AT THE END.
[OFF MIC]
>> Councilmember Howorth: SORRY, I FORGOT THAT HE -- OKAY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WE HAVE THREE CHOICES MOVING FORWARD IN THIS
ROUND.
COHEN, KELLY, BRINGLESON.
ONE, THREE, FIVE.
>> IT'S KELLY, COHEN AND BRAITMAN.
>> Mayor Montgomery: I THOUGHT BRINGLESON MOVED FORWARD.
ALL RIGHT.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: KELLY.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: BRAITMAN.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: BRAITMAN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: KELLY.
>> Councilmember Lesser: WE HAVE THREE TO CHOOSE?
>> WE HAVE KIMBERLEE KELLY AS OUR SEAT NUMBER THREE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WELCOME TO THE TEAM.
NEXT UP.
>> SEAT NUMBER 10.
THIS IS FOR A COMMERCIAL ENTITY NONMANHATTAN VILLAGE SHOPPING CENTER,
OUTSIDE OF THE MALL.
THE BUSINESS HAS TO BE OUTSIDE OF THE MALL.
WE'LL START WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: JOHN.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: HIS NAME IS NOT RIGHT HERE.
HE GOES BY HARRY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: I WAS GOING WITH HARRY AS WELL.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: HARRY AS WELL.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PETER KIM.
>> ROUND ONE, MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> MARY.

>> Councilmember Howorth: HARRY.
>> Councilmember Lesser: HARRY, ONE VOTE COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: THAT'S THREE, I'LL JOIN.
>> AND MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN?
>> Councilmember Franklin: I'LL GO WITH HARRY, RIGHT?
>> Mayor Montgomery: 5-0 UNANIMOUS.
>> 5-0 FOR HARRY ASHIKIAN.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MORE WORK FOR YOU TO DO.
>> NEXT UP IS SEAT NUMBER 11.
THIS IS FOR AT-LARGE RESIDENT.
AND I WILL REMIND THE COUNCIL THAT FOR THE AT-LARGE RESIDENT CATEGORY
WE DO HAVE TWO SEATS AVAILABLE.
SO WE WILL GO THROUGH SEAT NUMBER 11 AND REPEAT THE EXERCISE FOR NUMBER
12 FOR AN APPOINTEE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GERRY MORTON IS COMING OFF OF PLANNING COMMISSION
BUT DID HAVE AN INTEREST IN EXPRESSING AN AT-LARGE RESIDENT.
>> OR BUSINESS.
HE'LL QUALIFY FOR ONE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WE'LL SAVE HIM FOR LATER.
GOT IT.
THANK YOU.
>> SO FOR AT-LARGE RESIDENT SEAT NUMBER 11 WE WILL START WITH
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: THANK YOU.
I HAD IT RIGHT HERE.
PAUL MULLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: I'M SORRY HAVING A HARD TIME HEARING.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: SORRY.
PAUL MULLIN.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: YES, ADAM GOLDSTON.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: NO FURTHER NOMINATION.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: [INDISCERNIBLE]
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: GREG HARRIS.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: ADAM GOLDSTON AND THAT WOULD BE THE ONLY
ONE.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: PAUL MULLIN, ADAM GOLDSTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: ADAM GOLDSTON AND BRENDA O'LEARY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: WOW.
GREG AND BRENDA.

>> AND COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PAUL MULLIN.
>> OKAY.
WE'LL MOVE ON TO ROUND TWO.
SO FOR ROUND TWO THE OPTIONS ARE MULLIN, GOLDSTON OR O'LEARY.
WE'LL START WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: PAUL MULLIN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: O'LEARY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: O'LEARY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PAUL MULLIN.
>> AND MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: PAUL MULLIN.
>> THAT'S 3-2 FOR PAUL MULLIN.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WELCOME, PAUL.
MY CONDOLENCES.
YOU A FULL-TIME JOB NOW.
>> Councilmember Howorth: STILL RESIDENTS.
>> AT-LARGE RESIDENT SEAT NUMBER 12.
WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: FAITH LYONS.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: BRIDGETTE GOODMAN AND PEIR SEROTA.
>> JUST ONE FOR NOW.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: BRIDGETTE GOODMAN.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: ADAM GOLDSTON.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MARK KORDONSKY.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: RACHEL VANDENBERG.
>> THANK YOU.
WE'LL MOVE ON TO ROUND ONE.
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: BRIDGETTE GOODMAN.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: SO ADAM GOLDSTON AND BRIDGETTE GOODMAN.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MARK KORDONSKY.
ONE VOTE ONLY.
>> Councilmember Howorth: NO, YOU GET TWO IF YOU WANT.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MAKE IT CLEAR, ONE VOTE ONLY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: RACHEL VANDENBERG AND FAITH LYONS.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.

>> Councilmember Lesser: FAITH LYONS AND MARK KORDONSKY
[INDISCERNIBLE]
>> SO FOR ROUND TWO WE HAVE GOODMAN, KORDONSKY AND LYONS.
AND WE'LL START WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: GOODMAN.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: KORDONSKY.
>> Councilmember Howorth: LYONS.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: LYONS.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: GOODMAN.
>> SO FOR ROUND THREE WE'LL SELECT BETWEEN GOODMAN AND LYONS.
>> Mayor Montgomery: DOWN TO TWO.
>> WE'LL START WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GOODMAN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: GOODMAN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: LYONS.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: GOODMAN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: GOODMAN.
>> Councilmember Lesser: LIKE TO MAKE IT UNANIMOUS IF I MAY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES.
GOODMAN SEAT 12 AT-LARGE RESIDENT.
>> THAT TAKES US TO SEAT NUMBER 13, THIS IS AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR
BUSINESS.
JUST TO CLARIFY, WE HAVE THREE SEATS AVAILABLE FOR AT-LARGE RESIDENT
OR BUSINESSES.
WILL BE SEAT NUMBER 13, 14 OR 15.
WE'LL START WITH NOMINATIONS WITH COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: [INDISCERNIBLE]
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: LYONS.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: JUST A SECOND, PLEASE.
JOHN ALTAMURA.
>> WE NEED ONE SECOND JUST TO DOUBLE-CHECK.
>> Councilmember Howorth: OH.
>> Councilmember Franklin: I'M SORRY, WHAT DID YOU SAY?
>> Mayor Montgomery: I DIDN'T SAY ANYTHING YET.
>> Councilmember Lesser: ACTUALLY, QUESTION.
COUNCILMEMBER LESSER HAS A QUESTION.

>> YES.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I WANT TO MAKE SURE IN TERMS OF ANY NOMINATION THAT SHE QUALIFIES ON THIS PARTICULAR LIST.
>> THEY'RE ON THE AT-LARGE RESIDENT LIST, YOU COULD USE THAT LIST AS WELL.
>> Councilmember Lesser: OKAY.
[INDISCERNIBLE]
>> SO THAT TAKES US TO MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: LORETTA RAFTERY.
>> THANK YOU.
MOVING ON TO ROUND ONE, WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: JUDSON AND LYONS.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: LYONS.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: ALTAMURA AND RAFTERY.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> RAFTERY AND AUDREY JUDSON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG AND LYONS.
>> FOR ROUND TWO WE WILL SELECT FROM LYONS, RAFTERY OR JUDSON.
WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: LYONS.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Franklin: RAFTERY.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: RAFTERY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: LYONS.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: LYONS.
>> 3-2 LYONS.
>> Councilmember Lesser: CAN WE MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> Councilmember Franklin: CAN WE MAKE IT UNANIMOUS, PLEASE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: 5-0 LYONS FOR SEAT 13.
>> Councilmember Howorth: TWO MORE SEATS, CORRECT, MR. MAYOR.
>> Mayor Montgomery: CORRECT.
>> Councilmember Howorth: SORRY.
HARD TO KEEP TRACK.
>> ON TO SEAT NUMBER 14.
AGAIN AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR A BUSINESS.
WE'LL START NOMINATIONS WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GERRY MORTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: JUDSON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: MARK KORDONSKY.

>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PETER KIM.
>> AND MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: PIER SEROTA.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THESE ARE ALL GREAT PEOPLE.
>> Councilmember Lesser: IT'S AWFUL.
>> ROUND ONE, COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: EXCUSE ME, CAN I CONFIRM YOUR NOMINATION,
COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser:
I CHOOSE MARK KORDONSKY.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: OKAY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: THANK YOU.
JUDSON AND SEROTA.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: KORDONSKY AND SEROTA.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: KIM AND SEROTA.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: KIM, SEROTA.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MORTON, SEROTA.
>> ROUND TWO BETWEEN SEROTA OR PETER KIM.
WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: PETER SEROTA.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PETER KIM.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: SEROTA.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: SEROTA.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: SEROTA.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: I'LL JOIN.
>> 5-0 SEROTA.
>> Mayor Montgomery: PETER, WAY TO GO.
>> LAST BUT NOT LEAST SEAT NUMBER 15, AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR A BUSINESS.
WE'LL START WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: ONE MOMENT, PLEASE.
PETER KIM.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GERRY MORTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: AUDREY JUDSON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I HAVE GOTTEN MIXED UP ON MY SHEETS.

GREG HARRIS, IS HE ELIGIBLE ON THIS ONE?
>> Mayor Montgomery: RESIDENT OR BUSINESS.
>> Councilmember Lesser: YES.
GREG HARRIS.
>> THANK YOU.
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PETER KIM.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GERRY MORTON AND AUDREY JUDSON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: AUDREY JUDSON AND GERRY MORTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: AUDREY JUDSON AND GREG HARRIS.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PETER KIM.
>> AND MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: SORRY.
KIM AND HARRIS.
>> ALL ARE AVAILABLE FOR ROUND TWO.
THAT WOULD BE MORTON, JUDSON, HARRIS, KIM.
>> Mayor Montgomery: OF COURSE THEY ARE.
>> Councilmember Howorth: OKAY.
AUDREY JUDSON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: AUDREY JUDSON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: EMBARRASSMENT OF RICHES HERE.
THEY'RE ALL GREAT NOMINEES.
I'M GOING TO STICK WITH MY ORIGINAL ONE THOUGH, PETER KIM.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: AGREED, PETER KIM.
>> AND MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: SEEING NO SECOND I'LL MAKE IT OFFICIAL, AUDREY
JUDSON.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: I'LL JOIN.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MAKE IT OFFICIAL 5-0, AUDREY JUDSON.
DON'T GO ANYWHERE.
WE HAVE TWO ALTERNATES HERE.
ONE ALTERNATE?
I THOUGHT WE HAD TWO ALTERNATES.
[OFF MIC]
>> Mayor Montgomery: ONE ALTERNATE PER SEAT.
>> Councilmember Howorth: CAN I ASK A QUESTION?
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES, PLEASE.
>> Councilmember Howorth: IS AN ALTERNATE I GUESS THEY'RE ALLOWED IF
THE PUBLIC IS ALLOWED TO ATTEND A MEETING EVEN IF THE REGULAR PEOPLE
ARE THERE AS WELL?

>> YES, ABSOLUTELY.
>> Councilmember Howorth: THEY JUST DON'T GET TO VOTE.
>> THAT'S CORRECT.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: WE NEED TO SEND A MINUTE AND UPDATE.
>> WE'LL START AGAIN WITH SEAT NUMBER SIX.
JUST TO REPEAT FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE PUBLIC, THIS IS FOR AN ALTERNATE
MEMBER.
SEAT NUMBER 6 DOWNTOWN RESIDENT.
WE'LL START NOMINATIONS WITH COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: ONE SECOND.
COULD YOU PLEASE LIST EVERYBODY THAT WE NOMINATED FOR THE LAST ROUND?
>> Councilmember Lesser: NOMINATED.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: I'M SORRY.
SELECTED.
APPOINTED.
>> JIM BURTON FOR SEAT NUMBER 6 DOWNTOWN RESIDENT.
KIMBERLEE KELLY SEAT NUMBER 8, NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH RESIDENT.
HARRY ASHIKIAN, SEAT NUMBER TEN, NONCOMMERCIAL MB.
SEAT NUMBER 11, AT-LARGE RESIDENT, PAUL MULLIN.
FOR SEAT NUMBER 12 AT-LARGE RESIDENT BRIDGETTE GOODMAN.
FOR SEAT NUMBER 13 AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR BUSINESS, LYONS.
FOR SEAT NUMBER 14 AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR BUSINESS, SEROTA.
PETER SEROTA.
AND FOR SEAT NUMBER 15 AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR BUSINESS, AUDREY JUDSON.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: OKAY.
SAME AS BEFORE.
HERE WE GO.
SEAT NUMBER 6 DOWNTOWN RESIDENT ALTERNATE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: O'LEARY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I PICK JAMES QUILLIAM.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: JUST TO CONFIRM, [INDISCERNIBLE]
>> SORRY, COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO, WE COULDN'T HEAR YOU.
IF YOU DON'T MIND REPEATING --
>> Councilmember Napolitano: AM I CORRECT IN SAYING THAT SUZANNE
LEARNER HAS WITHDRAWN HER APPLICATION?
>> THAT IS CORRECT.
>> CAROL PERRIN.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: JAMES QUILLIAM.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: NO FURTHER NOMINATION.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: FIRST GOING TO SAY THANK YOU TO MEMBERS OF

PUBLIC FOR STICKING WITH US.
WATCHING THIS IS ALMOST AS EXCITING AS WATCHING GRASS GROW.
I WILL NOMINATE O'LEARY AND QUILLIAM.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: CAROL PERRIN.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: QUILLIAM.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: CAROL PERRIN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: O'LEARY AND PERRIN.
>> SO FOR ROUND TWO WE CAN SELECT FROM O'LEARY, QUILLIAM OR PERRIN.
WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: THANK YOU.
AND I'LL STICK WITH CAROL PERRIN.
SHE'S BEEN ACTIVE IN THIS PROCESS FOR THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS, SINCE
COVID STARTED.
I SUPPORT HER NOMINATION.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: CAROL PERRIN.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: CAROL PERRIN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: AND I WILL STICK WITH CAROL PERRIN.
>> Councilmember Lesser: AND I WILL ABSOLUTELY JOIN CAROL PERRIN.
MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> 5-0 FOR CAROL PERRIN AS THE ALTERNATE FOR SEAT NUMBER 6.
SEAT NUMBER 8, NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH RESIDENT FOR THE ALTERNATE SEAT.
WE'LL START WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: KNEE CO[INDISCERNIBLE]
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: COHEN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> NO NOMINATIONS.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: NO FURTHER.
>> AND MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: BRAITMAN.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: COHEN AND BRINGLESON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: COHEN AND BRINGLESON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: COHEN, BRINGLESON.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: BRAITMAN AND COHEN.
>> AND MAYOR MONTGOMERY.

>> Mayor Montgomery: BRINGLESON AND COHEN.
>> ALL NOMINEES ARE AVAILABLE FOR ROUND TWO -- NOT BRAITMAN.
SORRY.
BRINGLESON OR COHEN.
WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: THESE ARE REALLY HARD.
COHEN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: COHEN.
>> COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: BRINGLESON.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: BRINGLESON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: COHEN.
>> THAT'S 3-2 FOR --
>> Councilmember Howorth: MAKE IT --
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES, MAKE IT 0-0.
>> 5-0 FOR COHEN.
SEAT NUMBER 8 NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH RESIDENT.
SEAT NUMBER 10 ALTERNATE, COMMERCIAL NONMBFV.
WE'LL START NOMINATIONS WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: PETER KIM.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: KIM RILEY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: PATRICK GRAHAM.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: JOHN AULTMURA.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: I'M GOING TO TRY AGAIN, PETER KIM.
HE WAS ACTIVE IN THIS THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS AS WELL, THE NORTH DAKOTA
END BID AND REPRESENTS THE NORTH END.
SO TO SPREAD THINGS AROUND I'M GOING TO GO WITH PETER KIM.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: KIM RILEY.
JUST ONE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: PAT GRAHAM.
JUST ONE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: KIM RILEY.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: WHEN EVERYONE IS SAYING KIM RILEY, IS
THAT PETER KIM AND KIM RILEY OR JUST ONE?
>> FIRST NAME IS KIM, THE LAST NAME RILEY.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: OKAY.

SINCE THERE WERE TWO.
PETER KIM.
>> AND MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: PETER KIM AND KIM RILEY.
>> FOR ROUND TWO WE'LL PICK FROM KIM RILEY AND PETER KIM.
COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: PETER KIM.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: RILEY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: PETER KIM.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: PETER KIM.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> YOU HAVE THREE VOTES.
>> Councilmember Lesser: SHALL WE MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> PETER KIM ALTERNATE FOR SEAT NUMBER 10.
SEAT NUMBER 11, ALTERNATE FOR AT-LARGE RESIDENT.
WE'LL START NOMINATIONS WITH COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: I KNEW YOU WERE GOING TO DO THAT.
LET ME FIND MY LIST HERE.
BRENDA O'LEARY WASN'T CHOSEN, RIGHT?
>> CORRECT.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: BRENDA O'LEARY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: I JUST GOT TO UPDATE MY LIST HERE.
ONE SECOND, PLEASE.
ADAM GOLDSTON.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: LORETTA RAFTERY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: NO FURTHER NOMINATIONS.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: BILL HORY.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: GOLDSTON AND RAFTERY.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> RAFTERY AND GOLDSTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: O'LEARY AND HORY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: SO LEERY AND HORY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: O'LEARY.
>> ROUND TWO GOLDSTON, RAFTERY, O'LEARY, HORY.
MAYOR MONTGOMERY.

>> Mayor Montgomery: RAFTERY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: O'LEARY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: O'LEARY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: O'LEARY.
>> Councilmember Lesser: AND THERE WERE THREE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: PICK ONE.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: O'LEARY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MAKE IT UNANIMOUS AT 5.
>> 5-0 O'LEARY.
THAT'S SEAT NUMBER 11 ALTERNATE.
SEAT NUMBER 12 AT-LARGE RESIDENT ALTERNATE.
WE'LL START NOMINATIONS WITH COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: THIS IS SO HARD.
PAUL BESWICK.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: RAFTERY.
>> Councilmember Howorth: RAFTERY, HE SAID.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Councilmember Howorth: HE SAID RAFTERY.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: SORRY, I JUST CAN'T -- SOMETHING ABOUT HIS
MIC.
ROBERT NICHELL.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: NO FURTHER NOMINATION.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG.
RACHEL VANDENBERG.
>> WE'LL START ROUND ONE WITH COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: RAFTERY AND BESWICK.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: RAFTERY AND NICKELL.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: RAFTERY.
ONE PICK.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG AND BESWICK.
>> AND COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: BESWICK AND VANDENBERG.
>> Councilmember Howorth: THEY ALL MOVE FORWARD, EVERYONE EXCEPT
NICKELL, RIGHT?
>> SO RAFTERY, BESWICK AND VANDENBERG FOR ROUND TWO.
STARTING WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: RAFTERY.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.

