

ROUGHLY EDITED COPY
MANHATTAN BEACH CITY COUNCIL
REGULAR MEETING
REMOTE BROADCAST CAPTIONING
TUESDAY, AUGUST 6, 2024

* * * * *

This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

* * * * *

CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
CITY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING
TUESDAY, AUGUST 6, 2024

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you and good evening. We're going to recess the special meeting to immediately after this meeting. So, I can welcome you to the City Council regular meeting for Tuesday, August 6, 2024 at 6 p.m., and we are going to start off with a pledge to the flag. We have two lovely ladies here. We have Leah Piehl and her sister Shannon Piehl to lead us from Pacific school.

GROUP: I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one Nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, don't go away and I want to introduce your mom.

JESSAMYN PIEHL: Hello, I'm Jessamyn Piehl. I am these lovely girls' daughter. We are obviously living here in Manhattan Beach and love it. Both these girls are attending MBMS later this month. We do a lot of parks and rec. Shannon has been doing the tennis camps and we also, other things we like to do. We like to travel. We love California. They are fourth generation Southern California girls. My grandma was born here in Southern California out in the Anaheim area. So, we really

love the beach. We take advantage of that and our beautiful community here. So, thank you for having us.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. Well, we have something for you here.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Official city pins.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Official city pins and we have some certificates of recognition. Now, good things come in three and they have a great dog by the name of Tommy. Can anybody guess what school dad and mom went to? And Tommy is a Vishla, right?

SHANNON PIEHL: Yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And so what else does he have in common with you?

SHANNON PIEHL: We both have red hair.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Ah, great. So, thank you so much for coming. I really appreciate it. And, have a great rest of the summer. Okay. Thank you. Can we have a roll call, please?

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?
Councilmember Napolitano?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Steve?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Here.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Here. So, I'm also pleased on our ceremonial calendar to present certificates of recognition to Natalie and Vesta Sung for their extraordinary efforts and contributions to American Red Cross during the Maui Wildfires and they're Manhattan Beach residents. They were there. So, on behalf of the City Council and my colleagues here, we want to present you with these certificates of recognition. You can meet me up here. Face everybody here and I want to put you on the spot. If you could just tell us a little bit about your adventure and also your background and how that helped you prepare for helping out.

VESTA SUNG: So, a year ago, coming this Thursday, believe it or not, it'll have been a year. We were on vacation there and got caught up in the 80, 90 mile an hour winds. Five fires on the island bounced around to five different parking lots. Finally ended up at the Red Cross parking lot to find over 1,200 people basically scrambling, bum rushing the facility, the high school to get help. Only one newer Red Cross person there did a stellar job, but just overwhelmed. And Natalie and I decided we would just step up since I have that background,

having done work with CERT and with Red Cross during COVID. So, it was kind of, we were at the wrong place at the right time, shall we say, and it was really pretty amazing spending 10 days there, just to give you an idea of how nasty it really was. I mean, I think it took a good seven, eight months before I stopped seeing burned people in my daily life where I went. It leaves a mark on you and there are people there. We were just there in June and it's kind of like the second wave of the disaster. We still need people there. We need people to continue to prepare like we are doing here with the city. While the media does a lot of if it bleeds, it leads. The real story is with the City Council there at the Kaanapali, the capital, and at Lahaina. They were the ones that helped us put everything together, along with the Department of Education, the high school itself, Red Cross and obviously the Kaiser and some of the other doctors and such. But this was a community effort. So, thank you for what you do. Keep it up and this could be us if the big one hits.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, could you just explain a little bit about CERT and what the initials mean?

VESTA SUNG: Oh yeah. So, CERT, we have our Community Emergency Response Team and we have our very own Liaison here, Amanda MacLennan right here, and Frank Kiella is our Program Manager, if you will. This is under the Manhattan Beach Fire

Department. Come on out. Twice a year we have these incredible classes to teach you how to, in an emergency, prepare for your family. And then if you're doing all right in an emergency, you go prepare and help your neighbors, and then you help your community. And it's amazing because that's exactly what happened to us. We went from vacationers to victims, first responders to second responders, all in about 20 hours. So, that's how fast it goes. And I couldn't have done it without this one, I got to tell you. I threw her in the back and had her organize the dormitory. She dealt with all the burned folks, with the stories she heard over and over again and everything. It's just extraordinary.

NATALIE SUNG: I would just say that it was an incredible experience. I'll never forget the people that I met there. Hearing their stories, like we had people come in with only the clothes on their back and one lady, she literally only had some cat food and her cat. People walking four days with burns all over their feet just to get to the shelter. And seeing the community really just come together, bringing in food, all the donations was truly incredible from people who were displaced when they were on vacation to people who were just absolutely struck in with nothing left.

VESTA SUNG: Go vacation there, they need you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Well, thank you so much for sharing your story. Many of us probably in this room have gone through CERT training for CPR. So, it's very valuable to have. You never know when you're going to be called on. We're all out walking and having a good time and emergencies sprout up all over the place. So again, we just want to thank you for your courage and being willing to roll up your sleeves and get in there and do the hard work. So, we're very proud of you.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: And Mr. Mayor, if we could get a picture of the entire council.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes. Yes, please. And we have pins for you.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I love the plug for CERT. If you haven't done the class, it's incredible. We really are going to be on our own. There's not going to be enough. Well, it's sort of fun. I was kind of terrified the whole time. But that's how I roll. But then I got over it.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: And here you are.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: And here I am.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Well, let's move on to item number E, which is the approval of the agenda and waiver of full reading of ordinances.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So moved, your honor.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So moved, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, we have a motion by Councilmember Montgomery and seconded by Mayor Pro Tem. I always wanted to put Thomas in there.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: That's okay.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: But, Howorth. And can we have a vote, please.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So now we go to item number F, which is City Council and community organization announcements of upcoming events.

LIBRARY MANAGER MURRAY: Hello, Mayor, members of the Council. My name is Josh Murray. I'm here on behalf of Manhattan

Beach Library. I'd like to invite the community to enjoy a hilariously entertaining afternoon with comedy juggler Michael Rayner on Saturday, August 10th from four to five p.m. Join us for a wacky juggling show with Michael Rayner, who has appeared on America's Got Talent, Sesame Street, and The Late Show with David Letterman. You will laugh, you will be amazed, and you will see a spinning cheeseburger. This event is intended for all ages and registration is available on our website, lacountylibrary.org. And again, it's this upcoming Saturday, August 10th from four to five. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you, Josh. Anybody else?

