

ROUGHLY EDITED COPY

MANHATTAN BEACH CITY COUNCIL
REGULAR MEETING
REMOTE BROADCAST CAPTIONING
TUESDAY, JUNE 4, 2024

* * * * *

This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

* * * * *

CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
CITY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, JUNE 4, 2024

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Well, first we got to reconvene into open session from closed session and we have an announcement from City Attorney Quinn Barrow.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Thank you, Mayor. As previously announced the City Council went into closed session this afternoon to discuss the piece of existing litigation identified on the agenda. There was no reportable action taken.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so we're going to adjourn from closed session and welcome to the City Council regular meeting for June 4th, 2025. And we are going to have a pledge to the flag with Ms. Hazel Blockley from Pacific Elementary School. So, Hazel. So, Hazel. There we go. And the flag's right behind you. Oh, you might want to put that in your left hand.

HAZEL BLOCKLEY: Face the flag, put your right hand over your heart. Ready? Begin.

GROUP: I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one Nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, well done. Thank you. So, we are going to have a few words from your principal. They're good

words, don't worry, you're not in trouble. Okay, you did that just great. So, Ms. Vavao.

PRINCIPAL VAVAO: Yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Would you please come down and tell us about this wonderful student of yours?

PRINCIPAL VAVAO: My pleasure. Good evening, everyone. It is my absolute pleasure and honor to stand before you and recognize a truly remarkable individual who embodies all of the qualities of an outstanding citizen. This individual is none other than Hazel Blockley. Hazel is a member of Girl Scouts, student council, green team, no place for hate committee, and honor choir. She plays volleyball, flag football, softball, and basketball. She also participates in musical theater and plays piano. This girl does it all. From the very beginning of her journey at Pacific Elementary, Hazel has been a beacon of leadership, kindness, and positivity. As a member of the student council, she has continuously shown her commitment to serving her peers and community, leading with grace and determination. Whether it's in the classroom, on the playground, or within our school community, Hazel's leadership shines brightly, inspiring those around her to be their best selves. But Hazel's impact doesn't stop there. She exemplifies the true meaning of citizenship by choosing kindness at every turn, by lending a helping hand to her teachers, and by being respectful as a

friend and a classmate to all. Her dedication to her studies is unmatched, as she consistently goes above and beyond, completing assignments with excellence and pushing herself to new heights. Hazel's zest for life is contagious. With her infectious smile and unwavering positive attitude, she approaches every challenge with courage and determination. Whether she's on the field winning championships or volunteering her time during recess, Hazel's enthusiasm for learning and giving back to her community knows no bounds. Beyond her academic achievements, Hazel is a shining example of versatility and dedication. From sports to the arts, from extracurricular activities to academic pursuits, Hazel fearlessly embraces new experiences, there's more, and opportunities. Her list of accomplishments speaks volumes about her commitment to excellence and her willingness to step out of her comfort zone. Hazel, as you prepare to spread your wings and pursue your dreams, always remember the lessons you've learned at Pacific Elementary. Continue to lead with kindness, embrace every opportunity that comes your way, and never forget the power of your own light to illuminate the world around you. Illuminate. Congratulations, Hazel, on this well-deserved recognition. You are truly a shining example of citizenship, leadership, and excellence. We can't wait to see all the amazing things you accomplish in the future. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. And so, Hazel, on behalf of my City Council colleagues, we have Mayor Pro Tem Amy Howorth, Councilmember Lesser, Councilmember Napolitano, and Councilmember, there we go, Montgomery. We want to present to you the certificate of recognition, that for outstanding citizenship in the Manhattan Beach Unified School District and for leading the pledge today. So, thank you so much. And also, that pin. So, we can take photos now.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I've been taking photos all along.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Can you get all of those still here?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Come on first. You better all pack up.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Can you get us all?

COMMUNICATIONS AND CIVIC ENGAGEMENT MANAGER LATRAGNA: Can we all look over here? Got it. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: You're welcome.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Well, done.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Congratulations.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Have a great summer.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Pacific.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: You look so good for your work.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Whatever you want.

COUCNILMEMBER LESSER: We have more.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Great. So, can we have roll call, please?

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Present.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Here. And at this time, we'd like to take the opportunity to recognize any United States military veterans that are in the audience. So, if you would, just go ahead and stand and be acknowledged. So, we have Chief back there in the Marine Corps.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: All right.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, sir.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: All right.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you all for your service. Moving on to the ceremonial calendar. We have the presentation of

plaques to outgoing Commissioners and Board Members, parks and recreation commissioners, Lori McCarthy. Well, we'll go through that, but you know who you are. So, if you would, go ahead and come down here. That would be Lori McCarthy, Daniel Greenberg, Ron Spackman, and Samantha Erlich and Library Commissioners Janet Jones and Catherine Jester. Thank you, all. There are others as well, but they could not make it this evening. But these are your fellow residents who have taken their time out of their busy schedules to give back to the community. These commissions are a great asset to the Council here. They go and take a lot of the initial issues that are bubble up from the community. They do this, they do..

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: The heat.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: The heat. Yeah, thank you. They take the heat for us and because we can't do it all but they feel a great purpose for getting us the information interfacing with other residents bringing forth proposals that are considered by the Council. So, it's very important work and we want to acknowledge those folks who are leaving their commission assignments in this evening. So, we will start with Daniel Greenberg, did I see Daniel?

JANET JONES: No.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. And Mr. Rod Spakman. Here we go. Thank you so much. And you were leaving, which commission?

ROD SPAKMAN: I'm leaving the Cultural Arts Commission.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, great. And you serve the others?

ROD SPAKMAN: No. Just cultural arts. Happy to see the nautilus going up on the fire department wall.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Looks good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: That's great. So, if you like all the artwork his name is Rod Spakman, if you don't like it his name is Mud. All right, yes. And we have retiring from the Library Commission is Janet Jones. Congratulations and where are you off to now? What extra-curricular activities?

JANET JONES: So many things, I run a non-profit. So, I'll be spending a lot of time working on that on the single mom project. I'll be a Board Member for leadership Manhattan Beach and I hope doing a million things for the community besides commission work.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, thank you. Always making me feel lazy. Okay, and Samantha there we go.

SAMANTHA: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And let me read that for Cultural Arts Commission.

SAMANTHA: Yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, how did you enjoy it?

SAMANTHA: I liked it a lot. Yeah. I thought it was a great opportunity.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And what was your favorite project?

SAMANTHA: I liked choosing the murals.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: The murals. Great, again, if you like the artwork this is, no. That's great. I don't know if you've noticed it around town. Of course, you see it now in the fire station, you see all the utility boxes, you see the statues, this weekend the Library Commission was out in this plaza with the light gate sculpture. So that came through the Cultural Arts Commission and had a lot of people there for photos. So, all that wonderful art that you see out there is courtesy of you and your colleagues.

SAMANTHA: Yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, thank you very much.

SAMANTHA: You're welcome.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, is there anybody else here? That's it? Okay, great. So, photos? We have a very special presentation to the members of the Black Scholars Union Club out of Mira Costa High School. Having two kids that went through high school, I am pleased when students get involved in things that are outside themselves. These great students put a lot of time and energy into our Juneteenth celebration and helped out

with that quite a bit. They came here just like tonight. They came here to advocate for it before City Council, for us to vote on it. They got students at school to sign up, to take the survey, which is very important because those surveys give us a lot of ideas on what we want this celebration to look like. So, we want to take time today to recognize these students and to wish them well. And so, may I see Donne Ward? So, Donne, thank you very much.

DONNE WARD: Thank you very much.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: How are you doing?

DONNE WARD: I'm doing good. How are you?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I'm fine, thank you. So, I'm going to need your help because, you see, we've got a lot of people here, okay? So, what I'm going to do is hand you one stack at a time, and then I'll hold the microphone for you. If you just start saying the names there, but tell us a little bit about your journey here and how you got here and how you decided to get the group of students together and do this great work.

DONNE WARD: I actually joined the Black Scholars Union my freshman year, towards the end of my freshman year, and I actually didn't know that there was a Black Scholars Union. I went to a majority black middle school, or not a majority black middle school, but a majority black elementary school. Then I transferred from Inglewood to here, going to Hermosa Beach,

which was a very big cultural change. So, I was kind of scared to come over here where I didn't have that many people that were my skin color or knew what I was going through. But they really welcomed me when I came here. When I went into high school, I thought that there weren't people like me because at my middle school, it was me, my brother, and like maybe two other people. So, being able to know that there were a lot of people at my high school that were like me really made me happy. I was so glad that I was able to meet them. I decided after that I would sign up for a position on the board. I wasn't originally supposed to sign up for the president position, but I just decided to go for it because you never know what could happen. So, I did, and I got the position. I wanted to get our name out more because since there aren't that many black people at our school, I wanted people to know that there are black people at Mira Costa High School and that there are black people in Manhattan Beach and Hermosa Beach. It's not just only one culture here; we can have multiple cultures here. When I heard that there was a debate going on about whether we needed to have a Juneteenth celebration, I was immediately on it. I was like, obviously, we need to have a Juneteenth celebration because, first of all, it's a federal holiday. Second of all, Bruce's Beach is over here, which is very big in our culture. If we didn't have a Juneteenth celebration, I just felt like we would

be losing a part of our humanity by not having it, but also, we're just not celebrating people that we should be celebrating who fought for this land and sustained this land that we have today. So, yeah.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Just to let you know, this is City Council and you know when Steve, how old do you have to be to?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: 18.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: 18.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: 18? So, he is the youngest mayor and we had way back when - -

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Not now.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah not now.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Might still be the youngest.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, and oh I'm so sorry I forgot to read the certificate of recognition. So, the City Council my colleagues here and I of Manhattan Beach do hereby recognize Donne Ward for the Black Scholars Union Club president for their advocacy support and leadership in increasing a cultural awareness and activism and advancing awareness of social justice issues for a Juneteenth celebration in Manhattan Beach dated this fourth day of June 2024. Okay. So, if you can go ahead and say the next name?