>> Mayor Montgomery: RAFTERY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: VANDENBERG.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: I'M GOING TO DRAW THIS OUT FOR A WHILE.
OKAY.
RAFTERY.
>> Councilmember Lesser: SMALL WE MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES.
5-0 RAFTERY FOR NO. 12 AT LARGE.
>> Councilmember Howorth: IT IS GREAT THAT SO MANY PEOPLE WANT TO DO
THIS.
THIS IS TERRIBLE THAT WE HAVE TO -- OKAY.
>> SEAT NUMBER 13 AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR A BUSINESS ALTERNATE.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: MARK KORDONSKY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: NO FURTHER.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: VANDENBERG.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: NO FURTHER.
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: KORDONSKY AND VANDENBERG.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: KORDONSKY AND VANDENBERG.
>> COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: VANDENBERG ALONE.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: KORDONSKY, ONE VOTE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG, ONE VOTE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THERE YOU GO.
MAKE IT CLEAR.
>> ROUND TWO BETWEEN VANDENBERG AND CORVALAN.
I'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: VANDENBERG.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: VANDENBERG.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: KORDONSKY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: VANDENBERG.
>> Councilmember Lesser: VANDENBERG AS WELL.

SHALL WE MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES.
>> SEAT NUMBER 13 AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR BUSINESS ALTERNATE VANDENBERG.
SEAT NUMBER 14 AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR BUSINESS ALTERNATE.
WE'LL START NOMINATIONS WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GERRY MORTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: GEORGE [INDISCERNIBLE]
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: ONE MORE TIME.
MARK KORDONSKY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: I'M SORRY, I DIDN'T HEAR COUNCILMEMBER
HOWORTH'S NOMINATION.
>> Councilmember Howorth: GEORGE FLEMING.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: AUDREY JUDSON.
[INDISCERNIBLE]
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: COULD YOU TELL ME MAYOR MONTGOMERY'S
SECTION?
>> Mayor Montgomery: GERRY MORTON.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: AND ALSO COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: MARK KORDONSKY.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: OKAY.
PATRICK [INDISCERNIBLE]
>> ROUND ONE WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: GEORGE WRIGHT AND GERRY MORTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: MARK KORDONSKY AND GERRY MORTON.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: MORTON AND NEUHAUSER.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: JUST MORTON.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MORTON.
>> SO THAT'S SEAT NUMBER 14 AT-LARGE RESIDENT OR BUSINESS ALTERNATE
GERRY MORTON.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MAKE IT UNANIMOUS, JERRY.
GOOD JOB.
THIS IS OUR LAST ALTERNATE SEAT, FOLKS A AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO TAKE
A BREAK AFTER THIS BRUTAL EXERCISE.
>> Councilmember Howorth: AND IT CAN BE ANYBODY --
>> RESIDENT OR BUSINESS.
>> Councilmember Howorth: ANYBODY.
>> WE'LL START NOMINATIONS WITH MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> I'M GOING TO GO WITH JOHN ALTAMURA.
HE'S INVOLVED WITH THREE ENTERPRISES IN DOWNTOWN, RETAIL, RESTAURANT
AND OFFICE.

>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GEORGE WRIGHT.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: NO FURTHER.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I HAVE NAMES OF PEOPLE THAT WE'VE ALREADY
SELECTED AND I'D LIKE TO INCLUDE OTHERS.
BILL HORY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: THANK YOU.
SOMEONE WHO PROFESSES TO BE NEUTRAL IN THIS AND THAT'S ALICE
NEUHAUSER.
>> WE'LL START ROUND ONE WITH MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GEORGE WRIGHT, ONE VOTE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: I'LL DO GEORGE AND NEUHAUSER.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: I WILL DO HORY AND NEUHAUSER.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: NEUHAUSER.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: NEUHAUSER AND WRIGHT.
>> OPTIONS FOR ROUND TWO ARE WRIGHT AND NEUHAUSER.
WE'LL START WITH COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: I'M GOING TO PICK GEORGE WRIGHT.
AND I WANT PEOPLE TO UNDERSTAND THAT I DO KNOW THAT HE WILL BE FAIR
AND BALANCED AND IS SOMEONE WHO CAN REALLY WORK WITH A LOT OF DIFFERENT
PEOPLE AND LIKES TO MOVE THINGS FORWARD.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> Councilmember Lesser: ALICE NEUHAUSER.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: NEUHAUSER.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: WRIGHT.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GEORGE WRIGHT.
>> Councilmember Lesser: SHALL WE MAKE IT UNANIMOUS.
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES, SIR.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: I'LL JOIN.
>> SEAT NUMBER 15 ALTERNATE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU ALL, EVERYONE.
DON'T TELL ANYBODY YOUR TIME FRAME FOR THE FIRST TASK FORCE.
DO YOU HAVE AN ANY OF WHEN THEY WOULD ACTUALLY MEET FIRST?
>> WE'RE HOPING TO MEET END OF APRIL, OR EARLY MAY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE FOR THIS SELECTION.
I KNOW IT WAS TOUGH.
THANK YOU ALL FOR PLAYING.

COUNCIL IS DOING TO TAKE A SHORT BREAK AND BE BACK FOR THE NEXT ITEM.
>> I WANT TO RECOGNIZE TALYN AND HER STAFF.

>> Mayor Montgomery: WE'RE GOING TO RECOGNIZE THEM.

>> THEY DID A PHENOMENAL JOB PUTTING ALL OF THIS TOGETHER.
IT WAS A LOT OF WORK.

I KNOW IT WAS A LOT OF WORK FOR YOU TO GO THROUGH AND SELECT THESE,
BUT THERE WERE A LOT OF FRONT-END WORK THAT TALYN AND HER STAFF PUT
IN.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

WELL DONE.

MAKING OUR JOB EASY.

FIVE-MINUTE RECESS.

SEVEN-MINUTE FOR COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.

SEVEN-MINUTE RECESS.

[BRIEF RECESS]

>> Mayor Montgomery: RECONVENING THE MEETING NOW.

CELL PHONES OFF WHILE WE'RE UP HERE.

CELL PHONES ARE OFF, SILENT, VIBRATE WHATEVER YOU WANT.

AS LONG AS WE CAN'T HEAR THEM WE'RE GOOD TO GO.

NEXT ITEM IS 16.

CONSIDERATION OF RESOLUTION OF APOLOGY FOR THE CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
ROLE IN THE CONDEMNATION OF THE PROPERTIES AT BRUCE'S BEACH.

CITY MANAGER MOE.

>> ALI LATRAGNA WILL GIVE THE PRESENTATION.

>> GOOD EVENING.

I'M THE POLICY MANAGEMENT ANALYSIS FOR THE CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH.
THE ITEM BEFORE YOU IS A CONSIDERATION OF THE RESOLUTION OF APOLOGY
FOR THE CITY'S ROLE IN THE RACIALLY MOTIVATED CONDEMNATION OF THE
PROPERTIES AT BRUCE'S BEACH.

AS YOU KNOW THE CITY COUNCIL CREATED THE BRUCE'S BEACH TASK FORCE IN
2020 TO RESEARCH AND PROPERLY ACKNOWLEDGE THE CITY'S RACIALLY
MOTIVATED EMINENT DOMAIN ACTION THAT TOOK PLACE IN THE 1920s.
THE TASK FORCE SUGGESTED A RESOLUTION OF APOLOGY AND COUNCILMEMBER
NAPOLITANO AND COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN SUBMITTED ALTERNATE
RESOLUTIONS FOR CONSIDERATION.

ULTIMATELY THE CITY COUNCIL CHOSE TO ADOPT ON APRIL 6, 2021, A
STATEMENT OF ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF CONDEMNATION REGARDING BRUCE'S BEACH.
COUNCILMEMBERS LESSER AND HOWORTH REQUEST THAT THE CONSIDERATION OF
APOLOGY BE BROUGHT BACK TONIGHT.

THAT RESOLUTION IS BEFORE YOU FOR CONSIDERATION HOWEVER THERE ARE A
COUPLE OF MINOR SUGGESTIONS AND EDITS FROM THE STAFF THAT ARE
SPECIFICALLY IDENTIFIED IN THE STAFF REPORT AND I WANTED TO RUN
THROUGH A COUPLE OF THOSE BEFORE YOU NOW.

SO IN THE FIRST PARAGRAPH PREVIOUSLY LISTED JOHN MCCASKILL AND JAMES
AND LULA SLAUGHTER.

THESE FAMILIES OWN PROPERTIES JUST SOUTH OF 26th STREET NEAR THE
LOCATION OF THE PROPERTIES ACQUIRED THROUGH EMINENT DOMAIN BUT THEY

OR NOT PART OF THE PROCEEDINGS.
THE HISTORY REPORT HAVE INFORMATION REGARDING MCCASKILL AND PROVIDED INFORMATION ABOUT JOHN MCCASKILL BEING PART THAT OCCURRED IN THE 1920s.
HE'S IDENTIFIED IN THE HISTORY REPORT AND THAT IS WHY IT IS IMPORTANT TO INCLUDE HIS NAME IN THIS AND THAT'S WHY I BELIEVE COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO ORIGINALLY INCLUDED IT.
IT INCLUDES THE SLAUGHTERS EXPERIENCING INTIMIDATION FROM THE KKK IN THE FORM OF A FIERY CROSS AS WELL AS ATTEMPTED ARSON ON THEIR PROPERTY THAT OCCURRED IN THE MIDDLE OF THE NIGHT.
SO THEY DID EXPERIENCE THIS HARASSMENT AND INTIMIDATION HAS OUTLINED IN THE REPORT.
IT'S SUGGESTED IN THE RED-LINE.
IT'S INCLUDED IN THE RESOLUTION DRAFT TO MOVE THESE NAMES DOWN TO PARAGRAPH TWO, INCLUDE THEM AND MAKE IT MORE ACCURATE BECAUSE IN THAT PARAGRAPH IT DOES SAY THE PROPERTY OWNERS BUT THEY OR NOT PART OF THE EMINENT DOMAIN PROCEEDING.
SINCE THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA INFORMATION WAS PRESENTED BY HISTORIAN ALLISON JEFFERSON AND EDITS WERE PRESENTED BY THE HISTORY BOARD.
HOPEFULLY YOU'VE BEEN ABLE TO REVIEW BUT I'M GOING TO REVIEW A COUPLE OF EDITS WITH YOU FOR CLARITY'S SAKE AND FOR THE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.
ONE OF THE EDITS WAS TO MOVE THE NAMES DOWN SO THAT TO PARAGRAPH TWO FROM THE FIRST PARAGRAPH AND INCLUDE JAMES AND ANNA, JANET LEGETT AS WELL AS THE BLACK VISITORS THAT SOUGHT HERE.
AND THAT WAS SUGGESTED TO BE PART OF PARAGRAPH TWO.
HOPEFULLY, THAT'S CLEAR.
JAMES AND ANNA, JANET LEGGETT OWNED PROPERTY NEAR THE PROPERTY AS WELL.
THEY WERE A BLACK FAMILY THAT ALSO OWNED PROPERTY.
THE OTHER EDITS IDENTIFIED BY THE HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD MEMBERS, I'LL RUN THROUGH THOSE VERY QUICKLY, WAS TO MAKE AN EDIT TO THE RECITALS IN SECTION A.
RATE INCREASE THAN SAYING ROUGHLY A HALF A DOZEN, SAY FIVE FAMILIES.
AND AGAIN MOVING THOSE JOHN MCCASKILL AND JAMES SLAUGHTER DOWN TO THE SECOND PARAGRAPH IN THE APOLOGY RESOLUTION.
THE SECOND EDIT WAS TO REMOVE SUBSECTION C, TWO LITTLE I.
I DON'T KNOW EXACTLY HOW TO SAY THAT.
BUT IT'S THE SECTION THAT BEGINS UNKNOWN PERSONS LETTING OUT THE AIR FROM TIRES OF VEHICLES OWNED BY BLACK VISITORS.
SO OUR HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD MEMBERS INDICATE IT'S UNCORROBORATED INFORMATION SO THEY SUGGEST REMOVING THAT.
I ALSO SUGGEST REMOVING FROM THE RECITALS THREE LITTLE I THAT SAYS AN ADJACENT PROPERTY OWNER CORDONING OFF PROPERTY SO AS TO FORCE THE BLACK BEACH GOERS TO WALK ONE-HALF MILE TO THE NEIGHBORHOODS ACROSS THE OCEAN.
THIS IS SUGGESTED TO BE REMOVED FOR ITS AMBIGUITY.
AND THEN THE NEXT REVISION IS FOR THE NEXT SECTION DOWN FOR CI5 IS

ADDING SOME LANGUAGE THERE RATHER THAN LISTING OUT THE ORDINANCES, THEY SUGGEST ADDING IN CREATING OBSTACLES FOR TRADITIONAL BEACH-GOING EXPERIENCING.

LIKE CHANGING INTO BATHING SUITS AND MAKING PARKING DIFFICULT AROUND BRUCE'S BEACH.

SO THOSE ARE THE EDITS.

THEY'RE AVAILABLE TO THE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BACK OF THE ROOM AND PRESENTED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.

YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THOSE EDITS OR THE RESOLUTION BEFORE YOU I'M HAPPY TO PROVIDE ANSWERS.

BUT AT THIS TIME STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT CITY COUNCIL DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION AND CONSIDER ADOPTING THE PRESENTED RESOLUTION WITH EDITS.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, ALI.
COUNCIL, QUESTIONS.

COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH AND FOLLOWED BY COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.

>> Councilmember Howorth: ALI, IF YOU COULD GET BACK UP.
I WAS FLIPPING BACK AND FORTH.

IF YOU'RE LOOKING AT THE RESOLUTION, THE LAST ITEM YOU MENTIONED, I DIDN'T KNOW IF THAT WAS UNDER RECITALS SECTION C NUMBER 5 OR WHERE IT WAS.

YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT LIKE THE ACTUAL ACTIONS.

COULD YOU REPEAT --

>> YES.

SO THAT'S IN C4.

>> Councilmember Howorth: OH, 4.

>> IT THAT'S PARAGRAPH THAT BEGINNING THE CITY COUNCIL ENACTED ORDINANCES SHARPLY LIMITING THE CREATION OF NEW BATH HOUSES AND OTHER VISITOR-SERVING FACILITIES CREATING OBSTACLES FOR BEACH GOING ACTIVITIES, IE, CHANGING INTO BATHING SUITS AND MAKING THE PARKING DIFFICULT AROUND BRUCE'S BEACH.

SORRY I DIDN'T MAKE THAT CLEAR.

>> Councilmember Howorth: THAT'S IT FOR ME.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER LESS.

>> Councilmember Lesser: I HAVE A QUESTION FOR THE CITY ATTORNEY. THE STAFF REPORTS INCLUDES REFERENCE TO FIVE GOVERNMENT ENTITIES THAT HAVE ISSUED APOLOGIES FOR HISTORIC INJUSTICES SINCE 2021.

WHAT LITIGATION HAS FOLLOWED?

WHAT HAS ENSUED SINCE THOSE APOLOGIES WERE ISSUED BY THE GOVERNMENT AGENCIES?

>> WE DID SOME RESEARCH ON ALL FIVE OF THOSE AND WE COULD NOT FIND ANY LITIGATION ARISING BASED ON THEIR APOLOGY.

AND THESE ARE RECENT EXAMPLES.

I THINK THEY START WITH EVEN GLENDALE AND OTHER CITIES ALSO ADOPTED RESOLUTIONS AND WE HAVE FOUND NO EVIDENCE OF LAWSUITS FILED AGAINST ANY OF THOSE CITIES.

>> Councilmember Lesser: THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCIL, QUESTIONS?
MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YES.
SORRY.
NOT HAVING A GOOD WEEK WITH TECH HERE.
CITY ATTORNEY BARROW, IF I MAY, SO THOSE EXAMPLES THAT WERE GIVEN,
HOW CLOSE WERE THEY TO THE EXPERIENCES THAT WE HAD HERE?
MANHATTAN BEACH?
>> WELL, MOST OF THOSE WERE AGAINST CHINESE IMMIGRANTS WHO WERE
AGAINST ASIANS AND CHINESE AND THEY WERE FAR WORSE THAN WHAT MANHATTAN
BEACH DID IN CONDEMNING THE PROPERTY OR ACQUIRING BY EMINENT DOMAIN.
THERE ARE LAWS THAT PROHIBITED CHINESE CHILDREN FROM GOING TO PUBLIC
SCHOOLS.
THERE WERE BURNING DOWN OF LAUNDRIES.
THERE WAS LAWS THAT PROHIBITED LAUNDRIES MADE OUT OF WOOD.
SO THERE WERE A LOT OF THINGS THAT WERE JUST FAR WORSE THAN WHAT WAS
EXPERIENCED HERE.
I'M NOT TRYING TO DISMISS WHAT HAPPENED HERE.
I'M JUST SAYING THAT THEY HAD SOME PRETTY HORRIBLE THINGS THAT THEY
DID BACK, YOU KNOW, A HUNDRED YEARS AGO OR SO.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: I DON'T EXPECT YOU TO KNOW ALL OF THE DETAILS
BUT GENERALLY WERE PROPERTIES SEIZED BUT EMINENT DOMAIN PROCEEDINGS?
>> WE COULDN'T FIND ANY.
BUT THERE WERE SOME RECITAL FOR ONE OF THE CITIES ABOUT THE CITY
PERHAPS INVOLVED WITH BURNING DOWN A HOUSE AND THERE WAS PROPERTY
DAMAGE.
THERE WAS A RIOT LIKE IN 1877 UP IN SAN FRANCISCO AND I THINK MAYBE
IN SAN JOSE WHERE GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS WERE LOOKING THE OTHER WAY AND
LAUNDRIES AND HOUSES WERE BURNED DOWN.
SO THERE WAS SUBSTANTIAL PROPERTY DAMAGE.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: OKAY.
BUT NOT THE SEIZING OF PROPERTIES.
>> I COULD NOT FIND ANY, ANY OF THOSE INSTANCES OF ANY ACQUISITION
BY EMINENT DOMAIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: OKAY.
THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
>> Councilmember Howorth: THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR.
THIS IS A QUESTION FOR THE CITY ATTORNEY AS WELL.
DURING PUBLIC COMMENT THERE WAS A CALLER WHO REFERENCED, THEY SAID
WELL I BELIEVE THE CITY IS ALREADY FACING A LAWSUIT REGARDING THIS
APOLOGY.
AND WE ARE NOT, IS THAT CORRECT?
>> THAT'S CORRECT.
>> Councilmember Howorth: OKAY.
THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO, STEVE, ANY QUESTIONS?