JILL MCCURRY: Hello, Mayor and City Councilmembers. My name is Jill McCurry and I'm with Manhattan Village Shopping Center. I'm here on behalf of the Manhattan Beach Chamber of Commerce and wanted to announce some events that we have coming up that we would like to invite everyone to. The first thing that we have tomorrow is the Board of Directors installation with the Mayor's Lunch. Looking forward to seeing what Mayor Franklin is going to share with us. It is at Tin Roof at 11:30. Again, that's tomorrow. We still have availability. If you have forgotten to buy your tickets, you can do so on the Manhattan Beach Chamber website. The next thing that we have going on this week is we have a power lunch and networking event this Thursday at 11:30. It's going to be at the Joslyn Center and it's titled

The Hidden Secrets of Service and Counter Management presented by Richard Chase. So, you can also purchase tickets on the website. That evening, oh, I don't have any more time.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: One minute.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Go ahead.

JILL MCCURRY: Oh, we have a lot going on this week. So, thank you. We have the Young and Emerging Professionals Mixer this Thursday and that group's focus is on career advancement and networking for professionals of all ages. So, everyone is young and emerging no matter what your age is. You can join us at 5:30 at Denton and Denton. That's going to be that location. And then one other thing looking ahead is we have a community outreach breakfast. We're going to be discussing or hearing about how to effectively navigate the permit process. And that is going to be given by Talyn, the new City Acting Manager, and also with Set Ghajar, who's with Accelerate MB. And that is going to be on September 16th at 8:30 at the MB studios. So, thank you guys. And you can go to the manhattanbeachchamber.com website for all the information.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you.

BOBBY BELL: You don't want to leave for this one. This is where it gets started. She went long. I'm not going to go long. I promise you.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Tell her where you're from.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Bobby, we appreciate you not harassing our residents.

BOBBY BELL: Mayor, honorable Mayor, Mayor Pro Tem, City Councilmembers, city officials. Congratulations. My name is Bobby Bell. I am the dedicated education, Recycling Educator for the City of Manhattan Beach for W.M. with previously known as Waste Management. I'm just here to remind everybody that this coming Saturday, August 10th, we have our Free Paper Shredding Event at Mira Costa High School. It'll be from 9 to 11 o'clock. All Manhattan Beach residents and businesses are welcome to come out two banker sized boxes, shred safely and securely for free. Wish you guys all a blessed evening. Good night.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you, Bob.

CITY ENGINEER DOHERTY: Good evening, Mayor Franklin, honorable Councilmembers. My name is Katie Doherty. I'm the City Engineer. I wanted to provide a brief update on the full closure of parking structure lot three, which is located here in downtown at Morningside Drive and 12th Street. My team has been monitoring the structure regularly. The third level was closed earlier this summer due to observations of corrosion that required specialist assessment. On July 30th, the engineering staff and the Consultant Structural Engineer conducted an onsite assessment. Heavy corrosion was observed in several of the steel columns and the staircases resulting in a recommendation to

close the structure immediately or shore the areas where the corrosion is observed due to the unsafe condition. In the interest of public safety, the structure was closed completely to vehicles and people later that day. It is currently fenced off, including the adjacent public right of way that is below the cantilevered portions of the structure. Staff is working closely with the structural engineer to determine next steps. Redesign and reconstruction of the structure is a City Council work plan item. Preliminary efforts for that project are already underway and staff anticipates returning to council with an update this fall on that. I'm available for questions if you have any.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Colleagues? Okay, thank you. But if residents do have a question, sorry, where would you suggest that we, that they reach either public works or?

CITY ENGINEER DOHERTY: Yeah, there is a dedicated website and email address set up for this project. It's lot3@manhattanbeach.gov.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: lot3@manhattanbeach.gov.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: And Mr. Mayor, I have a question then. Yeah, and I know you don't have an actual date in mind, but we don't yet know. I think I want to express that we don't yet know what is actually going to permanently happen there. That will be a series of community, there'll be

workshops. There'll be outreach. There's different ideas that will be, you know, considered. But there will be also temporary, probably stuff that will be discussed in the fall, correct?

CITY ENGINEER DOHERTY: Yeah, both of those are correct. So, we're working now with our engineer to figure out exactly what needs to happen immediately with the structure. So, that's happening. And also, there's the effort for the long-term redesign redevelopment project.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you. Anybody else? How about on Zoom? Martha?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, great. I'm sorry, colleagues. Yeah, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I may be anticipating what Councilmember Montgomery's going to say, but I wanted to explain for members of the public as to why Councilmember Montgomery, our City Attorney and I are wearing our Hawaiian shirts tonight. And that is because our city manager will be retiring after 35 years. At our last council meeting, there was an honoring of him. But he who is not in a Hawaiian shirt usually wears one when he's not at a public meeting. And it's our way of saying

thank you to him for all that he's given our city for over 35 years.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Thank you. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Says the one guy not wearing a Hawaiian shirt in the room. I think that's part of what I was going to say. But the second part is how many of you actually went down to six man this weekend and saw what was like besides 10 of us. All right, there you go. So, a shout out to not just Parks and Rec, but PD and Fire and the residents and businesses. It was busy from Thursday on, but well managed busy. It's a difference. It wasn't outrageously, I would say overwhelming to downtown or the residents. We can all see it. And I can tell you the difference having CSC down there at their checkpoints made a big difference. I thought as far as structure goes, and checking bags, everything else, stopping people that still want to bring glass bottles to the beach. Amazing as it sounds. It still happens, folks. So, I think a shout out goes all the way around. Another big difference it makes when it's well managed and having CSC on site to help our PD made a big difference to all of us being down there and watching our own residents play and enjoy themselves in a safe environment and also supporting our local businesses was a big, big difference and a warm up for the MBA Open to follow. So, that's my shout out for the week.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: There you go. Oh, really want you hear these words. Kudos to Jay Cakley, who, you know, is carrying on the tradition of the father and he cares so much about this event and about it going well. And it's just so special to have this in our community and support it. I'm so glad it is successful. And as one of our colleagues is famous for saying six man is not a crime.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I wonder who that would be.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right. Speaking of that colleague, would you like to make any comments?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yeah, I'd like to do better next year than we did this year.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I didn't quite hear that.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Says he wants to better next year.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Oh, okay. Well, you did better than I did. So, there you go.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I don't know.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Anybody else here? Okay, so I would like to make an announcement and it has to do with the 2024 Paris Olympics. We're very proud to have two Manhattan Beach residents who participated. One is Daniel Golovick. And he's a Mira Costa grad. I guess the parents were from Australia, he actually ran the decathlon event for Australia. He finished in