DONNE WARD: Sephtis Peters?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: There you go. Congratulations, yeah
thanks for your help.

DONNE WARD: Carter Allen.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Hey, nice to meet you. Thank you.

DONNE WARD: Lauren Ward.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Hi Lauren.

LAUREN WARD: Hi.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Congratulations.

LAUREN WARD: Thank you.

DONNE WARD: Kathryn Glavin.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Kathryn? I think you're my neighbor,
right? She grew up on the other side of our back fence. We're
fence neighbors. Great, I think you even babysat my grandkids?

KATHRYN GLAVIN: Yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, thank you.

DONNE WARD: I'm sorry if I, but your last name? but
Michaela Navarette?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Hi Michaela.

MICHAELA NAVARETTE: Hi.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Nice to meet you.

MICHAELA NAVARETTE: Thank you.

DONNE WARD: Theodora Tuitupou.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Hi Theodora, so, nice to meet you, congratulations. Thanks for your help.

THEODORA TUITUPOU: Thank you.

DONNE WARD: Ryan Kim.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right. Congratulations, thanks for your help.

DONNE WARD: Lelea Tuitupou.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Hey there, nice to meet you. Thanks for all your work.

DONNE WARD: Raven Melvin.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Nice to meet you. Great.

DONNE WARD: And Skyler Wills.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Nice to meet you. You can sing God bless America. Great. Well, parent's now's a good time to come on in and get your photos. Oh wait. Wait yeah, we have one more I'm sorry.

DONNE WARD: Janet Allen.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Janet Allen, oh absolutely thank you for taking the time.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: We got one more. No picture yet.

DONNE WARD: Malachy Garbott. I'm so sorry man.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: There you go. And one more. And then Vasefanua?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He's not here.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Who does not have a certificate?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Vasefanua?

DONNE WARD: He's not here today.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. We got that mixed up. Sorry about that bud. All right.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Oh Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes ma'am?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Well since you know what will fill some space while people are leaving, Juneteenth that the kids have worked on it's going to be Saturday.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. You can do it turn.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Ok, alright.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Maybe announcement.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: All right, now, I was just trying to talk well. There are two events right. Okay.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right, we can go ahead and proceed Martha.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Can't hear anything up there it's too loud.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Well, no, I mean we—

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Can't hear anything down here either. It's too loud.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: What?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Until they close the door we can't hear anything.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: All right. We're good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay moving on to approval of agenda and waiver of full reading of ordinances. So, moved with by Mayor Pro Tem Amy Howorth and seconded by Councilmember Richard Montgomery. Vote please. Thank you, and now we have City Council- -

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Wait.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Oh sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Two screens at once.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Somebody didn't- -

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And we have City Council and Community organization announcements of upcoming events for one minute per person.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANI: Good evening honorable Mayor and Councilmembers, I'm Community Development Director Talyn Mirzakhani. This week the City Council received emails from residents regarding an extension of

an appeal period or an upcoming decision on telecommunications permit in the public right-of-way near 1720 Poinsettia Avenue. This afternoon, staff responded to those residents via email notifying them that their request was granted and that once a decision is made, the appeal period will be extended to two weeks. If anyone has questions on this matter, they're welcome to contact the planning division with the Community Development Department. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you very much. Any other? Please.

DEPUTY FIRE CHIEF GOMES: Honorable Mayor, members of the City Council, my name is Anthony Gomes. I'm your Deputy Fire Chief. In a continued effort by the Fire Department to re-engage with our community with our Community Risk Reduction section. We're proud to announce our partnership with Pulse Point. Pulse Point is a 911 mobile app that alerts our residents and community members and the visitors of our Manhattan Beach community of emergency events. Starting tomorrow Pulse Point subscribers will be able to follow Manhattan Beach fire and choose to be notified of significant events that may occur, it may affect themselves or their families. These notifications could include fires vehicle accidents flooding or even utility emergencies. We want to continue to improve the situational awareness of our residents and build a safer stronger and more

resilient community Pulse Point helps us do that. So, we'd like to invite everybody to download the app, you can see the flyer behind you and we have a QR code for residents to go on and it takes you directly to the website.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, thank you very much.

LAUREN WUBBLES: Good evening, Mayor and City Council members. My name is Lauren Wubbels, and I'm here from the Manhattan Beach library. Our summer discovery program has begun and runs through August 11th for readers of all ages. Sign up online or in person to read books, complete fun activities, and earn prizes. Our also, concurrent with that, our one book one County program has also started. So, please join the largest book club in your community by reading LA weather by Maria Amparo Escondón, with a limited e-book and audiobook copies available on Libby overdrive. Teams are invited to study hall hours at the library to prepare for finals. The large meeting room will be open for additional study space for teens for the next two weeks, and snacks will be provided. This Saturday, at 2, adults are welcome to join us for a relaxing afternoon making DIY coastal inspired oyster shell trinket dishes for your jewelry or small household items. Thank you for time.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you.

BOBBY BELL: Honorable Mayor, Mayor Pro Tem, City Councilmembers, City officials Mr. Lee. My name is Bobby Bell,

and I am the recycling educator for WM. Much like the artist formerly known as Prince Richard. WM is the rebranding of waste management. So, I will say WM slash waste management moving forward. I am here to announce our second annual second So, paper shred of the year it's coming up June 22nd at Mira Costa High School in the student parking lot is from 9 a.m. to 11 a.m. It's a first come, first serve situation. It's a drive-through, we ask that everybody stay in their vehicle for safety. Every resident Manhattan Beach is allowed to bring up to three boxes and I look forward to seeing you guys all on Saturday. God bless.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you so much, that's a great service.

CHARLIE STASCO: Good evening, Mayor and members of the City Council. We are members of ASB. My name is Charlie Stasco, and we are here to give an update on Mira Costa High School. So, on June 1st, we had our prom this event so sold well over 1,000 tickets and took place at the Ronald Reagan Museum. It allowed the students to explore various parts of the museum such as, Air Force One, had a fantastic DJ, and many other things that many of the students appreciated. Along this, we have senior finals approaching starting tomorrow's tomorrow seniors will begin to take their finals. They will be taking their finals in reverse order, meaning that they will start with fifth and sixth period

finals and they will end on the seventh with second and first period finals.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, Charlie what was the coolest thing at the Ronald Reagan Museum?

CHARLIE STASCO: There was a whole bunch of things that were super cool. My personal favorite thing, we had a robot that came out with LED lights to help the DJ get the crowd excited. So, I thought that was pretty cool.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: That's great. Thank you.

JADEN: Hi, my name is Jaden. I'm also a representative from ASB, I'm here to talk about some upcoming events. So, on June 7th, we have our senior breakfast. After seniors take their last final, they're going to go to audit, the auditorium, and they'll go over what will happen during graduation. And in addition, what will happen in the following weeks. There's also going to be breakfast burritos serve the students on this day. Also, upcoming finals seniors have finals throughout this week going on right now, and junior's sophomores and freshmen have finals next week from Tuesday up until Thursday. And the senior graduation is June 13th at Mira Costa from 5 to 6 p.m.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, thank you.

HENRY: Hello, my name is Henry. I'm another student from ASB at Costa. On the topic of graduation, we have our strand stroll that will be hosted after graduation on June 13th

for the graduating seniors to walk on the strand. The graduates will board buses and commence their walk on the 22nd Street in Hermosa to the Manhattan Pier where they will celebrate their send-off. Additionally, on that night they will have grad night where buses will take them to a mysterious location and it will allow them to have a safe celebration of their graduation.

Alongside, a lot of the seniors that they have been, that they have gone through their high school experience with.

Additionally, orchestra will be having their send-off concert this Friday, June 7th and they will be playing the music that they plan to play when they travel throughout Europe. This is following the band send-off concert which was last Thursday, May 30th and they will, they similarly performed a lot of the songs that they will be performing in Europe. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, thank you. How many signed up for the grad night?

HENRY: I think, it's about 500.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: 500?

HENRY: Yeah.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Wow. Have fun, be careful.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you.

RITA CRABTREE-KAMPE: Good evening, honorable Mayor, Mayor Pro Tem, City Council members. My name is Rita Crabtree-Kampe, and I'm coming to you with an announcement from MB safe,

Manhattan Beach safe alternatives for everyone. On Thursday from 5 to 8 at Grunions, we will be hosting some appetizers and some soft drinks. But we would like, we're hosting an information night for the community. If you have any curiosity about, what our organization is? What is the city doing with homelessness and how we are involved? And, how, what, how you can address homelessness, when you see someone who's on the streets and needing help. So, come and join us we'll see you at Grunions Thursday, June 6th 5 to 8 p.m. See you there.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, thank you Rita and thank you for the work that MB safe does. Anybody else for community announcements? Colleagues?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yeah. I was just going to mention, you know, you honored the students from the Black Scholars Union on Juneteenth, which is June 19th, which is a Wednesday. There will be a ceremony at Bruce's Beach. I believe, that one is at 10 a.m. and that will be a ceremony honoring the day at that site. And then, on June 22nd, which is a Saturday after at Polliwog Park starting at 11 a.m. is when the celebration that the kids have really worked hard on. As well as, Tracy Wines and other members of our community have worked on with music and food and a lot of cultural activities of significance. So, that will be June 22nd, 11 a.m., Polliwog.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Your honor...

