

ROUGHLY EDITED COPY

**MANHATTAN BEACH
CITY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING
REMOTE BROADCAST CAPTIONING
TUESDAY, JANUARY 16, 2024**

* * * * *

This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

* * * * *

CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
CITY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, JANUARY 16, 2024

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Alright. Good evening. We need to, we were just in closed sessions, so we got to reconvene into open session and CITY ATTORNEY BARROW Barrow, you have an announcement?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW BARROW: Thank you, Mayor. Pursuant to the Brown Act, the City Council in a closed session at 5:30 this afternoon. The City Council gave direction to the CITY ATTORNEY BARROW. There was no other reportable action taken.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. So, we're going to adjourn from the close session and, welcome to the City Council regular meeting, Tuesday, January 16th. We are going to call the meeting to order, and we have some great guests to do the pledge to the flag. We have, Annie Efthimiou, Katie Efthimiou, her sister, and we have their friends, Audrey West and Emily West. If you ladies could come up here. Yes. Alright. So, you can just come right along here. And there's your flag. So go ahead and well, here. Emily, you stand there. Okay. Katie, right here. Annie and Audrey. Okay. And we'll go ahead and go ahead and start.

GROUP: I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation, under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: That was great. Thank you so much. So let me just ask you a couple of questions. So, Emily, how old are you?

EMILY: 9.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Hello? Can you hear that alright? Can you hear that alright? No.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, Emily. How old are you?

EMILY: 9.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, and which school do you go to?

EMILY: Chadwick.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Great, and, Katie, how are you doing?

KATIE: Good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Alright. And how old how old are you?

KATIE: 8.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: K, and what school do you go to?

KATIE: AMS.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: AMS. Is that American Martyrs?

KATIE: Yeah.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Wonderful. And, Annie, how old are you?

ANNIE: I'm 13. I go to American Martyrs.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: K. And Audrey, how about you?

AUDREY: I am 12, and I go to Chadwick school.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Terrific. Well, it's no secret they're here today for one of my first meetings because these young ladies live on Pine Avenue where we all live. And, we have pretty much all have a pretty good time on Pine Avenue, don't we? With block parties, and birthday parties, and just any excuse for a party. So, we've got a couple of things for you here. So, Emily, we've got a commendation, thanking you, certificate of appreciation, and a city pen. And then Katie. Katie, we got one for you too as well and a city pen. And Audrey? There we go. And Annie. Alright. Well, thank you so much. We really appreciate it. You're welcome. Alright. Thank you. Oh, can we take a picture? Oh, oh, sorry. Sorry. We've got pictures. What am I thinking? So come on in. The other Council members will join us. Alright. We'll get that back to the parents. And mom Maggie? And Robin right there as well. Anybody else? Okay. Oh, and then, yeah. I guess you should just stay there. No. Because we have to do the general public now. So well, actually, yeah. The other thing we'd like to do is we'd like to acknowledge if there's any, military veterans in the audience joining us tonight, or families of military veterans? If you could go ahead and stand so we can properly acknowledge you. Yes. Thank you all. Thank you all for your service and your

family sacrifice as well. And we're going to move on to, well, roll call. So, I don't know if you want to, Okay.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro-Tem?

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: present.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Here. K. Thank you for that. And so, we're going to move on to the ceremonial calendar. And this evening, we have a presentation of certificate of commendation recognizing the retirement of K9 Koa and K9 handler, officer

David Gibbons, for his years of dedicated service. And here we go. Look at Koa, oh, terrific. Oh, cool. And we're also going to be introducing the new Manhattan Beach police department, K9, Troy, and K9 handler, officer Brian Cobian. How you doing?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Great. Fine.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Koa, how are you? I gotcha. You're finding anything? Alright. Good to see you. Thank you. I love this. You can't go wrong with dogs and kids. Right? You know? So, this is terrific. So, I want to talk a little bit about Troy. Okay? I don't want to step on your tail. So, Dude, do we have anything on Koa? For a commendation? Here you go. Oh, with commendation. Okay. Yeah. Let's start with Koa, for your years of service. So, whereas, myself, Joe Franklin, and the members of the city, of the City Council, wish to commend an honor, Koa, who retired on January 12, 2024, after serving almost 7 years in the city of Manhattan Beach Police Department; and

WHEREAS, Koa was born on May 15, 2015, raised in Germany. Oh, how's the psych Nick I'm sorry, well this. Do we get to see them as they're good. There we go. Well, I guess my German must be pretty good. he was purchased from the Alder Host International LLC and both Koa and its handler, Police Officer

David Gibbons, graduated the basic Police K9 Academy at Alder Host International in Riverside County in March 2017, and then under the guidance of officer Gibbons, Koa quickly became an integral part of the Manhattan Beach Police Department, providing valuable services in the areas of patrol, and narcotics detection. Koa was involved in a 166 deployments for patrol and narcotics detention resulting in 64 arrests, locating and seizing over 2,500 pounds of methamphetamine heroin fentanyl, and no, no, no, it's just a name, it's just a name, and cocaine seizing over \$1,046,000 in related narcotics sales and/or trafficking, and Koa successfully tracked criminal suspects and discovered evidence, conducted building searches with SWAT involvements in Manhattan Beach and throughout Los Angeles County. Koa has now reached the age when he must put aside his duties and incredible talent in assisting the Manhattan Beach Police Department and enjoy a more relaxed life with his handler, officer Gibbons and family during his retirement years. I don't think he wants to retire. That's great! So, after these many years of service, it is important to take a moment to reflect upon the great contributions of Koa and his handler, officer Gibbons, to the community of Manhattan Beach. We,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the City Council of the city of Manhattan Beach, California, on behalf of its officers, employees, citizens and residents, do hereby commend Koa, for his generosity to the community and the contributions he has made to the city throughout his seven years. Well done. Now, we know he doesn't want, we'll go ahead and we'll do the commendation certificate but okay and we know he's not going to really, you know, enjoy that but he will enjoy the toys that we got him to take him on into his retirement. Well done. All right, you're a good boy. You better tell scooter to watch out, okay? Because Koa was going to be- Alright. We come to Troy, okay. So K9 Troy, a Dutch Shepherd, born in the Netherlands on September 3, 2020. Boasts dual training in both apprehension and firearm detection. He and his partner, K9 Officer Cobian, graduated from Gold Koa K9 Patrol School in June of 2023, and swiftly commenced patrolling the streets of Manhattan Beach on July 4, 2023. That was a busy day I'm sure since their deployment. K9 Troy and officer Cobian have demonstrated exceptional skills through 22 gun searches, conducted throughout the South Bay resulting in 10 impressive successful fines. This exemplary performance, not only highlights the effectiveness of our K9 unit, but also underscores our officers' dedication and professionalism and ensuring our community safety and security. Their contributions are integral to the continued success of the

Manhattan Beach Police Department. So welcome aboard Troy. Troy, we really appreciate it and thank you to you as well. Some more pictures, colleagues. Oh, you've separated us, they don't. Oh yeah, I'm sorry. So, if you could just take a moment here and we're going to listen to the end of watch broadcast for Koa. Always a set.

SOUTH BAY RCC: So, they're all method units. Today, we are a different world's mature hero in the community. We celebrate retirement of a remarkable police dog who has served with unwavering dedication and commitment join us in paying tribute to Koa the four-legged officer, who had left an unforgettable mark on the streets of Manhattan Beach and throughout the county of Los Angeles. Koa's journey began in May 15 of 2015 in Germany. Raised there until March of 2017. Koa's destiny took a turn. He was purchased and underwent basic patrol training at Adelhorst K9 in Riverside. Little did he know, he was about to embark on a career filled with bravery achievements and a lasting impact on our community. In 2017, Koa was partnered with his K9 handler K9 officer David Gibbons together they formed an unbreakable bond and a part on an outstanding career with 166 deployments for patrol and narcotics. Koa and officer Gibbons became an inseparable force. Tirelessly working to keep our streets safe. Throughout their career, Koa and

officer Gibbons, demonstrated exceptional skills and determination. They completed their duties with an impressive record of 64 arrests, seizing over 2,500 pounds of methamphetamine, heroin, fentanyl, and cocaine. A total of \$1,046,714 related to narcotic sales and trafficking was also seized under their tent. Manhattan Beach 2k1, your partner, Manhattan Beach, K-9, Koa badge number 10 has reached end of watch on January 12, 2024. Koa, thank you for your unwavering service and dedication to the city and community of Manhattan Beach.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I just want to make an announcement about the Manhattan Beach Police Department K9 Foundation. So, this is a foundation that will help Koa in his retirement and the host family for our retired K9 so it's the K9 Foundation, and they sponsor every year a great car-show sometime during the end of September, and it takes place in downtown. So come by and support that and then you're going to be supporting dogs like Koa and his wonderful handler family. Thank you. He probably thought it was a weapon.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay and now it's continuing the ceremonial calendar. We have the presentation of the 2023 recognition Awards for long-standing local businesses. So, we're

going to start with businesses that have been here for 20 plus years. So, if I want to call out the business name, oh I'm sorry, Steve Charelian, the Finance Director, is going to do this.

FINANCE DIRECTOR CHARELIAN: Thank you, your honor. Really, I'm just going to a quick presentation and I'll just so. Tonight, we recognize awards for long-standing Local Business for the year 2023, and I'm going to turn it over to Emy-Rose Hanna, our revenue supervisor, to walk us, give us a couple of slides on the program, and then we'll turn it over to the presentation of the businesses. We got a packed house. We got a lot of businesses here to recognize. This one of our favorite evenings of the night. So, thank you.

REVENUE SERVICES SUPERVISOR HANNA: Thank you, Steve, for that wonderful introduction. good evening, honorable Mayor Franklin, Mayor Pro Tem Howorth, and members of the City Council, my name is Emy-Rose Hanna, and I have the distinct pleasure of presenting the 2023 Long-standing Local Business Awards. So, each year, we always look forward to this award ceremony since it's our time that, you know, what a favorite time of the year, that we get to celebrate and recognize our local long-standing businesses that have continued to serve our

special community over the last 50 years. Over the years, this program has evolved and has grown to what it is today and we now recognize 8 incremental milestones as illustrated on this slide. Based on these 8 milestones, we are recognizing a total of 144 businesses in total, and with that, we'll dive right into our presentation. As we walk through these 8 milestones to get started, we have our five-year category where we have 52 businesses that have been operating since 2018. And these businesses will be presented with a certificate as illustrated on this slide just to add all of the awards. Within the 5 to 15-year category, will be receiving their awards by mail, and all of the awards in the 20 to 50-year category, will be presented with special plaques. So, with a continuation of our five-year category, this is our largest category. Each year, this goes up to 52 businesses in total. So, we have a second slide, moving forward in our 10-year category, we have 31 businesses total that are being recognized and have been in operation since 2013, and these businesses will be receiving a proclamation for our 15-year category. We have 11 businesses total that have been in operation since 2008, and these businesses will also receive a proclamation. Moving forward, for our 20-year category, we have 15 businesses that have been in operation since 2003, and these businesses will be presented a plaque award. In our 25-year category, we have a total of 11 businesses that have been in

operation and open since 1998, and these businesses too, will be receiving a plaque award. As we move forward with our 30-year category, these businesses will be receiving a larger special bronze plaque award, and there are 9 businesses in total that have been operating since 1993. In our 40-year category, there are 14 businesses that have been in operation since 1983, and these businesses will be presented with a large silver plaque award. And lastly, we have our 50-year category where we have one single business being recognized this year for 50 years of service in the community. Operating open and operating since 1973, and they will be presented with a gold, a large special gold plaque award. So, we commend these businesses for their milestone achievements and at this time I'm happy to turn this over to Mayor Franklin as he'll be presenting the awards to the businesses.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Emy, sorry, I jumped the gun there but if you, when you hear your business name, please come down here with your party. Chilis Grilling Bar for 20 years. Interior Inspirations, North End Cafe. And just you can stand right there. We're going to take a picture. Rudette, I'm sorry, is it Gellish or Jellish, Gellish Rudette, and then the 900 Manhattan LLC. Okay, terrific. Get a picture. Okay, so our next group is for 25 years, and that would be, I believe, our

Hilltop Associates Madigan Properties, our very own Councilmember Lesser, and then Mark Costo, oh sorry, Mark Costopoulos DPM. There we go. I thought I recognized you. And then for 30 years, so we have a Ameci Pizza and Pasta Manhattan Beach, 24 Hours Fitness, Door to Door Valet Cleaners, Laura Maloney State Farm Insurance Agent, OB's Grill and Bar, and Ronald Green DDS. Well, thank you all very much, greatly appreciated. So, 40 years, we have 7/11, Beach Pizza, Congregation Tikvat Jacob, Farmers Insurance, Robert Stephenson accounting, and Journey of Faith Child Enrichment. Is that everybody? Thank you so much. All right, and then drumroll, please. For 50 years, we have The Kettle. Who here has not had a meal at The Kettle? So, you've all had meals at the kettle. A big thank you to all the businesses, truly the foundation of our city. Couldn't do without you. Sorry. Oh, there's one more. There's one more. Are they here? Okay, okay. There's one more coming. Everybody can take a seat. Okay, one more over 30 years. You've heard your kids talk about them. Miracosta kids, you know it. Amigos Tacos. Thank you. Those are up. Okay, already. All set. Okay, so we move on to approval the agenda and waiver of full reading of ordinances. This is the time for the council to notify the public of any change of the agenda. Remove items from the consent calendar for individual consideration or rearrange

the order of the agenda. So, we need a motion to approve the agenda and waive full reading.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Your Honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Anything to pull?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yeah, I'd like to pull number 8.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: And Mr. Mayor, I think there is public interest in item number 10.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Check my notes here for a second. Okay. And I'd like to pull item number 12. We have a motion to accept by Councilmember Montgomery and seconded by Mayor Pro-Tem Amy Howorth. Vote, please. Thank you.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So now we have public comments. The speakers may provide public comments on any matter that is

within the subject matter. I'm so sorry. Jumping ahead here. So, City Council and community organization announcements of upcoming events. One minute per person.

JOSH MURRAY: Hello. Good evening, Mayor, members of the council. I'm Josh Murray. I'm here on behalf of Manhattan Beach Library. on Wednesday, January 24th from 6 to 7 p.m. I'd like to invite members of the community to join us at the library for an enlightening marine mammal talk as the Roundhouse Aquarium Teaching Center explores the challenges facing our local bottlenose dolphins. Learn about natural and human challenges and how you can contribute to citizen science by reporting your own dolphin observations. This program is designed for teens and adults. And everyone is welcome. And I thank you for your time.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you, Josh. Next.

CULTURAL ARTS MANAGER STEWART: Hello, honorable Mayor, members of the City Council. My name is Eilen Stewart. I'm your Cultural Arts Manager, and I would like to take this opportunity to once and once again invite everyone to the opening of our new exhibition return to form. We will be showing the work of four artists who are working particularly in a classical nature and

working with the human form. The opening reception will be this Friday from 5 p.m. to 7 p.m. at the Manhattan Beach Art Center. And as always, we'll have refreshments and beverages. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you so much.

MANAGEMENT ANALYST MATSON: Good evening, Mayor and City Council. I'm Patty Matson, management analyst with the City Manager's Office. We wanted to announce that the city is currently seeking volunteers to assist with the annual homeless count that's taking place on Wednesday, January 24th. The count will be conducted from 8 to 11 p.m. And volunteers will begin by meeting at the Joslyn Community Center to check in and receive a brief orientation. Any interested individuals can sign up by going to ManhattanBeach.gov and selecting the event on the City's calendar under January 24th, or by visiting theycountwillyou.org/Manhattan_Beach. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you, Patricia. Next.