19th place. And it was very exciting to see him there and mentioned the fact that he comes from our hometown. And then the other one is Taylor Spivey. And Taylor also went to Mira Costa, graduated. We might know her mom, Bonnie Spivey. She ran a swim instructing business here in Manhattan Beach. I remember my two kids went. They were six and seven at the time. And Taylor, I think, was five. Taylor Spivey was five, and she was the assistant. And even then, she was going in and out of that water like you wouldn't believe. And she ran, she silver medaled in the mixed relay team for the triathlon, for the Olympic triathlon.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Jordan Rainey, who is a Mira Costa grad, also then went to Stanford, is on the women's water polo team. And they won today. And Jordan absolutely controlled that game. I mean, it's so thrilling to see these young women who are sponsored by Flavor Flav, you know, do so well. But yeah, Jordan Rainey's all over it.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: You have to explain. They don't know who that is. Flavor Flav.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yeah. They got a go look it up.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Just google the name Flavor Flav.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And we will at a future council meeting when they're in town. We'll bring them so that everybody can meet them. And I'm sure they got some great, they got some great stories. So, moving on to announcements, item number two, City Manager Moe.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yes, I'd like to take this opportunity to introduce Onyx Jones, who is our Interim Finance Director. Onyx, would you like to stand up and let everybody see you? Onyx, of course, is filling in behind Steve Charelian, who retired last month. You have a Master's in Accountancy from Wichita State. Most recently, she worked at City of Culver City as the Assistant City Manager, Finance Director and City Treasurer, with like roles in the City of Pomona as well. She brings a wealth of experience in all facets of finance, bond financing, and things like that. We'll put you to some good use. But thank you for leading the Finance Department here while the recruitment is ongoing and we find the next permanent manager or director. So, thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you and welcome, Onyx.

CITY MANAGER MOE: I'd love to. Okay, go ahead. So yes, Talyn, of course, is our Community Development Director, but with my departure, at the end of next week, Talyn has been appointed the Acting City Manager while a recruitment goes on for the permanent replacement. Talyn, of course, has already got

her hands full with all the development in town and housing and all the other activities that go on in that department. But I know she has a lot of bandwidth and certainly has a drive and determination to take this role on. So, I'll be giving her my support, just a phone call away any time you need it. And I'm sure the rest of you will join me in that. But thank you, Talyn, for stepping up.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Talyn. And another comment.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Mr. Mayor, maybe through the City Manager, can we also introduce our Acting Community Development Director, who I see is in the room?

CITY MANAGER MOE: Ryan, your turn. Ryan is, of course, our building official and is filling in behind Talyn and will do an awesome job like he does every other every day of the week. So, thank you, Ryan.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Terrific. Absolutely. Thank you, all. You really can't imagine just how lucky we are and fortunate to have such great employees to stand up and take on those extra duties. So, we move to item number G, public comments, three minutes per person. So, speakers may provide public comments on any matter that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the City Council, including items on the agenda. However, if you speak at public comments now, you cannot speak during the public

comment time when that item comes before the City Council. So please state your name and.

LOUIE PASTOR: Louie Pastor. Of April of this month, or this year, I celebrated 68 years of being here in Manhattan Beach, and I'm not going to go through nostalgic stuff how it used to be, you know, school district, fiscal responsibility and all that sort of thing. Whether I make it the next 68 years is starting to bother me. And here's maybe different levels of government can start talking to one another. Here's the local papers I've been reading. We got the sales tax. We had the recent parcel tax. And now beach cities wants a 30 million bond issue and prop two on coming up wants 10 billion dollars. So again, my fear is, can I sustain myself? And my dad used to say, there's not a money problem. There's a spending problem. I hope you'll address that to find out if we really need certain things. Okay. South Bay Unified School District, when I was going to school here from first grade through high school, they had a little office the size about this place on Pier Avenue. They sustained the district. There was no parcel tax. There was no this tax. We didn't have a wine festival. We didn't have an education foundation. So, I'm starting to think that maybe there is a spending problem if you could look into that. When I worked at Hughes Aircraft, one of the first things they did when things were going south, they looked at various positions,

administration and all that sort of thing and found out there was a lot of positions that weren't needed that could do away with and be more efficient company. Of course, later, they turned it over to General Motors who was worse and destroyed the company. Also, on the thing of taxes, I will address something my dad said some time ago in Liberty Village and you and I, Joe, talked about this. Why did we in Liberty Village still have to water city property? Why when the cement comes up because of the tree, we have to pay for that? Why do we have the burden? So, if you're going to pass all these taxes, hopefully you'll look east of Sepulveda and look at the Liberty Village folks, especially those old geezers going, wow, we've been doing this 68 years paying for that, cement, paying for that. And I talked to a young man when he was out there fixing our sidewalk. He said, you're the only city in the South Bay where they charge the residents. Please look into that. Appreciate it. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, Mr. Pastor.

TERRY CHASE: Hi, everybody. My name is Terry Chase. I live at 502, 24th Street and Richard Montgomery, I don't remember, we had a conversation about the noise from LAX in September of last year. And I was the only civilian on that call. I mean LAX made it very difficult to find about the meeting that they were going to have to talk about noise abatement. And I got to commend Richard. I mean, he was on it. He

said some good things. I mean the people in charge were saying, oh, they spent a lot of time talking about landings. I don't care about the landings, it's the takeoffs that are incredibly loud. And I happened to live right across the street from Grandview Elementary School. I moved here in 2009, I love the community, and I'm going to talk about noise. And hopefully, I can get through this in three minutes. But when I got here in 2009, we would walk around the neighborhood in the middle of the night or the day. It was quiet. Now we had the kids, you know, in the school. And I love them. I mean, it's a great school. I enjoyed the activity and all of that. Didn't particularly care for all the parents that had to drive their kids to school every day because I had trouble getting out of my garage because I'm right on the corner of Grandview and 24th Street. But, fine. Then all of a sudden somewhere between 2009 and today, I mean they changed the flight path for LAX. And I don't know everything about it, but I know the noise started becoming annoying, okay? And I just, I'm half deaf. I've got hearing aids. I lost the bass noises. I can hear great. Men, I can hear great. Women, I have a tough time. I really got to lean in. So, I put up with the construction across the street of Grandview for three years. My house would vibrate. The trucks would beep, beep, beep, beep. You know, when they back up, they got to do that. The noise was incredible. But I knew that was going to

