

**MANHATTAN BEACH
OUTDOOR DINING TASK FORCE
MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING
September 26, 2023**

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Director Talyn Mirzakhianian called the meeting to order at the hour of 1:03pm, and introduced Rick Barrett and Miguel Nunez with the consultant team (i.e., MIG Inc. and sub-consultant Fehr & Peers).

B. ROLL CALL

Senior Planner Jaehee Yoon welcomed everyone to the meeting and provided a brief overview of the meeting agenda.

Roll call was taken and the following task force members were present for the meeting:

Joseph Ungoco – Planning Commission
Bob DaGiau – Parking and Public Improvements Commission
David Archer – Chamber of Commerce
Maureen McBride – Chamber of Commerce
Jill Lamkin – Downtown (DBPA)
Jim Burton – Downtown resident
Mike Simms – North MB (BID)
Kimberlee Kelly – North MB resident
Harout (Harry) Ashikian – Commercial (Non-MVSC)
Paul Mullin – At-large resident
Bridgette Goodman – At-large resident
Faith Lyons – At-large resident/business
Peir Serota – At-large resident/business
Audrey Judson (At-large resident/business)

Don Ziss (Commercial-MVSC) was absent from the meeting; Sher Willis, alternate member for the Commercial-MVSC seat was participating on his behalf.

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was passed (unanimous) to approve the minutes from the August 29, 2023 task force meeting.

D. PARKING DATA & UTILIZATION OVERVIEW

Miguel Nunez of Fehr & Peers presented the parking data collected over two summer weekends (i.e., July 21-23 and August 11-13, 2023) in Downtown and North End. The data was analyzed to provide a better understanding of the parking supply and demand from 11:00 am – 8:00 pm throughout 18 lots and 55 segments, totaling 2,206 parking spaces. The data found that both on- and off-street parking spaces were being heavily utilized (up to 95%), particularly on Saturdays and from 1:00 – 3:00 pm.

Discussion ensued amongst the task force members, Mr. Nunez, and City staff regarding the following:

- The different types of restricted/reserved parking counts that have been considered in the study and how it can be further broken down by street segments, reserved spaces, and unreserved spaces.
- If the parking data can specifically analyze spaces in front of residential properties to see how those spaces are being utilized and impact residents. Staff clarified that public parking is for everyone and the City does not have residential parking permits in the coastal zone like some areas of Hermosa Beach, which was possible as it existed prior to the Coastal Act. In addition, staff noted that the City is analyzing how all the public parking spaces are being used by the public and not just for a particular group or area adjacent to residential uses.
- A question was posed regarding the correlation between this parking study and data from the City's smart meters to augment the consultant's analyses. Staff noted that the meters do not necessarily produce accurate data and the parking occupancy counts collected by the consultant team are the most dependable method of determining when spaces are occupied. In addition, staff pointed out that this parking study conducted during peak summer season is the first of its kind in the City and has been commended by the Coastal Commission as it will help support proposed parking solutions in the future.
- How the parking data analysis compares with other coastal cities. Mr. Nunez noted that the results are similar to that found in other coastal cities where there is much more parking demand than supply, whereas most other jurisdictions have sufficient parking supply and the analyses focus more on encouraging optimal use of underutilized parking spaces. He also noted that coastal cities are unique due to the Coastal Commission's involvement in reviewing matters related to parking.
- A brief overview of the merchant parking program status, permit issuance process, permit restrictions, applicable lots, and how the City can make better use of the program.

E. TASK FORCE DISCUSSIONS

Questions were posed for the task force on whether the data matches expectations; what are some common challenges that employees, visitors, and community members face when parking a vehicle in these areas of the City; and, what are some solutions and strategies to consider.