MIRA COSTA STUDENTS: Good evening. We're three of the ASB members from Miracosta High School, and we're just going to present a few upcoming events. And so winter recess began Friday, December 23rd after a very successful week of final

exams. And coming back for the new year, we had many exciting events occurring. We held our first council meeting of the year on January 9th. Tonight, there is a 12th grade parent meeting, and shortly following on the 30th, there is another for 11th grade parents. And for any students looking for additional guidance when applying to colleges, there is a Navigating College Admissions testing and the Digital Era info session from 6 to 7 p.m. on January 31st. And then last week, drama held auditions for the spring musical Footloose. And next week, there will be auditions for the senior roles. We are also excited to see both productions come to life. Continuing on the drama department, there is comedy sports match this Friday, the 19th, as well as Costa karaoke competition at 7 p.m. in the auditorium on the 25th. We've had a very eventful year so far for athletics department. And this week continues on with the trend. We play four games against our rival school, Redondo Union, including both soccer and basketball. And later in the week, we play games against both Palos Verdes and Culver City. We are also excited to announce that our winter sports signing day will be taking place Wednesday, February 7th, during the lunch in the main gym. And invite everyone interested to come show our amazing athletes some support. Finally, winter formal will be held February 10th at the Torrance Marriott from 7 to 11 p.m. and tickets will be going on sale by the end of this week. We are also currently

collecting signups for the second ASB blood drive of the school year, which will be taking place on February 1st in the main gym. The blood drive is an extremely impactful event for so many where only one donation of blood can save up to three lives. For anyone interested, whether adult or student, you can reach out to any ASB student to sign up and for any additional information. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you all. Any other community announcements from the audience? No.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I have one. Oh, I'm sorry. Zoom. Sorry, David Archer.

DAVID ARCHER: Good evening, our Mayor and City Council, David Archer here at Manhattan Beach Chamber of Commerce. It's my honor to invite you to our first networking mixer. It's November 23rd, 2024, Monday, January 22nd at Fish Bar in North Manhattan Beach. The festivities begin at 5:30 and I welcome you all to be there. Thank you so much.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you, David.

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no additional request via Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, I'd like to make one or I'll follow you. Okay. Is it? There we go. So, previous mayor, Richard Montgomery, has graciously allowed me to take over his tradition of coffee with the mayor. So, it will be held at the second and fourth Tuesday of every month from 3:30 to 4:30 p.m. This month, January 23rd, it'll be at Dunkin at 110 North Sepulveda. And then February 23rd, it'll be at the coffee bean. I believe in Manhattan Village is a little obscured here, but right, coffee bean and tea leaf at Manhattan Village. So, I look I'm sorry, that's February 20, February 13th. So, I look forward to seeing you there. And I'm sorry, my colleagues.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you, Your Honor. Just one mention. I want to thank everyone for the 31st Annual Beach City's toy drive that we hosted here in Manhattan Beach. Most of you showed up. They shut out Chief Lang and his people were helping us organize that. All the toys were stored at the behind the fire station. And I think most people were stunned to watch when the firemen wrapped toys. So good job, Chief, on that one. And when we got started without the help of Parks and Rec, Dr. Leyman and Liza, Martha, Patty, Mary, they did all the back work

things you see behind to make it happen. But again, it was successful. Over 4000 toys are donated and went over to seven charities across L.A. County. So, it makes a huge difference every year. Those toys get out distributed. So, thank you all to help make it happen. And one point, those that helped donate. That's it. Thank you, your Honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. Anybody else? We're good. Okay. So now it's time for public comments. It's three minutes per person. Speakers may provide public comments on any matter that is within subject matter jurisdiction of the City Council, including items on the agenda. The mayor may determine whether an item is within the subject matter jurisdiction. While all comments are welcome, the Brown Act does not allow City Council to take action on any item not on the agenda. And if you want to speak on an agenda item that comes later, you can speak on it now, but you can't speak on it when that agenda item is before the council. Dr. Lee?

DR. LEE: Okay, thank you. I'm back. So, I just want to take a minute to speak in support of the Juneteenth events that have been planned by the Parks and Recreation Commission and the magnificent job that the staff has done in planning and organizing these events, which were unanimously recommended by

Parks and Rec. Juneteenth is a brand new national holiday, not very well understood, but it symbolically represents the end of slavery in the United States. Not really historically, but we'll take it as a symbol. And the end of slavery means the beginning of full citizenship for African-American people in the United States and the beginning, the very first steps of our experiment in a multiracial democracy. So, this is a holiday which should be of significance to every American and should have deep meaning for all of us. The job that the Parks and Recreation Commission has done is really wonderful involving celebrations and food and music and cooperation with El Segundo and so on. They also were able to attract a very high level of private support and funding. One person donated \$15,000 for the first events, which is quite amazing. They want to remain anonymous, but I'm hoping, sort of like I'm hoping when I think about God, I'm hoping that she's a black woman. Anyway, it was astonishing, and I think that takes care of a lot of our problems. Anyway, this is the third time this issue has come to the city council, so this time I hope we can get it over and begin planning these celebrations. That's it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Dr. Lee. Anybody else that wants to speak, if you can just go ahead and make your way down to the sort of, in the on-deck circle. Yes, hi.

TERRIE MILESKE: Good evening, Mayor Franklin and City Council. I've never talked before like this. It's my first time. My name is Terrie Mileski. I've lived on the corner of 18th and Flournoi for 52 years. I'm speaking on a problem that's going on our street that's ongoing, much construction for three years nonstop. And 18th Street is a street that has a lot of traffic going up and down, so you can only have one car at a time. There's tons of construction workers and vehicles. There's even a big blue iron garment thing that they use for construction that's been on our street for three months. Anyway, everyone on the street just about has had it with this, and I know nothing can be done. There's a law that anybody can add on or do whatever. You can't stop them, but it seems like there should be some limits to this. When you've got five houses on one side of the street for three years with construction, and it's still going to be going on. It's still going to be going, so I just wondered if there's anything that can be done. I don't know. So, thank you very much.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you for your comment.

RAY JOSEPH: Hi, Ray Joseph. I can't remember when there wasn't construction on my street. What I wanted to talk

about, and I sent you guys some photos earlier today. I live on a walk street, as you know, and I watch kids and people zipping down the walk streets all the time. And when they go out to Bayview, the cars coming by can't see them always, because bushes are high. And this condition exists across Manhattan Beach, lots of different places off Ocean, off Bayview, off Crest, where you come down the walk streets because you go from the curb to the alley. And so, you can pop out there, and then it's just a matter of when a car's going to hit one of them. I've seen accidents on Manhattan Avenue and my street where a baby in a stroller got hit, where a kid riding a bike got hit. They're going zipping down the walk streets, and it's just scary. And when my son was little, he chased the football into Bayview. I'm like, stop, stop, stop. And he didn't stop. He ran a Bayview, got the ball. Five minutes later, he did the exact same thing. I yelled, stop. He stopped. My neighbor drove over the ball. She got out of the car. She was shaking because if he would have run, she would have hit him. But they can't see the kids because of, you know, depending on what people have in front of them. They have hedges in front of their houses and stuff like that. But there's, you know, like 20, 30 conditions like that across Manhattan Beach. And I believe on walk streets, you're not allowed to have stuff taller than 42 inches. Therefore, you can see a bicycle rider. You can see, you know,

kids running or whatever. And if he was pilling tag, he would have been hit by the car because she would have seen a ball to warn her. So, there should be something, you know, just take a look, go up and down. Ocean, go up and down Bayview, go up and down Crest and see all the conditions where that could happen. And now, because of e-bikes, you know, before, I only used to worry about the kids coming down. Now, it's kids coming up, too, because they can come up rather fast now. And they're moving a lot quicker through the streets. But I just see the kids every single day and they're never looking. And you just go, one day, it's not going to be good. I'd just like to see it to where the cars know that they're coming. So maybe if the conditions were lower, the fences, I mean, there's people that have fences, all kinds of stuff. But just across town, it'd just be great if it was a little bit safer for them to get across. So, thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Mr. Joseph. Anybody else? How about Zoom?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There are no raised-hands on Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Moving on. So, I get a motion to approve the Consent Calendar with the exceptions of items 8, 10, and 12.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So moved, Your Honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Moved by Councilmember Richard Montgomery, seconded by Councilmember David Lesser.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW BARROW: Before there's a vote, I need to read the title of item number 9. I don't have my laptop here at the moment, so we're going to get... You've got it? Okay. Thanks, Martha. I just need glasses. Urgency ordinance number 21-0002U. An ordinance of the City of Manhattan Beach amending Manhattan Beach Municipal Code chapter 4120 to adjust the limits for campaign contributions and municipal elections and declaring the urgency thereof. At this time, you can vote.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. And so now items removed from the consent calendar. Public comments. Each speaker may speak for up to two minutes on each item pulled from the agenda. First one is item number 8.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I pulled that one. So, this is a resolution revising and reducing the required deposit for appeals of administrative citations. I have a bit of experience in this. I'm an administrative hearing officer for a number of different cities and counties. And, you know, at the minimum, I would ask that staff go back and see what other cities require for a deposit if they have a deposit at all. In my experience, they don't typically have a deposit to cover the cost of the hearing. It's part of the due process that the city provides them. Of course, it's a choice. But even at 650, I think we were charging 1,500 before. Even at 650, that's a hefty fee. I haven't checked the filing fees for some things in court lately, but I think 650 exceeds those. So, I would recommend that we get more background and some research on what other cities require as a deposit if they have a deposit at all, because this still seems very high. So, you can have a \$50 administrative citation. You're going to have to put down a deposit of \$650. And if you lose, you're going to have to pay that. That's pretty high. Or I'm working for the wrong cities and counties.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Colleagues, anybody? Oh, wait, public comments. So, time for public comments, limited to two minutes on this item. Zoom?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALAVAREZ: There's no one on Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: No one on Zoom. Okay. Do we have any questions of staff? Close public comment. Oh, I'm sorry. Close public comments. Yes. So, Mayor Pro-Tem?

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Yeah. So, Councilmember Napolitano, are you asking staff to go back and find out, you know, what other cities, like cities are doing or, you know, do you want to suggest these to them? And you're saying that even reducing the fees, it's still an impediment to due process? Either table this or you just want to vote against it.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: No, I'm asking that we come back and see what other cities do.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: That was my question. I'm good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, a motion to bring this back.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: So, moved. Okay. With a comparison of other cities. Councilmember Napolitano, how broad of a range are you looking for the region? Are you looking for

county of Los Angeles? How broad of a range would it be helpful for you?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I don't want staff to spend days and weeks on this. I think a survey of five or so cities should give us a good indication.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: That'd be my motion.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, we have a motion by Councilmember Lesser. We have a second. That's seconded by Mayor Pro-Tem Amy Howorth. Can we vote please?

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Now, we have item number 10. Pulled by Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yes. There's been a good deal of community interest in this matter and I believe a fair amount of misinformation. So, what I would welcome is I'll look to the City Manager or to our Finance Director to see if they have an initial presentation about what this item entails and then I do have some questions.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yes, thank you. We don't have a presentation prepared, but I will tell you that we've done a fair amount of research on this over the past several months as has come before the council as early as May this year when we first started discussing with council. And so, I know there have been questions around whether the city would be paying these fees and legally the CITY ATTORNEY BARROW will tell you that under Prop 218 we are required to assess those fees to our properties and pay those assessments. That's different than how the existing laws were working when we first passed the stormwater fees back in 1996 before Prop 218, we could exempt our properties. We can no longer do that and so we need to pay the roughly \$74,000 that are associated with the roughly 70 properties that the city owns that are subject to this stormwater fee. As you know, we're currently subsidizing stormwater out of the general fund to the tune of about \$1.6 million a year, so we're obviously contributing to that right now. And we felt that putting this on the agenda was a good way to have the transparency of what the process is, which is, in this case, for you to consider delegating your power to vote to me to fill out those ballots. And I would certainly do that in accordance with the resolution that council passed supporting

the fees. So, I can answer any other questions, so can Finance Director Charelian.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: So, is that all the presentations staff wants to make at this time?

CITY MANAGER MOE: At this time, we'll answer questions.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: All right. So, first of all, does the city pay the fee? I'm just thinking some of the questions that members of the public have been asking about this item.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yeah, we don't currently pay the fee, but we are paying \$1.6 million to subsidize the utility at this point.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: And I had a question for the CITY ATTORNEY BARROW, and that has to do with the restrictions on the city advocating for or against a Proposition 218 measure like this is. To what extent is it appropriate to put this on the council agenda? Can you explain why or how?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW BARROW: The big issue with campaigning is that cities cannot spend any of their own money to campaign for or against a measure. Individual council members can do whatever they want in their free time. But that's the key. And so, items like this and the resolution that the council adopted in support of this a few months ago are legal. And you can do that because it doesn't cost the city money to support the Proposition or delegate to the city manager the authority to sign the ballots.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. And this could be a question for the CITY ATTORNEY BARROW or the City Manager. So, prior to Prop 218, when we set the fee, were we exempt at that point, did we exempt the 70 or 60 or 50 city parcels at that time?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW BARROW: Yes. But in addition to that, the engineer's report from 1976 valued the benefit to the city property at zero.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Okay, but the question is, so Prop 218 happens in what was voted in by the voters. Yes. Didn't just happen in 1996. And the language in Prop 218, does it allow us to, like, could we exempt ourselves again this time? As many of the residents are asking, you know, we should be exempt from voting because it benefits us, but it actually benefits the residents. But can we exempt the city so that under Prop 218?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: In most cases, no. Prop 218 says that the cities cannot exempt themselves unless there's clear and convincing evidence to exempt the city, which means the city would have to do an engineer's report that there's no benefit of the storm drain because their property is impervious, for instance.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: So, like if we were, but that still might not pass semester because then there'd be runoff. Anyway, we would have to prove that we get zero benefit from this measure.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Exactly, and that's kind of tough to do in your engineer's report. The independent engineer's report already valued the benefit to the city at \$74,000 or so.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: So, it would be illegal for us to exempt ourselves?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yes. Based on that engineer's report, we would have no basis for exempting ourselves, the city, from paying the fee.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Okay, and is it 60, 70 parcels? 70, okay, 70 parcels. I think those are my questions.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you. Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yeah, and what's striking too is that the school district was part of that assessment as well, right? And so they would no longer be exempt, and they have a number of properties in town. Would they be subject to this?

CITY MANAGER MOE: They are subject to it. I don't know why, but they are subject to it, the current fee as well, so they must not have opted out back in 1996. They pay about \$32,000 currently.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Okay, but they have a vote for each parcel in this as well?

CITY MANAGER MOE: They do. Yes, they do.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: And folks asked why we added an amendment last minute to do this. Were we legally required to even put this on the agenda to delegate our vote to the City Manager on our behalf? So, was that a legally required thing that we did and we just messed up on?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: No, there was no mistake in the part of the city. The city council has adopted a resolution 5-0 to support this measure, and the city council has the authority to execute that. To delegate it to the city manager, it's not that clear. So, the city council has delegated a lot of, through the municipal code, the city council has delegated lots of different powers and authority to the city manager. This is not listed as one of those, so it takes authorization out of abundance of caution.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: And I'm glad we did. You know, I think it was a good thing to do, but just to also clear that up, we did this, it's more than we are required to do. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Colleagues, anything else? So, I'd like to ask a question, please. There's been questions about the counting, you know, the counting of the votes. Could you please clarify that and talk about how the public can participate in that process?

CITY MANAGER: I'd like the City Clerk, Liza Tamura, to address that.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Honorable Mayor, members of the council, Liza Tamura, City Clerk. The ballots will be counted at the police fire conference room on Monday the 22nd. It starts at 9 o'clock, ends at noon. We take a lunch break 12 to 1, and we start back up 1 to 5. We continue to open up the ballots and count them until they're done. So, we've reserved the room for 2 to 3 days.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, is that the city employees that's doing it?

CITY MANAGER MOE: We've hired a third party in which to open and count the ballots. And to stress, it's in a public setting. The public is welcome to come into the building and watch if they so choose. Again, for transparency, the voting will take place in public.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: And the vote is still going on up until when?