end. I didn't think it was going to last quite as long as it did. And I'm grateful for what happened. I mean, it's a very nice deal. I mean, the school is much improved. One thing I really like is a lot of the parents are now picking their kids up down on Blanche, I believe. And there's fewer parents picking their kids up right across the street from me. So, I can actually get out of my garage at 8:30 in the morning. Okay, so I put up with that and I'm grateful. I had an end date. Over the weekend, anybody hear the boom, boom, boom? SoFi Stadium? That's seven miles away. Now, I'm asking the City Council, Mayor Franklin, I'm asking you to, let's prevent that crap from happening again. They got one scheduled next year at this time. That group has got to knock it off. It's this electronic stuff this rap stuff with a lot of bass. People were complaining all over the City of Manhattan Beach and El Segundo and Hawthorne. Some people at Marina del Rey and Redondo Beach. Can you know how far it is? Bass noise is traveling an incredible distance. We got to get ahead of this. Hawthorne, the Police Department was called. I think the Manhattan Police Department got tons of calls, I would imagine. Ridiculous. Let's get ahead of it. Let's prevent them from doing it. I don't know, class action lawsuit, whatever you got to do. They cannot be doing that to our neighborhood. But there again, three days, it was over. And by the way, my wife has very good hearing.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Mr. Chase, I'm going to have to ask you to wrap up.

TERRY CHASE: Okay, I'll wrap up real quick. All I'm asking, when Richard Montgomery was talking to us on LAX, the solution was have the incoming flights come in on the southbound runways and have the outgoing flights leave on the northbound runways. Do something. Do something different with the flight path. This was a peaceful, nice area, quiet. And now, I don't have air conditioner. I got to shut up the windows at night so my wife can sleep. Like I said, I just take my hearing aids out and I'm cool.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you, sir.

TERRY CHASE: That's it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you. Next.

UNIDENTIFIED PUBLIC COMMENTER: Yes, I would like to also complain about the noise. There's been an enormous amount of noise that I've had to deal with over the summer. But I think, fortunately, in two weeks when he goes back to college, it'll all be gone. Something that we can help improve house prices with is talking to some builders about some properties. And they're saying, because the permitting process takes so long, that they have to build in more costs, which drives down the price of lots. So, if there's anything we can do to speed up the building process would be very helpful. And another thing

that I've heard from several builders is they're talking about the Planning Department is becoming more and more punitive. Before when you'd say a deck size had to be this big. Now, they're measuring from inside the deck wall, as far as how much square footage you have to have your deck. And now, it's no longer three feet from the setback of your property line is in the sand section. Now, it's three feet from the inset of the retaining wall. So, all these things that keep going on and keep reducing and pushing back our buildings and making our buildings more expensive, and you're pushing them back further. There used to be, if you had an upward sloping lot, there was a huge advantage to having the property because you put the garage underneath, pull the house out over it, and you got a bigger backyard. Now, because of the three-story effect, you're only allowed to have one-story above your garage, and you push your house back further. So, there's a lot of things, and then the 24-foot wall effect, which makes absolutely zero cents in the sand section, because you're allowed to build to 30 feet, but if your lot is wider than 35 feet, you can only go 24 feet, so you have to go in three feet, then go back up again. And there's, I think, about 50 or 60 lots that are 35 feet or wider in the sand section, and a lot of them are half lots. So, you're being very punitive people with half lots in that area. So maybe there's some things we could do in the Planning Department to make it a

little bit more, you know, engaging and pull our houses forward and let people have more backyards. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you. Sir.

JOHN FLANAGAN: Hello, my name's John Flanagan. I'm owner, operator of Right Tribe. It's over next to our parking lot three that's being demolished. This is my partner, Lauren, but she runs it with me, and you can find us there most days. But I just wanted to say and come here today and thank you guys for considering us with the shift, with the building, and the demolition of everything, and how it'll go down. And just to say that we've really, being that our business is still impacted and we've seen such a good part of the community, and we love the community, and it's like gained everybody's, everybody's following and everything. But a lot of people are coming to us to talk about the parking lot, and we're getting a lot of public opinion and questions and concerns about just general safety, general timeline, of course, parking, you know, all these issues that I can't say that we have the best answers for. Obviously, I don't think anybody does because of the urgency of what it is, the parking structure itself. But, I'd just like to say that we want to stay in communication and just make sure that everybody knows our safety, and that when you're here in your office, or what have you, we'll know who you are. But that, and just that hopefully we can find a way to, you know, make it safe and tear

it down, and just put in a surface parking lot in the meantime, so that the public doesn't feel like it's just getting its feet dragged, or it has some other interests involved, or whether it'll be demolished, or whether it'll be rebuilt, and you know, hopefully we can get further, faster with its demolition and it's going back to normal. I mean, even just today when the fence went in, there was a big kind of issue with trash trucks and different things, and I can say it's nice that we're there, and then we're owner operators because we are there, and we also live downtown, so we, you know, we get to interact with a lot of the public, and we get to see what goes on with traffic flow, and with general, with people, and you know, people have a lot to say, so we just want to be able to communicate with them and be honest about what's happening. But, thank you guys, and appreciate you keeping us in mind as it makes for it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you, sir.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Mr. Mayor, if I could ask a clarifying question of Johnny. So, you'll have to go back up to the podium now. So, your business is Right Tribe, and what, where does your front door open onto?

JOHN FLANAGAN: Our front door opens onto Center Place, so it is essentially that alley where the parking lot is overhanging above.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Okay. Yeah, so that's, yeah.