>> Councilmember Napolitano: NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR, THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: ALL RIGHT.

OPEN UP PUBLIC COMMENT.

PLEASE COME DOWN IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK.

IF YOU SPOKE BEFORE YOU CANNOT SPEAK NOW.

ANYONE ELSE WANT TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

IT'S OKAY, FOLKS.

WE'LL BE HERE FOR A WHILE.

HEY, TIM.

>> Mayor Montgomery: FIRST OF ALL, GOOD EVENING, CITY COUNCIL, MEMBERS OF OUR COMMUNITY, NEIGHBORS, FRIENDS, FIRST AND FOREMOST I WOULD LIKE TO SAY THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH FOR BEING A BODY THAT LISTENS TO THE PEOPLE.

I'VE BEEN LIVING ON MORNINGSIDE DRIVE FOR THE LAST 18 YEARS.

I PRETTY MUCH PERCEIVE MORNINGSIDE DRIVE -- WE USED TO LOOK AT OUR BLOCK AS PERHAPS THE MOST DIVERSE NEIGHBORHOOD IN MANHATTAN BEACH. YOU GOT A BLACK FAMILY, JEWISH FAMILY, A CHINESE AND JAPANESE FAMILY AND VIETNAMESE.

AND DIVERSITY WAS OUR STRENGTH.

I EXPLAINED TO NEIGHBORS WHAT THE BLACK AND GREEN AFRICAN FLAG WAS. MY SON GOT A MINORA FOR CHRISTMAS.

LITERALLY IT WAS A NEIGHBORHOOD IN CHIEF JOHNSON WOULD SAY DIVERSITY WAS TRULY EXPRESSING ITSELF IN ITS BEST FORM.

I'M HERE TO SAY I'M IN FAVOR AND HOPING THAT THE COUNCIL FINDS ITSELF ABLE TO OFFER AN APOLOGY.

BRIEFLY, JUST TO TELL YOU, MY MOTHER IS 85 YEARS OLD.

SHE'S FROM THE SOUTH.

SHE DID NOT HAVE AN EASY LIFE.

AND WHAT I STILL FIND IS THAT HER DEMEANOR SOMETIMES, SHE CAN BE RUDE AND SHE CAN BE INSENSITIVE AND TO A CERTAIN DEGREE SHE CAN BE WHAT I WOULD CONSIDER ALMOST RACIST.

BUT IN SITUATIONS THAT I FIND MYSELF, IF SHE'S LIKE THAT, OR IF SHE EXPRESSES THAT TYPE OF BEHAVIOR, I FIND NO PROBLEM WITH APOLOGIZING FOR HER.

AND APOLOGIZING FOR HER, I DON'T LOVE HER ANY LESS.

ALL THE WONDERFUL THINGS SHE'S DONE IN LIFE ARE STILL RELEVANT.

BUT SHE REAL -- I REALIZE SHE WAS FROM A DIFFERENT TIME, A DIFFERENT PLACE AND ALMOST A DIFFERENT WORLD.

LET'S MAKE THE APOLOGY.

THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR MANY YEARS OF SERVICE TO THE BEACH CITIES TOY DRIVE.

UNsung HERO THERE.

OUR NEXT SPEAKER.

ANYONE ELSE CARE TO SPEAK?

MAYOR HILDY STERN.

>> GOOD EVENING, MAYOR MONTGOMERY AND MEMBERS OF THE CITY COUNCIL. MY NAME IS HILDY STERN, I'M AN ALMOST 30-YEAR RESIDENT OF MANHATTAN BEACH.

I KNOW IT COMES AS NO SURPRISE TO ANY OF YOU THAT I AM IN SUPPORT OF A RESOLUTION OF APOLOGY.

AND WHILE I'M NOT GOING TO REITERATE EVERYTHING THAT YOU'VE HEARD IN ALL OF THE PUBLIC COMMENTS TONIGHT AND BY E-MAIL, I JUST WANTED TO THANK YOU.

I'M VERY GRATEFUL TO EACH OF YOU FOR REVISITING THIS ISSUE AND FOR NOT ONLY LOOKING BACK AT THE ACTIONS OF THE COUNCIL OF THE 1920s BUT ALSO REFLECTING ON THE ACTIONS OF OUR PRIOR COUNCIL OF 2021.

AND WHILE THAT WASN'T TOO FAR BACK IN OUR PAST, WHEN THAT APOLOGY WAS NOT ADOPTED, YOU'RE WILLING NOW TO TAKE THE TIME TO REFLECT ON HOW THAT HAS IMPACTED US.

AND TO REALLY LOOK AT HOW TO CORRECT THOSE ACTIONS.

YOU HAD A COUPLE OF YEARS TO LEARN THE IMPACT THAT DECISION HAD, RECOGNIZING THE INADEQUACY OF THE DECISION MADE BY OUR PRIOR COUNCIL IN 2021.

SO THANK YOU FOR BEING A LEADER THAT TAKES YOUR ACTIONS SERIOUSLY, WHO LEARNS FROM PRIOR ACTIONS AND CONSIDERS HOW TO DO BETTER FOR OUR WHOLE COMMUNITY.

MAYOR NAPOLITANO, YOUR PERSONAL APOLOGY AT THE PLAQUE DEDICATION WAS A TURNING POINT FOR OUR CITY WHICH WAS THEN FOLLOWED BY COUNCILMEMBER LESSER AND HOWORTH REQUESTING THIS TO BE BROUGHT BACK.

YOU SHOWED BRAVERY AS LEADERS WILLING TO LISTEN AND LEARN.

YOU FIRMLY RECOGNIZE THAT THE RACIALLY MOTIVATED ACTIONS IN THE 1920s WAS UNACCEPTABLE.

AN APOLOGY SAYS YOU DO CARE ABOUT EVERYONE WHO LIVES, WORKS OR VISITS MANHATTAN BEACH.

AN APOLOGY SAYS YOU STAND WITH OUR ENTIRE COMMUNITY IN CONDEMNING RACISM AND WILL ALWAYS STRIVE TO BE BETTER.

AN APOLOGY SAYS YOU ARE A LEADER THAT WE CAN BE PROUD OF TO REPRESENT MANHATTAN BEACH.

THANK YOU FOR STANDING UP FOR OUR ENTIRE COMMUNITY.

THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, HILDY.

OUR NEXT SPEAKER.

SPEAKERS.

>> MAYOR, MEMBERS OF THE CITY COUNCIL, MICHAEL JENKINS.

I SPEAK HERE TODAY AS THE 45-YEAR RESIDENT OF THE CITY, MEMBER OF THE BRUCE'S BEACH TASK FORCE AND A MEMBER OF MB UNITED.

I ALSO WANT TO THANK YOU FOR RETURNING THIS ITEM TO YOUR AGENDA AFTER A TWO-YEAR HIATUS.

AND CONSIDERING ONE OF THE PRINCIPLE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE TASK FORCE.

WE RECOMMENDED AN APOLOGY BECAUSE APOLOGY REPRESENTS REGRET THAT THE ACTION HAD ON THE BRUCE FAMILY AND OTHER AFFECTED PROPERTY OWNERS AND

THEIR FAMILIES.
AND APOLOGY DISTINGUISHES OUR INTENTIONS FOR OUR CITY FROM THAT SHAMEFUL ACTION OF OUR FORBEARERS.
AN APOLOGY DEMONSTRATES TO OUR CHILDREN THAT WHEN AN INSTITUTION ACTS UNJUSTLY IT SHOULD SEEK THE TRUTH, APOLOGIZE FOR ITS FAILINGS AND RECOMMIT TO JUSTICE.
AN APOLOGY DOES NOT LABEL OR CITY OR RESIDENT RACIST.
RATHER IT SHOWS THAT WE UNDERSTAND AND REJECT THE RACIST ACT FROM THE CITY'S HISTORY AS THE COMMUNITY REPUDIATES RACISM.
NO BENEFITS FROM HIDING THE HARD TRUTHS ABOUT RACISM IN AMERICA'S HISTORY.
WE HAVE TO TEACH RESPECT FOR OTHERS.
RESPECT FOR DIFFERENCES AND SENSITIVITY TO INJUSTICE.
THIS DOESN'T DIVIDE US.
IT STRENGTHENS AND UNITES US AS A COMMUNITY.
PSYCHOLOGICAL AND SOCIOLOGICAL VALUE OF FORMAL GOVERNMENTAL APOLOGY TO RACIAL AND ETHNIC GROUPS THAT HAVE SUFFERED AT THE HANDS OF GOVERNMENT IS WELL DOCUMENTED.
APOLOGIES ESTABLISH ACCOUNTABILITY, A PREREQUISITE TO HEALING AND RECONCILIATION.
THERE ARE MANY EXAMPLES OF GOVERNMENTS OFFERING APOLOGIES FOR PAST WRONGDOING.
THIS STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS WOULD BE AN INSURMOUNTABLE BALL.
FINALLY WITH RESPECT TO THE RESOLUTION ITSELF, I SUGGEST, AS GERMANY STERN SELECTED, YOU DELETE THE LAST SENTENCE AND DO NOT DELETE THE SENTENCE DEALING WITH THE CORDONING OFF OF THE BEACH.
I DON'T FIND THAT ONE AMBIGUOUS AT ALL.
THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE TIME.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, SIR.
OUR NEXT SPEAKER.
>> MY NAME IS CHRISTY HOGAN, I'M A 30-YEAR RESIDENT OF THE CITY AND HAD MY BUSINESS HERE FOR A COUPLE OF DECADES.
AND I'M HERE TO SUPPORT THE EFFORT TO OFFER A REAL APOLOGY.
AND I WANT TO SAY HOW MUCH I APPRECIATE YOUR LEADERSHIP IN CONTINUING A COMMUNITY DIALOGUE ABOUT RACE INJUSTICE.
I KNOW THAT THERE ARE EASIER PATHS THAT YOU COULD HAVE TAKEN.
YOU COULD HAVE GOTTEN AWAY PROBABLY WITH SHRUGGING AND SAYING THAT THE FORMER COUNCIL DID WHAT IT DID AND LEAVE IT AT THAT.
I ADMIRE YOUR WILLINGNESS TO TAKE ON THIS DIFFICULT OBSTACLE THAT'S CLOGGING THE PATH TO OUR BETTER COMMUNITY.
THERE ARE A FEW THINGS IN THIS -- AT THIS MOMENT IN HISTORY MORE IMPORTANT THAN DEVOTING SERIOUS ATTENTION TO THE DISMANTLING THE SYSTEMS THAT HAVE ADVANTAGED SOME PEOPLE BECAUSE OF THEIR RACE.
WE ARE HERE TO REEXAMINE NOT JUST WHETHER OR NOT SOME PRIOR COUNCIL SUCCUMB TO COME PRESSURE TO TAKE AN ACTION TO SATISFY SOME RACIST ENDS, BUT RATHER TO EXPLORE HOW WE CAN BE ANTIRACIST.
HOW WE CAN USE THIS EPISODE TO REINFORCE OUR COMMITMENT TO REACH THE

OPPOSITE OUTCOME THAT WAS PURSUED BY OUR CITY LO THESE MANY YEARS AGO.
A SINCERE APOLOGY CREATES THE OPPORTUNITY TO DISTINGUISH OURSELVES
FROM OUR FORBEARERS.

I KNOW THAT YOU'RE NOT THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE 1920s.

BUT WE HAVE, I GUESS, TERM LIMITS I GUESS TO THANK FOR THAT.

BUT THROUGH YOUR WORDS TONIGHT YOU CAN HELP STATE OUR INTENTION TO
MOVE THIS COMMUNITY ONWARD.

SO I WANTED TO COME DOWN TONIGHT AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR THOUGHTFUL
EFFORTS IN THAT REGARD.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, CHRISTY.

ANYONE ELSE HERE WHO HAS NOT SPOKEN TONIGHT?

LET'S GO TO ZOOM, PLEASE, MARTHA.

NO ZOOM COMMENTS.

ANYONE ELSE?

CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT.

COUNCIL.

I'M SORRY, COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH, YOU PUSHED THE BUTTON.

THANK YOU.

>> Councilmember Howorth: I LISTENED TO YOUR SPEECH, MR. MAYOR.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

>> Councilmember Howorth: SO I'M GOING TO MAKE A FEW COMMENTS, NOT
ABOUT THE APOLOGY ITSELF BUT I THINK PEOPLE ARE CLEAR WHERE I STAND
ON THAT.

I WANT TO THANK FORMER MAYOR HILDY STERN FOR HER EFFORTS BOTH AS A
COUNCILMEMBER AND CURRENTLY, HER GRACE AND STRENGTH HAS REALLY MEANT
A DIFFERENCE IN THIS COMMUNITY.

YOU'VE MADE A DIFFERENCE.

AND I DO WANT TO THANK FORMER MAYOR STEVE NAPOLITANO WHO I THINK IS
STILL LISTENING ON ZOOM, BECAUSE I THINK -- OF COURSE HE IS -- AS
FORMER MAYOR STERN SAID, HIS COMMENTS SHIFTED THIS COMMUNITY AND
SIGNALLED TO ALL OF US THAT IT WAS TIME, IT WAS OKAY, IN FACT IT WAS
INCUMBENT UPON US.

I ALSO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE CURRENT MAYOR RICHARD MONTGOMERY WHO HAS
BEEN AT THIS LONGER THAN ANY OF US -- I THINK SINCE 2007, WHEN -- OKAY,
'5, BUT WHO'S COUNTING.

2005 WHEN HE WAS FIRST ELECTED TO COUNCIL AND WANTED TO MAKE AN APOLOGY
THEN TO THE BRUCE FAMILY.

AND I DON'T WANT THAT TO GO UNMENTIONED NOR DO I WANT YOU TO JUST HAVE
TO SAY IT.

YOU KNOW?

BECAUSE THAT'S IMPORTANT.

AND I THINK IT'S OFTEN SAID PEOPLE APPRECIATE WHEN THEIR POLITICIANS
OR I PREFER THE WORD LEADER -- I JUST DO -- CAN ADMIT WHEN THEY'RE
WRONG.

OF COURSE I DON'T HAVE TO ADMIT THAT I'M WRONG RIGHT NOW.

NO, I'M KIDDING.

BUT I THINK ALL OF US HAVE GROWN A LOT, HAVE LEARNED A LOT IN THE LAST

SEVERAL YEARS.

AND I DON'T BLAME ANYONE FOR WHAT THEY THOUGHT -- THEY WERE DOING WHAT THEY THOUGHT WAS RIGHT BUT THEY WERE WRONG.

THEY WERE WRONG.

WE HAVE A CHANCE TO CORRECT THE COURSE OF OUR CITY.

WE HAVE A CHANCE TO SAY IF WE WANT WRONG THAT, YOU KNOW, WE WERE THINKING ABOUT DIFFERENT THINGS AND THIS IS NOT JUST OKAY BUT WE MUST DO THIS.

THIS IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO.

AND THAT IS ALL I WILL SAY.

THIS IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.

>> Councilmember Lesser: WELL FOR ME IT WAS THE DEDICATION OF THE MORE FACTUALLY ACCURATE PLAQUE AT BRUCE'S BEACH AND THE ELOQUENT COMMENTS BY OUR COLLEAGUE, COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO, AT THE DEDICATION CEREMONY THAT ALLOWS US AS A CITY TO REVIEW HOW WE'VE RESPONDED BY THE FACTS THAT HAVE BEEN DOCUMENTED BY THE BRUCE'S BEACH TASK FORCE AND THE HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD.

IN 2021 THE COUNCIL RIGHTFULLY STATED THAT WE ARE NOT THE MANHATTAN BEACH OF A HUNDRED YEARS AGO, THE COMMUNITY AND POPULATION ARE LOVING, TOLERANT AND WELCOMING TO ALL.

WE REJECT RACISM, HATE, INTOLERANCE AND EXCLUSION.

BUT THIS WAS NOT ALWAYS THE CASE.

FOR THOSE THAT ARE WATCHING THIS, THOSE THAT READ ABOUT IT AFTER THE FACT, I ENCOURAGE YOU TO READ THE BRUCE'S BEACH HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD REPORT.

IT DESCRIBES DEEPLY TROUBLING ACTIONS BY OUR CITY GOVERNMENT, NOT JUST RANDOM RESIDENTS OF OUR COMMUNITY.

THE CITY BOARD, THE PREDECESSOR TO OUR CITY COUNCIL LED THE PROCEEDING IN THE 1920s TO CONDEMN THE PROPERTIES ON THE LAND THAT IS NOW OCCUPIED BY THE CITY'S BRUCE'S BEACH PARK AND THE COUNTY LIFEGUARD OFFICES. BOARD MEMBERS ACKNOWLEDGED AFTER THE FACT THAT THEIR ACTIONS WERE RACIALLY MOTIVATED.

AT LEAST IN PART.

SO WHY REVISIT THIS ISSUE NOW.

THAT'S WHAT MANY ARE ASKING ME.

THE UNWILLINGNESS OF THE CITY COUNCIL IN 2021 TO APOLOGIZE ONCE THIS HISTORY WAS DOCUMENTED AND KNOWN DID NOT GO FAR ENOUGH.

TO SIMPLY ACKNOWLEDGE, EMPATHIZE AND CONDEMN THE CITY'S RACIALLY-MOTIVATED ACTIONS, THAT'S HOW THE CITY CHARACTERIZED IT, IS INSUFFICIENT.

AS MAYOR IN 2017 I WAS PROUD TO JOIN WITH THREE OF MY CURRENT COLLEAGUES ON THIS COUNCIL AND THE MANHATTAN BEACH UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT BOARD TO ADOPT THE MANHATTAN BEACH INCLUSION PLEDGE.

WE COMMITTED TO STAND UP TO ALL FORMS OF HATE, BIGOTRY, VIOLENCE AND BULLYING AND TO TAKE ACTION.