CITY MANAGER MOE: Tomorrow at 5 p.m. Is it tomorrow?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Well, when they're due.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: When they're due. Correct.

CITY MANAGER MOE: The county begins Monday the 22nd.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And that's in the office. That's not postmarked.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Postmarks do not count. It has to be delivered.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, by now, they should probably bring them over.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Your honor. Can I tag team on that question? So why aren't we counting at 5:01 tomorrow?

CITY MANAGER MOE: I don't have a good answer.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: But abundance of caution so there's no accusations of...

CITY MANAGER MOE: Well, and frankly, in this way, it's during normal business hours and the consultant can come in and do that for public view.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: So, for assurance, though, are these... Where are these things going to be locked up and how is the public... How do we ensure that there's... To the public that there's no additional ballots after 5 p.m.

CITY MANAGER MOE: The clerk's office has been very meticulous about receiving date stamping ballots and safeguarding those ballots. And so that will continue to be the case.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Any other questions? Questions? Public comments? Please. Anybody here? If anybody else is going to make a comment, could you please start coming down?

KEVIN BURKE: Hi. Kevin Burke. I'm curious. I've actually made a...

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I'm sorry, your name?

KEVIN BURKE: Kevin Burke. I've come in to offices here to ask multiple times and I've sent two emails. I'm curious as to the disclosure as opposed to anonymous on this ballot for this measure. To my understanding, I've never been in any ballot where my name is on the ballot. So, I'm curious. So that's unique to me. What's the difference?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, we'll take that under advisement and answer at the end. Any other comments?

HEATHER KIM: Hi. I'm actually reading this on behalf of another resident who somehow couldn't work the Zoom. So, it says, this is from Audrey Ritterman and Estes and I'm calling on Agenda 10 regarding the ability of the city manager to be able to vote for the storm drain measure for city parcels. My understanding is presently, there are monies coming out of the general fund for storm drain costs. Presently, it is running at a deficit since 2016. The storm drain measure is passed. The city will pass that cost onto the property owners for eternity plus CPI increasing every year. Why would the city have a right to vote on this measure, which to me seems like a conflict of interest. Thank you for your time and consideration on this issue. And another few residents were talking about how they either did not get the ballot. And then another question was, why are people able to vote? Okay, this one is specific to property owners who are affected, but there are other instances where you can get an exemption for being a senior, let's say, and yet you can still vote to increase taxes. So, I'm not first in the law, so maybe there is some reason why they can do that. It just doesn't seem fair. And that's it for these comments. But I just wanted to also say Manhattan Grocery has been in business for over 20 years. That's all. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Any other comments? Zoom, on Zoom.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: There's someone with a username of iPhone25.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Okay. They're going to speak.

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: They're not accepting the prompt.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: A few more seconds.

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: Yes, they're not unmuting themselves.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: iPhone25, you're there? Maybe that's the person. Yeah, so we're going to close public comments. And City Manager Moe, do we have any questions about the issue of names on the ballots?

CITY MANAGER MOE: The City Attorney can address that.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Because of a court case involving storm drain assessments. Unlike every other election, the people

who vote per parcel, their names will be disclosed, well, they won't be disclosed. They're subject to the Public Records Act after the election. So, the secrecy remains up until the ballots are tabulated. But if someone asks her, well, can you show me how the city voted? We would have to produce that. It's very unusual, but it was a court case. And it's the only election that I know of that's not 100% secret all the way through the process.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: None of us.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So does that... That doesn't just apply to the city ballots. That's every ballot.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yes. So, they're kept secret up until once again the tabulation. They're still secret, but under the Public Records Act, if someone asks for how people voted, they'll be entitled to that.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yeah. Well, I was just going to ask a question. And that was regarding the senior exemption, right? There is no senior exemption.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: There is no senior exemption.

CITY MANAGER MOE: If I can also add, if somebody didn't get a ballot, there's still time to come to the City Clerk's office tomorrow and get one. But keep in mind, we have some people that thought they didn't get ballots because they're renters in town. These are property owners that are voting on this, solely property owners.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: And you get one ballot per property.

CITY MANAGER MOE: One ballot per parcel, yes.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: And could it be... I mean, I understand it is a court case, so we don't have any real leeway regarding the names on the ballots. But could it also be a way of double-checking to make sure that, you know, the people are voting? Because it is per parcel. So, it's not just any registered voter can vote. So, you would have to check to make sure, oh, yeah, those people can vote. If it was challenged. If it was challenged. Okay, thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Mr. City Manager, can you address a point that was raised in emails and was raised again tonight? And that is that it's a conflict of interest for the city to be voting on this matter because it's out to an election of the public. Or at least property owners. Can you at least maybe articulate why it's not?

CITY MANAGER MOE: We're subject to the fee, just like everybody else is. So, we should have a voice in whether we support that or do not. And so the city is being treated like every other property owner in the city, which is appropriate.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Okay, thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And anybody else, colleagues? So, I'd like to ask just one other question. So, we can come to a vote and decide not to cast a ballot. Is that correct? For the city, for the city properties?

CITY MANAGER MOE: I think you could abstain. Is that correct? Abstain.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yeah, you could abstain. Or this is, once again, this is just delegating to the City Manager. The city has the authority to do this.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: But can we give direction as to how the city manager should vote?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Well, you've actually already done that by adopting the resolution.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: We supported the resolution five to zero. That indicates we're, you know, that's how we are voting as a city.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, comments? Colleagues? Any further?

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: I have a motion. And that motion is to adopt resolution number 24-0005, delegating to the City Manager the authority to execute ballots for the storm drain measure for parcels owned by the city for the reasons that were stated tonight.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, and that's seconded by Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes, sir. For the reasons already stated, but I'll add something else to it. We've been talking about this, folks, since May 2023. Not a surprise. It didn't sneak up on anybody. May 2023. How do I know? Because I was the mayor. I know what happened that day. That's number one. So, when someone writes a letter to the other complaining that the election ballot is stuck up on you, I remind them May 2023. When the holiday is in May. We talked about it again. This council ratified it again. And now, we have all of the holidays we're talking about one more time. That's four different times we talked about it in public. Now, tonight, five. So, you heard the reasons why. See it's on a matter of constitutional law. As one person wrote letter to the other, he was incorrect and blatantly missing before in the public. Number two, I would add that this is a measure to public benefit. If you don't do this, but we're paying \$2.2 million right now just to keep it running. Think about that for a second. We're not adding any more pipe. We're not placing anything. \$2.2 million a year to keep it running. Now, add on top of that, the May would take out of a piggy bank over here that could be used for firemen, policemen, anything else, pulling that money out of piggy bank to cover

this cost. Why is that important? When's the last time we raised this fee? How many years ago, Bruce? 30-something? 1996. What else did you not raise since 1996? Is anybody else still paying the same rate for milk, gasoline, bread? 1996. Anybody raise your hand. No one is paying the same rate they paid 1996 for anything. So, if I would make public benefit to not have sinkholes or to same drain collapse anywhere, this goes to the city benefit. So, yes. We should have a right to vote and direct it. The fact that the council said city manager, you make that vote, fine. He can do it if not. We'll do it up here. We already said it before. We're going to move in the same direction. So, I have no issue being the second, but as long as people are informed of what happened, what the way it is, why we're doing it, that's the whole purpose while we're here tonight, to extend why we voted the first time and why we're doing it again in public at a regular meeting, not a consent. Put it out. Everybody can hear it. We'll go from there. So, glad to be your second.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yes, sir. I agree with everything, Councilmember Montgomery said.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, do I. I just, I mean, it's unfortunate that this came to light so late. It would have been

nice to have disclosed this early on in the process. But right here on the dais, we all just have been talking about how much the city needs this. It's basically helping to turn those grades that we get on the beaches. We get our fair share of Fs for failing health standards, and we're trying to turn those Fs to As. So, we have indicated it's necessary. I've corresponded with residents. Talk to them. Post it on Facebook. You know, that it is necessary to the extent that we could. And so, I agree with everything you said. Should we, if there's no more comments, then we have the voting screen, please.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passed 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you. And then, the final item that was pulled was number 12 by myself. So, this is the consideration of the Cultural Arts Commission recommendations for Utility Box Beautification Project. And Parks Recreation Director, Mark Leyman, please.

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: Good evening, honorable mayor, members of the City Council. I am available for any questions that you may have regarding this item.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Well, my question is, I noticed in the qualifications of the people who could submit, it was limited to all artists residing, working, or attending classes in the cities of Manhattan Beach, Redondo Beach, Hermosa Beach, or El Segundo. Correct. So, I just want to end there. The selected designs will be paid a \$600 stipend?

MARK: Correct.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, the reason I pulled it is because I would like to see a little bit more inclusion with other cities. Our beach, we're more or less the caretaker of the beach, but we can see on any given day busloads of school children coming in here from other cities, from many of them. This is their first experience coming to the ocean. They're going to the roundhouse. They go down the sand. It's quite a program. I've witnessed this quite a bit. And I, for one, would like to see their interpretations of what they feel about coming to the beach and to express that artistically and for us to display it on our utility boxes. I can just imagine that child coming back later or doing another field trip or coming with their family and saying, look, I did that. That's showing this particular fish or we learned about that particular sea plant or we learned this about the beach. And I just think we should sort

of widen the scope of people that we can have submit, not to mention that the \$600 stipend would be welcome as well. So, I'd like to offer it up to my colleagues to discuss that.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Go ahead, David.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: This is going to frame this as a question. Mr. Parks and Recreation Director, is there a reason for the specified qualification for the artist submitting to the beach cities?

PARKS AND RECRETION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: So, I know there was a consensus with the Cultural Arts Commission to focus on the youth and traditionally that has been the South Bay Cities.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Okay. Has there been a limitation on the number of submissions by doing so? Have there any other considerations or is this solely a policy decision for the Council?

PARKS AND RECRETION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: Solely policy. In fact, I know they wanted to expand the submittal period because they'd like to see more submittals again and focusing on the youth.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Great. Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: I was going to ask the same thing. I'm fine opening it up.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yeah, Your Honor. The one question is how do we open it up, though? Who do we reach out to? Do we reach out to schools? Do we reach out to youth groups? I have no idea. Okay. I would suggest there is a possibility that you could work through LA County Arts Commission to identify folks because they often do. Each district has a contest every year for banners that they put on the trash cans at the beach and they're done by schoolchildren. So maybe those things could piggyback as well.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Great. Thank you. Just as your suggestion. Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes, sir. More of a question. By going across LA County, how long is it a delay? How long are we kicking it out for? In other words, you just opened up the game from here to the South Bay. Now you want to go LA County wide. Now I'm not saying that's not a good thing. I'm saying how much longer will you kick it out because now you just delayed it kind of wide. Unless you have an interest date to say, it must be submitted by X date, by July 1, by June 1, by May 1.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I think this was extended to begin with for an extra period of 45 days. So, 45 days. And that was extended to try and get as many applications as possible. Would that need to be changed?

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: I think we can stick with that again. If those communications through the county are effective and if we're opening it, I'm hearing it through LA County, then we can just expand the marketing scope during that 45-day period.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So, we're not extending the 45-day period. We're leaving it set for the same period it's set for now. I'm fine with that.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: We're just asking staff to liaison to see if they have a list because there's also, I mean, they could also just reach out to schools in the South Bay. I mean, there's a dedicated, you know, that is a defined area, but I'm fine doing it county wide.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: That's why I say County Arts Commission because they already have a list. They have a list. You can just email and they'll send it out to everybody.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Right, so it's not like they're calling individual schools or anything like that. So, I'm good with that. Let's do it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And that would not, so we're not limiting everybody in LA County. Whoever they can reach out to. Yeah, they can reach out. Public comment, please. On this. Anybody here? I'm just waiting to hear if there's any more instructions.

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: Mr. Mayor, if I could see clarification, is that LA County wide for just youth or youth and adults?

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: We could all discuss, but let's keep it youth. The first was youth. I mean, if we're just youth, because the first one was sort of focused that way. And so the art reflects that. And I think it'd be sort of a different feel, which I'm not opposed to, but I don't know, kind of muddies it up. I think why don't we? I'll put that in the motion.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Public comments, please. Anybody here? In chambers, on Zoom.

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK TAMURA: There's no request on Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Can I second?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you very much. I appreciate that. So, I'd like to make the motion that we expand the areas from which the younger folks can make a submission to the artwork for our utility boxes. As so managed by our Parks Recreation.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Your Honor, clarification that the date remains the same turned it in by the cut-off date remains the same. Can that extend the cut-off date?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And that is what? March, was it? And that's March 17th at 5 p.m. And seconded by Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I have just one question. I'm sorry. And that is, is there an age restriction that was set in the original request for proposal? It's at all ages earlier on page. That's what I thought. So, this is going to be open to all ages, is it not? Am I missing something? All artists residing, working, or attending classes in?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I'm going to simplify and just say, let the department reach out to County Arts for youth and let the local adults submit, and we can rethink letting adults in next time. But let's just, in the effort, in the interest of moving this along, you know, we'll reach out for the youth of L.A. County and stick with all ages in the South Bay. Okay, sounds good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Good. Sound good? Okay, great. Ready for a vote? All right. There we go. Great, thank you.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you. Okay, so we move on to public hearings. So, item number 14, conduct a public hearing to consider introducing an ordinance renewing the city's military equipment policy, and we have Manhattan Beach Police Chief Johnson.

POLICE CHIEF JOHNSON: Good evening, Mayor Franklin, members of the City Council. Rachel Johnson, your police chief. Tonight's presentation for the public hearing will be given by Lieutenant Benjamin.

LIEUTENANT BENJAMIN: Hi, good evening. Mayor and members of the City Council, I am Lieutenant Benjamin, and I am presenting our annual military equipment use report during this public meeting as required by the California Government Code section 7072. This is a transparency law, and it's meant to better inform the public of the equipment used by the local law enforcement agency. As required by the government code, our city ordinance and our military equipment policy, the report was

required to have several items. These items include a summary of how the military equipment was used in the previous year, a summary of any complaints we received, and that was none, the results of any internal audits, and I'll talk about that in a little bit here, our annual costs, the amount of military equipment we currently possess, and this information can be found in our military equipment list, which is included with tonight's presentation, as well as also being available on our city website, and a request for the approval of any military equipment we may seek in the upcoming year. But before I begin, I want to again have some clarification for the council and for our public here and listening as to what exactly military equipment means. And so, the words military equipment is actually not defined by the Manhattan Beach Police Department. They are defined by statute, and the best way for me to describe that is military equipment is basically any of the equipment that we do not carry on our cell or on our person as police officers every day. It is the equipment that we use situationally and in very specific circumstances, and an example of this would be drones. They don't carry drones on our person. They don't come off our belts. This is a situational tool that we only use, and the drones that we do use are commercially available, and what that means is you can buy them at Costco. You can buy them online. They are not procured from the

military. These are commercially available items. We are also required by statute to gain the approval for equipment we may seek in the upcoming year, and I'm going to do this at the end of my presentation. This is a process before process, so what that means for you is that any equipment that may be approved for purchase tonight does not actually get purchased. We still follow the normal budgeting process for this. We still request this equipment in other ways, but now with this new statute, we have to request the ability to request this. All right, so now I will start the summary of our equipment for the 2023 calendar year. I'm going to start with drones, which in law enforcement we call unmanned aerial systems. The Manhattan Police Department has two drones. These were purchased this year after being previously approved by the council at the 2022 military equipment use public meeting. The drones that we did end up purchasing were the DJI Matrice 30T and the DJI Mavic 3T. Please do not ask me what that means. I do not know. They are drones. They fly. The MBPD has deployed an unmanned aerial system 12 times this year, and we deployed those systems on calls for service, search warrants, and during special events. It was also deployed 11 times for training purposes. The Bearcat that we share with our surrounding agencies, it's more commonly referred to as a Bearcat. The actual term for this item is an armored rescue vehicle. We used that 8-times for community events and