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I want to comment. I know people haven't moved here, don't know we're talking about say, the homeless issue, you read at LA Times think it applies to Manhattan Beach we're not the same. In 2017, the numbers were 41 homeless that we counted. The last update that we did account was nine through multi-prong effort from our own mental health teams, PD fire, MB safe with other volunteers. We haven't seen an update from LA County, with no one agree with the numbers they gave last. They held off providing the city's actual numbers. We know our numbers are lower than what they report but I'm hoping next time you get a chance, George. We're going to ask the county if they're going to either; A, release the numbers they have from last year, which no one has seen from our cities. Or B, they can disregard the numbers and we had, ourselves going forward. I'll stop there. Thank you, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, I'd like to just make a quick announcement about, you saw these on your seats when you came in and everybody's got them, wave them. Thank you, Tim. Thank you, Dr. Lee, appreciate that. So, this is part of the e-bike education program here in Manhattan Beach. So, you've got one side of this flyer has rules of the road, and then the other

side is e-bike safety. We're going to hear about e-bikes here in just a second, but it's a good reminder for children, even for adults. Because adults, you got to remember, you got to follow the rules of the road just as if you're a car. Just because you're on a bicycle, doesn't allow you to run through stoplights and stop signs and things like that. So, these are very important. I know it's kind of like cartoons but it's a, it's good. It has saved a lot of kids. This along education, along with enforcement is making a big dent in accidents and the like. So, if there's no more community announcements.

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: Mr. Mayor, we do have Heather Kim on zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Oh okay, I'm sorry.

HEATHER KIM: Hi, I'm not sure if it was mentioned already, but there is a community on home meeting on public safety from the Manhattan Beach Police Department. Taking place, I think, it's June 26 later this month 6 to 7 p.m. at Joslyn Center. You are to submit questions ahead of time at askacop@manhattanbeach.gov. I would urge everyone to attend and also urge people to submit their students but also, ask for a format change. So that, it can be like a real town hall where citizens ask questions and get answers and not just have a presentation. So, please email that askacop@manhattanbeach.gov

and ask for a more interactive question and answer period. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you, Heather. Anyone else on zoom?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no additional request.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. City Manager, Chief Johnson.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Good evening, Mayor Franklin, the members of the City Council. I'm Rachel Johnson, your Police Chief. I apologize for my raspy voice I promise you I'm not contagious but I'm still recovering. And before you today to provide an update to the City Council and the community at large regarding two separate yet related issues children on bicycles, not obeying the rules of the road and crimes committed by juveniles. Both issues are important and I'm going to speak about them separately. But before I begin, I want to remind the community that we will be discussing these issues in greater depth at our town hall meeting, which is scheduled for Wednesday, June 26 at 6 p.m. at the Joslyn Center. If there are questions you would like answered at the town hall, please email us at askacop@manhattanbeach.gov. If you have a question, other people likely have that question, please email us, send it to us. So that we can provide a comprehensive answer incorporate those concerns into our presentation. As electric bicycles have

become a more common method of transportation, especially, in the coastal cities we're seeing a proliferation of e-bikes ridden by both children and adults. Often, especially, with children we are seeing careless riding that manifests itself in the form of running stop signs, riding without helmets and a lack of adherence to basic traffic laws. And as a Council is aware the Police Manhattan Department worked with Mayor Franklin to provide education on the rules of the road in partnership with the school district. In conjunction with that education, the police department has conducted four directed enforcement operations since the beginning of the year to address issues related to the safe operation of bicycles with the most recent operation conducted last Friday. That operation consisted of not only Manhattan Beach Police Department personnel but also personnel from our neighboring agencies. And 30 citations were issued on Friday alone and one vehicle was impounded during that enforcement effort. For the first four months of the year our team has written over 200 citations to bicyclists and we continue to work in partnership with the Hermosa Beach Police Department, the Redondo Beach Police Department and the El Segundo Beach Police Department on this matter. And we have several direct enforcement days related to the safe operation of bicycles planned for the summer months throughout the South Bay. Once school is out for the summer you will see our school

resource officers out patrolling on bicycles. And in addition to our SROs, we traditionally bring back our beach patrol every summer and this year is no different. These officers travel on bicycles and off-road vehicles and will be patrolling downtown, the beach and other areas of the city where their mobility aids in patrolling more efficiently. We plan to host another bicycle safety event this year where we will provide information about safe riding habits, as well as, a little show from some professional bike riders. Once we've confirmed a date, be sure to share that with the City Council and the community at large. Much of the input that I receive about traffic issues related to bicycles concerns licensing and registration of bicycles. And I understand the desire to have some metrics in place to ensure our youngest riders have, are informed of the rules of the road and they're riding bikes that are appropriate for their age and maturity, as well as, just having an overall understanding of how fast they can go on those bicycles. Unfortunately, the legislation that was moving through the state to require licensing for e-bikes has been amended to the point that it doesn't recognize, doesn't resemble the initial bill and it's really not meeting our community concerns of the matter. And I know some of that is just because of the, what the bill was asking for, which was a licensing scheme for persons under between 12 and 16 to be able to operate e-bikes. And I know

that, that testing adding all of those new folks to have to take a test at the DMV and be licenses probably some of the attendant issues we have with regard to why that bill is now a much more watered-down version of itself. Nevertheless, we're still paying attention and we hope that a similar bill will be more successful as we, as e-bikes become more commonplace and more communities throughout our state experiences some of the challenges that we are having with sake, safe bicycle riding. I also, want to talk to the Council and inform the community that why we can't require bicycle registration. We are looking to into a voluntary bicycle registration program that will provide us with a means not only to register bicycles but also aid in the recovery if they are stolen. My goal is to provide the community with more information on this at our town hall later this month. The other part of this matter involves crimes committed by juveniles in our community. And I just want to be clear with the Council on the community, we investigate all crimes committed by juveniles to the furthest extent possible. We take these crimes seriously, no matter where the kids live or anything like that. Whether you're a local kid or from out of town, we treat you the same. We want enforcement, we don't want crimes committed by anyone in our community and we want our youngest residents to grow up without fear of getting assaulted or having their property vandalized or stolen. The juvenile

justice system differs from the adult justice system in that, the overarching goal is rehabilitation. And so, what that translates to in terms of outcomes, is outcomes that are just, they're not linear and they're not the same even for two people involved in the same incident. Just because of how the juvenile justice system looks at criminal acts, looks at a person's past history, and how they decide to move forward, and what they feel will give the juvenile the best shot, if you will at being rehabilitated and not reoffending. Your team at the police department, your school resource officers, your juvenile detective and the field operations team we take this all very seriously. And we're using all available means at our disposal to issue citations and make arrests when crimes are committed. Unfortunately, not everything progresses quickly. So we may make arrests weeks after an incident is committed, if we're not able to catch the perpetrators at the time of the incident. I asked for the public's assistance in several ways with this. One, if you see something, please call us. Please say the non-emergency number into your phone, so you don't have to look it up when you call us. It's 310-545-4566. Alternatively, if you're a big fan of our reach Manhattan Beach app, which I am, it's also listed on the home page of the reach Manhattan Beach app. So, you can call the police emergency line from there, as well. It takes a couple taps but you can call the non-emergency line from there

as well. Please call us. We often hear by incidents that occurred after the fact because no one called us and gave us an opportunity to investigate and perhaps apprehend the offenders. If you witness this activity and you call us, please don't involve yourself. Please just be a great witness, I love nothing more than a great witness and I don't want to endanger someone who's being a good citizen and a good witness because they decided to involve themselves in what was going on. If you are victim of a crime perpetrated by a juvenile, I need you to call us. Often, what we need in order to submit a case of juvenile probation is someone to tell us how they were harmed by the incident. Whether it's a property or event, was vandalized or property was stolen, they were harmed, we need you to call us and tell us what happened so that we can take a report and that allows us to submit it to the juvenile justice system for further adjudication. If you have information that you know directly that would help us solve a crime or identify perpetrators, I'd like you to email us at eyewitness, that's like your eyeball, eyewitness@manhattanbeach.gov. It obviously helps us, if the information that you're providing to that email address is first hand to you. However, any information you have is appreciated. Having firsthand information prevents our team from having to sift through versions of the same video submitted by parties who found them on social media but don't have any

information that would help us identify the suspect a victim or location. So, something else that's important to note regarding this matter is that, you know, I said the progression of a juvenile through the justice system is not linear. So, but also, it's important to know that the law does not allow us in most cases, to hold kids in our juvenile detention center facility for longer than six hours. And with that, with us not being able to hold anyone for longer than six hours and really juvenile hall only taking serious and violent crimes that means that most people even if they're arrested are released a short time after that arrest from our police station. Many of the outcomes regard, that will happen with the juvenile justice system include diversion, community service, probation and other restorative justice aspects, you don't often see unless the crime is serious and violent these children do in hard time in juvenile hall and things like that. Could because the goal is rehabilitation, the goal is to restore the victim and also have the juvenile understand how the harm they, how the crime they committed is harmful. We are working very hard to forget, put together top-notch cases for probation because it's their purview to determine the appropriate outcomes. And the last thing I want to touch on for our community is something that's often brought up regarding electric bikes and that's impoundment. You know, when we see kids that are running stop

signs, we want their, we want to, there's a desire to impound their bicycles. And what the law allows us to do is very different than that and if you think about cars and e-bikes the same way for just a moment helps. The car runs a stop sign, we can usually just issue at a citation and barring any other unforeseen circumstances. We send that driver on their way with their citation in their car. Now, someone runs eight stop signs and is, you know, doing burnouts. Well, that's reckless driving, we can make an arrest and we can seize their car but those two very different things, right? It's the same thing involving electric bicycles. For mere traffic infractions, we often cannot impound these bicycles. If the bicycle is actually a motorcycle, a motorized vehicle, we can. If the bicycle is used as the instrumentality of the crime, that means if someone is doing burnouts, you know, on a concrete patio and they're making all sorts of damage and it's going to cost money to clean that. Well, the bicycles instrumentality of the crime, we can impound for that but we can't impound for a lot of the traffic infractions that you commonly see. So, while we impound where we can and we did on Friday when we had the opportunity, it's not always a remedy that's available to us. This is continued to be an area focused for us at the police department and I encourage the community to speak with their kids about the rules of the road, as well as, being a good citizen. But also, if you have

questions, please send them to us at askacop@manhattanbeach.gov and we're happy to answer those. Both at our town hall and even beforehand and I'm available for questions.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Actually, if you can take some question.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes sir.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Perhaps there's a message here but my request to speak button is not working. Maybe my colleagues have conspired. Chief, can you repeat one more time, does our city have the ability to require the registration of e-bikes?