TO NOT JUST MAKE THEM WORDS BUT TO DO SOMETHING.
THE DRAFT RESOLUTION PROPOSED BY COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO IN 2021
THAT IS BEFORE US TONIGHT INCLUDES THE PLEDGE OF AND APOLOGY.
I SUPPORT BOTH.
I SUPPORT ADOPTING THE RESOLUTION WITH CERTAIN AMENDMENTS.
AND I WOULD SAY THIS.
BY APOLOGIZING FOR THE ACTIONS OF PRIOR CITY LEADERSHIP WE RECOGNIZE
OUR HISTORY FOR ITS GOOD AND ITS BAD.
WE'RE OPEN.
WE'RE TRANSPARENT.
BECAUSE THAT'S WHO WE ARE.
WE HONOR OUR PLEDGE AND WE HELP MOVE OUR COMMUNITY FORWARD.
SO WITH THAT I DO HAVE SOME PROPOSED REVISIONS BUT I'D LIKE TO HEAR
FROM MY OTHER COLLEAGUES BEFORE WE GET INTO THE SPECIFIC RESOLUTION
AND POTENTIAL AMENDMENTS.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YES.
THANK YOU.
SO I STAND BY EVERY WORD I SPOKE TWO YEARS AGO, APRIL 6, 2021, WITH
REGARDS TO WHETHER THE CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH SHOULD ISSUE A
STATEMENT OF ACKNOWLEDGMENT, CONDEMNATION AND EMPATHY OR A STATEMENT
OF APOLOGY.
QUOTE, WE CAN'T PAINT THE ENTIRE CITY AT THAT TIME OR TODAY WITH A
BROAD BRUSH OF RACISM DUE TO THE ACTS OF SOME OF ITS RESIDENTS AND
MEMBERS OF CITY COUNCIL A HUNDRED YEARS AGO.
YES, THERE WAS HARASSMENT BY SOME OF THE RESIDENTS.
YES, THERE WERE BAD ACTS BY SOME OF THE RESIDENTS.
YES, THERE WERE IMMORAL ACTS BY SOME ON THE CITY COUNCIL.
BUT NO RESIDENT LIVING IN MANHATTAN BEACH NOW IS RESPONSIBLE FOR THE
RACIST ACTIONS A HUNDRED YEARS AGO, END QUOTE.
SPEAKING TODAY I'M PERSONALLY SORRY ABOUT WHAT HAPPENED TO THE BRUISES
AND OTHER FAMILIES WHO MADE MANHATTAN BEACH THEIR HOME.
BUT THE ISSUE OF LIABILITY LOOMS OVER OUR ACTIONS TODAY AND CANNOT
BE EASILY OR LIGHTLY DISMISSED IN THE TENUOUS AND LITIGIOUS
ENVIRONMENT IN WHICH WE FIND OURSELVES.
SOME SUGGEST IT'S NOT LIKELY THERE WILL BE LAWSUITS SEEKING
REPARATIONS OR RESTITUTION IF THE CITY ISSUES AN APOLOGY.
BUT IN THE LOS ANGELES TIMES ON MARCH 19th, THE DAY AFTER THE BRUCE'S
BEACH PLAQUE WAS DEDICATED, IT WAS APPARENT THAT AN APOLOGY PERSONAL
OR FROM THE CITY WILL NEVER BE ENOUGH.
WARD STATED IN THAT ARTICLE, QUOTE, MANHATTAN BEACH STILL HAS A DEBT
TO PAY TO ALL OF THE BLACK FAMILIES FORCED OUT OF THE COMMUNITY AND
TO ALL OF THE BLACK PEOPLE THEY CONTINUE TO SYSTEMATICALLY PREVENT
FROM TAKING UP SPACE IN THAT COMMUNITY, UNQUOTE.
A BRUCE FAMILY SPOKESPERSON HAS STATED IN THE "THE NEW YORK TIMES,"
QUOTE, THE RESTITUTION AND PUNITIVE DAMAGES MANHATTAN BEACH -- AND
SORRY.

LET ME START THAT OVER.
THE RESTITUTION AND PUNITIVE DAMAGES MANHATTAN BEACH IS GOING TO HAVE TO PAY, WE'RE GOING TO KEEP UP WITH THEM UNTIL WE GET IT, UNQUOTE. REGARDLESS OF MY PERSONAL FEELINGS, I REPRESENT THE CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH AND MY JOB IS TO PROTECT IT FROM LIABILITY.
TWO YEARS AGO THE PREVIOUS COUNCIL VOTED 4-1 NOT TO APOLOGIZE AND TO ISSUE A STATEMENT OF ACKNOWLEDGMENT, CONDEMNATION AND EMPATHY. THIS ACTION WAS SUPPORTED BY AN OVER TWO H TO MARGIN OF RESIDENTS IN E-MAILS TO THE COUNCIL.
AN UNPRECEDENTED 251 TO 116 AND PROVIDED LITTLE TO NO LITIGATION EXPOSURE.
THEREFORE, AT THIS TIME I CANNOT SUPPORT THE STATEMENT OF APOLOGY. THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO, STEVE.
>> Councilmember Napolitano: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.
THERE IS NO ISSUE OF LIABILITY.
SORRY.
IT'S NONSENSE.
THERE'S BEEN NOTHING SHOWN OF THAT.
THE CITY ATTORNEY HAS BEEN CLEAR THAT THERE'S NO EVIDENCE OR CASE THAT SUPPORTS LIABILITY BASED ON APOLOGY.
AS FURTHER COMMENTS ON THIS, I MADE THIS AT THIS PLAQUE DEDICATION. I STAND BY THEM ONE THOUSAND PERCENT.
I WANT TO THANK ANY COLLEAGUES WHO HAD THE COURAGE TO PUT THIS BACK ON THE AGENDA.
I APPRECIATE THAT.
I APPRECIATE THIS OPPORTUNITY.
BECAUSE I MADE A PREDICTION IN 2021, AFTER I SAID THAT THE ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND CONDEMNATION WAS JUST A HALF STEP.
I PREDICTED THAT A FUTURE COUNCIL WOULD ADOPT AN APOLOGY.
AND I COULDN'T BE MORE PROUD THAT I'M A PART OF THIS COUNCIL THAT'S GOING TO DO THAT RIGHT NOW.
NOT BECAUSE IT'S WOKE, NOT BECAUSE IT'S PERFORMATIVE.
BUT BECAUSE IT'S THE RIGHT THING TO DO.
FINALLY.
LET'S DO THE RIGHT THING.
THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.
>> Mayor Montgomery: BEFORE WE GET TO COUNCILMEMBER LESSER'S REVISIONS ON WHAT HE MIGHT CHANGE ON THE LANGUAGE THAT IS PROPOSED HERE, I'LL GIVE MY COMMENTS AND COME BACK TO ANY REVISIONS THAT WE MIGHT HAVE.
AS COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH MENTIONED, THIS IS DEJA VU FOR ME. THOSE OF YOU HERE IN THE CITY IN 2006 REMEMBER WHAT HAPPENED WHEN WE CHANGED THE NAME OF THE PARK TO BRUCE'S BEACH PARK.
I WAS MORE OF A HISTORY PERSON THAT BELIEVED THE PARK ITSELF, THE PLAQUE SHOULD BE AT THE LOCATION WHERE THE INCIDENT TOOK PLACE.

THE BRUCE FAMILY SHOULD BE AT THE PROPERTY, NOT AT THE PARK,
REGARDLESS.

I THOUGHT THE WAY TO RECOGNIZE WHAT HAPPENED WAS TO APOLOGIZE IN 2006
AND I BROUGHT THAT UP TO THE COUNCIL.

COUNCIL DIDN'T WANT TO GO FOR THAT.

THEY THOUGHT -- THE MAYOR AT THE TIME SAID IT'S THE PARK, RENAME IT
OR NOTHING.

THAT WAS A MISTAKE IN 2006.

ANOTHER MISTAKE.

FAST FORWARD TO 2020, A LOT GOING ON.

EVERYBODY KNOWS.

FORMER MAYOR STERN KNOWS.

FRANKLIN KNOWS.

WE ALL KNOW WHAT IT WAS LIKE IN 2020.

EVERY DAY YOUR HEAD IS SPINNING, DIFFERENT THINGS GOING ON.

NO MATTER WHAT WE WOULD SAY IN THE DAIS UP HERE AND YES APOLOGIZING
AS A MAYOR DOES NOT TAKE THE SAME WEIGHT AS APOLOGIZING AS A TEAM.
IT WENT BUY THE WAYSIDE.

'21, SO MUCH GOING ON, LISTENING TO OUR ATTORNEY AND THE ISSUE ABOUT
ACKNOWLEDGMENT.

WHAT ABOUT THE LIABILITY.

WHAT DO WE DO.

TO MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN'S POINT.

WE DECIDED WE'RE NOT THERE YET.

WE'RE PUSH IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION.

SO FOR ME 17 YEARS LATER BACK WHERE WE STARTED FROM.

A DIFFERENT COUNCIL, DIFFERENT TIME.

WE'RE NOT IN THE MIDDLE OF COVID ANYMORE.

WE'RE PAST THAT HOPEFULLY.

WE'RE NOT GOING BACKWARDS IN TIME.

IN ORDER TO MOVE FORWARD, I DON'T KNOW WHO SAID IT TONIGHT, BUT WE
NEED TO MOVE FORWARD TO AN ANTIRACIST CITY.

WE HAVE AN ANTIRACIST CITY.

THAT'S NOT THE CITY.

WE'RE NOT THE CITY BACK THEN, NOT THE PEOPLE BACK THEN.

WHAT YOU SEE THE LAST TEN -- I'VE BEEN HERE 34 YEARS.

I HAVEN'T SEEN ANY INSTANCE OF THAT IN FRONT OF ME YET.

NOT THAT I'M NOT LOOKING.

I DON'T SEE IT.

TIM IS TALKING ABOUT HIS BLOCK WHERE HE LIVES.

I HAVE A SIMILAR BLOCK, FOLKS.

IT'S THE U.N. OF MANHATTAN BEACH.

YOU WANT TO SEE THAT.

HOW MANY OF YOU DON'T COME DOWN ON THE WEEKEND AND TELL ME WHAT YOU
SEE AND WHAT YOU DON'T SEE.

I APPRECIATE MY COLLEAGUES BRINGING IT BACK UP.

I UNDERSTAND WHERE WE'RE TRYING TO GO.

I'M PROUD TO JOIN THEM ON AN APOLOGY WITH THE REVISIONS THAT COUNCILMEMBER LESSER MAY MAKE AND WE'LL GO FROM THAT. WITH THAT SAID, COUNCILMEMBER LESSER WITH YOUR REVISIONS.

>> Councilmember Lesser: I SEE A MOTION HAS BEEN MADE BY COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH AND I WANTED TO SEE HOW HE PROPOSES TO PROCEED.

>> Councilmember Howorth: I DID PRESS MY BUTTON AGAIN TO SPEAK.

>> Councilmember Lesser: YOU'RE FIRST UP.
THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR.

>> Councilmember Howorth: AND I WILL GET TO THE MOTION.
I HOPE WE CAN GET TO UNANIMOUS DECISION.
AND -- BECAUSE I WOULD LIKE TO CHALLENGE COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN, WITH RESPECT, THAT WE HAVE BEEN TOLD, WE HAVE RESEARCHED.
THE APOLOGY DOES NOT WEEK WALL LIABILITY.
NOT APOLOGY MIGHT MAKE US MORE SUSCEPTIBLE TO SOME SORT OF ACTION AND SOME SORT OF TAINT.
EMPATHY -- AN ACKNOWLEDGMENT WITH EMPATHY IS THE WORST KIND OF APOLOGY I CAN HEAR OF.
I MEAN, APOLOGY IS EMPATHY.
APOLOGY MEANS WOW, THAT MUST HAVE BEEN AWFUL.
I'M REALLY SORRY.
ACKNOWLEDGING IT HAPPENED IS LIKE -- IS NOTHING.
SO I REALLY HOPE WE CAN GET YOU THERE.
BECAUSE IF YOU'RE WORRIED ABOUT LIABILITY, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE THE HIGHROSE DECISION A FEW MONTHS BACK WHICH BY US TAKING THE ACTION THAT WE DID PROBABLY SAVE THE CITY TENS AND TENS AND TENS AND TENS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN LAWSUITS.
AND YOU WEREN'T SO CONCERNED ABOUT IT THEN.
I'M GOING TO CHALLENGE YOU BECAUSE I THINK IT'S PROTECTORAL AND I THINK WE WILL -- WE WILL PREVAIL AND PEOPLE WHO TOOK THE RIGHT ACTION.
SO I DON'T DOUBT WHERE YOUR HEART IS AND NO ONE ELSE SHOULD.
BECAUSE THIS IS A GOOD MAN.
I WANT YOU TO UNDERSTAND THAT I BELIEVE THAT.
BUT I ALSO THINK IT MATTERS AND WOULD BE WONDERFUL TO HAVE A 5-0 VOTE.
I CAN TALK ABOUT THE MOTION I WOULD MAKE.
OBVIOUSLY, EVERYONE GETS ANOTHER CHANCE TO TALK.
BUT MY MOTION WOULD BE TO ACCEPT RESOLUTION OF APOLOGY.
AND I COULDN'T KEEP TRACK, QUITE FRANKLY, OF THE EXACT AMENDMENTS OR CHANGES.
BUT I THINK THAT WE WILL AGREE ON THEM.
I MEAN IT'S MOVING SOMETHING DOWN TO PARAGRAPH TWO, TAKING THIS OUT AND DOING THAT.
SO I WANTED TO -- IT WAS -- I VERY SELFISHLY PRESSED THAT BUTTON TO MAKE THE MOTION.
SO GO AHEAD AND TELL ME WHAT THE CHANGES ARE THAT YOU WILL MAKE.

>> Councilmember Lesser: SO FIRST OF ALL --

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER LESSER, GO AHEAD.

>> Councilmember Lesser: SO WHAT I HEARD FROM STAFF IN THE STAFF

REPORT, I WOULD PROPOSE TO ADOPT, HOWEVER I DID WANT TO HAVE A DISCUSSION.

SHOULD I GO THROUGH THEM IN ORDER TO FOLLOW THEM.

AND I WELCOME THIS TO THE EXTENT THAT WAS ORIGINALLY COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO'S RESOLUTION TO THE EXTENT THAT HE HAS A POSITION ON SOME OF THESE PROPOSED CHANGES.

I WOULD REALLY WELCOME TO HEAR FROM HIM.

STARTING ARE WITH RECITALS IN PARAGRAPH A, THERE WAS A RECOMMENDATION TO CHANGE THE WORDS FROM HALF DOZEN TO FIVE.

>> Councilmember Howorth: YEP.

AGREED.

>> Councilmember Lesser: WITH REGARD TO SECTION C IN THE RECITALS, SUBSECTION SMALL 2, DELETING THE UNKNOWN PERSONS LETTING OUT THE AIR, DELETE.

>> Councilmember Howorth: YEP.

>> Councilmember Lesser: WITH REGARD TO SUBSECTION 3, I WELCOME FURTHER INPUT FROM OTHER COLLEAGUES ON THE PROPOSAL BY STAFF WHERE ACTUALLY STAFF WAS REFLECTING COMMENTS FROM A MEMBER OF THE TASK FORCE WITH REGARD TO AN ADJACENT PROPERTY OWNER CORDONING OFF PROPERTY. I WELCOME INPUT FROM OTHER COLLEAGUES AS TO WHETHER OR NOT TO LEAVE THAT IN OR DELETE IT.

>> Councilmember Howorth: COULD WE GET CLARIFICATION FROM STAFF WHY THEY WANTED TO DELETE IT.

PERHAPS IT WAS DISPROVEN AFTER THE TASK FORCE OR NOT.

I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR THAT.

>> YES.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR QUESTION.

AND SO THE SECOND SUBSECTION UNDER C WHERE IT BEGINS AN ADJACENT PROPERTY OWNER.

>> Councilmember Howorth: YEP.

>> THAT ONE IT WAS SUGGESTED TO BE DELETED BECAUSE IT WAS UNCORROBORATED.

IT COULD HAVE BEEN THE ACT OF A RANDOM CITIZEN.

IT'S UNCLEAR WHO ACTUALLY COMMITTED THAT ACT.

AND SO IT WAS FROM THE HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD -- FORMER HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD MEMBERS THAT WE JUST DELETE THAT SECTION.

>> Councilmember Lesser: I WOULD RATHER STICK WITH AS MUCH IN THE WAY OF FACTS THAT WE HAVE IN THIS MOTION BECAUSE THAT'S THE POINT OF WHY WE'RE TRYING TO PROCEED.

>> Councilmember Howorth: AGREED.

>> Councilmember Lesser: SO IF THAT IS THE RECOMMENDATION, I WOULD PROPOSE REMOVING --

>> Councilmember Howorth: IS THAT HOW WE DO IT PROCEDURALLY?

>> Mayor Montgomery: IT IS BETTER TO MAKE THE WORDSMITH CHANGES AND THEN GO THROUGH THE MOTION?

>> IT'S BEST TO MAKE THE CHANGES AND THEN MAKE THE MOTION ON THE REVISED RESOLUTION.

>> Councilmember Lesser: I PROPOSE WE DELETE SUBSECTION C3. MOVING ON TO SUBSECTION C5, I DID NOT QUITE CAPTURE STAFF'S PARAPHRASING OF WHAT THE RECOMMENDATION WAS WITH REGARD TO CREATING OBSTACLES.

>> CENT.

IT'S ACTUALLY C4.

>> Councilmember Lesser: C4, EXCUSE ME.

>> C4.

AND THE SUGGESTION WAS TO INCLUDE SOME LANGUAGE THERE. AND I CAN READ IT OFF TO YOU, THAT SECTION. ADDS IT'S SUGGESTED.

>> Councilmember Lesser: PLEASE.

>> THE CITY COUNCIL ENACTING ORDINANCES SHARPLY LIMITING THE CREATION OF NEW BATH HOUSES AND OTHER VISITOR-SERVING FACILITIES, RECITING OBSTACLES FOR TRADITIONAL BEACH-GOING EXPERIENCES, IE, CHANGING IN BATHING SUITS AND MAKING PARKING DIFFICULT IN THE AREA AROUND BRUCE'S BEACH, IN DIRECT RESPONSE TO THE POPULARITY OF BRUCE'S BEACH AMONG THE BLACK AMERICAN COMMUNITY, SEMI COLON AND.

>> Councilmember Lesser: I WOULD PROPOSE TO INCORPORATE THAT SUBJECT TO ANY OTHER COMMUNITIES.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH, YOU GOOD WITH THAT?

>> Councilmember Howorth: YEP.

>> Councilmember Lesser: MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN, YOU GO WITH THAT.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YES.

>> Mayor Montgomery: NEXT REVISION.

>> Councilmember Lesser: PARAGRAPH E, STAFF DID NOT RECOMMEND THIS BUT THERE IS A REFERENCE TO PERSUADING THE CITY COUNCIL WHICH AT THAT TIME, IN EARLY 1920s, BEFORE 1927 WAS KNOWN AS THE CITY BOARD, I BELIEVE.

SO I PROPOSE TO USE THE LANGUAGE THAT WAS USED IN THE ADVISORY BOARD REPORT.

THE WHOLE SENTENCE WOULD BE A REFERENCE TO THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES, THE PRECURSOR TO THE CITY COUNCIL, AS OPPOSED TO SAYING THE CITY COUNCIL. BECAUSE THAT'S THE WAY THE BOARD REPORT REFER TO THAT BODY.

>> Councilmember Howorth: MAKES SENSE TO ME.