five times for search warrants last year. The MBPD mobile command post qualifies as military equipment. You commonly see it as the RV that we bring out to special events. That was deployed for six community events this year. Our SWAT MCV was used for nine SWAT trainings and six search warrants. Our CNT, which is our crisis negotiations team van, was used six times for search warrants. We did not use any explosive breaching tools in 2023. Rifles and rifle ammunition were only used for training purposes in 2023, and those trainings included annual rifle qualifications, new officer qualifications, and SWAT team trainings. We did not use any explosive projectiles in 2023. Noise flash diversionary devices, commonly known as flash bangs, were used during three SWAT warrants this past year, and one device was used at each of those incidents. One pocket tactical tear gas device was used during a SWAT training last year. Kinetic energy weapons, and what those are, are the launchers that launched the less than lethal sponge rounds. We used those two times for new officer and perishable skills trainings, as well as during one SWAT incident and during one patrol incident in 2023. Like I said before, we didn't receive any complaints related to our military equipment in 2023, and we did conduct an audit. That audit was conducted in December 2023, and as part of that audit, we located additional equipment, equipment that was not previously identified. Once we did identify and locate that

equipment, we added it to our military equipment list for 2023, and that equipment was 36, 40-millimeter kinetic energy projectiles, and in that grouping, it included inert training projectiles, CS projectiles, and OC projectiles. These items are now properly recorded in our inventory. The total annual costs for military equipment, including acquisition, personnel, training, transportation, maintenance storage, upgrades, and other ongoing costs totaled \$40,737.79. All continuing military equipment costs will be absorbed into the police department budget. Trainings were also conducted this past year, and those trainings included trainings that used military equipment. The cost for much of that training on the use of military equipment during training exercise was rolled into the police department training budget, and that is because the trainings, although they included military equipment, were not for the military equipment, and so the example I would give to you there is our SWAT trainings. Our officers will often do movement, and so that's how you get into a house, how you approach a car, things of that nature, and during those trainings, they're holding rifles, but the training is not actually about the rifle, it's about the movement. So, any training like that, we didn't go in and look to figure out what the cost was for the portion that used the rifles. We just don't consider that in military equipment training. So, when it comes to the quantity of

equipment that we possess, our updated 2023 military equipment log is attached to this presentation. It's also available on the website, and we update that log and the list throughout the year as we go through trainings and as we have different events. So for 2024, the department does have requests for military equipment purchases and procurements for this next year, and I again want to say that the approval of these requests does not mean that we will end up purchasing these items, only that if approved, the department will follow the process that is already in place for the purchase of these items. Our drone team is requesting the purchase of additional drones as the program continues to grow and become efficient. The police department may request to purchase a Lenco Bearcat armored rescue vehicle during the budgetary process. The current Bearcat is shared with multiple South Bay agencies, and it's nearing the end of its useful life. The next request is actually not for an item, but instead it's a request for approval from the City Council to put in place a mechanism to request additional military equipment via staff report to the City Council should the need occur prior to the next public meeting, which is now tentatively scheduled for January 2025. And this concludes my report. Staff recommends we hold a public meeting, which we're doing right now, and the Council review the 2023 annual military equipment report that lists the use of military equipment by the MBPD in 2023. After

receiving public input, staff additionally recommends the Council receive and file the annual report, introduce ordinance 24-0001 to renew ordinance number 22-0006 and approve future purchases of military equipment per both ordinances. And I'm now happy to answer any questions you may have.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Colleagues?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Done. No questions.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: No questions.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Mm-hmm. Thank you. Public comments? Martha on Zoom?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Close. Close public comments.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Your Honor, I made a motion to induce ordinance 24-001 to renew ordinance number 22-006, and along with that, this is something you provide to the department. The tools they believe, that they believe they need, let them do it, do their job. And the cost of maintenance was

\$40,000 or so to maintain and train with this. It's a fraction what the actual purchase cost would be. So, we're way ahead of it. Good for us.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. We have a motion by councilmember Richard Montgomery, seconded by councilmember Napolitano.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: And so now that we have the second, I'll read the title of the ordinance. Ordinance number 24-0001, an ordinance of the city of Manhattan Beach renewing a previously approved military equipment use policy pursuant to assembly bill 481 in government code section 7070 at sec.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Great report.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Voting screen. Thank you.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

LIEUTENANT BENJAMIN: All right. Thank you very much.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: The mayor of that ordinance will come back on your next consent calendar for adoption.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you. Council, how are we doing? Motor on? Yeah, sure. Okay, great. So next item on the agenda under general business is item number 15, consideration of options to address overnight parking of oversized vehicles. City Manager Moe.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Assistant to the City Manager, George Gabriel will be giving the presentation. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Okay. Honorable Mayor Franklin and members of the city council, George Gabriel assistant to the city manager giving a presentation tonight on options to address overnight parking of oversized vehicles. So, by way of background, this item is not necessarily new. It's an item the city council has considered. In 2010 and 2011, the city council did consider a variety of options and eventually settled on what our current regulations are, which we'll be discussing shortly. This item comes back to you now as a result of a city council request and city council direction to provide options to update the city's municipal code regarding the overnight parking of oversized vehicles that happened in October 17 of 2023. So,

kind of a refresher of what we currently have right now and what was approved in 2011. And so what was done in 2011 was basically the municipal code states that the parking of non-motorized vehicles and trailers are prohibited on city streets. The on-street parking of oversized vehicles, meaning the stopping, standing, parking, or leaving an oversized vehicle is prohibited in areas designated by the police chief and traffic engineer or their designees. And third is the running of electric cords, extension cords, hoses, cables, and other items across or above the park where sidewalk from any residential or commercial property to an oversized vehicle or trailer parked on a public street is also prohibited. It should be noted that there are some exceptions. I didn't go through it in this slide, but some notable exceptions to this right now include commercial vehicles such as those doing home or construction maintenance, which they have to go through a separate permitting process, tow trucks, public or utility vehicles, public emergency vehicles, and so on and so forth. So, what do we define as an oversized vehicle? And in essence, the current definition that we have for an oversized vehicle is basically a 22 by 7 by 8, 22 feet in length, 7 feet in width, and 8 feet in height. And this definition of oversized vehicles is the one that we currently have, and it's fairly in line with other jurisdictions. Some of the jurisdictions have some minor modifications.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Just quickly, sir, but you say all those things, but it's any one of those things, right?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Yes, any one of those things.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Okay, so it could just be 8 feet, but shorter than 22 feet. And that would be oversight. Okay. Just want to clarify, because it does say, or my law school class told me that, you know, go ahead.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Are you saying, well, just to clarify, are you asking that it's all of those count? They have to, all of those measurements have to abide by it. As it states right now, I believe our municipal code is either one of those count as an oversized vehicle, whatever the measurement is. So also, our current regulations related to trailers these are prohibited per the municipal code as well. And those are some examples of trailers as well. So, there are different examples of oversized vehicles. These are actually examples that were pulled from the Manhattan Beach, or not from the Manhattan Beach, but from the DMV. And so these are common ones. And so as you can see, and I showcase this example mainly because sizes can vary on oversized vehicles and even though

these may seem like an oversized vehicle, there are instances where let's say the height doesn't correspond or the length or the width, whatever it may be. So, I mentioned earlier that there are current regulations regarding the oversized vehicles, and what I wanted to showcase here is staff looked into our signage as it relates to those regulations. And so we have about 70 signs related to our current regulations. And there's 35 around the perimeter of the city detailing the city-wide prohibition of detached trailers, and they're basically surrounding it the major entry points to the city. And then there are also 35 additional ones at various locations. These locations include Valley Drive near the areas of Joslyn Community Center and Live Oak Park, perimeter of Pacific Elementary School, Grandview Elementary, and an area along 18th Street just off of Sepulveda. And those are areas that were designated by the police chief at one point as areas that were not to be part of oversized vehicles. So, in doing research as to address options, we looked at what other cities were doing as it relates to oversized vehicles, and one thing, some cities that we surveyed, including bordering cities as well as some additional cities in the South Bay. And we played particular attention to El Segundo, Hermosa, Redondo, and even Torrance as well. And so as you can see by the graphic there, or not by the

graphic, but by the text there is that all these cities that are bordering us do have permit programs of some sort.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Just for oversized vehicles.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: For oversized vehicles, correct. So, in summary, these are some practices of neighboring cities. The practice of neighboring cities, no oversized vehicle parking at any time without a permit, and that's basically the practice of Hermosa Beach and Torrance. The other is daytime oversized vehicle parking is allowed, but permit parking is required for overnight type oversized vehicles, and that's the practices of El Segundo, Gardena, and Redondo Beach. And another one was the oversized vehicle parking is allowed for a limited period of time without a permit. Parking for a long period of time would require a permit, and that's the practice of Hawthorne. So, each city has a variety of parameters, application processes, and we're going to kind of go into how a potential program may look with council direction as well later on in this presentation. So, in short, in looking at various options that council could consider, we kind of narrowed down to three options and option three is fairly complicated and we'll go through the parameters. But option one is status quo, basically maintain the municipal code as is if the council does

see fit. Option two is the status quo with additional areas that are going to be designated by the police chief. So, basically, what council will be doing is telling staff to look at additional areas that could encompass our existing areas that the municipal code can cover and prohibit oversized vehicles. Option three will be to establish a permitting process to supplement some of the current municipal code provisions. And so if council did choose option three, staff would need to return with a draft ordinance that includes the following recommended parameters in consultation with community development, police department, staffing. And so the permit program that staff would recommend as right now would be an oversized vehicle parking at any time without a permit. A permit will need to be obtained in order to park on the street. The issuance of said permit will be required from a resident will need to submit an application for themselves or a guest. But the guest permit would be transferable and is not to be assigned to a particular oversized vehicle. Another parameter would be the application. A resident would need to submit a permit as well. If that resident would like a guest permit, they would also need to obtain a permit for that as well. A fee annually, the first permit will be issued at no cost to the resident. A guest permit fee is yet to be determined right now. And I should note that the goal of this, the goal of these parameters is to create a process so that the

city can properly regulate but at the same time we don't want to create a burdensome process for residents that do currently have oversized vehicles. Do you want to ask the question right now? Okay, sorry. And so regarding the duration, the permits will be valid for one year, July 1 to June 30 to coincide with the fiscal year. Residents would need to reapply annually. And then limits, oversized vehicle parking permits are limited for two permits per year, one for the resident and one for their guest. Additionally, permit holders would be, will need to be part on any street unless otherwise prohibited. So, all the parking restrictions must be observed. And the issuance of a permit would not need to allow the holder to, the issuance of a permit does not allow the holder to utilize hookups kind of reference earlier with the current municipal code revisions. It should be noted that obviously enforcement, the same regulations apply. You still would not be able to park more than 72 hours in one location. Permit holders would need to comply with street sweeping and permit holders would pay any applicable parking meter charges for all the spaces utilized as well. Violations obviously could be prosecuted in a fraction and be subject to citation or towing or both. And obviously the display or creation of fraudulent forge or altered or counterfeit permits or permit numbers is a misdemeanor as well. So, with that being said, the staff recommendation is to discuss and provide

direction where the city council would like to update the city's current regulations regarding the overnight parking of oversized vehicles and trailers. And with that, I'm available for questions from city council.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Napolitano.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Thank you, Your Honor. I guess I'm all concerned about some of the provisions. I think I'm leaning towards option number three, but that doesn't mean I agree with all the parameters that have been set here, and I think they should be adjusted along the way. I don't know why we would have a transferable guest permit, for example. I think offhand it should be assigned to a particular oversized vehicle, so it's better tracking. So, whoever is enforcing the rules can track who has permits and who does not. And as for the fee, you know, there's no cost to the resident guest permit. We're charging \$650 is recommended as a reduced fee for a deposit for administrative citation hearing. We charge for anything else. I don't know why we wouldn't charge for the resident obtaining a permit for using a public street, because that's what we're talking about here, parking on public streets, and generally those oversized vehicles don't move very often. But I'm open to other ideas, but I don't like the transferable, and I would

think that anyone coming in from outside the city is not tied necessarily to a resident, but might just be visiting, and how are we going to deal with permits for folks like those? They get a day permit, how many issued to that license plate per year or even per quarter or whatever else it might be. But I think there are some tweaks I would make to this, but in general, I could see the benefit of a permit system. But I know we haven't taken public input. I'll wait and hear from my colleagues and from the public.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: This item's on our agenda at Council's request, but I'm a little confused. What is the problem we're trying to solve here? I'm not clear what are the issues that warrant revisiting the 2011 series of ordinances. We only see a fraction of the number of residents that I would suspect we might see if, in fact, we are looking to overturn what was a balancing act that we approached in 2011. From staff's perspective, can you describe what the challenges are of the current system? I mean, I think I read that there have been no infractions as of 2023. Is that correct? Let's start there.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: No known citations have been given this year. We don't not have any records that we were able to pull up from the prior years, but this year, this past year, there were no citations given for oversized vehicles. With regard to why this issue is coming up, I am aware that there are concerns that have been raised in the community about unauthorized parking and a proliferation of traffic in the community. And I think City Council is responding to that and put this item on the agenda.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Can we take a closer look at the second option, which would give the chief status quo with the additional prohibited areas as designated by the police chief and city traffic engineer. Can you describe how that process would work?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: In the prior years, the police chief would meet with the traffic engineer and they would identify certain areas. And so I think at this point, if City Council did choose to direct us to move forward with option 2, a similar meeting would take place and additional areas that would be of concern would be identified as well.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: And just to ask maybe a follow-up question that I anticipated, let's presume there was a council majority that wanted to move forward with option 3. I recognize that this item would need to come back. But what are some of the logistical aspects of setting up a permit program? What would be involved in that?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: So, great question. Any sort of permit program would obviously need to lead an application process. We need to identify a department that would lead that application process. We have an idea. We need to determine, create permit placards for that. Thereafter, we would have to develop an internal protocol with applying for set permits. We'd have to notice the community for these permits as well with that pending requirement. And then obviously we'd have to train police officers for how to respond to these permits and what they would allow. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. With the additional sites that would come back to us, I was going to ask

if other elementary schools were considered, because I think I heard you say Pacific and Grandview, but I don't think other elementary schools were considered. Is that something that would be considered?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: If City Council did direct us to move forward with option two, definitely consider them. I believe the current ordinance has a stipulation that it has to be near schools, community centers, high traffic areas, near intersections. Yes. Prohibition of oversized vehicles. And so it would have to be in line with that. And if the police chief and the traffic engineer wanted to designate additional areas, it would have to be in conformance. And obviously, additional schools would be in conformance with the existing regulation.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Yeah, because I think back in the day when we discussed it, I believe, I think it was sort of a piecemeal policy trying to address certain vehicles that were causing issues. A couple other just questions. And guest passes, my understanding of the guest pass system would be, let's say my brother wants to drive out from Ohio in his camper, which he does. I would be in charge of it would be up to the resident to call and say, I need a temporary guest pass for my visitor who's

coming to stay with me for five days. And so that's how it would work. It wouldn't be that people who just want to come. It's not like an RV. It's not like Dockweiler or not Dockweiler, but the RV place down there where you actually can reserve a space. We're not like offering that up, right? It could be up to the homeowner.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Yeah, the current parameters as described to the City Council, the goal is to attribute it to a resident. And so there would be some accountability in place. And it would also allow the resident the flexibility, excuse me, allow the resident the flexibility to have a guest and have that option.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Yes. Of course, if I'm mad at my brother, I don't get him to pass. He gets a ticket. And then we got some public comment or an e-mail, I think my colleagues received it too, that actually I thought pretty interesting. There's been a lot of people have been buying those Sprinter vans or the comparable Ford Transit, you know, as a camper or whatnot. So, I've seen more and more of those. But as per the staff report and our policy, those actually don't fit, you know, they actually would not meet the requirements for being regular sized. They would meet the requirements for being oversized as

is with the ore, right, because they're eight feet long. I think we would be wise to if whatever we decide to do to taste that into consideration because there has been many, many more of those being bought. So that's a changing circumstance from the last time this was done. And so I think we would need to either carve something out or consider that. So that's it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you, Your Honor. So, George, mind us all here. State law is 72 hours. So, it doesn't matter. 72 hours. We're doing the same thing the state does. We had no permits at all. 72 hours would still make the same thing happen. So, a reminder of it here, institutional knowledge. Three of us were here. We had the same issue. It started originally, what, 2009. It came up because we're having a problem with RVs parking for a long period of time near our schools and playgrounds. So of course, everybody gets, you know, no issues back then but let's make it safe. Let's keep RVs ban from playgrounds and schools, right? Common sense. Then we saw that RV moved, whack-a-mole part that moves over to Rosecrans right behind the part view where the golf course is. What happens? They start taking over Parkview. So, we may outlaw Park, turn over at 2 o'clock in the morning to 5 in the morning.