JOHN FLANAGAN: And I know that there's yet to see the full report on what it is to be demoed and all that, so we'll see, and hopefully we can continue to be there.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Tell them about the email address they have set up.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: He heard it. He was here.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, next. Okay, seeing no more here, how about online?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request via Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so. Oh, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: To answer Terry Chase's question about the LAX flyover, is Terry still here? 2003, Terry, as the Congress changed the rules on protocol called NextGen, it allows the plane to take off differently. You hear more noise than we've ever heard before, because the frequency and takeoff order has changed. That's why we're hearing more and more. The ones you hear at nighttime, LAX. The ones you're screaming over your head at 6 o'clock in the morning until sun, until 10 o'clock at night, that is Hawthorne Airport. That is not LAX. The low-flying screamer jets, Hawthorne. The loud big jets, LAX. Anyone unsure about that process? Email me,

rmontgomery@manhattanbeach.gov. I'll tell you exactly the difference, who you call, who you email about problems, but planes when they fly over, because it will not go away. During football season, it will get worse. So, just give the heads up there. Yes, and the second thing I was going to say, Your Honor, was Louie still here? No, Louie? Just so you'll know, MBUSD is a separate elected official body. They have their own elected people. They don't report to the city. If you want to contact them about their budget, you need to contact them directly. Okay? That's how it works. So, just so you know, I'm just telling you, just telling you how it works, just so you'll know.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah. Okay, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So, it's not a give and take. I'll talk to you afterwards. And the last thing I was going to tell you was that, all right, the second thing I'm going to say was, the issue you brought up about the tax on sidewalks, every property owner has that, and the city-wide. It's not just east side. I know, because I'm an east side guy. So, I'll just tell you how it works across that. And finally, Your Honor, the last thing I'll bring up, those of you who are wondering what we're talking about, the sales tax, the half-cent sales tax you're hearing about all over the place, that is because we have our own infrastructure needs. How many of you know about lot three, right? That's a \$15 million project to

replace it to today's standards. 15, one-five, not three, \$15 million. Where's that money going to come from? So, I could do half a sales tax, where 61% of the people that actually pay it are not Manhattan Beach residents. So, someone brought the argument up and saying, Richard, we shouldn't tax our own people. We should let it go. Let the county have that money for homelessness. How many here, but just don't tell me your name, by show of hands, believe the homeless problem in LA is being controlled by LA County and managing their money well? Anyone? That's what I thought. Zero. So, why would I give a group that's not functioning well in homelessness half a cent more forever? It never sunsets, folks. It goes on forever. We have our own needs here. We're going to use the half-cent sales tax. If we do not pass it in our own city, it automatically goes to the county. Our own needs or county, you decide. It's that simple. I'll stop there, Your Honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you. Seeing no more, we're going to close public comments and go on to item number H, the consent calendar. Looking for a motion to approve.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Second, Montgomery.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, we have a motion by Mayor Pro Tem Howorth and seconded by Councilmember Montgomery. Can we have a vote?

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, so moving on to item number I.

Items removed from the consent calendar. There are none. Item number J, public hearings. There are none and item K, general business. So, speaking of the ballot measure, we have item number 8 and we are going to hear from City Manager Moe.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Actually, you're going to hear from Assistant to the City Manager George Gabriel who is leading this project and George will give you the overview of the resolutions that are before you for approval this evening for your consideration.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, thank you.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Honorable Mayor Franklin, members of the City Council, George Gabriel, Assistant

to the City Manager. Tonight, before you, as a result out of direction from the July 16, 2024 City Council meeting where the City Council received report on a sales tax feasibility survey and took some actions. Most notably, City Council directed staff to return at this meeting with the required resolutions to place a ballot measure establishing a one-half cent sales tax at the November 5, 2024 general municipal election and to establish a subcommittee of Mayor Pro Tem Howorth and Councilmember Montgomery to help with the development of a community-led public outreach campaign regarding the measure. Consistent with Council direction, staff has drafted those resolutions and they are attached to the City Council agenda packet which proposes a one-half cent sales tax attached specifically to Resolution No. 24-0089 is the ordinance for the voters to consider to establish a transactions and use tax, which is also known as a sales tax. The resolution also specifies the ballot language that is proposed and consistent with the sales tax feasibility survey. Additionally, it should be noted that section 6 of the resolution provides that the Councilmembers to file arguments for or against the measure. Staff is looking for direction if any Councilmembers would like to file an argument in accordance with the attached form. Additionally, City Council may request the L.A. County Registrar Recorder County Clerk to assign a particular letter to the City Initiated Ballot. The attached

form allows the Council to choose a first, second, and third letter designation as well as letter choices and those that the City Council does not want. The Ad Hoc Subcommittee comprised of Mayor Pro Tem Howorth and Councilmember Montgomery discussed some ideas. Three primary options with slogans for Council consideration are the following KFL, Keep Funding Local, PMB, Protect MB, as well as third MMB, Move MB Forward. Staff recommends that the City Council direct the City Clerk to inform the County of his preference for a ballot letter designation. The deadline is August 14th but, obviously, this is the last Council meeting before then so we'll need some direction tonight. Also, the Council could decide which development letter designation they do not want as indicated earlier. Lastly, consistent with Council direction, the Council Subcommittee are assisting with the development of a community-led public outreach campaign regarding measures. Both Councilmembers may report on this at their discretion but should they find supporters of the measure they will need to file an argument of the support of the measure by August 16th in accordance with the County's deadlines so they can be listed as an official potential supporter of the ballot measure. I say that because there are some changes to some of the requirements this year. There was some recent legislation passed by the state legislator called AB-1416, which now under measures once the ballot

language is listed. Supporters and opponents of the measure will be listed as well. And so, that's something that's going to be quite different on this election cycle. And so, if the City Council chooses, they may be listed as a supporter of the measure as well, or other community nonprofits and such. So, with that being said, staff recommends that the City Council consider the following actions, adopting the resolution, which basically places the ballot measure, adopting resolution providing for the filing of rebuttal arguments for the city measure and, thirdly, directing the City Clerk to inform the County of its preference for a ballot measure designation for the City's sales tax measure. With that being said, I'm available for questions. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, colleague. Mayor Pro Tem Howorth.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I don't have, sorry, I don't have questions at this time, thank you. Sorry.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Councilmember Napolitano.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: No questions, Your Honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, I have a question. This is one thing that I kind of know the answer to, but it always amazes me. From what I've learned is we don't, the City does not get their full share of the sales tax revenue for internet or sales that are delivered on trucks to our residents. So, for

example, if you're going on to Amazon, you make a purchase, there's a sales tax. That's not treated the same way, I believe, as going into a store. Going to a store, we would get our full one percent of the total sale as our share of the sales tax but from internet sales, it sort of goes into this nebulous pool and, somehow, I don't even know how we get a check or what that totals. So, first of all, George, am I correct in that?