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: No sir.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Why is that?

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: The state law prohibits the registration, prohibit us from requiring registration. We can offer it as a voluntary measure but we cannot require persons running through our city to register their bicycles.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, next?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Oh, I was trying to, it wouldn't let me.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Just raise your hand. Mayor Pro Tem.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: There's a voluntary registration potential.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: So, like we could potentially bring that up at a future meeting and talk about it and then give it some teeth. In other words, advertise it, so that people know it's out there. Like, the benefits of that would be that if a bike is stolen it might be identified something like that. So, we could direct, you know, to look into that, correct?

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes ma'am. My plan is to do the big reveal if you will. As bigger reveal as I do at our town hall meeting about the voluntary registration program. And from there, we'll kick off our information push to the community.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Thank you.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes ma'am.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I guess the one follow-up would be residents also feel that there's not enough officer presence to catch the offenders. The young kids that are running through stop sign, we all see it and driving recklessly. What's the response of the police department to that sense, that there's not enough oversight of our traffic laws by e-bike riders?

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: I certainly can appreciate that concern. I know that when I'm, you know, out and about and I see infraction when I'm on my time off, you know, and there's never anyone around, right? And it always feels that way but do know

that your police department is around. Some interesting things I learned last week was that our response to priority e-calls like, crimes in progress, last week was 42 seconds. So, we can't get somewhere in 42 seconds if we're not already out in the area being present, so it was 42 seconds. And then, last week our self-initiated activity, which as the Council knows is typically far higher than our calls for service nearly double from about 300 self-initiated activities for the week to over 500. And so, our team is out there, they are making stops, they are making contacts. I certainly sympathize with, you know, the old saying, where's a cop when you need them. Because it always seems like when, you know, someone cuts you off, there's no one there but when you cut someone off there, you know, the red blue lights are on. And so, I certainly can appreciate that, but do know that we are there, it is our presence and our self-initiated activity is a metric that I follow very closely with my team.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you, Chief.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes sir.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Chief I just have, so what is your team seeing out there? Are they seeing more compliance with the rules of the road?

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Pardon me. So, we're seeing a little bit of both. We're seeing, I was out Saturday before last around the city walking around and I saw a lot of kids with

helmets, I saw a lot of kids riding well, and I was, you know, in my vehicle, which is not marked I saw a lot of people riding very responsibly. But we also, but at the same token I come back from lunch sometimes and I see kids doing wheelies. And so, I do think that all of the education that you were so vital to bringing to the schools has helped. I see a lot of helmets and I see a lot of kids stopping. But we, you know, get more kids in the community all the time, not all of them are as versed with the rules of the road. And sometimes, it's, you know, it's fun to be a little reckless when you're a kid because you don't have an appreciation of consequences. So even kids who know better sometimes aren't riding safely but overall, we've seen a significant impact. Yes sir.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And then, can you just elaborate on the parent's involvement. I mean, we're, so let's say, you stop, you know, a juvenile.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Right.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: You've witnessed it, everything like that. Do you take that juvenile back to the station? Do you try to reach the parents and do it in the field? Can you just sort of give us an idea.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: So, it really depends, but in any time, we take a juvenile into custody like, we take them from the field to our facility their parent or legal guardian

has to come get them. Now, if they are given a ticket in the field or spoken within the field, the officer has a lot of discretion. I'll give you an example from what I did a couple of weeks ago when I was talking to some kids at MetLox, who were riding around and they were like incredibly polite. And so, we got all the parents on the speakerphone, one at a time, and we talked to the parents about what I observed, how nice their kids were, and just asked them to have a conversation about making sure they're reading the signs where they are, and that they're well versed in the rules of the road. But when we contact juveniles, our standard practices contact the parents and let the parents know what's going on.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, and then. So, the parents have to, in some cases come to the station.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes sir.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: In that conversation?

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes sir.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, great. Colleagues, anything else? Thank you very much, chief and your team. Keep doing the good work, we know it's difficult, we know there are little rascals out there. So, but we want them to comply because it's just so important.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Yes sir.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah, it's not a toy. As I tell people it's not a toy, e-bikes are not a toy. They are a machine and they can be deadly. So, follow the rules of the road. Thank you so much.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, we're going to move on to public comments but I need to make an announcement first. So, it's come to our attention that people have been disrupting City Council meetings in other cities with the antisemitic or racially based comments through zoom. Such comments are disruptive and interfere with the people's business and are not within the subject matter jurisdiction of the City Council. I'm instructing the City Clerk's office to mute any speakers who attempt to disrupt the meeting with the antisemitic or derogatory comments based upon race, gender or other protected categories. And remember, in your public comments you have one bite at the apple. Essentially, you can, if you make a comment here about an agenda item you cannot make any comment on when that agenda item comes up. So, please come on down, state your name clearly please.

JOAN GOSSER: Good evening, my name is Joan Gosser and I live at 1720 North Point South Avenue in Manhattan Beach. I'm referring to the cell site that was discussed earlier tonight. We have been residents of Manhattan Beach for 34 years. 13 of,

which have been at this address raising our two boys. Tonight, I stand before you asking for help in stopping the approval of a cell site upgrade located on a telephone pole in front of our home. The original installation occurred around 4 a.m. a number of years ago by Crown Castle. The middle of the night approach to install it was at a minimum suspicious. Although, planners are looking for a permit for the original installation, nothing has yet been found. The installing company provided the same story as the letter we received. They don't follow city construction or noise ordinances and they can do as they please. On June 1st, our neighborhood, in general received letters which have been forwarded to you stating that the city is set to approve an upgrade to this cell site, which our Senior City Planner Mr. Faturos confirmed is happening this week. There are many unanswered questions at this point. We have no permit for the original installation, yet an upgrade is being approved? We have asked for information on size comparisons to what is there now and what the city, and the city does not have that. There is nothing written about the sound that will admit from this upgrade. This process began in January yet the city waited until June to notify us and information is still lacking. What is being installed? I am letting you know that because the letter contained no details, the antenna is 14.6 inches or 14.6 inches round and nearly two feet tall, the photos provided in the

letter are deceiving and have no measurements on them. I did inquire and receive this information. This sits 30 feet from my second story bedroom window on a telephone pole. In addition to the antenna, the lower, what they call radio shroud. There's no explanations to what that is other than its equipment. Sits on the pole ten feet up from the ground and is 50 inches over four feet tall two and a half feet wide and over two feet deep and that sits on the side of the telephone pole in clear view of my front yard. The current system makes a fan like sound in warm weather and the proposed unit is roughly five times that size. This is in our front yard, imagine for a moment, if this is placed on the city property sidewalk directly in front of your home. Again, four feet tall and we don't know what it is and what sounds that will make and we are told we have no recourse for what is installed. I can't imagine what this will do to our property values and again, there is no recourse. City Council voted in 2019 to keep Sal antennas 200 feet of a school, I ask, why? Yet this is five houses north of Pacific School. That my time?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: That's three minutes.

JOAN GOSSER: Oh, I didn't get to the good part. Thank you for your time.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you though. I'm sorry, I should have mentioned it's three minutes and there's a counter. And yeah, by all means email it.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: To all of us.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah.

HEIDI RAYDEN: Hi, Heidi Rayden and I'm here to speak about this outrageous letter from Crown Castle. And I want to share my grave concerns about the city's irresponsible approach to the 5G rollout. These towers are showing up not only in residential areas but in your schools where young children spend the majority of their time. The small group of residents that join me today, they're all sitting over there, are just as upset and many wrote you guys to express their desire to join an appeal requesting an extension. And they could not be here because of the questionable short notice provided by our planning department. So, don't mistake their absence for lack of commitment to fighting this, I'm speaking for myself and for them as well. Behind me sit, again as I said, some of my neighbors and they don't want this latest upgrade and we don't want the tower at all. It's located on Jones property, it's too, it's far too close to the homes at Pacific Field and the school buildings. I understand our extension for appeal is being granted and thank you, but that's not enough. First of all, on Monday, June 3rd I spoke at length with the project planner Ted

Faturos. It's my understanding, he is a city employee but he sure comes across like he works for Crown Castle and not Manhattan Beach. I say this because it was not forthcoming with the information required for me to understand the appeal process. He stated, he didn't even know the cost for an appeal and he is listed on the email as our contact for questions about the appeal process. Additionally, I learned the original application date for these new towers back in February 2024. However, residents were not in receipt of the public notice until June 2nd. Even worse, the majority of residents within 300 feet radius never received a public notice until after we started complaining. And suddenly, they started getting them, that was really weird. So furthermore, there's a two-day notice for appeal, two days. I researched about a dozen other cities and there's a veritable time frame for appeals in each city ranging from 10 to 30 days. When I asked Mr. Faturos, why on earth such a tight window for an appeal and who determines this time frame? He informed me that it was a city department practice to not only inform residents with such short notice but also, excuse me, with the such short notice hearing the approval process but also the city determines the duration of the appeal window. So now, I understand why you missed the public notice for that giant 5G tower that's at live Oak Park. It's totally unacceptable you guys. Because of this, because of a dangerous

surgery that I personally had two years ago, I have to get regular screenings for a lie on my sarcoma cancer. It's one of the most deadly cancers. This tower, so close to my home is a tremendous risk to my health to Jones' health, who is currently living with stage 4 cancer and it's a known fact that these towers are very, very dangerous for young children. In addition, to the granted appeal we are asking you guys, a city liaison forthcoming with information that can support us in the appeal process. We need to know the cost of the appeal and we are asking the city to drop laws as other cities have restricting placement of the towers within 1,000 feet of home and 2,500, within 2,500 feet of all our schools. I'm asking you guys as our leaders to protect our health and follow the dozens of other cities in town, of towns across America that have done this. I, this is not part of my public comment but thank you. I really, I had to publicly thank Bruce Moe because he literally always responds for what two years I kind of bug you with my questions. You never not respond to me and I really appreciate it. So, you are going to be missed in your retirement. Thank you, guys.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you.