No parking. Didn't say RVs. Said no parking period. 2 a.m. to 5 a.m. So of course, if you're in RV or regular car, you're going to move, aren't you? And you go somewhere else. So, this is what, it's all started all over again. Councilman Lesser's issue, the reason why this came up, we're seeing the proliferation of more RVs than we've seen since that time. Whether it's a result, unintended consequence of the Playa del Rey and Forks for the Action by L.A., we're seeing more of them. There's not a residence parking in front of your house loading up the RV to the Big Bear. There are others that we've never seen before. Neighbors call and say, Richard, this is one of ours. Need to call to market and get it moved. So, we're playing this game. Tick-tack-toe. Hello, the city. I don't want to be an admin person and drop it on the cheese plate. This is an admin function. This should be simple. Option number three with Steve's comments, of course, I agree with about. It needs to be simple. Needs to be straightforward. Admin fee, whatever our cost is, you put that cost on there? It's not free to folks. So, whatever it's got to be make it simple. Easy to follow if you're going to spin a van fine hook it up. Call us get a permit five minutes. You're done This is not a difficult process. Let's make it simple. You don't need 15 pages to get this, right? So, option three, I agree with you Steve. It shouldn't be Free-for-all. Hang tag move 10 vehicles tied to the vehicle. You're going

to own you're going to use right. Simple, no transfer fees. Your buddy down the street to park his car there and go from there. So, I'm fine. We wouldn't afford with you with the comments that we have I don't think it's going to happen overnight But I'm loathe to drop this on PD and the City Attorney to have them draw this up We'll be stuck six months talking about this again Thank you, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay to continue with some questions, I'd like to ask a couple please. Has there been an influx, you know, there's this whole concept that we're learning about now a van lords, you know, people who rent out the vans and then the vans move, you know, from place to place. Have we seen an increase of that? If not, just in our area but from our sister cities and neighboring cities?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: It's certainly a topic that's been discussed at the regional level within the South Bay You know, particularly South Bay City's Council of Governments of necessarily van lords, but just you know, additional oversized vehicles that have been prevalent in the area, in the region, I should say.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, and so I mean we got some history here, but has this been sort of an unprecedented, you know, we saw what happened at Bologna Creek, and we saw what happened at other areas. Is that fairly unprecedented? Where these vehicles are moving? Trying to find a place to stay?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: I'd say this is a topic that is, I don't want to say unprecedented, but it's certainly a topic that has shown up more recently. Obviously, Covid everything had been you know, what during the Covid period all these sorts of topics kind of stopped. Prior to Covid, I don't recall this topic coming up but more recently, this topic has come up, yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, the permitting process, so we've done, have we done that in other neighborhoods? I mean do we have sort of the infrastructure? We do that relatively efficiently.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: We still need to talk about it internally from a staff perspective but we do have examples of parking permit programs that finance overseas. We do have temporary permits given to, let's say, construction vehicles as well. So, there are some institutional knowledge

that we can certainly use in order to stand up a similar program but we'll definitely need to pull together, you know, a variety of departments and make sure this program is run Officially and smoothly.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I know I can add to this. Those of us who are here when we're Costa parking program. We have run a perfect permit program before. It worked well around Mira Costa. So, we're not inexperienced. We have done it a long time but it worked. It solved the problem. It was simple.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah, and it's up to which of our agencies to monitor that and enforce it community service officers code enforcement?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: We would still probably need to work that out internally, but I think our first guess is probably our community service officers our PACS team but we'll give you an update on that once if the council does direct us to come back with an ordinance. I'll give you, for sure answer when that comes back.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Great. Thank you. No further questions Colleagues? Go to public comments.

RITA CRABTREE-KAMPE: Good evening honorable Mayor and Council members. Rita Crabtree-Kampe. I just wanted to make a comment. I also noted that some people wrote in and said that there are some vehicles that tend to not fit this. I just want to make sure that family vehicles that they use for everyday transportation or even further vacations or whatever they do, don't get disqualified, like, they can't not have them parked on the streets anymore. So, I would want to make sure that that is definitely an option for people. I am a proponent of option number three. I'd like to keep the permits only for administration. I don't want to look at the costs being absurd, and then a second question that came up in your discussion was for somebody for example, Mayor Pro-Tem's brother comes in visits. Can she get a five-day pass? Is that something they get a permit for or does it just get to park on the street and then have to move every 72 hours? Just that it would be outlined. That would be an easy to understand and very simple application process. And then as far as, have we seen an increase in some vehicles? We actually have and we've had in the last year and a half two years, we've had an issue with some people who are continuing to park and we're having some and that does fall in the realm of people living in their vehicles? And so we have had some issues how to enforce either moving or having to get their

cars registered, etc. So, if this permit policy did come in place, it would be something that the authorities would be able to say, well, hey, you at least have to get a permit or pay for the space, etc. So, thanks things to consider. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Rita. We get the whole Kampe family.

STEFAN KAMPE: Good evening, Mayor. I'm Rita's husband. That's how most people know me. So, I was really pleased to hear that we didn't have a lot of issues last year. That's very positive. So, I think that was good news. I think Rita and her observations with MB Safe kind of tells it a slightly different story there. What I think would be really good is when we talk about this next time is let's give some real-life examples of what we think is okay and what we think is not okay. So, for example, you know, if we have residents with oversized vehicles, they're going to use it as transition, right? So, they're going to have a long-term parking somewhere. So, if they need a permit because they're staging it between trips, great, you know. If we have tourists coming into town, you know, that they're going to stop for the day, okay. Well, they probably don't have time to get a permit but they're not allowed to spend overnight. Okay, but maybe we can get some examples that we have. What's not okay

in my mind would be, you know, parking in the high-use areas. We don't want big vehicles downtown and we don't want people sleeping in those things overnight as well. When I look at the options, please consider maybe combining options two and three. I think there's good pieces in both of those. Thank you so much.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right. Thank you So we have—

WILLIAM VICTOR: Hi, my name is William Victor and I happen to be here for other reasons. All right. I have a property I had a fire and some anti-semitics decided to stir people up and have my property demolished, okay. I've had it, I've been a citizen of this town and paid taxes since 1980, I think, but maybe longer, but I just want to say, I don't and the City Attorney was very involved in the whole thing and he choreographed a meeting on September 6th, okay. I have a parking. I have a 30 by 90 lot. It's going to be demolished against my wishes and maybe a court case involving that, okay, because my property only had a fire that affected one unit. I have some licensed structural engineers who have come up and said whatever is necessary, no more than one unit of the three that I have has to be repaired, okay. And then, there was a hearing. The hearing never, the attorneys couldn't get the connection. So, it didn't take place on November 30th. Okay, so and that, the lawyers that

I paid 20 grand to did return some of the money but I just want to tell you, I don't like the whole thing. I think, it's a hate crime. The people who started the whole thing and have whipped it up have called people dirty Jews and I don't go for that in Manhattan Beach. Okay. I am so surprised. I really had to ask these people what they said and they repeated it. They even said some of their best friends are Jews. Thank you, Mayor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Mr. Victor. Anybody else? Welcome. Good evening.

TIM JONES: Good evening, in listening to this particular topic a question rose in my mind. I'm an outdoorsman. So, the trailer necessarily is a would be four seasons. As far as I'm concerned but there are people that I know that actually do have motor homes that may come from outside of town, and it is kind of perplexing to me to say that you cannot park your trailer anywhere in Manhattan Beach because your trailer is, basically, banned. So, to speak, at public parking places not everyone has a trailer that they tow a car on. So, they literally bring their RV and they drive in and they may want to go to a restaurant. If the restaurant parking lot is full, they can't reach. They all go to a meter spot. So, the question is this particular ordinance literally saying that RVs, on even a

short-term basis, are banned from parking. Option 3 mind you, are they banned from parking at a public parking place? That's it. Thanks.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you, Tim. Anybody else? How about zoom?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you. So, I'm going to close public comments. Colleagues? Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Yeah, I think, I have a couple more questions. So, if we were to go with option three, it would, the permit for the resident, so with, for their RV is free. As currently proposed, which I personally think is right because people have been doing that for a long time, and it's like, I don't know. I just say all of a sudden to change that doesn't feel right, but the other questions I have is that the permit program states that no oversized vehicle parking at any time without a permit, but if they have a permit, they still would have to move it every 72 hours. Okay, so even if they get a permit, they can't leave it there. That's important, but we

can't ban it. A couple people have said a few things about, well, overnight is okay. We can't make it less than 72 hours because that's a state law. So, we can't say, even if you're, if you don't have a permit. So, here's the thing, let's say my brother comes. Just let him stay in the house. He's the one who wants to drive anyway. Are we legally allowed to ban his camper without a permit or does he, does the state provide the ability to park on the street for up to 72 hours? Are we even legally allowed to do this?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yeah, so I should address that. Yeah, there's several cities in California and other places that ban overnight parking for all cars. I think San Marino does that, Beverly Hills.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: We could do, that's great. I just want to be sure, okay, good. I'll tell him that. All right, but no I appreciate it. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you, your honor. Well, I heard a comment earlier that we didn't have any 2023 infractions. Just because we didn't have any infractions it

doesn't mean that didn't happen. We have a lot of people get noticed. They knock on the door. I tell the guy you can't park here. Whatever's going to happen, they going to move. Just because it was written up doesn't mean didn't show up. It means they moved for 72 hours. They get marked and they're gone. So that's one item to Tim's point. They're all California cities, especially, coastal cities that have permit parking in place. It's not new folks. We're not starting a new idea here. And I think, if we're going to have permits, if I have George or someone to run up for me, it's a cost of his time to oversee a permit manager program. It can't be fee unless you're getting with discounts on George's time. And so, look, I need to equal the cost of the time going to put into it unless, you would give him a waiver. When he got a fee waiver, that's up to you, but we should have a program that pays administration fees for it or get a negative on it for what a year or two. So, I like option three and I'll make that motion with the modification, the permits must be tied to the vehicle in question. It's not transferable to your, to Amy's brother's truck. It has to be stuck to that vehicle period. No handouts, you know, the guest thing or not a guest thing. They treat it like a separate incident and go from there. So, I'll stop.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Clarification and potential friendly amendment before there. The clarification is I don't think the resident permit should be stuck to that thing that vehicle. Option three permits a guest permit on occasion. So, you're still okay with that?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Would you accept a friendly amendment to exempt residents from the permit fee for the first year of the policy?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I'm going to hold it. I'd wait and see what the cost is going to be. Okay, oversee that. I'm like a blank check of \$500,000. So, I'll wait and see what the cost is.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I Think we can work with our existing ordinance with direction to our chief and our traffic engineer to find additional areas where RVs should not be parked. That would be option two. So, with due respect, I will not be supporting the motion. I think, there's been an absence

of facts. There's been an absence of information about the specific problem that we're trying to solve here. This is a major undertaking that we're talking about. Doing here which is going to impact law abiding citizens who own trailers and own RVs, and will be subject to needing to get permits. I also think we're overlooking the fact that this is going to involve staffing in our city. We already have questions of our increased city expenditures. There's going to be costs. There's going to be logistics involved in this and again, when more residents hear about what we're proposing, I think they would, they would be here in larger numbers to or at least express their opinion of a different type. So, I would be in favor of option two. I think it's perfectly reasonable to expand upon our existing ordinance to prohibit additional areas where we are seeing problems.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Napolitano.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Thank you. I don't disagree with Councilmember Lesser. I think, this is a bit of a can of worms. As I said, I am leaning towards option three but really to review what that would be when it comes back in its final form. I think there would be a lot of unintended consequences here or at least people waking up to this and saying oh, wait a

minute, no, I wasn't paying attention, and now I'm not happy about it as going to what the problem is that we're trying to address. I'm going to throughout my theory that what we're trying to address is people living in cars in Manhattan Beach. And we don't want that. We want them to take housing. We want them to take services. We have outreach. We have MB safe. We have our own efforts. We've got a coordinator and sometimes those folks resist and when they Resisting they just move from place to place and we want to help those folks But you know, this is a way to do that by forcing the hand of sorts At the same time though, you know, we're going to be dragging in a whole lot of Residents to do that and you know, there are other reasons I understand to address oversized vehicles Some folks have to live with them on their street that they don't want to see them It's like oh the neighbor always parks out there. They don't want to complain to the neighbor, but they put it to us So that's another issue but you know, we haven't received really enough complaints to generate a whole new Program so far. I'm willing to look at it. I'm not sold on it yet. I'm like, this is the other council business where we need three votes to go forward. I'll join the majority to go forward and see what it looks like, but I'm still going to reserve final approval for this because you know, there are some court cases that are making their way to the Supreme Court that could help cities

address the situation. I think is the primary concern of this community and not necessarily just the fact that a car is eight feet tall or one inch tall and 22 and a half feet or something like that. So, I'll reserve judgment, but I'm willing to see what is brought back. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Thank you, Mayor. I'll just, before I had kind of a clarifying question now, I just want to give my comments. You know, I think you said it well, Councilmember Napolitano, about, I believe, we're going to capture too many residents in this policy. That's going to be an unintended consequence. Yet, I have, I guess, empathy for, not empathy for and understanding that there is a problem when there are people living in their vehicles, and they're parked in a neighborhood over 24 hours or overnight. There are safety concerns for everybody, the people in the vehicles and the residents. So, but I don't think this is the answer. So, I appreciate you. So, you're going to withhold judgment. See what comes back. I'm going to not be voting to move it forward for the same reasons that Councilmember Lesser said. So Okay, I'd like to find another way to address the living in vehicles.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay George if I may just ask another question. So, does this only apply to the public street? Can a homeowner or an RV owner park it in their own private driveway? As long as that completely fits on it and doesn't block the sidewalk?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Yes. This ordinance would be intended to address people, would be able to address oversized vehicles on the public street.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Good news for your brother.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: When you say that though, the public street because for instance, the pier parking lots are open 24 hours. The state requires a student state-owned parking lot and the meters there, and like, the rest of downtown are there for 24 hours, and that's a parking lot not a public street. And if you have a disabled placard, there's no time limits. You can stay there as, you know, live in that van or camper or whatever it might be for as long as you want. Is that correct? Because this wouldn't apply to them.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: This would not apply to the pier lot, correct.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: that state law 72 hours and now right.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And for any vehicle or just the disabled?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Just disabled parking placards are entitled to long duration of stay. As well as, no fees associated with it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And can people live in, you know, spend the night in the vehicle or is it still no overnight camping?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Actually, take that back disabled parkers are only good for on-street parking. No time limits for on-street parking.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yeah, the proposal. It's very similar to what option three is similar to what Hermosa has forever. One hour parking and that's one of the programs that George looked at. So back to your question though, yes. There's no we had this issue with the state parking lot. They're requiring it to stay open. And so anyone can stay there.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, but how about spending the night?