>> Mayor Montgomery: I AGREE.

MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YEAH, THAT'S FINE.

>> Councilmember Lesser: PARAGRAPH F, AS IN FRANK, THE LAST IS INTENSE, THERE WAS A PROPOSAL TO REMOVE THE LAST SENTENCE WITH REGARD TO THE CONDEMNATION OF PROPERTIES OWNED BY OTHER RACES AND I REALLY JUST WANTED TO HAVE A COUNCIL DISCUSSION TO SEE IF ANYONE ELSE WANTED TO KEEP THAT IN OR REMOVE IT, WHETHER IT WAS FACTUAL, WHETHER IT WAS INCLUDED IN THE HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD REMEMBER.

MAYBE I COULD ASK ALI THAT QUESTION FOR A START.

>> YES.

SO YOU'RE REFERRING TO SUBSECTION F, THE LAST SENTENCE THAT SAYS 25

OTHER PROPERTIES OWNED BY WHITE PROPERTY OWNERS WERE ALSO CONDEMNED AS PART OF THE ACTION.

>> Councilmember Lesser: CORRECT.

>> AND THAT IS IN THE REPORTS.

>> Councilmember Lesser: COMMENTS.

>> Mayor Montgomery: IF IT'S ACCURATE, I WOULD LEAVE IT IN.

>> Councilmember Lesser: WE'LL LEAVE IT IN.

AND THEN THE OTHER STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE EARLIER IN THE DOCUMENT BUT I THINK WE THOUGHT THEM AND THAT IS TO DO WITH THE MOVING OF THE NAMES OF THE INDIVIDUALS FROM THE RECITALS IN A TO SECTION 2. DO WE HAVE ALI JUST SUMMARIZE THAT ONE LAST TIME OR DO YOU THINK YOU HAVE IT.

>> Mayor Montgomery: I'M FOLLOWING ALONG, INCLUDING JOHN McCASKILL, ELZIA IRVIN AND JAMES AND LULA SLAUGHTER?

MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN, ARE YOU GOOD --

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: IT'S ACCURATE, RIGHT?
IT'S IN THE REPORT.

>> Mayor Montgomery: WE'RE GOOD.

THOSE REVISIONS NOTED, NO OTHER REVISIONS TAKING PLACE --

>> Councilmember Howorth: THAT'S MY MOTION.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO?

>> Councilmember Howorth: OH, YEAH.

>> Councilmember Napolitano: I'M STILL HERE.

>> Mayor Montgomery: DID YOU HAVE ANY ISSUES?

>> Councilmember Napolitano: NO I'VE BEEN FOLLOWING ALONG.
ANYTHING THAT MAKES THIS MORE HISTORICALLY ACCURATE I SUPPORT.
I WENT OFF THE INFORMATION AVAILABLE AT THE TIME WHEN I DRAFTED THE APOLOGY.

I APPRECIATE THE EFFORTS OF EVERYONE TO MAKE IT EVEN MORE ACCURATE THIS TIME AND I'M HAPPY TO SUPPORT THAT.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN, GO AHEAD.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YES.

SO THE -- STARTING ON PARAGRAPH D.

>> Councilmember Howorth: D?

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: ON THE SECOND PAGE.

ON THE SECOND SENTENCE IT SAYS MANHATTAN BEACH RESIDENTS AT THE TIME ARE ON RECORD.

TO ME, AND THIS IS WHAT BOTHERED ME IN THE FIRST TIME WE DISCUSSED IT, IT SOUNDS LIKE YOU'RE -- THERE WERE ABOUT 600 RESIDENTS IN MANHATTAN BEACH AT THE TIME.

AND WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IS TO PUT IN THE WORD SOME.

BECAUSE I WOULD REALLY FIND IT HARD TO BELIEVE IN A CITY THAT THE BRUCE FAMILY SETTLED IN, WHEN ALL OTHER CITIES ALONG THE COAST WOULD NOT ALLOW THEM, I DON'T THINK THAT ALL 600 EXPRESSED CONCERN OVER THE EFFECT OF A BLACK POPULATION.

SO I WOULD LIKE THAT QUALIFIER IN THERE AS SOME MANHATTAN BEACH

RESIDENTS.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCIL.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: TO ME IT SOUNDS LIKE IT'S --

>> Councilmember Howorth: I'D ASK COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO WHAT -- IF HE WROTE THIS, LIKE WHAT WAS HIS --

>> Councilmember Napolitano: I SEE THE VALUE IN THAT.

I SEE IT EVEN MORE IF COUNCILMEMBER FRANKLIN WILL JOIN IN SUPPORTING THE APOLOGY.

TO A CERTAIN EXTENT THERE'S NO POINT IN MAKING CHANGES IF YOU'RE NOT GOING TO JOIN.

BUT I DO AGREE THAT I MADE THE POINT IN MY REMARKS THE OTHER DAY THAT NOT EVERYONE PARTICIPATED IN RACIST ACTS THEN, JUST LIKE WE'RE NOT SAYING ANYONE DOES THAT NOW.

SO I THINK HAVING A QUALIFIER THERE WOULD BE FINE.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: AND I'D ALSO LIKE TO MENTION ON THE NEXT PARAGRAPH, WHERE IT SAYS THE EFFECT OF EXCLUDING BLACK AMERICANS FROM THE COMMUNITY, AGAIN, WHITE RESIDENTS, IF WE CAN QUALIFY THAT TO SAY SOME WHITE RESIDENTS, FOR THE SAME REASONS.

>> Councilmember Howorth: IT WOULD SEEM -- AGAIN, I WOULD REFER -- IT'S OKAY WITH ME, BUT I WOULD ALSO REFER TO COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.

>> Councilmember Napolitano: AND I WOULD LOOK AT THE HISTORY ADVISORY BOARD AND SEE THAT.

I MEAN I THINK IT'S -- IT IS APPROPRIATE TO SHOW THAT NOT EVERY -- THAT WE'RE NOT INDICTING EVERY RESIDENT OF MANHATTAN BEACH AT THAT TIME.

>> Councilmember Howorth: I'M FINE WITH THAT.

>> Councilmember Napolitano: AS PRESSURING THE CITY TO EXERCISE ITS POWER OF EMINENT DOMAIN.

WE KNOW THAT NOT EVERYONE DID.

WE DON'T HAVE A VOTE, WE DON'T HAVE ANY PROOF, BUT, YOU KNOW, AT THE SAME TIME, LAW OF AVERAGES WOULD SAY CERTAINLY NOT EVERY RESIDENT OF MANHATTAN BEACH PARTICIPATED OR TRIED TO PERSUADE THE CITY COUNCIL.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO.

APPRECIATE THAT.

I ONLY HAVE BUN -- ANYTHING ELSE?

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: ONE POINT.

ON THE LAST PAGE, THE STANDUP --

>> Mayor Montgomery: AGAINST PREJUDICE AND HATE?

>> Vice Mayor: STANDUP AND INCLUSION COMMITMENT.

I KNOW WHAT IT'S SAYING AND I UNDERSTAND THAT.

IT JUST SEEMS OUT OF PLACE HERE IN TERMS OF WHAT IS THE GOAL OF THIS. I MEAN, IF -- ARE YOU EXPECTING EVERY SINGLE RESIDENT OF MANHATTAN BEACH TO FOLLOW EVERY SINGLE POINT HERE?

IS IT AN ASPIRATIONAL THING.

>> Mayor Montgomery: HEY, EVERYBODY.

QUIET.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: I MEAN I JUST DON'T REALLY SEE WHY THIS

IS NEEDED TO BE IN THIS DOCUMENT RIGHT THERE.
YOU'RE STATING WHAT YOU WANT IN THE PREVIOUS SECTION.
SO IS IT -- ARE YOU TRYING TO -- WELL, LET ME JUST ASK THAT QUESTION.
WHY IS IT THERE?

>> Councilmember Napolitano: WELL, AS THE PERSON WHO DRAFTED IT, IT'S BECAUSE THAT IS WHAT THE CITY ADOPTED IN OUR EFFORT TO STAND UP, BE INCLUSIVE, SHOW THAT WE'RE AN INCLUSIVE COMMUNITY, STAND UP AGAINST HATE, PREJUDICE, VIOLENCE AND BULLYING.

ARE WE EXPECTING EVERYONE TO FOLLOW EVERY TENANT.
NO.

NO ONE IS FORCED TO DO ANYTHING.

IT'S SOMETHING THAT THE CITY HAS ADOPTED AND THE CITY COUNCIL, IN REPRESENTING THE CITY AND CITY GOVERNMENT, CERTAINLY IS TRYING TO SET AN EXAMPLE BY FOLLOWING THESE TENANTS AND BY HAVING ADOPTED THEM.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: SO IT'S ALREADY AN OFFICIAL CITY DOCUMENT?

>> Councilmember Napolitano: YES.

>> Mayor Montgomery: ARE YOU GOOD?

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: OKAY.

>> Councilmember Napolitano: IT WAS NOT INCLUDED BY ACCIDENT.
THE CITY ALREADY ADOPTED IT.

AS COUNCILMEMBER LESSER SAID, I BELIEVE IT WAS 2017.

THE SCHOOL DISTRICT HAS ADOPTED THE SAME.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.

>> Councilmember Howorth: JUST QUICKLY.

IT'S TAKING THESE STEPS SO YOU APOLOGIZE BUT THEN IT'S TAKING THE STEPS TO BEHAVE DIFFERENTLY, RIGHT, AND TO SHOW THAT WE WANT TO BE BETTER. AND I DON'T THINK THERE'S ANYTHING IN HERE THAT IS THAT CONTROVERSIAL BUT I THINK IT'S REALLY CRUCIAL.

...WHEN I FIRST READ THE DRAFT RESOLUTION BY COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO, I DIDN'T GET IT, INITIALLY.

IT INITIALLY GAVE ME PAUSE TOO BECAUSE I REMEMBER THAT DISCUSSION, I WAS PROUD OF IT.

BUT THEN IT GAVE ME SOME THOUGHT AS TO WHY WE ARE TAKING THIS ACTION NOW.

WHY, IN FACT, WE ARE REVISITING THIS ISSUE AGAIN TWO YEARS LATER. IT PUTS BROADER CONTEXT WHY WE ARE DOING THIS AS AN EXPLANATION TO OUR COMMUNITY.

AS COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO SAID, THESE ARE THINGS WE ASPIRE TO. IT HELPS EXPLAIN WHY WE ARE HERE.

>> THANK YOU.

I WILL JUMP IN WITH MY OWN REVISION.

THAT LAST SENTENCE, COUNCILMEMBER STERN YOU WROTE IT.

WE OFFER THIS APOLOGY AS A FOUNDATIONAL ACT FOR THE NEXT 100 YEARS AND THE ACTS WE WILL TAKE TOGETHER TO STAND UP AGAINST PREJUDICE AND HATE, RESPECT AND INCLUSION.

IT'S LONG OVERDUE.

>> I WROTE THAT AND I SUPPORT THAT CHANGE, YOUR HONOR.

>> Mayor Montgomery: IT'S LONG OVERDUE.
>> A. Howorth: LONG OVERDUE.
>> D. Lesser: NOW THAT YOU READ IT SHOULD WE SAY AS A FOUNDATIONAL ACT FOR MANHATTAN BEACH'S NEXT 100 YEARS AND BEYOND.
>> Mayor Montgomery: I JUST WANT TO PUT IT IN THERE. GET IT DONE.
>> D. Lesser: IT'S LONG OVERDUE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: STEVE, ARE YOU GOOD WITH THAT?
>> S. Napolitano: ABSOLUTELY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.
ALI?
>> I HAVE ONE CLARIFICATION.
IT SOUNDS LIKE YOU ADOPTED EDITS THAT IS IN THE RECORD. IN ADDITION TO OTHER EDITS YOU JUST REVIEWED.
I JUST, IT WASN'T SAID WHEN YOU REVIEWED FOR INITIAL EDITS THAT YOU WERE INTENDING ON INCLUDING JAMES AND ANNA, JANET LEGGETTE AS WELL AS THE BLACK VISITORS WHO SOUGHT BEACH ACCESS IN THE SECOND PARAGRAPH. AND I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE YOU WANT TO INCLUDE IT?
>> A. Howorth: I DO WANT TO INCLUDE THAT.
THEY WERE PART OF THE SWIM OUT, AND YES, ABSOLUTELY.
>> Mayor Montgomery: I'M FINE.
>> S. Napolitano: THAT'S FINE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY WORDSMITHING CORRECTIONS TO DO?
ALL GOOD?
ANYBODY?
>> A. Howorth: I MADE A MOTION.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MOTION ON THE FLOOR.
MADE BY COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH, I NEED A SECOND BEFORE I CAN MOVE FORWARD.
>> D. Lesser: I HAVEN'T SECONDED OUT OF DEFERENCE TO SEE IF A MEMBER WHO HAS BEEN HERE LONGER OR THE AUTHOR WOULD LIKE TO SECOND. BUT I CAN SECOND.
>> S. Napolitano: THIS IS A GROUP EFFORT.
YOU CAN GO AHEAD AND SECOND, COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
>> D. Lesser: I SECOND.
>> Mayor Montgomery: ROLL CALL, PLEASE.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY?
>> YES.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO?
>> ABSOLUTELY.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH?
>> YES.
>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER?
>> YES.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN?
>> NO.

>> MOTION PASSES 4-1.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU ALL FOR BEING HERE.

WE WILL MOVE TO THE NEXT ITEM #17.

CITY MANAGER MOE?

>> City Manager B. Moe: GEORGE GABRIEL WILL MAKE THE PRESENTATION, THANK YOU.

>> HONORABLE MAYOR MONTGOMERY AND MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL, GEORGE GABRIEL, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER.

THIS IS FOLLOWING THE MEETING WHERE CITY COUNCIL RECEIVED THE SIX MONTH REVIEW AND UPDATE ON THE COYOTE MANAGEMENT APPROACH.

FOLLOWING DISCUSSION CITY COUNCIL DIRECTED STAFF TO ADJUST ITS APPROACH INCLUDING EXPLORATION OF A TRAPPING PROGRAM AND RETURN TO THE CITY COUNCIL.

WITH A REVISED COYOTE MANAGEMENT PLAN.

FOLLOWING COUNCIL DIRECTION STAFF REVISED THE PLAN AND THE INCIDENT RESPONSE TABLE WHICH SPECIFIES COYOTE ACTION AND INCIDENTS THAT WOULD NECESSITATE THIS ACTION.

THEREFORE THE TABLE EXHIBITS WHICH NECESSITATES TRAPPING, PENDING INVESTIGATION BY THE CITY'S ANIMAL CONTROL DIVISION.

THESE ACTIONS INCLUDE -- IF YOU COULD SHARE THE SCREEN, PLEASE. I WOULD APPRECIATE IT.

FIRST IS ENTERING A PRIVATE YARD AND KILLING A PET.

BITING OR INJURING A PET WITHOUT ATTRACTANTS PRESENT.

NIPPING WITHOUT CONTACT.

BITING OR INJURING A PERSON.

AND THESE ARE PRIMARILY, THESE ARE COLOR CODED, AS YOU CAN TELL IN THE INCIDENT RESPONSE TABLE THAT IS SHOWN BEFORE YOU.

IT'S PRIMARILY REFLECTIVE OF THE SCROLL DOWN A LITTLE MORE, PLEASE.

IT'S REFLECTIVE OF THE YELLOW, ORANGE AND RED CATEGORIES THAT ARE THERE.

THE YELLOW ORANGE AND RED CATEGORIES REFLECT WHEN A LETHAL REMOVAL WOULD POTENTIALLY OCCUR.

IN DEVELOPING THESE ACTIONS IT SHOULD BE NOTED THAT STAFF SOUGHT TO IDENTIFY ABNORMAL OR DANGEROUS COYOTE ACTIONS THAT WOULD THREATEN PUBLIC SAFETY, THAT IS ONE OF THE MAIN PILLARS.

SHOULD A COYOTE EXHIBIT ANY OF THESE ACTIONS NOTED, THE CITY ESPECIALLY WHERE IT'S BITING OR INJURING A PERSON, THE CALIFORNIA FISH AND WILDLIFE MAY CAPTURE THE COYOTE.

IT SPECIFIES ALL ATTACKS ARE SUBJECT TO INVESTIGATION TO ENSURE HUMAN HARASSMENT OR PROVOCATION DID NOT CAUSE THE ACTION AS WELL.

STAFF RECOMMENDS THE CITY COUNCIL CONCEPTUALLY APPROVE THE COYOTE MANAGEMENT RESPONSE PLAN PENDING PREPARATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTATION.

THAT WILL CONCLUDE MY REPORT.

AND POLICE CHIEF RACHEL JOHNSON, REPRESENTING THE ANIMAL CONTROL DIVISION IS SPECIFICALLY HERE AS WELL FOR ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE CITY COUNCIL.

THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

STAFF QUESTIONS?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER?

>> D. Lesser: THE COMMENTS I HAVE GOT FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE CONCERNED IF WE ARE GOING TOO QUICKLY TO TRAPPING.

MY QUESTIONS ADDRESS A LITTLE ON WHAT'S ON THIS CHART BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY A PRACTICAL UNDERSTANDING TO THE EXTENT WE ARE LAYING THE FOUNDATION TO HAVE TRAPPING AS A TOOL, WHAT ARE THE STEPS FIRST, PARTICULARLY WHEN PUBLIC EDUCATION IS A HUGE IMPORTANT PART OF THIS TO REMOVE FOOD SOURCES, TO REMOVE VEGETATION?

>> POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON WILL ELABORATE ON THAT.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.

THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION.

I WILL BEGIN, THROUGHOUT THIS CHART AND GEORGE'S PRESENTATION WE TALK ABOUT PENDING FURTHER INVESTIGATION.

BECAUSE WHAT WE WANT TO LOOK AT WHEN WE ARE LOOKING AT THESE INCIDENTS INVOLVING COYOTES ARE THERE OTHER UNDERLYING FACTORS THAT ATTRACTED THAT COYOTE TO THAT LOCATION.

WHEN PEOPLE SAY I SAW A COYOTE IN MY BACKYARD, DO YOU HAVE A FOUNTAIN IN THE MIDDLE OF SUMMER THAT IS BUBBLING FOR COYOTES.

WE WANT TO LOOK THOROUGHLY, IF THE COYOTE IS EXHIBITING ABNORMAL BEHAVIOR, WHICH MEANS IT DOESN'T HAVE A FEAR OF HUMANS THERE MAY BE OTHER MITIGATING FACTORS BEFORE WE GO TO TRAPPING.

>> D. Lesser: HOW ARE WE GOING TO CONSIDER THIS A SUCCESS TO THE EXTENT WE IMPLEMENT TRAPPING.