Comments were made by task force members as follows:

- Eliminate or reduce the number of reserved parking spaces for City employees by providing a shuttle service where there is an abundance of parking which will provide more available parking spaces in the coastal zone. Staff noted that City employee parking spaces do not impact peak hours or day of the week as it is usually occupied during off-peak hours and weekdays.
- The influence of parking availability on employment as there are not as many applicants in the coastal zone compared to non-coastal areas. Parking benefits are generally not provided for employees in Downtown and employees will not likely pay for parking which often results in getting creative amongst themselves to get around. Unless the employees are incentivized to park somewhere else and use shuttle services, it may not work well since parking farther and

waiting for shuttle service will add to their commute which is not paid for. Also, shuttle service operations is an expense which needs to be considered if it is proposed.

- Shuttle service should be used for more than just employees, including residents and visitors. The Downtown in the past would be a good example if it could travel to more locations throughout the City. Staff noted that it would be in the best interest of the City to operate the shuttle for the collective population and is in the process of discussing something similar with a company called Circuit.
- The cost to build additional parking and related infrastructure is a costly endeavor. Hence, rooftop dining or implementation of an in-lieu fee should be considered as an alternative. Staff noted that there was an in-lieu fee in the past which will be reintroduced as part of the City's parking code update.
- Increasing the supply of parking may not be the best solution to addressing parking issues since it also induces that much more demand.
- Scarce parking is not necessarily a deterrent based on Uber ride data showing that the most popular destination in California was The Grove.

Further discussion ensued amongst the task force members, Mr. Nunez, and City staff regarding the following:

- Whether the value of a parking space has been studied, to which Mr. Nunez responded that it needs to be researched but in general, the cost of building parking spaces or how much people are paying for parking is more commonly known.
- Question on how the City can get more parking enforcement, to which staff responded that currently there are not enough resources available to enforce parking regulations and hence, it will need to be discussed with the City Council.
- Potential use of Dial-A-Ride as a solution, to which staff noted that it would be difficult to do so since it is already at full capacity and there are several restrictions that would prevent the City from using it to serve people outside of the intended purpose or population the Dial-A-Ride program is intended for.
- Whether the City is analyzing areas where new parking structures will be built, to which staff responded that a separate Citywide parking study will be conducted to look into those opportunities. Staff also suggested possibly making use of parking apps that can work with the City's data or system to find available parking spaces without having to drive around and find a spot, as well as making parking payments on their phones.

Staff clarified that the parking study will be used to provide a holistic solution to the loss of parking created by the outdoor dining program as the data provides a quantitative basis to start thinking about how we can offset parking issues. Staff also suggested looking into geo-fencing and coordinating with rideshare companies to offer discounts or incentives to utilize rideshare programs as a possible solution.

F. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Three public comments were received as follows:

- Whether the consultant had looked into how much people are paying for parking as the cost of parking impacts demand. Consider more affordable parking spaces further away for beach goers who can utilize the potential shuttle system rather than using retail or restaurant parking in the coastal zone. Staff noted that it would be challenging to convince the Coastal Commission if we suggest parking for beach goers further away as it is inconsistent with their goal of protecting and enhancing the public access to the coast.
- Consider realistic solutions to parking issues as Coastal Commission is sensitive to loss of public parking spaces. Also, consider who will pay for the cost of shuttle service and vouchers as there are costly expenses involved in order to implement these suggestions. Circle back to the big picture again as there are still outstanding issues related to trash, trucks, noise, and circulation as well.
- Consider the number of increased seating that will result from the program to come up with a solution for parking since there is unlimited demand. Create more on-site open air dining opportunities so as not to aggravate parking challenges or occupy public parking spaces.

F. ADJOURNMENT

Staff announced that the next two meetings will take place on October 24, 2023 at 1:00 pm at the Manhattan Beach Library Meeting Room; and on December 12, 2023 at 1:00pm at the Police/Fire Conference Room. In addition, staff provided a brief overview of the upcoming community workshop on October 2, 2023 and asked the task force members to encourage the public to attend.

The meeting concluded at 2:45 PM.