CITY MANAGER: Yes, I mean through the night.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes, through the night. Okay, so getting back to Mayor Pro-Tem's private driveway and her brother, can they hook up extension cords and lines and everything like that?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: I have to read the exact language in the orders, but I think the ordinance indicated that it's going across the sidewalk and onto the public street. In terms of hookups.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: okay, so on a private driveway.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Yeah, what goes on the private driveway? I don't believe the city can regulate that. It's what our regulations as it is currently. In the Municipal Code right now is intended to address hookups that are stemming from the residents across the public right-of-way, and are on the public right-of-way.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay All right, great. Thank you for answering that. So, you know, I know some RV owners that I would say, you know, a responsible RV owner. Stores it in an RV storage facility and then when they're ready to use it, they'll bring it to their home. They'll Load of provisions, you know, that may take a day or two. So, you know, they would have, I'm leaning towards option three. I'm looking at this scenario. They would have the permit for it. They could go ahead and load up their provisions and go on their trip and then come back and do the opposite. They can leave it there while they have a day or two or three to clean it, and then they, you know, drive it back to the RV storage. We have small lots. We have small streets. They're very narrow, you know. We're not built up to be an RV recreational community on our streets. It's a safety issue. It just people are out walking. They're walking their dogs, kids are riding their bikes, they're coming back from school, and to have to go around to be, you know, a big vehicle is dangerous. There are issues of, you know, is it being properly stored and locked when it's on the street. So I was asking so many questions about the permitting because I don't think it is something that will be new to us. And It's just like anything else in our small communities. People communicate and if they see that hey, over there that city they're not, you know, they

don't have permits. There's going to be a migration of people over to that city because they don't have permits at either doesn't cost, again going back to the responsible RV owner if they are going to be here, they're going to be a guest with the resident, you know, they will look into this. I mean they spend you know, RV owners, you know, the lament I hear is that, you know, they can't get into the national parks. They can't you know, okay, you know, it takes a lot of planning and they're used to doing that planning. I don't see any reason why they wouldn't do that planning if they were visiting Manhattan Beach. They would, you know, they know that it's an oversized vehicle and if there is an expectation of a permit, I think they would go ahead and seek that permit and even pay for that permit. It's just like everything else. We got a kind of look out for the irresponsible, you know, RV owners and taking advantage of, you know, I call it the gaps, you know, like my favorite gap is down at the pier, you know, you got one agency that takes care of the pier. The other agency takes care of the bike path, the other agency takes care of the strand, and you know, another agency for the parking lot. So, they're, you know, they're some things fall through the gap, but I think, what our residents on the whole would like to see, it would be this regulated. So that people don't take advantage of it, that it makes our, doesn't become a nuisance in the neighborhood. They want a little bit of

backing and I think it was, you know, everything I've seen an option number three. And I agree with you, Councilmember Napolitano. I'd like to see the finished product so that we don't miss something there, but I think it's time to look at this. I mean, we're really living in these unprecedented times and we want to make sure that we're at least equivalent or close to what our neighbors have because just turn on the engine and roll and go over to the place where the restrictions are not as stringent. So that's where I'm leaving.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Because you withdrew your motion, right.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: No, I made the motion. I made the motion to follow option three with a second from the mayor. okay, with the comment that the permit must stick with the registered vehicle period.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yeah, it's not the only question I have and this is also from my experience in Hermosa, there's two different types of guest permits. There's the one-day permit that you can buy when you're having parties and there's also the guest placard that can be transferable. It's clear from the

consensus here that you don't want a transferable guest parking pass.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: No, my comment is, my motion is to include only the vehicle with the property owner period.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: And so no one-day guest permits.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: But the tag can't transfer from point A to point B.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: It would be a different type of permit. But so that's still under consideration when this comes back. That one-day permit.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: You had the motion. You had the second. Yes, call the question.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: I look forward to seeing the report when it comes back.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: You mean George.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, three-two.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Break your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay colleagues. Yeah, let's have a break. Let's have a 12-minute break. Okay. Thank you. Next agenda item, welcome back, and next agenda item is item number 16. Consideration of field reservation and per player fee adjustments and creation of a turf replacement plan and Parks Recreation Director Leyman.

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: Thank you. Honorable Mayor members of the City Council. Archie Sherman, our Senior Recreation Supervisor, will be presenting this item.

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR SHERMAN: Good evening, Mayor Franklin and members City Council. The Parks and Recreation Commission, oh, sorry perfect place to start right recommendation. I'm here tonight to discuss the proposed field reservation and per player fee adjustments for fiscal year 24 and 25 as well as the creation of a turf Placement plan using revenue from the increase in per player fees, and matching funds from the general fund being no less than \$50,000 per budget year. The proposals were inspired by the recent marine Avenue Park Field returf project which is about to finish up and

looking amazing. By the way, in the past, the original installations for both our synthetic turf fields being marine soccer and Manhattan Village were heavily funded by the local youth Organizations in exchange for 10-year MOU agreements, which would secure their field space throughout that time. The current Marine turf project is being funded by a combination of the city and grant funding by having the city fund returfs. It eliminates the need to negotiate with user groups for financial contributions in exchange for those 10-year agreements. With the new model, the synthetic turf field, allocations will be controlled and allocated just as the grass fields are for our current field use policy. Marine soccer fields returf will be completed this week in Manhattan village. Returf is due fiscal year 28-29, which sets future projects five years apart from each other between the two fields. The lifespan of synthetic fields runs approximately 10 years. By creating a turf replacement plan, city would be able to accumulate yearly revenue from the user groups and matching funds to cover the majority cost of the future returfs of our two synthetic turf fields. To keep competitive with other municipal field, rental rates as well as reflect the increased cost for maintaining and providing access to these fields. Staff is recommending adjusting current field rental fees for fiscal year 24-25, and scheduling an annual consumer price index adjustment not to

exceed 3% for each subsequent year, and on the current side, you'll see since 2019, the beginning of that year, we started with the current rental rates per hour and below our proposed field rental rates. As well as, we broke a couple of heavy hitter fields from the school being bagged center field, Pacific and MBMS, especially, bag with compliments of the pec reservoir project last year. We got the new LED lighting converted to that. So, it's a more in demand field. So, we increase those prices even more.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Can you speak up a little bit? Archie, and then go more into the mic next time? It's kind of hard to hear, Thank you.

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR SHERMAN: So, the current proposed and user group rates in addition, current user group for player fees range from 25 to \$100 per residence, and 3 or 35 to 110 dollars per non-residents. These are collected every spring and fall season. Monthly charges to the user groups are also collected for field lights, porta-potty rentals, and room rental fees when the field space is available. The city also allocates that field to non-user group rentals, which include individuals and teams. Total revenue among all the user groups reaches 400,000 annually. The proposed per field fees include a

\$5 increase for each category is outlined on the slide along with \$1 increases each year afterwards. If the proposed fee adjustments are implemented in July 1st of 2024, annual projected revenue will increase roughly 45,000 for fiscal year 24-25, increasing an additional \$9,000 each subsequent year.

Okay, back to where I started. The Parks and Recreation Commission and staff recommend creating a turf replacement plan to accumulate resources for replacement of each synthetic turf field every 10 years. Revenues received from the per player fee adjustments will be allocated to the fund and the city will transfer a matching amount no less than \$50,000 from the general fund at the end of each fiscal year. Aggregated funds are estimated to be sufficient to cover the cost of replacing Manhattan Village in fiscal year 28-29 and marine field again, in 23 or sorry 2033 and 34. If there's a short fall for the first project as funds accumulate, grant funds from the LA County regional parks and open spaces Measure A grant program could cover the difference. In Conclusion, staff recommends the City Council just field reservation and per player fees for fiscal year 24-25. Include an annual CPI adjustment not to exceed 3% for field renters the rentals each subsequent year. Include an annual dollar increase per player fees each subsequent year. Establish a turf replacement plan in the capital improvement program for future turf replacements, and

allocate revenues from the fee adjustments, as well as, matching funds Less than 50,000 from the general fund to the CIP each budget year beginning fiscal year 2024 and 2025, to fund future turf replacements. And with that, open to any questions, but I wanted to give a little sneak peek what marine field. I took this earlier this morning and so it's pretty cool to have our new logo on that one. And we'll stop the City Seal on Manhattan Village, Yeah, it came out really good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Any questions, colleagues?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I have one your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you, Archie. This is our fifth time talking about this. So, remind me again, the first-time person attending our rates are determined by what a survey our cost of replace? How do you set rates?

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR SHERMAN: Comparable for our hourly field user grades rates and we haven't Updated those again. We created that policy last, it was December 2018, and so

we started implementing those in 2019. And we just wanted to be comparable to other cities.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So, we're talking Torrance, Redondo, everybody else out there.

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR SHERMAN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: That's all I've got for now.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Colleagues, anybody else? No questions? Okay, I'd like to open public comments. Open public comments. Anybody want to? Oh, yeah, so if anybody wants to make a public comment on this issue, please come on down. If you're going to be in line. Come on down and sit down at one of the chairs down here place stuff on here again.

STEFAN KAMPE: Just like the question. Maybe you could answer for me is I just don't know how does it work with the fees? because it's a per player fee? How does that work and just because I haven't used those fields and haven't had to pay that fee. I'm just interested to know how our residents get billed?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Any other questions any other comments? On Zoom

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. I'm going to close public comments and Archie can you answer that question, please?

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR SHERMAN: Sure. So, we have two groups. Our biggest thing and this goes along with the field policy for the user groups that we created in 2018, as well. So, our heaviest use is from our eight user groups, which are based upon, which we categorize between as low as 100% pure recreation based nonprofit organizations to for-profit club groups. They all have to be resident based. That's how you get in that and their other protocols as well but that's how you get in those eight groups, that are the ones assessed the per player fee. That's the heavy fundage of that over \$400,000. It's a pass-through though, right? They clocked in hand it over to us correct twice a year, so They're billed their big rosters are for the spring and for the fall every season. So midway through the season will bill based on the rosters. Correct, right and

then the field rentals by the hourly are what? Are the individual reservations not related to those user groups?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you. I just stay there for a second. So those who don't know how we do our system, how long the city members in charging for user fees resident. All right, non-resident. How long are the years have been charging for user fees before my time?

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR SHERMAN: Doing this 2005 for the sports but so that's what really created the per player fee is because with the evolution of club groups where they're charging thousands of dollars per year compared to, AYSO that might be \$150 for their season. So, was it fair to charge? You know the same price for both organizations per hour.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: You said you have support from your surveys in other cities. We're not out of line out of whack We're not too high. We're not on our fees We're probably mid-range of anything and I remember they're using turf meant to replace folks. It's not free.

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR SHERMAN: Correct. So, and it's really because of the synthetic turf fields and the demand for those across, you know the nation really.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you, Archie. Nothing further, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Well, I have made a motion to accept the recommendations. I'll make some comments too, but first, let's see a jet weight in my, let me, let's make sure I get the language correct here. Yes, I will approve the consideration of field reservation and per player fee adjustments and creation of a turf replacement plan as outlined in the staff report, which includes adjusting the player fees for fiscal year 24 25 Annual consumer price index of CPI adjustment not to exceed 3% for field rentals each subsequent year annual \$1 increase of per player fees each subsequent year and the turf replacement plan as long as I've been involved, I guess, what 2011? It's always been a problem. The problem being outlined like all of a sudden, we realized that the field is getting the turf. It's going to need replaced and we are so lucky that we have these groups. So, we'll raise hundreds of

thousands of dollars, but it hasn't. We've relied on the kindness of strangers. If you will or you know friendly strangers, but it also hasn't been fair right? It has then been allotted to the people who've been able to pay money to help fund it not exclusively. So, beyond the fairness issue though. I really want to applaud staff and the Commission. I think this is such a smart plan and it allows for growth every year. It doesn't just say okay, we're charging X amount now. We came up with a number and that's what we're charging out includes a CPI increase, and it includes a dollar per player per year. It's in line with other cities. It's smart. It provides wonderful playing fields for the future. So, I am grateful that people put time into this. And now, we don't have to have all these different groups coming down and saying, do something. And it's great.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Anybody else?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I made a second, your honor. I'm good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. I just want to make a comment. I remember my AYSO coaching days back in the 90s, and that field was notorious for giving birth to rocks and stones. And I don't

know where they came from, but that was a pretty rough field. And I liked the first turfing. And I'm really proud of this turfing for just the reasons that you mentioned, but it's going to protect the players, and it's going to protect, I guess, older adults. Archie, do you know older players play there as well? So, I think, just in terms of injuries and safety it's going to be a lot better. So, great job on putting together a not only a feasible plan, but then one that's sustainable to fund its own replacement in 10 years, because we didn't have that way back then. So, this is just a great template for other fields. So, thank you and so we have a motion by Mayor Pro-Tem Amy Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Richard Montgomery.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you Well done, okay, and we move on to agenda item number 17. Consideration of Juneteenth community events in 2024 Park and Recs, Parks and Recreation director again, Mark Leyman.

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: Good evening, honorable Mayor, members of the City Council. Mark Leyman, your Parks and Recreation Director. I wanted to provide a brief background on this item. I will also address budgeting and

funding and then, I will turn it over to Karri Bell, our Senior Recreation Supervisor, to talk about the event proposals. So at the beginning in April 2023, the city council directed the Parks and Recreation Commission and staff to develop a robust plan to hold a Juneteenth event in 2024, and look at several possible locations for these events. On December 5th 2023, city council considered recommendations for two Juneteenth events in 2024. A small event at Bruce's Beach Park on June 19th and a larger event at Polliwog Park on Saturday, June 22nd. The estimated cost for both these events were not to exceed \$30,000. City Council also directed staff to review funding options at the December meeting, and to continue the discussion to this evening, January 16th, to allow the public more time to review the proposals. Regarding the funding options, staff received a proposal from an anonymous donor to provide \$15,000 through the MBX foundation. If council approves the events, the donor requests a city match for an overall budget of \$30,000. One option would be to allocate \$15,000 from the general fund and direct staff to offset the cost with additional donations. Staff has reached out to possible donors and anticipates approximately \$10,000 being secured if City Council direct staff to move forward with these events. Further, the anonymous donor also committed \$30,000 through MBX for Juneteenth events in 2025 and 2026 \$15,000 each year with matching funds. And I would like to recognize, Gary

Wayland, who is present from MBX. He will be available to answer any questions after the presentation via those specific to the donor or MBX. I'd also like to take the opportunity to recognize again the ad-hoc committee members, Tracy Wines, Larry Zimbalist, Daniel Greenberg, the Parks and Recreation Commission, and this community members, that took the time to share their community input and provide other input from the survey as well. So, with that, I will now turn it over to Karri Bell our Senior Recreation Supervisor to run through the event proposals.