I SAY THIS LIKE TORRANCE WHO HAS A TRAPPING PROGRAM.

THEY ARE CONTINUALLY TRAPPING THE SAME NUMBER OF COYOTES.

AND AS I UNDERSTAND IT, COYOTES REPLACE, AS ONE POD MOVES ON OR ANOTHER GROUP IS TRAPPED OTHERS MOVE INTO THAT TERRITORY.

SO HOW DO WE GAUGE THE SUCCESS OF THIS.

OR A PET OWNER WHO LOST A PET TO A COYOTE.

HOW CAN WE EVALUATE THE SUCCESS?

>> I THINK SUCCESS IS DIFFICULT TO MEASURE FOR THIS.

CERTAINLY, IF WE HAVE A COYOTE THAT ATTACKS A HUMAN, THAT'S CAUSE FOR LETHAL REMOVAL WHETHER WE ADOPT THIS PLAN OR NOT.

WE WILL ENGAGE THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND WILDLIFE TO LETHALLY REMOVE ANY COYOTE THAT ATTACKS A HUMAN.

BUT PRIOR TO THAT, WE HAVE THESE COLORED STAGES WE ARE TALKING ABOUT IN OUR RESPONSE PLAN.

THE METRIC WILL BE VERY DIFFICULT TO MEASURE WHAT IS A SUCCESS.

SOME THINGS I HAVE SEEN IN MY EXPERIENCE WITH COYOTES IS EXACTLY WHAT YOU STATED IN TERMS OF COYOTES TEND TO GO WHERE OTHER COYOTES AREN'T. SO THEY AREN'T COMPETING FOR FOOD SOURCES AND COULD BE PART OF A PACK. WE MAY SEE COYOTES COME.

THAT'S WHAT MAKES IT DIFFICULT TO DETERMINE IF A PROGRAM IS ACTUALLY SUCCESSFUL.

>> D. Lesser: THANK YOU, CHIEF.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MPT FRANKLIN?
MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YES, THANK YOU.
I HAVE TO GET USED TO THAT.
M.P.T.
HI, CHIEF JOHNSON.
THANK YOU AND TO GEORGE AND HIS DEPARTMENT FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER.
I HAVE A QUESTION, AT LEAST THE STAFF REPORT, PAGE 555, IT'S THAT SAME
CHART.
UNDER THE ORANGE, YELLOW, POTENTIAL LETHAL REMOVAL OR CAPTURE UNLESS
AN ATTACK IS PROVOKED BY HUMAN HARASSMENT PENDING INVESTIGATION.
WE HEARD A LOT BEFORE IN PRIOR PRESENTATIONS THAT ONE THING YOU WANT
HUMANS TO DO IS TO HAZE.
IS THIS TO BE CONFUSED WITH HAZING?
IF SOMEONE IS HAZING AND THEN THE COYOTE TURNS ON THEM?
>> WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT HAZING AS HUMAN HARASSMENT, BUT THERE'S
PROVOCATION.
JUST LIKE WITH ANY SPECIES OF ANIMAL, IF YOU ARE PROVOKING THE ANIMAL,
CORNERING IT OR DOING OTHER THINGS THAT PROVOKE IT, THAT'S DIFFERENT
FROM HAZING WHERE YOU ARE TRYING TO GET IT TO MOVE AWAY BY MAKING
YOURSELF LARGE AND YELLING.
THAT IS DIFFERENT FROM HARASSMENT.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: HAVE YOU HEARD ANY EXPERIENCES IF SOMEONE
IS SEEING THEIR PET IS BEING ATTACKED BY A COYOTE, THEY WOULD ACTUALLY
GO IN A LITTLE BIT FURTHER THAN JUST HAZING, BECAUSE THEY ARE TRYING
TO SAVE THEIR ANIMAL.
OR ANYTHING LIKE THAT.
I'M THINKING IF THAT SITUATION COMES UP, I'M NOT SO SURE.
I MEAN, THAT'S PROTECTING, HEAVEN FORBID A FAMILY MEMBER.
OR YOUR PET.
OR YOUR PROPERTY FROM A COYOTE.
>> SO I THINK THERE'S A FINE LINE BETWEEN HAZING AND PROVOCATION.
WHEN WE THINK OF PROVOCATION BY A HUMAN BEING, WE PRIMARILY THINK OF
AN INDIVIDUAL THAT IS CHALLENGING A COYOTE, OR TRYING TO ELICIT A
REACTION TO A COYOTE THAT PUTS IT IN A DEFENSE MECHANISM.
SO ONE EXAMPLE IS LET'S SAY, A HUMAN IDENTIFIES THEM IN DEN FOLIAGE.
YOU SHOULDN'T BE GOING TO THE DEN.
MOST LIKELY THAT DEN MAY HAVE BABY COYOTES.
AND IF THERE IS A MOTHER AND FATHER COYOTE THAT IS THERE, THEY ARE
EXHIBITING NORMAL COYOTE BEHAVIOR, PROTECTING THEIR KIN.
SO WHEN WE THINK ABOUT HUMAN PROVOCATION, THAT'S ONE OF THE EXAMPLES
OF WHAT WE ARE TRYING TO ACCOUNT FOR.
HAZING ISN'T TRYING TO ELICIT A RESPONSE THAT ENDANGERS YOURSELF.
USUALLY HAZING INVOLVES MAKING LOUD NOISES, WHICH COULD STILL BE DONE
AT A SAFE DISTANCE.

SOMETIMES INVOLVES WHAT ANIMAL CONTROL DOES, WHICH IS FLICKER THEIR LIGHTS AT A COYOTE SO IT COULD GET THEM RESPONSES. HAZING ALSO DENOTES SOME LEVEL OF SAFETY THAT IS ASSOCIATED WITH IT. WHILE HUMAN PROVOCATION CAN POTENTIALLY PUT YOUR IN HARM'S WAY BY THE WAY YOU ARE GOING ABOUT INTERACTING WITH THAT COYOTE.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: I'M JUST CONCERNED THAT ALL THAT IS GOING TO TAKE TIME.

AND WHETHER OR NOT YOU CAN TRACK DOWN, IF YOU DECIDE AFTER YOU SAY OKAY, IT WAS HAZING, IT WASN'T HARASSMENT, BUT YOU HAVE TO INVESTIGATE IT.

NOW LET'S GO AHEAD AND TRY TO TRAP THAT COYOTE, IT'S GOING TO TAKE TIME.

>> I THINK THAT'S A CONSIDERATION OBVIOUSLY. A SELECTIVE TRAPPING PROGRAM IS MORE CAREFUL. IT IS MORE VETTED.

IT IS NOT A PROGRAM THAT IS MEANT TO TRAP AT FIRST INSTANCE OR TRAP AT ALL COSTS.

IT'S MEANT TO DO IT PENDING ON A SELECTIVE BASIS.

AND DOING SO IN A MANNER THAT IS TRYING TO ACCOUNT FOR A COYOTE THAT IS MORE AGGRESSIVE IN NATURE.

VERSUS A COYOTE ENGAGING IN NORMAL BEHAVIOR, WHICH IS, YOU KNOW, NORMAL BEHAVIOR MEANING, YOU KNOW, POUNCING AROUND IN FOLIAGE AND SO ON AND SO FORTH.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: WHAT IF. BECAUSE IT SORT OF HAPPENED.

SO LET'S SAY A COYOTE DECIDES TO TAKE UP RESIDENCE IN YOUR BACKYARD OR BEHIND YOUR WALL AND IT'S IN CLOSE PROXIMITY TO A HOME -- WELL EVERYTHING IS IN CLOSE PROXIMITY TO A HOME BECAUSE WE ARE SO CLOSE TOGETHER.

SO THE HOMEOWNER DISCOVERS IT. AND THEN YOU COME OUT.

I MEAN, IS THAT A BASIS, THE FACT THAT IT IS SO CLOSE TO A HOME? MAYBE IN THE YARD TO WARRANT TRAPPING?

>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN, WE WILL NEED TO INVESTIGATE THE FULL IMPORT OF WHY THAT COYOTE IS THERE.

BUT THE FACT ALONE THAT A COYOTE IS IN SOMEONE'S BACKYARD DOESN'T GIVE US ENOUGH INFORMATION DECIDING TRAPPING IS IMPORTANT, IF THERE ARE FOOD SOURCES, A BIRD FEEDER THAT ATTRACTS SQUIRRELS THE COYOTE COULD FEED ON.

WATER FOUNTAIN.

PET FOOD MAY BE ALL THE REASONS IT IS IN THE BACKYARD.

IT'S NOT THAT IT HAS BECOME A HABITUATED TO HUMANS BUT IT'S SEEKING FOOD AND WATER IN THAT BACKYARD.

WE NEED TO DO AN INVESTIGATION TO DETERMINE WHY THE COYOTE IS IN THAT BACKYARD.

DETERMINE IF IT HAS BECOME SO HABITUATED TO HUMANS IT IS NO LONGER

FEARING THEM.

WE TAKE THAT INTO CONSIDERATION.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO?

>> S. Napolitano: I HAVE A QUESTION.

YOUR HONOR, I WANT TO BE TRANSPARENT HERE, AND UNDER THE YELLOW, ORANGE AND RED, IT SAYS POTENTIAL LETHAL REMOVAL OR CAPTURE.

AND IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT CAPTURE MEANS LETHAL REMOVAL FROM OUR PAST, DISCUSSIONS ON THIS, MY UNDERSTANDINGS ARE TRAPPING REQUIRES EUTHANASIA.

I WANT TO BE CLEAR IF THAT'S THE CASE OR NOT.

CAN YOU CLARIFY THAT?

>> TRAPPING, TWO OPTIONS, LETHAL REMOVAL OR RELEASE THE SAME LOCATION YOU TRAPPED.

BASED ON THE DIRECTION WE RECEIVE FROM COUNCIL, IN ALL LIKELIHOOD IF WE ARE TRAPPING, THERE IS GOING TO BE A LETHAL REMOVAL THERE.

I THINK THE LANGUAGE IS MEANT TO BE SOMEWHAT FLEXIBLE.

BUT I THINK STAFF IS AWARE THAT TRAPPING, OR LETHAL REMOVAL IS THE DIRECTION FROM COUNCIL.

>> Mayor Montgomery: ANYTHING FURTHER, STEVE?

>> S. Napolitano: NO, YOUR HONOR.

THANK YOU.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER LESSER?

>> D. Lesser: LET ME FOLLOW-UP ON THAT.

I WANT TO BETTER UNDERSTAND PROCESS, IN TERMS OF WHAT IS BEFORE COUNCIL TONIGHT AND WHERE IS OUR NEXT DECISION AS IT RELATES TO TRAPPING. WHAT IS BEFORE COUNCIL DIRECTLY I UNDERSTAND IS CONCEPTUALLY APPROVE THE COYOTE MANAGEMENT RESPONSE PLAN, ENDING PREPARATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTATION.

BUT IF COUNCIL APPROVES IT TONIGHT, STAFF WILL EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT WITH THE CEQA CONSULTANT FOR ANALYSIS SERVICE AND THEN RETURN TO COUNCIL WITH A TRAPPING SERVICES CONTRACT.

SO THERE WILL BE ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY FOR COUNCIL, IF THEY DECIDE THEY ARE NOT IN FAVOR OF TRAPPING TO NOT APPROVE THE TRAPPING CONTRACT, IS THAT RIGHT?

>> PER SE, YES.

THERE WOULD BE AN OPPORTUNITY.

BY WAY OF PROCESS, TONIGHT WE ARE REVIEWING THE COYOTE MANAGEMENT RESPONSE PLAN.

THEREAFTER, IF COUNCIL DOES APPROVE THIS PLAN, AS PROPOSED, STAFF IS TRYING TO OBTAIN A CEQA CONSULTANT IN ORDER TO GET THE NECESSARY ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTS.

THEN STAFF WOULD COME BACK TO THE CITY COUNCIL, CERTIFY OR ADOPT THOSE CEQA DOCUMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH THE PLAN.

PROBABLY ON THAT SAME VEIN STAFF WILL PROBABLY BEGIN TO NEGOTIATE A CONTRACT WITH A TRAPPER FOR SERVICES, IF, YOU KNOW, JUST TO HAVE THAT FLEXIBILITY AND THAT SERVICE ON HAND.

SO IF STAFF WOULD LIKE TRAPPING SERVICES, THAT TRAPPER WOULD BE AVAILABLE.
BUT OBVIOUSLY COUNCIL WOULD LIKELY NEED TO APPROVE THAT CONTRACT BECAUSE IT WOULD PROBABLY BE OVER THE THRESHOLD BY STAFF TO EXECUTE A CONTRACT.
BECAUSE IT'S LIKELY GOING TO BE OVER \$50K.
>> D. Lesser: THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: QUESTIONS?
ONE MORE FROM ME.
I'M SORRY.
I'M NOT ASKING FOR CONCRETE NUMBERS BUT CAN YOU TELL US, THE PUBLIC HERE, WHAT THE LAST NUMBERS WERE SINCE OUR LAST REPORT.
ON SIGHTINGS AND -- ANY KILLINGS?
ACQUISITIONS?
TAKINGS?
BY COYOTES?
>> SINCE THE LAST REPORT THAT WAS PROVIDED THAT CONTAINED JANUARY DATA, FEBRUARY AND MARCH DATA, IT'S REFLECTED ADDITIONAL SIGHTINGS I BELIEVE THERE WERE FOUR OR FIVE ADDITIONAL SIGHTINGS SINCE FEBRUARY AND FOUR OR FIVE ADDITIONAL SIGHTINGS IN MARCH.
NO ATTACKS ON PETS AND NO ATTACKS ON HUMANS IN FEBRUARY AND MARCH.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU FOR THAT.
COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH?
>> A. Howorth: JUST TO FOLLOW-UP ON THAT, I MEAN, IF YOU LOOK AT YOUR INCIDENT RESPONSE TABLE, THE COLOR-CODED, IF THERE'S A SIGHTING, THE CITY IS AUTOMATICALLY TAKING OUT THE TRAP.
THERE'S THIS WHOLE CHECKLIST OF THINGS THAT HAS TO BE IN PLACE.
>> WE ENCOURAGE THE PUBLIC TO REPORT IT TO ANIMAL CONTROL, OR UTILIZE THE CITY'S GO REACH APP FOR COYOTE SIGHTINGS AS WELL.
>> A. Howorth: WE WILL SHOOT THAT OUT NO MATTER WHAT WE DECIDE TO DO. WE'RE NOT SAYING WE ARE GOING TO TRAP AND EUTHANIZE EVERY COYOTE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: MY POINT EXACTLY.
THANK YOU, GEORGE.
OPEN UP PUBLIC COMMENT?
GOING IN THE WRONG DIRECTION.
OKAY.
ANYONE ON ZOOM CARE TO TALK ABOUT THIS?
NO, NO, YOU'RE GOOD.
YOU'RE GOOD.
ANYONE ON ZOOM?
MAKING SURE.
ANYBODY ELSE?
CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT.
COUNCIL?
>> S. Napolitano: YOUR HONOR?
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES, COUNCIL NAPOLITANO.
>> S. Napolitano: I'M FINE WITH WHAT'S PROPOSED.

I THINK WE HAVE TO KEEP TRAPPING IN OUR BACK POCKET.
AND FRANKLY NOT BE AFRAID TO USE IT WHEN WE NEED IT.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, SIR.

ANYONE ELSE?

I SEE A MOTION BY COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH, I SEE A QUESTION BY MAYOR
PRO TEM FRANKLIN.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.

YOU'RE FIRST UP.

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: I ABSOLUTELY AGREE WITH THAT.

IT'S A SOUND PROGRAM.

AND WE SHOULD BE READY WHEN NEEDED TO TRAP, SO WE DON'T HAVE TO GO
THROUGH A WHOLE PROCESS TO BE CERTIFIED TO USE A TRAPPER AND USE A
CERTIFIED TRAPPER AND THE LIKE.

WAS THERE ANY SEASONALITY TO THE SIGHTINGS?

I KNOW IT'S WINTER.

DO THEY GO TO MEXICO FOR THE WINTER OR SOMETHING?

>> PRIMARILY GREATER SIGHTINGS OCCUR IN THE SPRING AND SUMMER MONTHS.
AND THEN SOMETIMES BEGINNING OF FALL.

BUT DURING THE WINTER MONTHS, COYOTES ARE MORE PRONE TO BEING IN THEIR
DEN AND THEY ARE MATING AT THAT TIME AND CREATING BABY COYOTES,
BIOLOGICALLY SPEAKING.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER LESSER?

>> D. Lesser: I SEE THE DIRECTION THIS IS GOING.

I AM NOT CERTAIN THAT I THINK WE HAVE DONE ENOUGH FIRST BEFORE WE GET
TO MAKE THE DECISION FOR TRAPPING.

IT'S NOT JUST THE CEQA FOUNDATION WHICH WE WILL NEED TO DO AS A MATTER
OF LAW.

BUT IT'S DOING WHAT WAS RECOMMENDED TO THE CITY BY AT LEAST A
CONSULTANT THAT WAS ENGAGED BY THE CITY LAST SUMMER.

AND OTHERS THAT I'VE SOUGHT TO REACH OUT TO, TO TRY TO GET INDEPENDENT
CORROBORATION.

NAMELY, THERE'S A REASON WHY THERE ARE MORE COYOTES HERE.

IT'S BECAUSE THERE IS FOOD AND HIDING SPACES FOR THEM.

THE WAY THAT NEEDS TO BE COMBATED IS IN PARTNERSHIP WITH OUR PUBLIC.
MORE ROBUST OUTREACH THAN I THINK HAS BEEN DONE SO FAR.

THOUGH I GIVE STAFF HUGE CREDIT WITH WHAT THEY HAVE DONE SO FAR.

I THINK MORE NEEDS TO BE DONE.

I THINK THERE IS SEASONALITY, WHEN THEY ARE IN HIBERNATION AND WHEN
THEY ARE ROAMING.

WE NEED TO ALIGN SOME OF OUR OUTREACH TO THAT.

BUT I DON'T WANT TO STOP THE PROCESS OF AT LEAST HAVING THE CEQA STUDY
DONE.

BUT IN THAT PROCESS I'M NOT COMMITTING TO NECESSARILY AUTHORIZE
TRAPPING.

>> Mayor Montgomery: UNDERSTOOD.

TAKE THAT AS A NO.

ANYONE ELSE?

QUESTIONS?

COMMENTS?

I DON'T SEE A SECOND.

NOW I SEE A SECOND.

>> A. Howorth: MY MOTION IS CONCEPTUALLY APPROVE THE COYOTE RESPONSE PLAN.

>> Mayor Montgomery: CLARIFICATION, CITY MANAGER MOE? THANK YOU, STEVE.