ANDREAS KOCH: Hello, City Council members and City Management, my name is Andreas Koch and I am a resident on Ardmore Avenue. Unlike the other topics here, I'm here to talk just briefly or voice my concern about the e-bike, all the

violence and the safety issues going on. This is great, thank you. This is awesome about the safety. Mine is more about the aggression of some of these kids namely this goon's gang, I'm referring to. I learned recently that there's been some proactive measures and that's awesome. I guess really part of it is just a fact-find here and I there was some good information shared. And also, just to voice my concern as a parent of a teenager that was actually bullied and was chased by a gang at the Redondo break wall. Now, why am I here? Maybe there's an opportunity to have a coalition with other cities Redondo, Hermosa, Manhattan and maybe that's happening. These kids are roaming from city to city. I'm glad to hear that there's put, there's been suppression on some of this. Gets more of a suggestion on having a collaboration with the other cities and also to say I'm still seeing it. My son is still a bit nervous to be riding around, my son and his girlfriend were on the Redondo break wall and they were chased by this this group of bullies. Do they wear a patch that says, I'm in this gang well, I'm in this gang? They do not, they just camouflage themselves within the community. So, it's not that easy to find, you know, insignia on the back of a jacket or some gang member. So, it's a challenge, I get it but what I wanted to mention is that, if we can put our efforts forward and still continue with this, it's not easy, and let's see if we can come up with some kind of

multi-city solution here. Just an idea, maybe off-base, but we're still a little bit nervous and walking about the city there with this so-called kid gang on e-bikes. So, thanks for your time appreciate it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Andreas. Any more public comments? Oh yeah, there you go. Sorry.

DENISE PADDEN: Hi, I'm Denise Padden. I live next door to Joan Gosser at 1716 Point Sedia and our property and family is affected by this proposed cell tower addition as well. I just was going to, I didn't prepare anything because I talked to Ted today and haven't received any feedback from him yet. But I was going to finish up with Joan Gosser's comments, if that's okay?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Sure.

DENISE PADDEN: And which she was speaking about the antenna. City Council voted in 2019 to keep cell antennas 200 feet of a school. Yet this tower is five houses north of Pacific School. So, the question is, why? Somehow this antenna is exempt from that ruling, how can it be 30 feet from her bedroom as well as our bedroom? The report that she has received regarding the safe and dangerous areas only tests for a maximum exposure of six minutes. We would be in our home sleeping for eight hours, so six minutes seems silly. Not quite sure where why that is even considered effective. Joan has stage four metastatic breast cancer. Although, she does not know the cause, she does know

that she is severely immune compromised. We would like, our asking the City Council to help us protect our home, our family, our property values and really our community. There are better ways to spend, for all of us to spend our time than worrying about what if from this tower. We understand that cell sites are, there is a need for them within the city. What we don't understand is why it needs to be placed in a neighborhood when it could easily placed at a commercial site on Manhattan Beach Boulevard Sepulveda, there is other options. Speaking with the City Planner today, Ted, he said his job wasn't to make suggestions, it was just to check the box to make sure that this fit within Manhattan Beach City regulations. That's not very supportive of Manhattan Beach as a community. I've lived here for 35 years. I've been in this property owner for 25. So, I would ask all of you to help us come up with a better solution for this. Move it out of our neighborhood or all of our neighborhood, commercial site would be great and really that's it for wrapping it up. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you.

TIM JONES: Good evening, Tim Jones, Manhattan Beach resident 20-some-odd years across the street from Robinson School when I heard that these students were going to be recognized this evening there's no way in the world that I could not be here. Dating myself I grew up in the time when I had

relatives attending the March on Washington, Angela Davis Black Panther free lunch program free breakfast program daycare by the Black Panthers in in Oakland. So, here's something that I thought might be interesting and I intended it for the students primarily about student activism brief history. 1942 to 43 the white rose a peaceful resistance group of students in Nazi Germany who began anonymously publishing leaflets opposing the Nazi regime and painting graffiti on buildings with phrases like down with Hitler members were caught and executed 1960 the Greensboro sit-in 4 black students from the North Carolina, from North Carolina anti-college went inside Woolworth's and sat at the lunch counter when denied service they refused to leave please quickly arrived. The protest grew by the summer many businesses and public facilities began integrating. 1989 Chinese students began protesting for more individual freedoms and human rights huge numbers of student protesters gathered in Tiananmen Square, to disperse the crowds the People's Liberation Army arrived with tanks and tear gas thousands were arrested and some executed. I was hoping to let the students to know that they should use this experience develop your own moral compass with time and experience your magnetic needle will become steady. There may be efforts I'm sorry, there may be offers a financial reward or threats of career destruction by those who try to

change your course the first amendment protects free speech, it's the first amendment for very good reasons. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Tim, unfortunately, I wish the students that heard your message earlier. All right.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: You want to get your words to them we do you know how to reach Janet Allen, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: That's good. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: What and Tim, will be speaking at the beach.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: And warm up.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Juneteenth, yes, okay anybody in council chambers? No? How about online? I'm sorry Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Once we've received zoom comments.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I'll wait until she's done.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Anybody online?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: We have Heather Kim.

HEATHER KIM: Yes, I just wanted to say thank you to Mayor Franklin and to the City Council for your push for the public displays of Tritism, it was so heartwarming to see all

the American flags flying up and down Manhattan Beach Boulevard and, on the strand, and basically everywhere in Manhattan Beach. What a unifying symbol of our country and I really appreciated it. I know many of our neighbors that I talked to really love seeing that as well. I hope we can continue that and you know really show our patriotism. And also, I wanted to say that, oh, I heard Chief Johnson speak briefly, and what caught my attention was she said that juveniles and stay a maximum of six hours. And so obviously, when you're dealing with juveniles, that's very different system. However, if I don't believe anybody should be cited and released, I have a store in downtown, and we, deal with a lot of shoplifting incidents and it is heartbreaking and it is frustrating. And why not keep them for the full six hours if that is maximum that they can do? I know I've talked to certain police officers who've said, yes, they will make it very uncomfortable for her any shoplifter, and we'll put handcuffs on them, march them to jail to get fingerprint and all that. Then I don't know if that is actually just a discretion thing or if it is policy. So, I think what needs to happen is there needs to be a strong show of course from the police department to continue to, you know, catch these guys and for all the business owners to, you know, follow through with prosecution in order for them to be able to do their jobs, what you know, whether it happens or not that's

secondary. We need to make sure that they are caught that they are reported, so that crime does it not look like it is going down when it's not. We I've been guilty of that, too. Not reporting everything because I'm like, well, what's the point? And you know we're not doing that we're going to report everything as it happens. And you know, adults and children should not just be cited and released, you should be handcuffed and made uncomfortable. The maximum amount of time so they can think about what they did, so they know that Manhattan Beach is not an easy target. Because right now, I think we look silly and a lot of towns look silly and, in LA County, obviously, but we have to do better and send a very strong message. let's make them as uncomfortable as legally possible. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Heather.

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no additional request.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so we're going to close public comments.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Your honor, I just want to ask Director Mirzakhani, to come expand her statement. Obviously, was so confused with three things, and I'll wait for you to get down here. Could you explain go over just a little more detail about, number one, are the appeal process, how it works what on our end. Second question. I'll wait. I'll go one

at a time about that appeal process for the, communications tower we're hearing about.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANI: Sure. As soon as the decision is made, the app the residents will now have two weeks to file an appeal, and that appeal has to be filed electronically through our customer service self-service portal. And the hearing will be held by a, conducted by a third-party independent hearing officer. The hearing officer's decision will be final. And the reason there's confusion about the cost of the appeal is because there's no set fee for it. It's based on however many hours it takes the hearing officer to prepare to hold the hearing and then to make a decision and issue a decision letter. So, what we'll do is we'll take in what we feel is a reasonable deposit based on what other types of hearings in the city, how long other types of hearings tend to take, and then we'll refund whatever is not used.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Follow up question of that, and that's going to be the fee waiver. I'll talk to City Attorney about that. Second process. City control versus federal law. Can you explain that people don't understand the difference?

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANI: Yes. These types of facilities are what is known as a small-cell facility, and the city went through a major code amendment to

title 13 back in 2019, essentially to address all of the changes in federal law related to small-cell facilities. And these federal changes took away a lot of the local control, the opportunity for local control. We can have less stringent requirements, but we can have we cannot have more stringent requirements for these types of facilities in our local ordinance. And so, in that sense, we are bound by the federal regulations, and that that's what we're required to follow.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: One more follow up. We were here in 2019. I'm trying to explain the difference in the 200-foot rule from schools. Why is the four houses from the school, is it outside 200 feet? Is that why we lose the control? The buffer.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANIAN: This part. This particular location is outside it's just outside the 200 feet.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: This is why. All right.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANIAN: However, there's a possibility that, there's a possibility that even without that 200 feet, it would still, the 200 feet would still not apply to this particular project.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Understood.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANIAN: Because of the design.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you. One last question Attorney Barrow, Quinn. City Council of a right to waive the appeal? One comes in, it satisfies the appeal process. Does the council have the right to waive that appeal fee?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: In the past for other type of permits, like conditional use permits. The city people have asked the city, they've sent a letter to the City Council to waive those fees. So, it's within your discretion to do that upon request or this type of fee.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Once she receives an appeal, we can jump in behind it.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Probably yeah, I mean, that was the practice in many cities, including Manhattan Beach, for use permits. It's always been an upon request.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Perfect. Thank you. Thank you, your honor. No more questions.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: No more questions. Thank you, Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Bear similar questions and comments based on what Councilmember Montgomery just indicated with regard to those who spoke about the antenna sites. I wanted to follow up with the City Attorney. We are governed by federal

law. I mean it, comes across like we're not listening to the residents, but can you just give a summary on what our rights are as a city, what our abilities are what our discretion is, as opposed to the federal law that basically you serve our ability to regulate these?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: It's very limited. I mean, we talk often about the state preempting local control, but it's worse with the federal SEC. I mean they've basically have decided, for whatever reason that all the gaps need to be filled, and you know that was an important concept. And this is a co-location. I understand staff has been doing some research to find out the prior approvals, but when it's already there it's the city's powers is severely restricted.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you. It's part of our challenge.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Can we also clarify why it's going there rather than on a commercial corridor like Manhattan Beach Boulevard or Sepulveda? What are they base that?