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR BELL: Good evening, Mayor and City Council members. I'm Karri Bell, and I'm here to talk about the specifics of the Juneteenth events. So, there are two Juneteenth events that were recommended by the Parks and Recreation Commission. The first is a Juneteenth ceremony at Bruce's Beach Park and the proposed date is Wednesday, June 19th 2024, from 10 a.m. To 11 a.m. Oh Sorry, okay, so the date and time is Wednesday, June 19th 2024, from 10 to 11, like, I stated. And the plan is to have comments from City Council members at that event, Police Chief Rachel Johnson, a local historian, and a representative from the Mira Costa Black Scholars Union, to speak about the meaning and the significance of Juneteenth. Some of the event enhancements will be a gospel

music, a Juneteenth educational activity for kids, and refreshments. Okay, according to the Manhattan Beach school district, Grandview Elementary School parking lot is available for the June 19th event for overflow parking before during and after the event. I think that was one of the questions that came up at the last meeting. So the second event that the Parks and Recreation Commission proposed was a Juneteenth celebration on June 22nd 2024, and the date and time is Saturday, June 22nd 2024, from 11 a.m. To 3 p.m. And the location is Polliwog Park, and the vision for this event is to commemorate the end of slavery in the United States, and honor and celebrate African American history and culture, which is American history. And the plan for this event is to have a professional jazz concert, DJ dancing, art family, and educational activities, vendors and food trucks. And for this cultural celebration, we would like to partner with black business owners, musicians, and performers from Manhattan Beach and neighboring cities. The Parks and Recreation Commission as well as, the participants that attended our community meetings also emphasized the importance of using African American business owners and musicians from Manhattan Beach in the neighboring Cities since this is a Juneteenth event. It is important that the vendors represent the culture that is being remembered and celebrated. Another recommendation from the Parks and Recreation Commission was to utilize a local

event coordinator with experience planning a Juneteenth celebration to leverage expertise lessons learned and connections for successful implementation of the first year of the city sponsored event in Manhattan Beach. So, the budget range for this event would be \$21,000 to \$23,500. So, the funding options as explained by Mark Leyman. As he talked about, we have a private donation of \$15,000 and this could also be given to us each year 2024, 2025, and 2026. And staff has also reached out to corporate sponsorships. And we anticipate on getting ten thousand for that and then of course, the general fund allocation which would be up to City Council. So the total for both events would not exceed 30,000. And any remaining funds would be used for future Juneteenth events. So Staff is requesting direction on plans and funding for a Juneteenth ceremony at Bruce's Beach Park on June 19th 2024, and a Juneteenth celebration at Polliwog Park on June 22nd 2024. That concludes the presentation, and I'd be happy to answer any questions you may have.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, colleagues any questions?
Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank You, your honor.
Karri, a good plan set up. But when you run the event past PD,

public works, those numbers will change based on what your cost of fee, is just run that past them, and tell us, what the number will be because I know it's not going to be as low as what you put here as parks and rec costs, but the event in the city touches our streets or parking needs to have parking enforcement PD. Look at it especially all the vehicles showing up in that morning no place to park. We all know that. So, parking at Grandview is one relief, but then someone to oversee all that so I would just add in your cost whatever chief Johnson needs for to maintain the order down there and parking enforcement. I think we're good to go.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Council members received an inquiry about how this event aligns with other regional events in honor of Juneteenth. I believe there was reference to that in a prior staff report, but I didn't see it here. Can you explain what the city of El Segundo is doing, for example, and when? And any other regional events that might tie into this one?

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR BELL: Right, I'm not sure of the specific date that El Segundo has selected however, we're

working with them. So, we're going to make sure that we're not picking the same day.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yeah, thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Any other questions? So, Karri, I have a question. I had the same question about other cities. What is the predominant date because it comes in the middle of the week? June 19th that other cities, you know broaden it to throughout Los Angeles County potential draws for our event. What are the dates that other cities are actually celebrating, you know Juneteenth?

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR BELL: Right, from my experience, I can only say that a lot of cities do the Juneteenth event the Saturday before Juneteenth or after. So, it just varies every city is different, but for our neighboring cities, we would definitely check in with them to make sure, you know check, it in with the dates and definitely with El Segundo. So that we're not overlapping. We want to work together with other cities.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, is there a way to get like definite information? I mean, I know it's about six months away,

but to actually go to different sites, you know or even call your colleagues that at those cities to get a more definitive date?

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR BELL: There's a chance that they've already booked it, but I can't speak on all the other cities, but I can always reach out to them.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay All right, and let's see. Almost is it. Is it generally, I know you're fairly new, you know with us, but is it generally When we go out and seek donors for this type of event you mentioned that the \$10,000 is anticipatory. You anticipate 10,000. I mean is that, it is that a realistic amount? Could it be more?

SENIOR RECREATION SUPERVISOR BELL: I'll let Mark speak up.

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: Excellent question, Mayor. Yes. I think it's a conservative number. We have heard from a number of potential donors and I feel strongly that the 10,000 is a conservative number that they would contribute towards this event. There again waiting on City Council direction.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Is it, would the sponsorship be just here's the money or would they expect signage or Some programming.

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR LEYMAN: I think we we'd want to provide some deliverables again signage and the advertisements, you know, it probably minimal overall, but standard to what we see in other city events.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Mm-hmm. Okay. Great. Thank you. No further questions, I'm going to open up public comments. Yeah, so you've seen, so come on down and then who's ever next come on down as well. Anyway, and do we have two minutes?

DONNAE WARD: Greetings again, City Council members. My name is Donnae Ward, and I am the president of the Black Lives Union at Mira Costa High School. I come here along with my fellow club mates and advisors to speak on behalf of not only the students of Mira Costa, but the Manhattan, the residents of Manhattan Beach as well. We believe that it is extremely important to host an annual Juneteenth celebration to commemorate the freedom of African Americans, and to also showcase the beauty of our culture by embracing and appreciating these cultural expressions. We strengthen the bonds that tie our

community together, creating a vibrant and inclusive environment for everyone. Certain individuals state that we as young individuals are merely subject to the influence of our teachers. Suggesting that we are easily swayed by the opinions of adults. However, this assertion bears an inconsistency How could our teachers exert influence over us to engage in activities beyond the scope of the school's authority? Moreover, even if they were to persuade us to attend this meeting the diversity of our individual speeches each presenting a distinct personal perspective stands as evidence against the notion of outside control as Stated in the previous meeting There is a tendency among us to focus solely on the superficial aspect of the issue in this case being the relevance of students voices. Given their inactive contributions to taxes. However, we must delve into the deeper layers of the situation The purpose of this event extends beyond just an expenditure of tax dollars It is a commemoration aimed at expressing gratitude and reflecting upon the enduring struggles faced by our community over centuries. This event is not a mere appropriation of funds. Rather it is an exploration of the historical journey of African Americans acknowledging the challenges we have overcome. It serves as a celebration of the progress that allows our people to aspire to have equal standing on the global stage fostering the potential for greatness among our people. Furthermore, hosting a Juneteenth celebration lets

the nation know that Manhattan Beach stands with the idea of unity. It conveys the message that we all stand together regardless of our backgrounds to celebrate freedom and equality. Let us take this step towards a more inclusive future where every resident feels seen heard and value, regardless of their tax status. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, sir. Yes. Come on, This is good practice who's in model, you in come on.

RYAN KIM: Sorry about that. All right. Hello to all city council members. My name is Ryan Kim and I represent the black scholars Union Club as secretary. Today, I am making a statement that not only stands among the students in our club and at my high school, also, the citizens of Manhattan Beach who have never gotten the opportunity including me to witness African American culture in its truest essence. I say this for myself because growing up in a predominantly white community in New Jersey, I was never really given the opportunity to be shared with others about African American culture until moving to California and was able to understand how extremely important it meant for my peers to be black. How my friends, I have known for so long up to this point, had strongly and persistently encouraged me that I would fit in and share their stories. Even

if I was not black. I immediately learned that the purpose of the black scholars Union was to create a safe space for anyone, while also being able to learn about their lively culture, which is not sorry, which is why that is the reason to fight and make the statement on why we would expand that kind of safety and awareness more than just at school, for the sake of this discussion. I ask that we must sorry, I ask why must we be forced to shy away from celebrating this holiday in our own backyard, when we live in a world that can bog us down so substantially and stressfully, to where we forget who we are and what we are fighting for our lives. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. Anybody else that wants to come? Come on and come on down.

RAVEN MELVIN: Good evening. My name is Raven Melvin. Good evening. I'm a senior at Mira Costa High School and I've been in MBSD since seventh grade. Pretty much all throughout my educational experience. I've been the only African American girl in all of my classes and it's been hard for me to connect with people who don't know about me or understand my culture and what makes me. So I feel like the Juneteenth celebration will shed light on some of the things that are so important to the African American culture, like, our food, our attire, our traditions,

and more importantly, our history in LA specifically. It sucks that we go to a school where we are constantly around people who don't really know anything about us. And I believe this celebration will make all of the students of Manhattan Beach more culturally educated and tolerant. And I feel like it would be specifically beneficial for African American students as it will make us feel like we belong and are more valued in our community as we where we go to school. Also, importantly, to note that the city of Manhattan Beach gives so much funding to events such as the annual fourth of July Celebration. And I feel like this Juneteenth celebration is the same idea. It's just a different culture. And I feel like Manhattan Beach should give the same respect and homage to all of the people and cultures that reside and go to school here. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you.

MIKAYLA: Thank you. Good evening, honorable Mayor and Council members. My name is Mikayla and I'm a sophomore at Mira Costa. I believe the need for Juneteenth lies in its ability to serve as a reminder of our shared history. By acknowledging this day, we confront the injustices of the past ensuring that the lessons learned resonate within the fabric of our community. It becomes a powerful educational tool fostering understanding

among residents of all ages. Tying in the historical context, we cannot overlook the residents of Juneteenth, which places like Bruce's Beach, a site that encapsulates a chapter in our city's history marked by racial injustice. This celebration is not just an event. It is a testament to our commitment to creating a city where every member feels valued and represented in commemorating Juneteenth. We are not merely celebrating a day. We are embracing a commitment to shaping a city where every resident feels honored, seen, and heard. It is acknowledgment of our shared journey and pledge to continue striving for a future where the ideals of justice and equality are not elusive, but integral components of our community's identity as a high school student. I understand the concerns raised about young people not paying taxes and the potential impact in our say in civic matters. While it's true that we not bear the same economic burdens as some adults, it's essential to recognize our engagement in civic affairs is not solely about financial contributions. It's about actively shaping the future of our community, despite not yet shouldering the full weight of taxes. We have a stake in the decisions that will impact our lives and the trajectory of the city many, call home. Recognizing Juneteenth is an acknowledgement of our commitment to addressing historical wrongs. Ensuring that such injustices are not remembered but actively rectified. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you.

DORA TUITUPOA: Good evening, Mayor and city council members. I'm the vice president of the black Scholars union at Mira Costa, and I believe my peers before me did a great job at explaining the importance of Juneteenth and I would like to contribute by sharing my view on what this celebration means to me and what it means for it to be held in Manhattan Beach. And my perspective as a young person, I truly believe if this celebration is held with proper funding and undeniable commitment, then it can be an enriching experience for us youth where we can gain the ability to immerse ourselves in different perspectives and empathize and rejoice with each other. And I think that is a very crucial experience as we are growing up. I think that it will foster a generation of humans who will look at the world with a wider lens and understanding and empathy for those who are different than ourselves and the ability to contribute to conversations that many people may not have enough understanding to voice an opinion. And this generation can come out of Manhattan Beach. So, with the proper funding and thoughtful planning, we can make this happen.

MIKE JENKINS: Thank you, Council. Mike Jenkins, 45-year resident of the city. It tells you something about that importance and value of an event or a program when a private citizen ponies up \$45,000 of their own money to support that program. We should all be wowed by this proposed donation the donor wisely. Observes that it's not often easy to get an event going the first time. Oftentimes, for a program to succeed, you need to have more than one year, more than one event to gain traction to build an audience, especially when we have a brand-new holiday. And celebrating something that this community doesn't know very much about. Consequently, the donor has, I think, very wisely said that only 15,000 of the 45 may be used each year and has asked the city to commit to three years of celebrations. Not one year, but three years of celebrations, in order to give this event a chance to succeed, and to commit to match that \$15,000 each of those years with either city funds or private donations. So, I would urge the council to accept this very generous donation to commit to supporting the Juneteenth event for three years, to budget up to \$15,000 each year of either general funds or private donations in addition to that donation, to support the event, and to approve the event as it is proposed by staff in the staff report. Thank you.

SKYLAR WILLS: Hello, my name is Skylar Wills and I am a student at Mira Costa, and I had previously spoke here advocating for the Juneteenth event. And I would proudly speak here again and again because that's how dedicated I am for this event to happen. And that's how dedicated all of my peers are to have this event happen for me living in this neighborhood as a young black woman, it's so important to see my culture being shared amongst others. They may not be informed on what Juneteenth even is and also being able to hear black voices being uplifted and highlighted is incredibly important to not only me but others black students and other minority students at Costa, who might feel like their voice isn't shared enough. And so I think that Juneteenth is an incredibly important holiday that should be celebrated here, and deserves just as much respect as other independence holidays, like July. I'm like July 4th. So, I hope you will consider it.

JANET ALLEN: Good evening Council members and Mayor and Mayor Pro Tem. Thank you so much. My name is Janet Allen. I am a school psychologist at Mira Costa high school and in MBUSD the last 22 years. I'm also the founding Faculty advisor for our black scholars union that I founded in the year 2010 at Mira Costa high school. I'm very proud of these students before you that have come and shared their vision, their passion, their

voices, and their education on what they view as the importance of Juneteenth, and why this should be funded, and why this should move forward. I want to share a very personal experience as quick as I can. I'm very excited that this would start on the site of Bruce's beach. The site where my grandparents and great grandparents were only allowed to go to the beach. As a fourth generation Los Angeles resident growing up and then, moving to south bay with my family and my children. Hearing stories from my grandparents and great grandparents of where they were allowed to go to the beach. I would love to bring my 88 year old father to Bruce's beach on June 19th to see where his parents and his grandparents were allowed to go to the beach. I would love for our students not only here today, but our students that are across our city, to learn about this wonderful event and to celebrate with family members, church members, neighbors on the beauty of this holiday. To learn about this in their classrooms, but to learn about it outside of their classrooms as well, as an impassioned educational plea that we expand on what our students are learning about in the world today in America, and what we are passionate about for the future. Thank you.

HEATHER KIM: Thank you Hi, we're making kind of a joint um comment. Tim and I my new friend that I met out in the hallway. My name is heather. I came, uh, I don't know a few

months ago when this was uh discussed, and um, I did not get a chance to preface my public comment at that time. I agree that we absolutely should have a Juneteenth celebration of some sort. I was completely shocked at the price tag that was being proposed, but now I am really happy to see there are community members and people, you know, stepping up to make it a big event. I am physically very conservative and um, so that's where I come from. I will say um jointly that we both agree that this type of a Juneteenth celebration should occur. We differ on what that looks like maybe but I wholeheartedly agree with that. I also we also agree together that the divisiveness in this community has to end. There's so much being pitted against each other whether it's by race or political ideology or any of the other categories that you want to tick off Um, and so we both agree with those things. Um, I also think that um Uh, I didn't really look into this enough. I wasn't coming here actually for this anyways, but Um to really have an opinion on the costs at this moment, but at the time to the untrained eye, this survey looked very skewed and I thought this is not really representative and Um, I was kind of right in that because it was the students. I'm not saying students don't have a voice Um, but I am saying that in terms of actually when it comes to the dollars that you guys are spending on our behalf, we really do

have to be um more prudent in how we use the funds from the taxpayers. Thank you

TIM JONES: Good evening again, I'm starting to get accustomed to this for council. Actually, miss Kim and I uh, as you might know we agree to disagree on a lot of things but the one thing that we absolutely agree upon is that divisiveness in our community has got to stop. It's got to stop, and it's got to stop right here Um to paraphrase some of the words of uh, Benjamin franklin. Democracy is a wonderful thing If we can keep it Union general guardian union general Gordon granger delivered news of general order number three in Galliston texas on june 19th 1865. So celebrations were already taking place in Galliston because word of Freedom for the slaves had already reached many of the blacks. Because Galliston is a port and that news had reached a long time before however, slaves were not able to celebrate because of the retribution that they felt from the slaveholders. One of the things that we truly want to do right now is we want to celebrate. We want to celebrate Juneteenth and invite all of Manhattan Beach to understand what it feels like, to feel that sense of release and freedom, the slaves that actually gained freedom, they weren't able to do that and just quickly for a uh, quick history lesson for Our students and to show just the inclusiveness that we have for

everyone. Major General Alvar Otis Howart was the first commissioner of Galliston, Texas freedman's bureau General Howart went on to become the founder of Howart university. And served as its first president. So the history that we have is combined and guess what? It's all us history. Thank you for your attention.

MADDIE HUTCHINSON: Hi My name is Maddie Hutchinson and I'm a teacher at Mira Costa. And I'm here again tonight to once more implore y'all to listen to the incredible young people in this space tonight. We are so lucky to have passionate individuals willing to show up yet again to advocate for what they believe in. They represent a large subset of our own community current and future who are hungry for information and excited to celebrate this holiday. Imagine the incredible potential of creating an event that inspires people to learn to increase their understanding and tolerance, and to unite to celebrate something as important as the end of slavery. The other hope I would quickly share while I'm here is to please be as thoughtful as possible when organizing this event. The presentation and the students did a lovely job discussing the purpose of this event. As well as, discussing the importance of partnering with black business owners, musicians, and performers from Manhattan beach and neighboring cities. This is a powerful

chance to amplify and center black excellence. And therefore, a great opportunity to partner with reach out to and invite to the table. The very individuals from this community that we're celebrating. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. Anybody else, and if you're uh, if you're planning on speaking, please come on down and sit right here on the on deck.