CLARIFICATION, BRUCE?

ANY CONTRACT WOULD HAVE TO COME BACK TO CEQA FIRST?

>> City Manager B. Moe: TYPICALLY THE CEQA ANALYSIS, IT WOULD LIKELY EXCEED \$50,000.

>> Mayor Montgomery: AND THE TRAPPING CONTRACT.

>> City Manager B. Moe: THAT REMAINS TO BE SEEN, BUT PROBABLY YES.

>> Mayor Montgomery: YOU CAN BRING THOSE BACK.

>> City Manager B. Moe: WE CAN BRING THOSE BACK AT YOUR REQUEST.

>> Mayor Montgomery: I WANT TO SEE BOTH, THE CEQA AND CONTRACT. MOTION BY HOWORTH AND SECOND BY FRANKLIN.

ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN?

>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YES.

>> MONTGOMERY?

>> Mayor Montgomery: YES.

>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH?

>> A. Howorth: YES.

>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER?

>> D. Lesser: YES.

>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO?

>> S. Napolitano: SO MUCH FOR MY SECOND.

YES.

>> ITEM PASSES 5-0.

>> Mayor Montgomery: ITEM 18.

CONSIDERATION OF A RESOLUTION APPROVING ONE YEAR LOAN AGREEMENT OF THE "SURF ASCENSION" SCULPTURE BY ARTIST DOMISI KEVEN PARHAM AND ALLOCATE FUNDING FROM THE PUBLIC ARTS TRUST FUND IN THE AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$12,000.

>> I WILL TURN IT OVER.

>> CONGRATULATIONS MAYOR NAPOLITANO, I DON'T THINK I'VE SEEN YOU IN THE SEAT BEFORE.

I'M THE CULTURAL ARTS MANAGER.

I WILL INTRODUCE THIS ITEM.

IN 2018 THE NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT DETERMINED THEY WOULD LIKE TO COMMISSION A LARGE-SCALE ICONIC SCULPTURE THAT WOULD PINPOINT MANHATTAN BEACH AS A DESIRABLE PLACE TO VISIT AND HAVE THIS ENTRANCE PIECE.

THEY COMMISSIONED ARTIST DOMISI KEVEN PARHAM AND STAFF BEGAN TO MEET WITH MEMBERS OF THE BID, THE BID ARTIST TO BEGIN THIS PROCESS AND USHER

IT ALONG.

WE MET ON SITE MULTIPLE TIMES, STAFF IDENTIFIED AREAS OF CONCERN, SOME OF WHICH WERE RESOLVED, OTHERS NOT SO MUCH.

THE ARTWORK EVOLVED ITSELF SINCE 2018, THE NOTABLE CHANGES IS ADDITION OF BLUE QUARTZITE STONE.

TITLE PLAQUE HAS SINCE BEEN REMOVED.

AT ONE POINT THE STATUTE HAD WI-FI CAMERA FROM THE NORTH END CAFE, THOSE ISSUES WERE RESOLVED AND REMOVED.

THE ORIGINAL PROPOSAL WAS FOR THE PIECE TO BE A PERMANENT DONATION TO THE CITY BUT THAT HAS BEEN PIVOTED TO A ONE-YEAR LOAN, WHICH IS WHERE WE STAND TODAY.

SOME OF THE CONCERNS THAT STAFF IDENTIFIED WORKING ON THIS PROJECT WAS THE LOCATION.

IT PARTIALLY BLOCKS SOME OF THE VIEWS BUT IT ALSO DOESN'T REALLY EXHIBIT THE ARTWORK IN ITS FULL GLORY, SO IT'S A LITTLE TRICKY LOCATION.

THE QUARTZITE MATERIAL IS NOT A MATERIAL THAT IS CONVENTIONALLY USED FOR OUTDOOR SCULPTURE PURPOSES.

IT'S TYPICALLY USED FOR MORE OF YOUR COUNTERTOP APPLICATION ON THE INTERIOR.

AND THE ARTIST HAS ALSO NOT USED THE MATERIAL IN THIS APPLICATION BEFORE.

THERE'S A GREAT LIKELIHOOD THE MATERIAL WAS FRAGILE, IF IT WERE TO BE DAMAGED IT WOULD BE VERY COSTLY AND TIME CONSUMING TO REPAIR.

WE JUST DON'T KNOW HOW THE MATERIAL WILL WEATHER IN OUR CLIMATE, WHETHER OR NOT IT WOULD GET ABRADED OR FADED BY THE SUN.

SO WHERE WE STAND CURRENTLY THE PROPOSAL IS FOR A ONE-YEAR LOAN OF THIS ARTWORK.

IT WOULD BE PLACED IN A LOCATION OUTSIDE OF THE NORTH END CAFE.

AND IT WOULD REMAIN UNLIT WITH THE EXCEPTION OF 12 MONTHLY LIGHT SHOWS. WE ARE CALLING THEM.

THAT COULD BE PROGRAMMED TO COINCIDE WITH DIFFERENT EVENTS, MONTHLY VALENTINES DAY, THINGS LIKE THAT, HOLIDAYS, THAT'S THE WORD.

HOLIDAYS.

STAFF ALSO CONDUCTED PUBLIC OUTREACH.

WE NOTICED RESIDENTS WITHIN A 1,000 FEET RADIUS OF THE PROPOSED ARTWORK TO GET THEIR FEEDBACK.

THE FEEDBACK CAME BACK WITH ABOUT 32% OPPOSED TO THE PROJECT, AND THE REMAINDER IN FAVOR.

THIS PROJECT WAS ALSO REVIEWED BY THE NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH B.I.D. BUT ALSO BY THE CULTURAL ARTS COMMISSION.

THE CULTURAL ARTS COMMISSION DID UNANIMOUSLY RECOMMEND FOR THIS PROJECT AND RECOMMENDED ALLOCATE FUNDS REQUESTED BY THE NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH B.I.D.

SO IF APPROVED THE FISCAL IMPLICATIONS WOULD INCLUDE A \$2,000 STIPEND TO THE ARTIST THAT WOULD HELP TO OFFSET SOME OF THE COSTS OF DELIVERING AND INSTALLING THE ARTWORK.

SOME OF THE PERMITS STILL OUTSTANDING AND NECESSARY, AS WELL AS THE ARTIST TO COME IN AND CONDUCT THE 12 LIGHT SHOWS BECAUSE THE ARTIST WOULD PHYSICALLY HAVE TO BE PRESENT FOR EACH ONE OF THOSE SHOWS FOR ALL 12 TIMES.

IT WOULD ALSO INCLUDE UP TO \$3,000 FOR PUBLIC WORKS TO ASSIST WITH INSTALLATION OF THIS ARTWORK.

AND UP TO \$7,000 FOR MAINTENANCE, SHOULD THE OCCASION PRESENT ITSELF, IF THE ARTWORK IS DAMAGED AND NEEDS TO BE REPAIRED, IT'S A COSTLY ARTWORK TO REPAIR.

THERE WILL LIKELY BE OTHER COSTS THAT WILL HAVE TO BE INCURRED BY THE ARTIST AT THIS POINT, PRIMARILY FOR PERMITTING, ENGINEERING, PLANS, SITE PLANS, THINGS LIKE THAT.

SO JUST KIND OF A SUMMARY OF A FEW PROS/CONS.

FOR THE ARTWORK, OBVIOUSLY WE KNOW WE WOULD LOVE TO HAVE MORE ART IN THE CITY.

IT'S WONDERFUL TO SEE ART.

THIS IS A LOCAL ARTIST.

SO THE VERY EXCITING TO HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO WORK WITH HIM.

AND IT'S WONDERFUL TO INSTALL SOMETHING IN NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH.

WE HAVE SO MUCH HERE IN DOWNTOWN, SO IT'S GREAT TO BRING ATTENTION TO NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH.

SOME OF THE CHALLENGES TO BE AWARE OF AGAIN IS THE PUBLIC OUTREACH THAT WAS NOT QUITE AS OVERWHELMINGLY IN FAVOR AS WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE. BUT DIFFICULTIES WITH THE LOCATION AND IT'S WORTH NOTING STAFF DID PROPOSE SEVERAL OTHER LOCATIONS AND THE B.I.D. ULTIMATELY DECIDED THIS IS THEIR PREFERRED LOCATION.

AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, THE CHALLENGES WITH THE STONE MATERIAL, WE JUST DON'T KNOW HOW IT'S GOING TO RESPOND TO THIS APPLICATION.

WE DO KNOW IF IT WERE TO BE DAMAGED IT WOULD BE QUITE DIFFICULT TO REPAIR.

AND IT'S GOOD TO BE AWARE THERE'S STILL QUITE A LENGTHY PROCESS BEFORE WE CAN ACTUALLY INSTALL THIS PIECE.

THERE'S QUITE A FEW THINGS THAT STILL NEED TO GET DONE BEFORE WE ARE READY TO GO.

SO IF CITY COUNCIL WERE TO APPROVE THIS PROJECT, THE NEXT STEPS WOULD BE THE FIRST OF THE NEXT STEPS WOULD BE FOR CITY COUNCIL TO DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT THEY WOULD LIKE THE CITY TO BE A PARTNER IN APPLYING AND USHERING FORWARD THIS PROJECT.

THE REASON TO DO THAT, IT WOULD ACTUALLY SAVE QUITE A BIT OF COST AND SAVE QUITE A BIT OF PERMITS WE WOULDN'T HAVE TO ISSUE TO OURSELVES. IF THE CITY DECIDES THEY WANT TO BE A CO-APPLICANT WE CAN WAIVE CERTAIN PERMITS WHICH WOULD BE REALLY GREAT.

CITY COUNCIL WOULD ALSO NEED TO APPROVE THE LOCATION AND ALLOCATE FUNDS, OBVIOUSLY.

AND THEN THE ARTIST WOULD HAVE TO COMPLETE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT, WHICH HAS ALREADY BEGUN BUT IT'S MISSING QUITE A BIT OF INFORMATION. THERE'S QUITE A FEW THINGS WE NEED TO GET DONE, SITE MAP, LAND SURVEY,

ELEVATION SURVEY, SOME ENGINEERING SPECS, CERTAIN THINGS LIKE THAT THAT WOULD NEED TO GET DONE AS WELL AS THIS EXTREMELY LONG PUBLIC WORKS PERMIT, GROUND, NON UTILITY EXCAVATION PERMIT.

DEPUTY INSPECTION AND POSSIBLY OTHER THINGS.

WE ARE NOT AT THIS POINT 100% WHAT THE COSTS WILL BE, A LOT DEPENDS WHAT THE LOCATION AND WHAT WE PURSUE IN TERMS OF PARTNERING WITH THE CITY.

SO THAT IS THE OVERVIEW OF THE PROJECT.

AT THIS TIME I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO -- THE FORMER EXECUTIVE COORDINATOR FOR NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH.

MIKE SIMS THE CHAIR WAS NOT ABLE TO BE HERE TODAY, SO SHE WILL READ A STATEMENT ON HIS BEHALF AND WE ALSO HAVE THE ARTIST HERE WITH US, WHO CAN BRIEFLY GO THROUGH THE POWERPOINT PRESENTATION AND IS AVAILABLE TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

>> Mayor Montgomery: GOT IT.

>> HI, I'M DAWN -- THE FORMER MANHATTAN BEACH B.I.D. EXECUTIVE COORDINATOR AND I'M HERE SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF MIKE SIMS WHO COULDN'T MAKE IT TODAY.

HONORABLE MAYOR AND COUNCILMEMBERS I APPRECIATE YOUR CONSIDERATION OF THIS INSTALLATION IN MANHATTAN BEACH.

AS EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF NORTH M.B. B.I.D. I PRESENT THE PROJECT TO YOU TODAY.

ONE REASON FOR A LENGTHY TIMELINE IS THE CONSTRAINTS WHICH WE HAD TO OPERATE.

THE SIZE OF THE DISTRICT.

THE NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH B.I.D. IS A SMALL DISTRICT REDUCING THE NUMBER OF OPTIMAL SITES.

I PERSONALLY WALKED THE DISTRICT AND COULDN'T LOCATE OTHER LOCATIONS THAT WOULD BE PROTECTED FROM TRAFFIC.

EVERY TRAFFIC SIGN-IN THE MEDIANS IS DESTROYED BY VEHICLES ROUTINELY, I HAVE CONCERNS REGARDING THE FEEDBACK SURVEY.

HOWEVER I DON'T THINK THE PICTURE ON THE POSTCARD DOES THE ARTWORK JUSTICE.

I WAS TOLD IT WAS ALREADY BUILT SO I VISITED DOM'S WORKSHOP TO SEE IT IN PERSON.

IT IS FAR MORE TACTFUL AND PLEASING THAN THE POSTCARD REPRESENTED. LASTLY, THERE'S OTHER CONCERNS INCLUDING THE MATERIALS USED FOR CONSTRUCTION.

I FEEL THE LIMITED TIME OF ONE YEAR ADDRESSES THESE ISSUES.

THE NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH B.I.D. BOARD THAT IS ALWAYS A MOUTHFUL, THANKS YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION AND ENCOURAGES YOU TO SUPPORT THIS INSTALLATION.

>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.

NOT THAT WE DON'T LIKE SEEING YOU BUT TELL HIM HE CAN EMAIL IT NEXT TIME.

ERNEST?

>> THANKS.

HELLO, MAYOR AND COUNCIL.
MY NAME IS DOMISI KEVEN PARHAM AND I'M THE ARTIST THAT WAS CHOSEN TO
PUT THIS PROJECT TOGETHER.
IT'S BEEN A LONG RIDE.
I'M APPRECIATIVE OF THE PROCESS.
I WAS INSPIRED TO GET INTO SCULPTING FROM A TRAUMATIC EXPERIENCE IN
MY LIFE, SURVIVED A BRAIN TUMOR AND ONGOING TREATMENT FOR IT.
SO THIS IS MY THERAPY.
AND THAT'S WHY I DECIDED TO DONATE IT TO NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH INSTEAD
OF TAKING A PAYMENT FOR IT.
I WOULD LIKE TO CONTINUE FORWARD.
IT STARTED IN 2018 AND IT WAS PROPOSED, AND IT WAS RENDERED BY A GRAPHIC
ARTIST.
AND THEN I STARTED WITH PROCURING THE STAINLESS STEEL AND PUTTING THE
STRUCTURE TOGETHER.
BASED UPON MY -- I'M A CERTIFIED WELDER FOR THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES
AND A CERTIFIED WELDING INSPECTOR WITH THE -- I'M LOSING MY
THOUGHTS HERE.
I'M A CERTIFIED WELDING INSPECTOR, I KNOW METALLURGY AND ELEMENTS ARE
THAT PREVENT CORROSION IN THE MARINE ENVIRONMENT.
THAT WAS MY METAL OF CHOICE.
TOOK A WHILE TO GET PROPORTIONS TOGETHER.
THEN THERE'S THE ELECTRICAL COMPONENT OF IT FOR THE ADDRESSABLE
L.E.D.'S WHICH DO A LIGHT DISPLAY BEHIND THE TRANSLUCENT STONE.
AND THEN I ALSO ENGINEERED THE SCULPTURE TO BE LIFTED BY FORK-LIFT
INSTEAD OF A CRANE, JUST TO MINIMIZE SOME OF THE COSTS FOR
INSTALLATION.
SO THE SCULPTURE CAN BE MOVED AROUND QUITE EASILY.
AND THEN THIS IS THE STONE THAT IS EMBEDDED INTO THE SCULPTURE.
IT IS AQUA MARINE QUARTZ.
QUARTZ IS ON THE SCALE OF 7, DIAMOND IS 10.
IT'S VERY HARD.
THE STONES FLOAT IN BETWEEN THE METAL.
IT'S FASTENED TOGETHER BY FASTENERS THAT WON'T ALLOW IT TO CRACK OR
BREAK, BUT WILL ALLOW IT -- BUT STILL KEEPS ITS ADHESIVENESS TO THE
STRUCTURE.
THAT'S BEEN APPROVED BY AN ENGINEER, AS WELL AS THE STRUCTURAL PART
OF IT HAS BEEN APPROVED.
AND THEN THERE IS A LIGHT COMPONENT TO IT.
THE SUPPOSED TO SHOW BUT I DON'T REALLY KNOW HOW TO CLICK ON THAT.
THE LIGHTS MOVE BEHIND THE STONE AT DUSK, THERE'S A THREE-HOUR LIGHT
SHOW THAT WE AGREED UPON.
THESE ARE JUST SOME OF THE SHOWS THAT ARE ALREADY KIND OF MIXED INTO
THE PROGRAM.
BUT I ACTUALLY HAVE AN OUTSIDE VENDOR I'M HAVING PUT THIS SHOW TOGETHER
FOR ME.
SORRY ABOUT THAT.