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: You're correct. You know, to reference a lot of the stories that City Manager Bruce Moe has brought up regularly about shopping locally, I think it's always preferred, in terms of the city's sales tax, to shop at a local dealer. And, I think one of the examples that City Manager Bruce Moe brought up is shopping your local Toyota dealer. But that being said, sales tax, generally, ones that are done through online sales are all allocated in a county pool and the county and the state together divvies up and the city gets a portion of that for those, let's say, Amazon purchases that you're referencing. Rather when you go into a brick and mortar store, one percent of those sales tax dollars are guaranteed to go to the City of Manhattan Beach.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, those delivery vans and the like, they're going on our roads, right, putting wear and tear on our infrastructure. Has there been any discussion about trying to work with our elected officials to change that? I mean,

certainly, it can be tracked where, you know, where the sales are coming from and the residents who are paying the money and as long as we're providing those trucks, you know, nice road to drive on we should be getting our fair share.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: No discussions that I'm aware of.

CITY MANAGER MOE: I'm not aware of any either. However, of course, they pay unless they're electric they're paying gas tax, which comes back to us that goes towards our road infrastructure so it's not a total loss but it's not, there's no discussion going on that.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I mean, that's an issue that gets brought up at Congress a lot too, right? But I'm told Amazon has a lot of money to spend on lobbyists, right, so.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Somebody's paying the sales tax and they're not keeping it, somebody's getting it so. So, how are we doing like on maximizing our revenues from all available sources like parking meters and parking tickets and the like? I thought I saw the, our budget just came out and I saw that there was a drop in our actual revenue and citations. I mean, are we doing the best that we can to maximize our, you know, city revenue?

CITY MANAGER MOE: Parking citations can be a bit of a challenge because, obviously, we have to have staff to issue

those and we've had difficulty filling some community service officer positions, but we do our best to issue citations appropriately when there are violations. It's not viewed as a revenue generator. It's more of a compliance tool for us but, of course, we do get significant revenue from it. So, you know, we monitor on a monthly basis. We get reports from finance that we utilize to identify areas where perhaps we're not giving maximum effort and look for reasons why that may be occurring and what we can do to fix it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, we're no longer outsourcing citations, parking citations?

CITY MANAGER MOE: We are not.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. And then, some residents have expressed concerns about the fact that this money, this additional sales tax would be going into the general fund and we want it to be for infrastructure. What kind of guide rails are we going to put up to ensure that, you know, are we going to make this an enterprise fund type of thing or something to we can say, yes, we collected that money that additional money on the sales tax and here are the infrastructure projects it's going to go towards.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yes, you're correct. It is a general tax and all those funds are fungible and it would go into a general use fund of some sort, whether that's general fund or

capital improvement fund. However, the council always has the ability to designate any of the funds in the general fund for particular purposes and that can change from one council to the next. You probably recall that we have some of our hotel bed tax dedicated to the CIP fund, helps pay the debt service on the police fire facility here. So, that's a tool that's available to you that as you determine how you want to designate those funds you can do that.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Great. Thank you. Colleagues, any more questions? Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I think it is important. Even though this is a recap of other exchanges we've had in council, to just confirm again, we have tremendous upcoming capital improvement needs. In fact, I saw a number today and I was wondering if you can confirm it on the City Manager, Assistant City Manager Gabriel of 200 million in upcoming infrastructure costs.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: How would we otherwise pay for those capital improvements and over what period of time are we talking about to come up with the funds under current facilities to pay for them?

CITY MANAGER MOE: Well, oftentimes, it's from surplus that's generated from the general fund. Typically, there are

some leftover dollars, revenues over expenditures at the end of the year, but it's not the way that we should be funding these important capital projects and that's the purpose of looking for additional revenue that could be then perhaps bonded against so that we could accelerate some of these projects or these projects such as lot three where, you know, two or three or four years ago, we hadn't anticipated the timing on.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Can you reiterate what you just mentioned in passing, which is bonding? I had an exchange with our now former finance director about why, because questions have been asked of me by residents, why can't we just go out for a bond to pay for some of this infrastructure that we're talking about, including as was mentioned earlier our parking lot three where we're just guessing now at how much it may cost? It may cost 50 million, it may cost more, but why don't we go out for just a bond for that as well as other infrastructure?

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yeah. It's very similar to a home mortgage and you need to have income to pay the home mortgage. We can bond but we need to show revenue to pay the debt service on that and currently, we don't have a lot of capacity to go out and bond because we don't have a lot of leftover cash.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you. Any other questions? Okay. So, public comments for this item?

UNIDENTIFIED PUBLIC COMMENTER: Cars the sales tax is based on where the car is registered, which most likely is your house. So, it doesn't matter where you buy, it matters where the registration goes to, which is typically your house. So, therefore, if someone buys a car down in San Diego and they live here, they register it here, they're paying sales tax based on here. I looked it up.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: That sound right? I don't know.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I googled it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: You googled it. Oh, well, then it's right.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Wow, and the government doesn't lie.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: So, for a transaction and use tax which is what this would, sorry, may I answer?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes, that's okay.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: For a transaction and use tax, which is what the proposed ballot measure would address, yes, it is where the tax is assessed on where the car will be registered. However, that being said, the current 1% the city see, receives right now, those sales tax dollars, the point of sale is what the city receives. So, if a car is bought at the Toyota on Sepulveda, for example, the city

gets 1%. But if the city imposes a transaction and use tax, the city will not get the additional half cent. They will be getting, they'll be getting whatever car is registered in the city. So, it's a slight nuance on sales tax, and that's what the difference is between a typical sales tax and a transaction and use tax, which is known as sales tax. Sorry for that complicated explanation.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you. Okay. So, I'm going to open it additional public comments. How about online?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: We have Steve Charelian.

STEVE CHARELIAN: Good evening, Honorable Mayor, members of the City Council. Can you guys hear me okay?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Hold on just a second. Can everybody hear that? Okay. Yeah. Turn up just a little bit here, please. Okay. Great. Okay. Go ahead and proceed. Thank you.