SEPH PETERS: Hi. My name is Seph Peters and about a month ago. I appeared before you council members for the same cause to petition for a Juneteenth celebration in this city at Polliwog park. The historical disaster that took place at Bruce's Beach still remains prevalent in recent times, and the city has shown little tolerance for demonstrations and the like. Other beach cities have funded and thrown Juneteenth celebration. And I believe, there is no reason for this city, specifically, to take pause when it comes to granting us the celebration. Our clear commitment shows just by our numbers and how we are all here willing to speak and support this cause. Every community in this city deserves to feel acceptance, but they also deserve to learn and understand the other cultures and communities around them. This celebration is important for our entire community to further unite and bring us together through

not only our differences but the similarities that we find through those. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you Anybody else? How about on zoom?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you, Martha. I'm going to close public comments and turn it over to my colleagues. So, Mayor Pro-Tem Amy Howorth.

MAYOR PRO-TEM HOWORTH: Thank you. Mr. Mayor, um Gosh, I don't think it's in doubt that we're going to go forward but I'm just so moved right now by everybody's comments. Uh, the students I want to say one of the greatest things was in in listening to all of you, is watching all of you watch each other and the support you were giving each other is just, it's so great to see. You were modeling some good stuff for all of us. So um, I there's been a motion made to accept all of this, I believe, but I just, I have to make a few comments because I'm just so moved. I really appreciate Ryan Kim's comments about how he grew up in a predominantly white community back in jersey.

Correct New Jersey, excuse me. Um I liked that you called it out and several of you did call it out about Black culture and celebrating black excellence and uplifting black voices. It is important that we keep the focus on that for this holiday. It is all of our history but it is the way to, but I but we need to understand what we're celebrating and we need to understand the things that we don't understand, and perhaps this is a way in. And I want to really commend the parks and rec department for the process and Allie Latragna, for all the community outreach. We did we had two meetings community engagement means of course, the survey which has been talked about, but it's still got 400 responses that weren't students. And that's an incredible effort to do both the survey, but the community outreach and then the program that's sort of proposed right now. It's so great because we started Bruce's Beach and I'm so glad that is in there. I mean my colleagues, I want to say you all how far have we come? This what a difference and thank God because this is really important. Janet your comments about your grandparents and great grandparents. I just want to talk to you more about that and I can't wait to meet your dad so, I wanted to give staff kudos. I wanted to give all of you kids, kudos Um, thank you for sharing stories and not stories your voices. Um, you better all be there Uh and help us out. I'm looking for you. It's wonderful that yesterday was Martin Luther King Jr.'s day, right. So that's not

lost and I'm glad staff it just works out really well. So, I'll turn over to my colleagues, but I'm just so moved and proud All right, thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Napolitano.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Thank you, your honor. I appreciate the comments made by Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth, and you know, the noise and divisiveness that we all experienced. Some of us more than others. A few years ago, I would love to bring clarity and unity to tonight, but there's no need for me to do what it's already been done by you all so I'm not going to belabor the point. I'm going to make the motion that I pushed my button for here and that we commit. I didn't think there was a doubt that we were committing ourselves to an ongoing celebration. We don't do one and done for national holidays. I fully expect that we're going to continue on but since we have a commitment of three years of a donation of \$15,000. I think it's appropriate that we at least say that we're going to commit the community the city to three years of celebrations, and we're going to budget up to \$15,000 in city funds. Whether that be city funds or donated funds and hopefully those donations continue on, and that we approve the recommendations made by staff, and that includes reaching out to anybody else who wants

to participate and support and work out exactly what the details of the event that are going to be. And I, and as I said, that the last time we talked about this, I don't want to see pepper bellies at the Juneteenth event. I want to see I want to see a reflection of culture. That's what I want to see so, I thank you all for being examples of the better angels of ourselves. And I hope that we can move forward from tonight as a better example as a community as well, that's my motion. Thank you,

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I'm pleased to support moving forward and have seconded the motion, like Councilmember, excuse me, Mayor Pro-Tem Howorth, I'm and councilmember Napolitano, I'm moved by the comments that were provided tonight. Thank you. Thank you for sharing your voices and being here tonight. This is an opportunity. It's an opportunity to celebrate our federal holiday. It's to recognize our diversity and it's to show our openness of community. These were fundamental reasons why I know I ran for office again because I didn't feel that how our city was appearing to the world reflected the community that I've known for the 28 years? I've lived here. I am pleased to move forward with this event. There were some issues that were mentioned that I just wanted to note. There was a concern about

other events in the region. Well, if you think about it on Veteran's day, other cities have Veteran's day celebrations as well, but that doesn't take away from the fact that we have our own. With regard to the cost, it's already been stated. We not only have a budget that's commensurate with other community events, but here we have the added. We have the addition here of donations from someone who wants to see our community celebrate this federal holiday. So, I'm pleased to be seconding the motion and to move forward.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you. Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Thank you, your honor. I want a question from Maddie Hutchison. Thank you. Now, for a second. Since you stated you were a teacher at Mira Costa. I get to ask you a question. On the way I'll preface this, they should get to grade you. Where's my red pen? So, Maddie, they teach student history at Mira Costa. Um, I want to say, yes, but I'm not sure how consistent that is across the board. You can cheat and ask Dr. Allen. She might know. Would you agree with that statement? It's inconsistent across the board if students get it. Yeah, and when they get it, it's probably minimal. So, you believe they teach history Juneteenth at Mira Costa? I think

that we need to do more of it. Why I'm asking you is because my great, I was born in Texas. So, we know the history. It's in our school books at an early age not a shock to me of us. We know the answer. So I was curious about, I've never heard anybody talk about the fact Mira Costa is teaching the history of Juneteenth anywhere until tonight when you answered that question. So, I'm curious when it started or it kept going and what a depth it was? Thank you, Maddie. You're a resource. I can call you from now on. No, I think I would add to it. I obviously supported as well. I'm going to repeat what everybody said here, but I remind everybody I said to manager Moe just to make sure you come back with a fully burdened rate on what it's going to cost for public works in PD. This is not \$6500. We all know that but we saw the first year when comes when Mayor. I am sorry Mayor I had the event at Bruce Beach. We Sadly underestimated the volume people that would show up for it. So, we learned our lesson from that one. That's on us. We need better parking enforcement. Although it's early. There's no place to park down there. It was wasn't meant to handle big crowds, but now that we found that the grand views offered their parking lot that will certainly take some of the surge away, but it needs courted effort. We don't want publics to cost \$6,000 to come back end up being \$20,000. So long as you're upfront with transparency and the cost, I'll go with it. And I agree with Steve and everybody

else that needs to be a three-year deal. I assume \$15,000 donation. It's coming every year from that person those three years. So with that said, then I'll go along with the majority and move forward. Nothing else, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Did that mean you want to say something?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Well, I boy we we're not even married and you can like you can sense, right? No, proximity I Just really quickly Steve. Come on. I'm trying to make it so you wouldn't have that. No, um Move for the question. Okay Call for the question, but I would be remiss. I mean I was so moved but as Mike Jenkins said, we have a donor in our community who believes so strongly in this that they were committing 15,000 for three years. And I want to thank that person whoever they may be, that's incredible. That is that's what has made this happen.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: You can thank him at the event. Thank him at the event. Your honor, can I add one more thing. Where's Michaela? You do pay taxes Michaela. Remember where do you, where do you buy McDonald's food at or El

Sombrero? Do you pay taxes there? Yes, you do. There you go.
7/11 even better.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so I'll go ahead and wrap this up. I wrote several notes here one was quote it inspired, you know, it inspires to learn other communities are celebrating it. Veterans day is the same. It's on the same day. The reason I was asking about the day is I didn't want to diminish potential participation. It's a shame when a national holiday comes in the middle of the, you know, of the week. I think our neighbors to the north celebrate it and El Segundo celebrated the weekend before. I'm hoping that people will want to come, you know, to ours as well. Also, the students who's got it marked in their calendar when school ends? Yeah, June 13th, 14th, the other Juneteenths, but not to belittle the importance of Juneteenth. You know June 19th now. Inspired to learn, I went back. I mean I learned about the immense space and proclamation back when I was in high school. I don't want to say how many years ago Okay, suffice to say we didn't have smartphones Um, and so I looked it up and uh And I read it, but the thing that touched me the most You know, they were great words Uh, it took a lot of courage for Abraham Lincoln to do this. The war hadn't, was not finished And so he had hoped to inspire uh Participants to fight harder Uh, there was a lot of participation of African-Americans. Uh, I

believe there was over 200,000 African-Americans soldiers and uh and it was designed to inspire them to let him know that he's not forgetting them. That this was the prime one of the primary reasons if not the primary reason that the union army, that the entire union army was committed to fighting this war. In addition, he didn't want enemies of the union to know that he wasn't fully supporting this effort. So, the countries that were supporting the south wouldn't continue that support So that the union army would prevail. And ultimately, there would be a call to end of slavery didn't happen right away. As you may know, okay, it took another couple of years before it actually happened. And then, it took another couple of years before it went to councilmember Montgomery's home state, you know, of Texas. But the thing that touched me the most was at the very end where President Abraham Lincoln wrote, in witness, whereof, I have here unto set my hand and caused the seal of the united states to be affixed. Done at the city of Washington. This first day in January, in the year of our lord, 1863, and of the independence of the United States of America, the 87th. So here we were this young country not even 87 years old. Think about it. Roman Empire, thousands. Think of the British empire. Hundreds if not thousands of years. France, this young country 87 years old embarked upon this great quest to free all people. Okay, not and initially it was just in the slaveholding states,

but now this was for the adjacent states as well 87 years old that country to commit and to have the sacrifice of hundreds of thousands of soldiers who died and were crippled including many of the 200 000 African-Americans soldiers. The 87th year in order to do that, and so that to me, is a testimony of back then the greatness of America and the greatness of America today is the respect of that the value of every American life. So, I'm going to support this. I made the challenge as far as last time to suggest, you know, recommend that the city put forth \$10,000 in the receipt raised and that was a very successful effort. That's getting buy-in from the community. That's going to get the support of the community. So, if you are on your summer vacation by the time this comes around you can't make it. The residents of Manhattan Beach got your back. Okay, so with that, I'd like to, let's do it. Repeat the motion and vote.

CITU CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, let me just get my notes one more time. We're not done Yeah, just a few little housekeeping things A, B, one, two, three, four reports. None easy.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: You can stay for the rest of the meeting.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay All right, I think we can hear what's going on so item number 19. Consider a request by Mayor Franklin and Councilmember Montgomery to discuss exploring art opportunities that commemorate the police or fire. I would like to say, I thought, I said and fire departments with the scope of the crosswalk improvement project at valley drive and 17th and 18th street. City manager Moe.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yes, this is simply looking for the third vote to move this forward, need a third. There you go.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you, future agenda items, none. Even reaching..

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I was going to make a comment on the last item, but it was just up for a third vote.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Well, I'm going to say right now, let's look beyond a crosswalk. We can do better than that.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: And I would again repeat because this is on the agenda. Mr. Mayor, so I can talk about it that this is the wrong site for this Uh to the extent that you reopen this project. You're going to have a lot of older adults who use

the Joslyn center very upset on this crosswalk project that they've been working on for several years. Not very pleased because this will delay this project and I was going to ask the City Manager. And again, this there's already a third vote to bring this back. So, I don't want to belabor this.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Let me ask the folks who put it on Mayor Franklin and Council Montgomery, if we can just put a period after departments.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: A period?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: So that it would read if I can interrupt to discuss exploring our opportunities that commemorate the police and fire or fire departments and let's change that and fire departments within the city, in the city, but it's up to the maker the motion if it comes.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: If it comes back as a crosswalk somewhere, that's great.

MAYOR FRNKLIN: We can look at that. We've already looked at alternative sites. There's not much to expand down. Okay, A process so that'll be preserved. Okay, okay.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: That's three votes for anywhere within the city.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay City Manager report.

CITY MANAGER MOE: No report tonight, thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: City Attorney report.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Nothing tonight.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, uh informational items.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Call me Ishmael. No, let's have a long conversation about this next item. So that's why there's some levity as to how long this meeting might take.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right. So, I guess we're going to adjourn. Okay, and we're going to adjourn. The meeting is adjourned to a closed session on Tuesday, February 6, 2024, at 5 p.m in City Council.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I'm, sorry. Yes, Could I ask us to Adjourn and memory.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Oh, I'm so sorry. Yes. We have a memorial.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I do we have another one?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Uh, yeah, Madelyn Harter.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: If I could do one in addition to that after you do it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so we're going to have two. So, if we could stand and we want to honor. Adjourn in honor of Madelyn Harter. Well known and beloved, Manhattan Beach resident, who passed away peacefully in her sleep at age 100. So that is worthy of note as well. Madelyn was born in Pasadena at Clarin furl pile. She was the oldest of two children. She graduated from John Marshall high school and later from Pasadena junior college, where she enjoyed being active in college life. Her future husband, Wendell Harter, a student at California institute of technology, attended Holliston methodist church on Colorado street. They met and were later married. There during World War II in 1944, after moving to Manhattan beach in 1948. They purchased a home. They raised a family and continued to be

active in the community. Madeline was a lifetime member of San Piper's. As we know a Phil Lance Ropic Charit and charitable organization. She served as volunteer assistant director of seniors for the Torrance south bay YMCA camp in big bear. A cub scout and girl scout leader, vice president of the PTA. As a member of Manhattan Beach community church, she served as camp counselor for six years. I feel lazy. She's a great inspiration to us. She received the outstanding woman of the year award in honor of her years of service. Wendell and Madeline both received the honorary rose and scroll award given by the MB Chamber of commerce in recognition of their outstanding community service. She taught in elementary school and later worked as an administrative secretary for 15 years at nearby Northrop corporation and Hawthorne on weekends. They love to race their 19-foot lightning class sailboat named paddle, and Madeline, as king harbor. Yacht members, Madeline and Wendell, participated in regattas all over the west. They rotated their children into the three-man crew and won over 300 trophies. Madeline was preceded in death by her brother, Richard, wonderful husband, Wendell, to whom she was married for 73 years, and son Dr. Gordon Harter. She is survived by her two children, Lowell Harter, married to Maria, and Janet Shaw, married to Greg. And by her four grandchildren, and seven great

grandchildren. Can we have a bow our heads in prayer? Great thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yes, thank you your honor and Madelyn and Wendell, absolutely fantastic people. Very sorry for her passing. I would like to add to that. Um, someone that uh, I think most of you know someone who I certainly knew most my entire life and that's Mike McAvin. Mike McAvin was a lifelong Manhattan Beach and South Bay resident. He touched, not just thousands, but tens of thousands of lives. If you went to his memorial, you could have seen that because Mike, besides growing up here, knowing everybody working as a bartender, putting himself through school, working the bartender, and many of the hot spots around the towns, and made friends with everybody. He became a teacher, and he became a teacher who taught at Mira Costa. He taught English, he taught journalism, though and he was the advisor on La Vista, a newspaper, which was award winning under his tutelage, as well as others, but he really helped his students long in that way. Not that they didn't just didn't win awards. He made them better people and he certainly made me a better person and many others a better person. He leaves behind a family, two kids, wonderful kids. One in college, one still in high school. And he is sorely missed

among all his friends in this community. So, if we can have a moment of silence for Mike as well. Thank you. Thank you, Honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. And with that, the meeting is adjourned to the closed session on Tuesday, February 6, 2024, at 5 p.m. in the city council chambers. Thank you all.