AND THEN THIS IS THE PROPOSED SITE LOCATION.
AND IT WAS, I GUESS SOMEONE TOLD ME THERE WAS A SIGN PREVIOUSLY THERE
WHERE THIS SCULPTURE IS GOING.
AND WE HAVE DETERMINED THAT THIS SCULPTURE IS ABOUT 1300 POUNDS AND
IT'S AMPLE, THE WEIGHT DOESN'T EXCEED THE FOUNDATION.
ALSO THE BOARD IS BEING WRAPPED WITH A CLEAR WRAP AROUND THE WHOLE
BOARD INCLUDING THE STONE FOR THE REASON OF IT BEING OUTDOORS.
THE STONE HAS NO PROBLEM BEING OUTDOORS, BUT IN THE EVENT THAT SOMEONE
GETS ON IT OR MOVES IT AROUND, JUST TO PREVENT ANYTHING FROM COMING
APART, IT'S FULLY WRAPPED WITH A CLEAR WRAP.
IT HAS A LIFETIME OF FIVE YEARS.
SO I THINK THAT'S IT.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WELL DONE.
COUNCIL, ANY QUESTIONS OF MR. PARHAM.
>> D. Lesser: THANK YOU, MR. PARHAM, I HAVE A QUESTION OF STAFF.
CAN WE LEAVE THAT IMAGE UP?
AND I HAD A QUESTION ABOUT ITS PLACEMENT AND ITS LOCATION.
NAMELY, FIRST OF ALL, TO WHAT EXTENT COULD THIS BE SOMETHING THAT IS
CLIMBED ON?
I'M NOT SURE TO WHAT EXTENT STAFF HAS EVALUATED THAT.
BUT LEAVING THAT ASIDE, THE LARGER QUESTION I HAVE IS WITH ITS LOCATION
SO CLOSE TO THIS OTHER BUSINESS, WHERE IT ALMOST APPEARS TO BE AN
EXTENSION OF THE BUSINESS, EVEN THOUGH THE COLORS DON'T QUITE MATCH.
SO I HAD ASKED THROUGH STAFF WHETHER THERE MIGHT BE ANOTHER LOCATION,
EVEN THOUGH I UNDERSTAND THE POSITION OF THE B.I.D., THIS IS THE SITE
THEY WOULD LIKE.
BUT PARKING LOT 4, WHERE THERE PRESENTLY ISN'T ANYTHING.
I'M NOT SURE IF THERE'S ANY SLIDES RENDERED BASED ON MY ASKING THE
PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR, AS WELL AS THE PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR,
WHETHER THAT WOULD BE A VIABLE LOCATION.
FIRST WE WOULD HAVE TO HEAR FROM MY COLLEAGUES.
BUT I'M JUST WONDERING IF THERE'S ANOTHER VIABLE LOCATION THAT IS
PROXIMATE TO LOT 4 WHICH IS ROSECRANS AND HIGHLAND.
>> THANK YOU, COUNCILMEMBER LESSER.
TO ADDRESS YOUR EARLIER QUESTION, THIS ISN'T SUPER CLIMBABLE.
IT'S CONSTRUCTED IN SUCH A WAY IT WOULD WITHSTAND IF SOMEONE COULD
MANAGE TO CLIMB IT, THEY WOULD HAVE TO BE SPIDER-MAN.
IN TERMS OF CLIMBABILITY, IT'S NOT A HUGE, HUGE CONCERN.
YOU COULD LEVERAGE YOURSELF ON THE PEDESTAL, I SUPPOSE.
BUT AS ARTWORKS AND SCULPTURES GO, IT'S NOT TOO BAD CLIMBABILITY WISE.
IN TERMS OF THE LOCATION AND ITS PROXIMITY TO THE BUSINESS, IT'S OUR
UNDERSTANDING THAT THE BUSINESS OWNER IS IN FAVOR OF THE ARTWORK, THEY
DO ENJOY IT AND THEY ARE HAPPY TO HAVE IT IN THAT LOCATION, EVEN THOUGH
IT ALMOST LOOKS LIKE IT'S PART OF THE BUSINESS.
THE BUSINESS OWNER IS ONBOARD WITH THE LOCATION.
LASTLY, IN TERMS OF THE LOCATION, UNFORTUNATELY WE WERE NOT ABLE TO
PUT TOGETHER A SLIDE FOR THAT.

MIGHT BE ABLE TO PULL UP A GOOGLE MAP.
AND YES, WE DID HAVE SOME VALUABLE FEEDBACK FROM OUR PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.
IT WOULD BE POSSIBLE TO PUT IT ESSENTIALLY INTO THE GRASS PLANTER SECTION NEXT TO THE SIDEWALK THAT'S BY LOT 4 THERE.
YOU COULDN'T PUT IT ON THE SIDEWALK ITSELF.
IT'S TOO NARROW.
AND YOU WOULD HAVE TO DO A BIT OF WORK.
YOU WOULD HAVE TO RELOCATE SOME UTILITIES.
I BELIEVE THERE ARE SOME WATER MAINS UNDER THERE THAT WOULD HAVE TO BE RELOCATED, THE FOUNDATION WOULD HAVE TO BE POURED.
SOME WORK WOULD NEED TO GET DONE.
IT IS FEASIBLE.
>> D. Lesser: THANK YOU.
>> Mayor Montgomery: DIRECTOR LEE, DO YOU WANT TO ADD TO THAT?
>> JUST TO CLARIFY, NOT WATER MAIN, THERE'S WATER LINES TO BE MOVED.
>> Mayor Montgomery: ANY OTHER COUNCIL QUESTIONS?
SEEING NONE.
PUBLIC COMMENT -- I'M SORRY.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: NO, I WAS GOING TO REQUEST TO SPEAK.
>> Mayor Montgomery: GO AHEAD.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: IF THE QUESTIONS ARE DONE.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THEY ARE DONE.
NO PUBLIC COMMENT YET THOUGH.
PUBLIC COMMENT?
ANYONE HERE?
ANYONE ON ZOOM?
SO CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT.
MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: TO YOUR POINT, COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH.
EARLIER.
SO ON THE COUNCIL, STILL AM THE COUNCIL REPRESENTATIVE FOR THE NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH B.I.D. SO I'VE SEEN THIS AND IT'S SO GREAT TO SEE YOU HERE IN PERSON.
I'VE BEEN HEARING ABOUT THIS SO MUCH FOR SO LONG AND HEARING ABOUT YOU AS WELL.
THANK YOU FOR ADDING YOUR TALENTS TO THIS AND THINKING ABOUT US.
I'M IN FAVOR OF IT.
I THINK IT'S A GOOD LOCATION.
WE ARE TRYING TO DO SOME REVITALIZATION IN NORTH MANHATTAN BEACH.
THERE'S BEEN THE HOLIDAY STROLL.
WE HAVE HAD THAT NOW FOR TWO YEARS AND THAT ALL TAKES PLACE IN THAT AREA THERE.
AND THAT HAS PROVEN TO BE A GREAT SUCCESS TO BRING A LOT OF ENERGY TO THAT AREA OF NORTH MANHATTAN.
SO I THINK THE LOCATION IS GOOD.
I THINK THE MESSAGING IS GOOD.

THE LIGHTS, I BELIEVE, WE TALKED ABOUT THAT, IN TERMS OF CONTROLLING IT AND NOT HAVING IT BE A NUISANCE FOR THE NEIGHBORHOOD. I THINK PEOPLE WILL LOVE IT AND WILL WALK BY IT AND HAVE THEIR SELFIES AND EVERYTHING TAKEN AROUND IT. I'M GOING TO VOTE TO APPROVE IT.

>> D. Lesser: WE ARE MISSING THE MAYOR. IN THE MAYOR'S ABSENCE --

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH?

>> A. Howorth: HE HAD SOME COMMENTS WHILE YOU WERE GONE. I'M PREPARED TO SUPPORT IT. ESPECIALLY, I KNOW IT'S BEEN GOING ON LONG BEFORE I WAS HERE. YOU KNOW, AND IF THE B.I.D. WANTS TO TRY THIS, I THINK THAT'S GREAT. AND THANK YOU TO THE ARTIST. THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE. I THINK YOUR PRESENTATION ACTUALLY HELPED ME UNDERSTAND, LIKE IT EVEN MORE. SO THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE. I LOOK FORWARD TO SOME SORT OF FUN SOCIAL MEDIA CAMPAIGN AROUND THE LIGHTING OF IT WHEN IT HAPPENS. I THINK THAT WOULD BE SUPER FUN. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO ATTENDING DURING THOSE THREE HOURS. NOT THE WHOLE TIME. JUST SAYING.

>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO? AS A RESIDENT ARTIST, YOUR COMMENTS?

>> S. Napolitano: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. I APPRECIATE THE EFFORT HERE, BUT I CAN'T SUPPORT THIS AT THIS TIME. THERE'S JUST TOO MANY UNKNOWNNS. ALL I HEARD ABOUT A WHOLE BUNCH OF UNKNOWN COSTS IN THE PRESENTATION. I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE LIABILITY HAS BEEN WORKED OUT IF IT'S DAMAGED WHO IS RESPONSIBLE FOR THAT. COSTS ON TOP OF COSTS. ESPECIALLY FOR A ONE-YEAR LOAN. WHICH IS FAR BELOW MOST OF OUR ART PROJECTS, I BELIEVE. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW MORE ABOUT THE ULTIMATE FINAL COST OF THIS. BUT RIGHT NOW, YOU KNOW, I HEAR \$12,000. BUT WITH SO MANY UNKNOWNNS IT SOUNDS LIKE A BLANK CHECK TO ME. I CAN'T WRITE THAT BLANK CHECK.

>> Mayor Montgomery: UNDERSTOOD. COUNCILMEMBER LESSER?

>> D. Lesser: I HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT THE LOCATION. ABOUT WHETHER THIS IS THE RIGHT PIECE FOR THAT SPECIFIC SPOT. BUT I WOULD SHARE COUNCILMEMBER'S HOWORTH'S COMMENT, IT WAS VERY HELPFUL TO HAVE THE ARTIST HERE TO SHOW THE PROJECT, UNDERSTAND HIS PASSION AND WHAT HE IS TRYING TO ACHIEVE. THIS IS A ONE-YEAR PROJECT. AND ONE YEAR ONLY.

THAT'S MY UNDERSTANDING, CORRECT?
ACTUALLY, MAYBE I ASK THE STAFF A QUESTION.
WHAT HAPPENS AT THE END OF THE YEAR?
AS WE APPROACH THE END OF THE YEAR.
CLARIFY THAT BEFORE I MAKE MY FINAL COMMENT.
>> S. Napolitano: WE ARE GOING TO BE ASKED TO BUY IT.
>> SO IT IS OUR UNDERSTANDING THAT THE NORTH END B.I.D., BECAUSE THEIR
ULTIMATE GOAL WAS TO HAVE THIS BE A PERMANENT ARTWORK, I BELIEVE THERE
MAY BE THEN A PROPOSAL FROM THEM TO ACCEPT THIS AS A ONE-YEAR ARTWORK,
EXCUSE ME, AS A PERMANENT ARTWORK.
THE ONE-YEAR LOAN IS MEANT TO BE A TEST PILOT, TO ADDRESS A LITTLE
BIT OF COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO'S COMMENTS, A QUESTION, I SUPPOSE.
AT THIS POINT THE LIABILITY OF REPAIRING THE ARTWORK, THAT'S THE
MAINTENANCE CONTINGENCY, HOWEVER IF IT WAS PERMANENT.
>> D. Lesser: SO IF AT THE END OF THE YEAR IT'S DAMAGED IT'S ON WHO?
>> ALLOCATION OF \$7,000 FROM THE PUBLIC ART TRUST FUND WOULD KICK IN
FOR THE ARTIST, MR. PARHAM TO REPAIR IT.
HE WOULD THEN BE PAID OUT OF THAT'S \$7,000, NOT TO EXCEED \$7,000
ALLOCATION.
>> D. Lesser: GOT IT.
I DO SUPPORT IT FOR ONE YEAR.
BUT I WANT THIS TO COME BACK TO COUNCIL AND WE WILL BE ABLE TO REASSESS
IT AT THAT TIME.
>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH?
>> A. Howorth: I MADE A MOTION.
CAN I LOOK AT THE LANGUAGE HERE?
TO ACCEPT THE RESOLUTION APPROVING A ONE-YEAR LOAN AGREEMENT OF "SURF
ASCENSION".
AND ALLOCATE FUNDING FROM THE PUBLIC ARTS TRUST FUND IN AN AMOUNT NOT
TO EXCEED \$12,000.
>> Mayor Montgomery: I'LL ADD MY COMMENTS AS WELL.
I ACTUALLY LIKE IT, MR. PARHAM.
I LIKE THE DESIGN.
BRING AN IDEA.
SO IT CAN'T TOPPLE OVER.
MOVE IT BY A FORK-LIFT.
CHANGE THE LIGHTING BASED ON THE SEASON HERE IN MANHATTAN BEACH OR
WHATEVER EVENT WE WANT TO HAVE.
I UNDERSTAND COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO'S COMMENTS ABOUT IT.
MAYBE BRING BACK MORE INFORMATION FROM PARKS AND REC.
WHAT THE ACTUAL COSTS ARE.
WE WILL GET THAT NAILED DOWN.
IF IT RAISES A FLAG WE WILL BE CONCERNED ABOUT IT THEN.
NO FURTHER COMMENTS.
ROLL CALL, PLEASE.
>> COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO?
>> S. Napolitano: NO.

>> COUNCILMEMBER LESSER?
>> D. Lesser: YES.
>> MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN?
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YES.
>> MAYOR MONTGOMERY?
>> Mayor Montgomery: YES.
>> COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH?
>> A. Howorth: YEP.
>> MOTION PASSES, 4-1.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU ALL FOR BEING HERE.
APPRECIATE YOUR TIME.
SEE YOU SOON.
OUR NEXT ITEM, WE STILL HAVE WORK TO DO.
LET'S SEE.
LETTER L, CITY COUNCIL REQUESTS REPORTS INCLUDING OUR FAVORITE,
AB1234, MAYOR PRO TEM FRANKLIN TELL YOU ABOUT THE TRIP NATIONAL LEAGUE
OF CITIES.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: THE GREAT THING ABOUT THE CONFERENCE, THEY
BRING IN FEDERAL LEGISLATORS AND FEDERAL STAFF FROM VARIOUS
DEPARTMENTS IN THE CABINET TO TALK WITH US AND EXCHANGE IDEAS.
MOSTLY TALK ABOUT GRANTS THAT ARE AVAILABLE.
AND SPEAKING OF GRANTS, WE FOUND THAT THERE'S THIS GRANT FINDER
APPLICATION FROM LEXIPOL AVAILABLE FOR US TO USE.
IT HAS ACCESS TO OVER \$600 BILLION IN GRANTS.
AND IT'S FREE TO, SINCE WE ARE A MEMBER IN GOOD STANDING WITH THE N.L.C.
TO USE.
SO I UNDERSTAND, IN TALKING TO CITY MANAGER MOE THAT WE CAN UTILIZE
IT IN VARIOUS DEPARTMENTS.
AND LOOK FORWARD TO BRINGING THAT ONBOARD.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU.
I ALSO ATTENDED THE NATIONAL LEAGUE OF CITIES CONFERENCE WITH MAYOR
PRO TEM FRANKLIN.
IT'S NOT JUST THE FEDERAL PEOPLE THAT ARE THERE.
JOE GOT TO SEE THIS ONE-ON-ONE TIME WITH OFFICIALS FROM ALL OVER
CALIFORNIA.
NEVER MET BEFORE FACE TO FACE.
FOR YEARS WE HAVE BEEN DOING IT BY ZOOM.
NOT JUST FEDERAL LEGISLATORS, IT'S PEOPLE IN CALIFORNIA, OTHER
STATES, WHAT ARE THEY DOING ABOUT HOMELESSNESS, AV?
IT'S 3,000 ELECTED FROM ALL OVER THE COUNTRY.
THOUGH IT RAINED ON US THE FIRST THREE DAYS, FINALLY GOT A CHANCE TO
WALK AROUND D.C. AND TALK TO PEOPLE.
IT'S AMAZING WHAT YOU LEARN.
I WILL BRING OUR BOOK TO LIZA.
SOMETHING WILL CATCH YOUR EYE, WHETHER AB HOMELESS.
THAT \$300,000 GRANT FROM THE FEDS, THAT CAME FROM THAT CONFERENCE,
NLC.

I'M GLAD WE WENT AND MADE IT BACK AND BACK TO NORMAL.
THAT'S ALL WE HAVE.
COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO?
ANY AB 1234 REPORTS?
>> S. Napolitano: NO, YOUR HONOR.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THERE WE GO.
MOVE TO NEXT ITEM.
FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS, ANYONE?
>> S. Napolitano: NONE FROM ME.
>> A. Howorth: NO, SIR.
>> Mayor Montgomery: CITY MANAGER REPORT?
>> City Manager B. Moe: TWO QUICK THINGS I WANTED COUNCIL TO BE AWARE
AND THE COMMUNITY, OUR POLICE DEPARTMENT COMPETED IN BAKER TO VEGAS
RUN, IT'S A 20-LEG RELAY RACE, COVERS 120 MILES FROM BAKER, CALIFORNIA
TO LAS VEGAS.
IT'S GOT SEGMENTS ANYWHERE FROM FOUR MILES TO 10.7 MILES, SOME OF IT
IS UP HILL.
IT'S OVERNIGHT, IT'S DARK, IT'S COLD SOMETIMES.
IT'S REALLY AMAZING TO SEE ALL THESE TEAMS FROM ALL OVER THE WORLD,
FRANKLY.
THE ROYAL MOUNTED CANADIAN POLICE RUN IT.
I THINK WE HAD PEOPLE FROM OTHER COUNTRIES, I'M LOSING THE THOUGHT
HERE.
AT ANY RATE THEY DID VERY WELL, CAME IN 7th OUT OF THE 22 TEAMS IN
THEIR CATEGORY.
THAT ENTITLES THEM TO THESE TROPHY MUGS.
THEY ARE VERY COVETED.
LAST YEAR THEY WERE TEAM 134 BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE THEY FINISHED
OVERALL.
THIS YEAR 79th PLACE.
SO THEY DRAMATICALLY IMPROVED THEIR SLOT, WE TEAMED UP WITH HERMOSA
BEACH ONCE AGAIN WITH THEIR POLICE DEPARTMENT.
AND COMPETING WITH SOME TEAMS LIKE L.A.P.D., THEY HAVE 10,000 OFFICERS
FINDING 20 GREAT RUNNERS ISN'T THAT BIG OF A DEAL.
BUT OBVIOUSLY WITH A SMALL DEPARTMENT LIKE OURS IT IS A BIG DEAL.
[INDISCERNIBLE] RAN THE LAST LEG.
YES, IT WAS THE BERLIN POLICE DEPARTMENT THAT ALSO RAN.
>> OF COURSE.
>> City Manager B. Moe: ANYWAY, I WANTED YOU TO BE AWARE OF THAT.
A COUPLE OF YOU IN THE PAST PARTICIPATED ON A WEBSITE REDESIGN TEAM.
SO I WOULD LIKE TO SOLICIT HELP FROM THE COUNCIL, IF YOU WOULD LIKE
TO SELECT TWO OF YOUR MEMBERS TO --
WE ARE GOING THROUGH THAT PROCESS.
COUNCIL INPUT LAST TIME WAS VERY HELPFUL.
IF WE COULD GET A COUPLE VOLUNTEERS.
>> A. Howorth: I LIVE FOR THAT.
>> IT'S FEELING LIKE 2011 ALL OVER AGAIN.

>> A. Howorth: SPEAK FOR YOURSELF.
>> Mayor Pro Tem Franklin: YOU KNOW --
>> D. Lesser: IF THERE'S ANY BLAME YOU CAN BLAME IT ON THE
COUNCILMEMBERS ON THIS.
>> Mayor Montgomery: COUNCILMEMBER HOWORTH VOLUNTEERED FOR THE
WEBSITE REDESIGN.
>> A. Howorth: MAKE IT PINK.
>> City Manager B. Moe: YOU HAVE THE POWER.
THAT'S ALL I HAVE TONIGHT.
>> Mayor Montgomery: THANK YOU, SIR.
CITY ATTORNEY REPORT?
>> City Attorney Q. Barrow: NOTHING TONIGHT.
>> Mayor Montgomery: WE ARE GOING TO ADJOURN TO TUESDAY APRIL 18th,
2023, 6:00 P.M. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS.
THANK YOU ALL FOR BEING HERE.
GOOD NIGHT.
PASSOVER, EASTER.
SEE YOU ALL IN TWO WEEKS, IF NOT SOONER.
THANK YOU.