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANI: I don't want to speak on behalf of Verizon, who this happens to be, but typically what they do is they check to see where they have gaps in service, and then they also have to check to see where are they allowed to put these facilities. So, it's almost like a

puzzle. Where do they have a gap in service, and where can they put this facility to address that gap in service?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: They have a map that shows that.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANI: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: In their application?

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR MIRZAKHANI: Correct. I can confirm with staff.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so public comments is closed, and we move on to the consent calendar. So, I have a motion to accept.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: So moved.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, we have a motion to accept by Councilmember Lesser and seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Howorth.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion Passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Great. Thank you. And we move on to public hearings. So, we're going to conduct a public hearing regarding the proposed five-year capital improvement plan and consideration of a resolution for fiscal year 2024-2025 through fiscal year 2028-2029. Public works director Lee.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Before Director Lee, gets started, I just want to publicly thank Erick, Katie, and the engineering staff for the hard work that went into this. It's obviously a month-long process. There's a lot of work that goes into

identifying the projects, the costs and so on. So, hats off to Erick and the engineering staff for that.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you.

PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR LEE: Thank you. Well, good evening, honorable Mayor, and members of City Council Erick Lee, your public works director. Tonight, the public works department is pleased to present the proposed five-year capital improvement plan update for your consideration, and city engineer Katie Doherty will be given the presentation. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you.

CITY ENGINEER DOHERTY: Good evening, Mayor Franklin, honorable Councilmembers, Katie Doherty your City Engineer. I will be giving a brief presentation, recapping our discussions so far on the five-year CIP and in hopes of adopting it tonight. But of course, I'm here for questions and can make any revisions as needed, So, a brief timeline to recap where we've been on April 24th, we presented the draft CIP to the Planning Commission for confirmation that it conforms with the city's general plan which they found that it did. April 25th, we presented the draft CIP to the parking and public improvements Commission. On May 14th, we discussed it here at a City Council meeting. The five-year CIP proposes 94 projects over five years at a total of about 177 million. On April, excuse me on May 21st, there was an additional opportunity for City Council to discuss the five-year

CIP. And here we are tonight on June 4th for final adoption. Quick snapshot of the five-year CIP. There's just about 81 million in previously appropriated funds this year. We are asking for 32.9 million for this coming fiscal year. And I'll stop there just to note a quick item from the last time we discussed this. On May 21st, there was a request that we include a capital improvement project to do some sidewalk improvements at 33rd, west of Sepulveda and this was a result of the Oak Avenue Manhattan Village shopping center. Neighborhood traffic management plan. We staff is proposing to include that project as the next cycle of the annual concrete annual citywide concrete repairs project. So, that will be right now, we're in the middle of cycle 2, cycle 3 can include funds for that project. So, there were no changes to the project list specifically. But staff is recommending that we include that in the annual concrete repairs program which is in the gas tax fund. And with that change, we are also recommending that previously the open neighborhood traffic calming project, which is partially funded by the Manhattan Village Mall, we were recommending that be, moved to the new grants fund. Now that we have plans to spend it this next fiscal year, we're recommending keeping it where it is, which is the CIP fund. So, that you'll see that that project has moved from the new grants fund that's being proposed back to the CIP fund, which is where it has

previously been shown. And the last minor change that I wanted to highlight was that the HSIP cycle 11 improvement intersection improvements project. Excuse me. Was previously shown to have revenues ten thousand dollars higher. That it doesn't accurately reflect the revenues that we're projecting. So, it's been reduced by ten thousand dollars. Excuse me. Ten thousand dollars so the new total for the projects is 176 million nine hundred sixty-eight thousand and change. So those are the only changes that have been made since the last time you saw the CIP. Okay, so just a quick recap. of the nine categories of the CIP. We have the water sewer and storm drain funds. Those are our enterprise funds that are paid entirely by user fees. We have a street light and landscape fund parking fund state pier and lot fund. We have our streets, sidewalks and right away fund, our CIP projects. And lastly, the new fund that we've introduced this year, which is called the Grants Funds. So, tonight, staff is recommending that City Council conduct a public hearing and adopt resolution 24-0066, approving the five-year capital improvement program for fiscal years 25 through 29. And I'm here for any questions that you may have. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Colleagues, Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I have a minor question it would be on page 177 of the staff report. It's regarding the Sports Court at Marine Avenue Park. Pay and play. It's basically the

demolition of the existing pay and play facility. But then it goes on, as we've discussed at prior CIP meetings and says, and installation of a futebol court. Once again, can you confirm what plans we've even discussed for that facility and what the status is? And can we eliminate at this point, the designation of this is a foot, fouts all, futebol court when we haven't even given that direction?

CITY ENGINEER DOHERTY: The answer to the second part of that question is absolutely yes, we can revise that description to remove that language if you'd like a status from Director Leyman, I can ask him to come up come up but my understanding is that this item will come back to you before any final decisions are.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I think that's so point of trying to make thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Any other questions okay we'll open it up for public comment yeah thank you. Seeing none, in the chambers how about online?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There are no requests on zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay so comments colleagues a motion.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Okay, here, I'll make a comment, though I'm trying not to with this cough. But your honor, I said it the last time we met, and I will say it again.

This is less a CIP, a capital improvement program for five years, than it is just a wish list. If we want to make it into an actual CIP instead of a wish list, we're going to need to have a continuous stream of revenue to do that. The only way I see might be appetizing enough to the public is if it's shared by the visitors who come here as well. So that would mean an increase in the sales tax from nine and a half to ten percent to create an ongoing revenue stream of five and a half million dollars a year that we can put through an advisory vote to CIP so that we can actually accomplish these things and not just add to the list year after year after year. This list was, I don't know, 35-36 million when I started on council years ago, and that's 177 million now. Why? Because we haven't been able to do a lot of the projects because we don't have the money to do them. We have to do them one by one. We have to issue bonds, we incur debt, and it takes a long time to do that. You know, people want outdoor dining, they want a pool, they want parking structures. The money has to come from somewhere, and we don't have it on a year-to-year basis through the general fund, through our sales tax, through our property tax. It's not enough. It's not going to happen. So, someone, especially this council, is going to have to step up at some point and say, "Okay folks, if you want to do it, we got to pay for it," and put it on the ballot to do so. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, Thank you. Mayor Pro Tem Howorth.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Well, I just want to say well said. You know, I'm making a motion to approve and adopt Resolution Number 24-0066, which is our five-year capital improvement program. I appreciate my colleagues saying this is a wish list; however, it is a well-thought-out plan. There is a plan to do what we can, and that is what our public works department works very hard to try and do. I'm grateful to have that. I do think that it's been gratifying to see certain projects come to fruition, whether it's the Peck Reservoir or the fire station—all these things that we actually voted on in maybe 2014 or so when we were on council before—and to see them finally get done. It's also gratifying to see, after the lean years of 2008-2009 when we had to really pull back and try to build up our reserves again, that we're able to put something towards our capital improvements. But it really is incumbent on us to do something to guarantee some sort of revenue stream for facilities and infrastructure. So, well said, and I made a motion to approve.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: And I seconded the motion and will be echoing my colleagues. I appreciate the hard work of our staff in prioritizing the most fundamental infrastructure-

oriented projects that we need to keep our city running. I think they've chosen well with the resources that we have, but I also echo Councilmember Napolitano's comments. To the extent that we want to keep up with the ordinary wear and tear, let alone the aspirational objectives for our community to have the sort of facilities that we all would expect, we're going to need a greater revenue stream. We just can't do it with what we have at present and we'll need to make our case. Certainly, a viable method of doing so in other cities that we should consider would be an increase of our sales tax because if we don't raise our sales tax, we won't be able to keep the revenue here in projects in our community. I believe we are close to the cap, if not at the cap, that the county can assess for county-wide projects. That would be one reason to consider and explore sales tax with a focus on keeping up our own infrastructure here in our community. So, I'm pleased to second the motion, Mayor Pro Tem Howorth.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you. Your Honor, this is déjà vu all over again for me. Most of us were here in 2008. Twenty years ago, we're still talking about some of this. I think Gill was here, Greta Schelling was here, Mark, Bruce, Liza. I'll tell you what, I would say three things, looking at this from the outside for the first time. Look at the majority

of the charges of that 177; it's not the glamorous, sexy project, folks. 48 million for street sidewalks and other right-of-way, 26 million for sewer projects, 27 million for water, 36 million for storm drain. What here gets you excited? It's like public works, guys. I know you guys, anybody else wouldn't get excited about these. So, these aren't new parks for Parks and Rec, not new fire stations, not another Metlox, not another water treatment plants. This is just the basics. We have there, that's basic money. Councilmember Napolitano got it right, it's like, hey, if you have a choice, if you don't raise our sales tax half a cent or a cent, the county will, and they'll get that money, folks, not us. They're going to get it themselves; we get nothing out of it. So, I think, with urgency, as colleagues, that we consider that half cent or at least a full cent. That money is local, stays local, and pays for all this. Otherwise, 20 years from now, when you guys are here, Mayor Pro Tem Howorth is mayor 20 years from now, she'll be talking about these very same items all over again. So, I support it. It's about time we do it, but we need help. Thank you, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, I echo what everybody has just said here on the dais. It's, uh, just like your home, right? You have the budget. You might need a new roof, you might need, uh, concrete work, you know, new concrete steps. You might need a new heater, you know, you might need, you know. So, just

like you have these budgets and priority lists, you know, at home, we have to have it for the city. And we also have great expectations in this city for a high level of service. We all pay a lot of money for our homes and, so we want, you know, commensurate services, here, and we expect that. So, the, sales tax. Nobody likes to hear it. Nobody likes to hear about it. And the fact that it's going, one thing, we don't have hard numbers on it, but sales tax is at least, partially, I think, a significant, amount paid by visitors. You know, they're coming here, this is a destination, they're driving on our streets, they're staying in our garages, you know, parking in our garages, they're roaming around the streets looking for parking in the garages. So, that's all wear and tear. But, when they go ahead and buy a meal, buy other items in our stores and things like that, they're at least contributing, you know, to the solution. So, I support that as well. So, we have a motion to accept by Mayor Pro Tem Amy Howorth and seconded by Councilmember David Lesser. So, can we have a vote, please?