STEVE CHARELIAN: Good evening, Honorable Mayor, members of the City Council. Is that better?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

STEVE CHARELIAN: Thank you. First of all, I just want to thank Council and compliment Council for considering this measure. This goes back to working through the Council Work Plan of 2023, as well as through the finance subcommittee. And it takes a while to get it to this point. So, I'm glad that we're here talking about this tonight. I heard a lot of good things

about, you know, where's money come from? What do we do with this money coming in? So, to me, there's, again, there's a lot of capital needs. There's limited new revenue sources. But I think the most important thing is, as City Manager Moe mentioned, that Council does develop a policy at some point, sooner than later, you know, once the outcome is out there that and if it does pass and, what to do with that, with the next budget cycle. And, with that being said, I'm all for Move Manhattan Beach forward. That's my vote. So, I will, leave it at that, and thank you all for your time.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you.

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no additional request on zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, we're going to close public comments on this item. Oh, did you?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: No, I'm not. I just want to make council comment.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Oh, yeah. Yeah. So, council discussion.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Why, thank you. I mean, Robert's order would allow me to make a motion to support this, and so I shall do so. I believe that what we're going to have to do, I do want to make some comments. I want to make a motion to place a ballot measure on November 5, 2024 General Municipal

Election that would establish one half cent sales tax. And I think we should take, even though I think we should take each of these letters individually. So that's my motion.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Second.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Thank you. And I have some comments. Thank you, sir. And my comments are and I appreciate former Director Charelian talking about how long the finance subcommittee and people in his department have been working on this because this is not just something that comes out of nowhere. This is a lot of people continuing what has been incredible fiscal management in this city. How many cities in the country have a AAA bond rating? Director Moe, do you know?

CITY MANAGER MOE: I don't know what the number is but it's not that large.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: It's really small. We have a AAA bond. What's that?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Google.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Right? Can you Google that? And one of those reasons is thanks to retiring City Manager Moe, who used to be the Finance Director and he's very conservative fiscal management practices. And so, this is not something our Council just does lightly. But I remember I first joined the Council for the first time with David Lesser in 2011. And, Richard is fond of talking about the fun days of the recession,

and how we had cut so many things and we had to, you know, we had to really, you know, it was terrible for everybody. And because of the conservative decisions by the Council and by the Finance Director, our city made it through. Now, when I joined in 2011, we made it through. But we had a Joslyn Center that needed spit and polish to hold it together and make it safe, right? We didn't have any money for facilities improvement. And, you know, this is Manhattan Beach where you know how much the homes go for, right? We could not, we couldn't make infrastructure improvements. Now, we did make some policy decisions that were also smart, like we set up a pension obligation fund that we, you know, or a reserve fund, pension reserve fund, set aside what, a \$1,000,000 or more than that now. You know, that but we took, that was money that could now not be used for infrastructure. And so, this is a smart, smart thing to do. It is the kind of tax that as everyone has said, is going to be borne more by visitors than people who live here. Nothing against visitors, but, you know, it's a smart thing to do. So, we can consider parking lot three. We can consider beautification of downtown. We can consider other acquisitions or infrastructure. And guess what? We build new facilities that, you know, Fire Department, or the Library or any facilities that we build that actually goes on our balance sheet, if you will, that makes us, those are assets, right? So, that only solidifies

our financial position. So, I see this, in all of those terms. And so, that's why, those are some of the reasons I'm voting to move this forward. And, we can talk about the letter designations before or later, but that's my motion. And we have a second.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I'm still a second.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Did you want comments? I think my colleague, Mayor Pro Tem Howorth said it the way I want to say it, but I'll even give you another example that people don't really see half their money where it goes. Underground, you don't see it. Sewer and water lines, you don't see it. Street gets paid in front of you, you may see that. Otherwise, you don't see anything. You wonder where the money goes. How about the pier railing project? Anyone pay attention to our do pier railings? For years, people raised. Now, all of a sudden there, no one says a word about it. It's amazing. But you get a trick question that you're coming down the line that you get asked. How many miles or how many acres of parks does Manhattan Beach have? 122. How many miles do we have? Anybody know? Miles of roads? I won't give that one away. But the main thing is, I would say two things, that Marjil knows this. The one percent sale tax has been around for a while. Shop MB has been the

slogan since I've been living here. One percent of what you buy here, stays here. This tax doesn't apply, folks, to your medicine, prescriptions, or groceries. It's not taxable. Doesn't make a difference there. But I think Steve said it well, is that it's revenue. Five million a year is what we're going to get. We project if it's tax passes. It's five million a year in revenue that we're going to get, right? Take the county out of it. That's five million a year whether a lot three cost fifteen million or, David's right, maybe by then twenty million. Who knows what it'll be? It's going to cost something. And that money needs to come here to our own backyard, not go to the county. So, I can't make it easier. I'm going to need a dedicated revenue stream that Bruce slash Talyn slash Onyx is going to be able look at and say we have five million more a year to pay towards these projects. We can't count on something else getting money for us without raising rates on our own people. This is totally different. We do it inside, keep the money here. Those who talk about local control, this is exactly where you put your money where your mouth is. Local control. You want to control your own money, where it goes, this is how you do it. So, I'll stop there, your honor. My second still remains.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Now, that's for the first item, right?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: For A. Placing the ballot measure on for the half cent sales tax.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah. Okay, Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: My comments. This will be a measure for the voters. But in order to explain why we were putting this out for a vote, we need to repeat some issues that we have been discussing at prior meetings, and it starts with the obvious. No one likes to pay more taxes. We as policymakers don't want to ask our voters to vote on more taxes. There is no good way to create a revenue stream for our city. But as you heard in our exchange earlier, we have enormous capital needs going forward without adequate resident streams to pay for. We have to improve our revenue streams so that we have the infrastructure and the services that residents in our community have come to expect. And there's no good way to do it. There's no perfect way. But this is the best balance that we seek to move forward. And ultimately, it's our voters that will make the decision. But I am in favor of moving forward to give our residents, our voters, the opportunity to make the decision and for us to make our case.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. Councilmember Napolitano.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: This is certainly isn't for Richard. I, we're not going to be the ones that are going to be