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, how we doing? Doing okay?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Great. For me.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So now we're going to, move on to the other side of the budget. We'll conduct a public hearing and

consider resolutions adopting the fiscal year 2024-25 operating budget. So, Finance Director Charelian?

CITY MANAGER MOE: Before Finance Director Charelian steps up and presents the budget, I do want to recognize Steve. Steve has announced his retirement from the city.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: No.

CITY MANAGER MOE: It's hard to believe. Steve has been a fixture here for 35 years.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What?

CITY MANAGER MOE: His entire career has been with the finance department. He started in revenue services, as basically an account clerk and worked his way up to finance director. I appointed him to that position six years ago. Steve's been instrumental in so many of the things we've done over the past six years and even before that, but namely, you talk about some of the debt that we've issued, Steve has made sure we've maintained our AAA credit rating with the rating agencies. We've issued pension obligation bonds. He's helped build policies that help fund some of our CIP projects in the future. He's been involved with the transient occupancy tax election back in 2019. He worked really hard on that, and again, the AAA and so many other things that I could go on and on about Steve, but again, he's been just a tremendous asset to the city. He's going to

retire and enjoy the good life, still live here in town. So maybe one day he'll be sitting in one of your chairs up there.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Oh good. Payback.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yeah.

CITY MANAGER MOE: With that, I want to congratulate Steve. Obviously, I won't be here as well to enjoy seeing Steve on the council perhaps, but I've enjoyed working with him all these years, and you know, he's been team finance all along. He brings great energy and enthusiasm to everything that he does, and the one thing I will say about Steve is that he's kind of like that song, "Put me in, coach, I'm ready to play," and it didn't matter how much is on Steve's plate, he would always come to me and say, "How can I help you?" and that was true with the TOT, the pension obligation bonds, any of those projects. You know, Steve was the first one to step up and say, "I know I got a lot of shrimps on my Barbie," as he would always say, but he was, uh, he was always willing to take on additional. So, with that, I do want to publicly thank Steve for that, and of course, we'll have time to have going away recognition for him. Steve's last day with the city will be July 5th. But with all that, I do want to thank Steve, Libby, and Julie and Marcello and the finance staff for putting together the budget that's before you this evening for adoption. And it's all of their hard work and dedication that it shows in this plan, and I'm sure he'll be

happy to answer any questions at the end of the presentation.
So, thank you, Steve.

FINANCE DIRECTOR CHARELIAN: Wow. Can only go downhill from here. Thank you. Bruce is always a Maestro with his words I appreciate that very much Bruce. Our careers class of 89 we're two months behind each other. I think you started in May and I was in July 5th. So, yeah, so kind of had that career path together and grew together and learned and everything together but just a few words. My 35-year tenure has been filled with wonderful professional opportunities I really want to express my gratitude to Bruce for entrusting me with the role of finance director for nearly the last six years. Together, we achieve significant milestones of fortifying the city's financial framework. Throughout my career, I've had the privilege of collaborating with extraordinary individuals, and our current executive leadership team undoubtedly shines among them. My sincere appreciation goes out to every department for the opportunity to collaborate with you. And lastly, I extend my thanks to City Council for your leadership in navigating competing financial priorities and making prudent decisions. And there will be a celebration.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Who's paying?

FINANCE DIRECTOR CHARELIAN: All right, onto the budget this is our public hearing tonight for our fiscal year 24-25

budget. This is a long-term process. It takes about six months. We kick it off internally in December and we have a community meeting in February. Budget study sessions we have the proposed budget and another opportunity, a couple of our opportunities in May to talk about the spending plan for 2025. And it all leads to tonight, which is the public hearing for the adoption of the spending plan for 2025 and again Appropriation limit. So tonight, serves as the public hearing for the fiscal year 25 operating budget. The proposed operating budget will give a brief overview. There'll be changes to the proposed operate. Any changes to the proposed operating budget is in exhibit A and none of those items have fiscal implications. Resolutions for adoption with 2025 operating budget as well as again appropriation limit. Our fiscal outlook, our spending plan and for City Council priorities of public safety and maintaining essential services are intact revenues are stable and growing in key areas. Balanced budget with a surplus of \$508,000 in the general fund and the city's AAA credit rating reaffirmed back in 2021 when we issued pension obligation bonds. Overall, the financial position allows us to reinvest in services service levels, maintenance and infrastructure corresponding's with course community priorities, as well as City Council priorities. Our personnel costs include MOU adjustments, the full impact of positions that we approved in the mid-year and February, and

four new full-time positions that are included in this year's budget. Our general fund reserves. We have about \$29.1 million and three buckets. Our policy reserves are 20% of expenditures with 19.5 million. The economic uncertainty is 4million, and our unreserved is 5.6 million. We have some transfers this year, transfers out to the CIP fund for \$1 million and then the Street Lighting Landscaping fund which is about 313,000. We're also utilizing some savings from doing those pension obligation bonds for unfunded liability pension policy, with the CIP getting another one point close to \$1.2 million and then the Section 115 trust for about \$1.8 million. There we have strong revenues in the general fund in a balanced budget, again, a surplus of \$508,000 with services being maintained. Our significant addition additions and initiatives include a vehicle replacement with fire engine for \$2 million, capital improvement projects supported by that \$1 million transfer and Police SWAT Rescue Vehicle, which we're calling Bruce's bear cat, and contract services, including the CPI adjustment enhancements. Our recommendations for tonight, is to conduct the public hearing and adopt Resolution 2467, adopting the fiscal year 2425 operating budget as proposed and amended in exhibit A, and adopt Resolution 2468, establishing the Gann appropriation limit for 2425, which shows still an availability spending limit of about 30%. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Any questions? Colleagues? We'll open up the floor to public comments. How about on Zoom?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on Zoom.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: There you go.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Your honor. I would move to adopt Resolution number 24-0066. Do we need to do this in two separate ones? What was the other one?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: 24 - -

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: 24-0068.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: - -68.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: You could do both at the same time.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Okay. That would be for both.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: 67 68 68 again.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right. Okay, so we have a motion to accept by Councilmember Steven Napolitano. Seconded by me so can we have a I'm sorry. We have a comment by just I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: One day the next council one of zero people show up, talk about the budget, not about dog parks or anything else. We talk about the budget and they once again. I'm not surprised no one else is here. An election year that someone actually show up it's a candidate they'll show up

at this event, talk about the budget. Not one of them showed up. Not a one disappointing but not surprising, but the budget's good. I'm great people Steve we're going to miss you but you haven't left yet thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. Mayor Pro Tem?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yes, well and it is as your last budget Councilmember Montgomery. No, I mean it should be your last budget so I fully expect you to return as a resident.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: So, you'll be coming down and speaking on the budget.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Absolutely. I hope so.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: (Inaudible) with his glass of Chardonnay.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I love it

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay so can we have a vote please?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: It, oh there we go.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: There we go. Thank you.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay so we move on to general business item number 11 consideration of awarding a RFP number 1319-24 with western audio-visual security for audio video and broadcast casting services.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yes, and IT Director Miguel Guardado will be making a presentation he's remote with us this evening he's under the weather but he's online as well as the requested supplier that we've selected here to answer any questions so Miguel, please proceed.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay so we will test the equipment.

CITY MANAGER MOE: And replace it.

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Good evening, honorable Mayor Franklin and members of the City Council. Miguel Guardado, your Information Technology Director. This evening, I'm joined by Liza Tamura, our City Clerk, and Tatyana Peltekova, our IT Senior Management Analyst. We're here to discuss the consideration of RFP number 1319-24 and adopting that resolution for an agreement with Western Audio Visual. It's no surprise that the existing system is a little outdated, as some of the issues we've had since I've been here. I just wanted to talk a little bit about those items that are affecting the quality and reliability of our broadcast. The current limitations of our system primarily include poor audio clarity, outdated video equipment, and unsupported audio control software in our back room, which makes broadcasting our meetings very challenging not only for city staff but also for our contractor. The last upgrade of this system was done in 2014; however, it did not include the audio system, which was done even earlier

than 2014. Best practices in this field recommend that equipment be refreshed every four to seven years. As technologies progress and get better, we should keep our hardware the same. But right now, we're stretching some of our equipment to the 10-year mark and actually some of it even longer, again making it a challenge for us to have reliable meetings. We've run across some compatibility issues with modern technologies as well, and maintaining the system as it is increases the risk of failure and our inability to be able to broadcast our meetings to our citizens. A little bit about what's in the scope of this work and the benefits to the city: the project aims to replace all the old audio, video, and broadcasting equipment, enhancing the AV and broadcast experience for the public and our staff. The scope includes the update of three systems: audio, video presentation, and broadcast, which is the live recording and streaming of our meetings and also the on-air channel playback. This is what we shoot out to Frontier and to Spectrum. The project will also do some modifications to the dais as we put new equipment in. We're looking at some modifications to bring in the new equipment, but it should be transparent to you all as you sit in your positions. A little bit of background on our process: the city released an RFP in early February, and the City received two proposals—one from Western Audio Visual and Security, which came in at \$647,846, and one from Web Ink, a

company based out of Camarillo, which came in at a million \$52.149. Western was selected for their comprehensive understanding of our project, the experience, and the qualified team they are bringing forward to this project. Overall, it's a better value for the city in the long run as we have had an established relationship with them. Western AV has done similar projects with other municipalities and special districts such as the City of Cerritos, the City of Ventura and also a special district in San Diego, the Altai Water District, and many other projects throughout our region. A detailed breakdown of the total cost of this project is \$791,884. The breakdown is as follows: \$688,914 is for the equipment, software, labor, training, and all the stuff that's gonna happen on the backend the gutting of the systems, cleaning out all cabling, and just making it a new environment that is easy to troubleshoot and maintain. We're also including four years of extended maintenance at \$68,524. This will a system that will be solely maintained for the next five years, as the first year is included in the base price. And then in addition, the \$791,884 carries 5% contingency for any unexpected findings as we gut the room and start tearing into the walls and running new cables and things of that nature. So we wanted to carry \$34,446 for that. Sufficient funding is available in our PEG restricted accounts. We have approximately \$892,570. These funds are derived from the

cable subscribers to both Charter Spectrum and Frontier. As a reminder, that's our Spectrum channel number 8 and Frontier channel 35. These funds can be used for projects like this that support PEG projects and purchases. If this proposed project were to be approved, there will be a remaining PEG balance of \$100,686. And I will add that any unused funds from the project after completion will be returned to these PEG accounts. These upgrades are important and they do cause an impact. And what we are doing, if this agreement were to be approved, we are scheduled to begin working on the actual physical demolition and building of this system on July 17th, that's actually after our second meeting in July. We have an aggressive schedule but have met with the consultant and we will be done by August 30th. So our goal is to have our first meeting in September back in the council chambers. Your IT department and the City Clerk, we completely understand the importance of public meetings such as council and commission meetings. We have worked with our commission liaisons to identify their needs during this upgrade period. We've coordinated with them to identify those meetings and then we coordinated with Western AV to ensure continuity of operations for council meetings and commission meetings during this construction time. At this point, we are considering the Police and Fire Conference Room as our temporary alternative to the council chamber. Of course, with any changes like this, we

need to communicate this out to our citizens, so we'll be working closely with our communications team to publicize the council and commission meeting relocations for the month of August. Again, I'm here before you requesting that we award RFP number 1319-24 and approve the agreement with Western AV. In closing, I do have Mr. Darren Dorschel, the city consultant who helped with the development of the RFP, and Haley Shelling and Eric Wilson from Western AV, are on the call. We're here to answer any questions you might have. Thank you for your time and consideration, and I'm open to any questions you might have.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, colleagues, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I have one.

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you. Director Guardado, it's David.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah, I was going to say Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Can you just briefly describe how Zoom will be better integrated into the system that we currently have?

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Yeah, so, again, I touched a little bit about the newer technologies, and this is one where we brought in Zoom to a system that was not inherently open to taking these types of feeds, but we made it

work. What we're doing in this redesign is that the system that we're bringing in is going to have all the capabilities to be able to work with Zoom and any other broadcast stream that we might want to provide.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: That's fine for now, Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, and I have a question. How long did it take to get that fund up to \$892,000?

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Yeah, that's a great question, and we did do some analysis on that. But we went back five years, so the average growth between 2019 and 2024 till now has been about \$580,180 for what we call Time Warner or Charter or Spectrum now, and then Verizon has been about \$9,197. So, we did a little bit of analysis here. If we were to continue at our current growth for the next 10 years, we would potentially see a growth of, in 2023, we would see a growth of \$673,148 if we were to continue 10 years at the numbers that they are today. We have seen fluctuations in the money that is being brought in because of the subscribership, and you know, the pandemic had a lot to do with that because everybody was mainly not watching TV but streaming. So, you cancel those subscriptions and maybe do Netflix or some of the other services. But in talking to our consultant, we are seeing an uptick, or there has been an uptick over the last couple of years, and it's due to live sports. Live sports don't stream on

those types of services, so you need to have a subscription to Spectrum or Verizon or Time Warner to be able to get those channels, to be able to get all that. So, we are seeing an uptick on that.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, and how many, what other uses are of these funds? I mean, are they used for anything else?

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Yeah, so - -

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I just don't want to leave it empty when some other need comes up.

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Yeah, great question. And you know what, I'm actually going to dial a friend. I'm going to dial Liza who's on the call, but I do believe that the city made a concerted effort to use these funds only for public meetings and things of that nature. And I think that that was passed through a resolution. But Liza, can you help me with that question?

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Yeah, that is confirmed, but as far as what other uses could be used, that I don't know.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, well, obviously we haven't used them, so that's great. Thank you. So, open it for any other questions, open it for public comments. Come on, don't disappoint, Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Exactly.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Just ask one. No, that's okay. Seeing none in chambers, how about online?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, we're going to close public comments. Any other comments or well, we've got a motion by Councilmember Montgomery and seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Amy Howorth.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: And I just have a comment, a quick comment.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Oh, I'm sorry.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Mr. Mayor. That's fine. I mean, this is so needed. Technology has been changing at a quick clip, and this will just improve our ability to communicate to the residents. You know, and hopefully, we will get far less emails and texts during the meetings themselves that say, "I can't access the meeting." It's, you know, what's going on. It's a real problem. I mean, we want what we are doing to be seen and heard by the public. So, thank you, Director Guardado. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great.

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Thank you so much. Thank you for your support.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so - -

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Let me restate the motion, Your Honor? I'll say the motion.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So, my move to award RFP number 1319-24, adopt the resolution approving the agreement with Western Audio-Visual Security for audio, video, and broadcasting services for a not-to-exceed amount of \$791,884, and the PEG restricted funds. Everybody understands that restricted funds part of it. And also, add that, folks, for 10 years, we've been using duct tape and patches. As Mayor Pro Tem knows, residents are unhappy, especially seniors, when you cut out the feed. We may not see it up here, but we hear about it personally by text or by call or by emails. And let's put it in perspective, folks. This came out when the iPhone 6 was out in 2014. We're on iPhone 15 now. Think about that. iPhone 6, iPhone 15. So, we're upgrading, iPhone 15. So, Miguel, you get a brand-new shiny iPhone 15, and it's all yours. That's my motion.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right.

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR GUARDADO: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And it was seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Howorth.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Terrific. AB1234 reports? City Manager, or anybody? Colleagues? No? Not about future agenda items.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: David had one.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I have one.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: So, may I ask the City Clerk to show two images in connection with the request for just a second vote on an item related to rear yard setback requirements. Namely, it's an issue that we as a city have control over. It's not something that's served by state housing law. Some residents asked me to show what was happening in their backyard. I went over to see it. Essentially, a rear yard structure is going up on the lot line. There's no setback whatsoever. Can you show the next image? This is the backyard, and literally, it's being built on top of what was a wall. So, I'd like to talk about it and what we might be able to do in our-

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I'll second that. I'll give you another.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you for that. That's it.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Now, you're bringing it up. There's a house behind my mom's that's doing the exact same thing. The garage is back right on the lot line.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Is it an ADU?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: It's a garage.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Wow.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: It's been there since the 80s.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Here's a question. I don't know where your, City Attorney, can we, could council even ask for a, along the lines of your voluntary registration that the chief brought up, please? Could we consider a voluntary long registration, something on the helmet that says a numbering that says, "Hey, I'm number one, voluntary registration," on those e-bikes and their parents and to give voluntary consent that we could not only register but imagine helmets have a number on it tied to it as well, voluntary. No one's making you do it, but if your parents give you a letter that says I consent, it's voluntary registration. Why not register the helmets as well, so we all know.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yeah, we could probably do that. I mean, because it's completely voluntary.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: And that's my-

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I'll second that or just any bring back voluntary registration options.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yes, entirely, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And then I have a future agenda item, please. So, it has to do with Uncle Bill's Pancake House, who has been asking for a revised CUP with the same number of hours. They only now, right now, they have the patio in the existing CUP from many, many decades ago. It's from 7 a.m. They want to change it to 9 a.m. They just simply want to change that to 7 a.m. and then close at 3 p.m. versus 5 p.m. And I would like, in honor of their contributions to the City of Manhattan Beach, they are an icon. People come here, unlike shark art on the wall, they come here to have breakfast or lunch at- -

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: They could have both.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And they could have both.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: No reason.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Anyway. Financially, and so I would like to see us have Council waive the \$6,000 registration fee or \$6,000 fee for the change of the CUP and also waive there's been like \$7,000 in fines as a result of this, and finally put this matter to rest. And that they have been in operation for 63 years or 78 years, depending upon what. And I know, so I'm just looking for a second to further discuss this.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: So, wait, so you're saying they want to now open it, they want to have the patio, the outside dining open at 7 a.m.? Okay, just clarifying.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Why is that a CUP issue as opposed to the encroachment issue?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: That's where I was going?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Encroachment.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: It's just the encroachment was the patio usage.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: City Attorney Barrow's going to answer that.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: I was going to say, since it's not on the agenda, if you want to report from the staff about why it's a use permit. As it's, it's a condition on the use permit.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: If there's no second, I'll second. If there's a second I'll be a third.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Okay. So, there's two. That's all you need for now. So, we'll give you a report.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you. City Manager report.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yes, I'd like to close the loop on something Council discussed at the last meeting. That was, namely, the declaring the vacancy of Alan Kirschenbaum's seat on the PPIC. Upon further review, it appears as though there was not a correct accounting of his absences, and he did not reach that four absentee level. So, he continues to serve on the PPIC, and we're also continuing to take a look at the Municipal Code

and any changes that may be necessary for that. But I just wanted to close the loop.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you. Informational items? Seeing none. So, we will adjourn to 6 o'clock on the 11th, June 11th?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: 12?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: No, no.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: 18th.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: 18th, sorry.

MAYOR PRO TEM: Right.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah, that would cut short a lot of things.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I'm not going to have a closed session?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Right. June 18th at 6 p.m. Thank you very much.