able to spend this. It's for the next Council and the councils after that. You know, we stabilized our operational funding through the storm drain fee increase. So, we're not subsidizing that anymore through general fund. And because of that, operationally, we can move forward with, the staffing that we need, providing services to people, to the residents, to the visitors, to our businesses. But beyond that, we can't, it's not money that we can spend for the things that we want to rebuild. And Manhattan Beach is full of aging infrastructure right now, and infrastructure is very expensive. We've got the scout house, senior scout house project that is now, the estimates come back, I think, two or three times what it was expected to be. We can't build that without more money. We can't build a pool without more money. We can't build wider sidewalks without more money. I mean, this might not be any of these one projects might not be anyone's personal preference, but anything that we've been doing, we've been doing projects on a piecemeal basis about one every ten years, drip, drip, drip with the funding that is either budget dust that we save every year in surplus from the budgets that we have. But, you know, we can't pass a bomb because we still need a revenue stream to pay for that. We don't have DISH dollars. And, no, we can't fire everybody to make that happen. I'm sorry. We're not voted in administration or anything like that. Talk to the builders right now who are, talk to Mr.

Joseph there in the audience who knows that, yeah, it takes time to get permits and everything else because we were understaffed for a period. We're still playing catch up with that because we've hired some folks. Talk to the people who want more police on the streets, who wanted more firefighters. If we're voted, you tell us who to fire. Tell me who to fire because there's nobody out there right now that isn't doing a service for somebody, some group, some purpose out there. Our staff right now is overworked. They don't have, we don't have enough folks to meet the expectations of everybody's wants and desires out there. The nature of government is that we have endless wants and limited resources to pay for them. This will create a revenue stream of five and a half million dollars to pay for those things that we haven't been able to, to upgrade Joslyn Center, to upgrade Manhattan Heights, to have better sidewalks, to have better streets. Now, it's a general tax because, frankly, that's how you get it passed. It's a majority vote to get that passed. It's two-thirds do a special tax to be dedicated only to public works projects. So, we're not saying we're going to do that. That's my expectation. That's why I'm pushing this forward and future councils are going to have to hold themselves to that, but it makes sense to do this. And so, I'm going to say, right now, that I hope that they spend it on that because we've got 50, 60, 70-year old buildings that are

just not meeting the needs of our residents. And while we're an affluent city, that doesn't mean that City Hall is affluent. We understand that nobody wants to spend more. Nobody wants to be taxed more. Nobody wants to waste a single penny, and we're doing our best to address that. But the simple fact is if you want to fix things, you got to pay for it, and there's no other way to do that. And if you don't support this, I understand. I get it. You don't want any more taxes whatsoever. There are other things. There are other, you know, both knowing those as well, I hope. But in terms of this, just don't expect anything to get done or to get done quickly in the future. And that's not a threat. It's just a reality because that's where we've been for the last 20, 50 years. We can fix that. We can fix that now. We can fix that with its measure. And so, I hope we move forward on it. Thank you, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great. Thank you. So, my comments are I would like to see hand-in-hand with this, I kind of alluded to it in my questions. It's just to make sure the City is, you know, maximizing all the other forms of revenue as well then that can be an additive effect to this because, you know, as Councilmember Montgomery's lament is that nobody comes to the budget meetings. But when you see that the Capital Improvement Program needs all these things and money is just dribbling into it, there's got to be a steadier source. So not only do I

support this sales tax increase but then also to maximizing things like the parking citations like, well, we just lost 139 spaces and that means a 139 meters, parking meters. But to maximize that, this is a 60-40 split. Anybody again who was here this weekend, you saw a lot of visitors. And I think we all have the phenomena of walking down the streets and really not seeing a familiar face. Well, that's good. You know, people are coming here and enjoying and we welcome that, and we want everybody to have a good time. But, now they're going to you know, with the sales tax increase is they'll be paying for some of that maintenance. They'll be paying for the road that they're driving in on for the, you know, the amenities that they're enjoying, the pier railings, which by the way are just gorgeous, those type of things. So, our visitors will help shoulder that burden. And, I agree with Mr. Joseph as well in terms of, you know, making sure that we're optimizing the permitting process. The mathematics are there. I mean, we're a partner in those homes and buildings that are being built because we get a share of the parcel tax. So, if a developer buys a lot for, let's just say, two million dollars and, so, you know, old Joe Franklin was, you know, paying, you know, \$2500 a year in parcel tax there. Now, the city, now, it's at 20,000 a year that's being paid, and the city is getting a proportionate share of that. That's a two million. But then, the big bonanza comes when you sell that home

for four or five million dollars. Now, the parcel tax is, you know, \$50,000 a year. So, it behooves us from the time value of money is to get that process maximized so that we can go ahead and not only get a happy new homeowner here, but also, you know, get that additional revenue into the city. So, I think if we just sort of all keep an eye on that revenue ball and I'll work towards that goal because that AAA rating is golden. I mean, that is what you want. That gets the attention of lenders and that's, and that keeps our borrowing cost down.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: So, should we call for the question on this one because we have two more resolutions. Can we call for the question on this one?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yeah. But I just want to overall for the whole thing.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Okay. So, you can call for the question.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Can I just finish?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: You can finish. It's just, you know.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right. So, that's the way that I see this process is this partnership with our residents. It's partnership with our businesses, and also with our visitors. So, let's call for the question on, item number or is it number 1 or number or letter A?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: A, I guess.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: And that's resolution number?

MOTNGOMERY: 24-0089.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: 24-0089.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay, can we have a vote?

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?

Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: And then I'll make a motion to adopt Resolution No. 24-0090, which provides for the filing of rebuttal arguments for the city measure.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Second.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: That one shouldn't really require too much.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, we've got a motion by Mayor Pro Tem Howorth and seconded by Councilmember Lesser.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Sure.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. You're leaving someone else to do number three?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Well, I mean, number three requires a little bit of discussion. So, I mean, I could lead it off. I like number three and number one, but I'm agnostic. I mean, let's see. I like to keep funding local but I think Richard would, we were talking that maybe funding isn't something good to put in the title, but I do think that resonates with people. I like MMB, Move MB Forward because it's

like mmm-b or something, I don't know. But I don't have, I'm just getting discussion started.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: I'm for MMB.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: What are you for?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: MMB.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: MMB. The man in the box has spoken.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I was still preferential to PMB, Protect MB. You're talking about these funds are protecting what we have. You're talking about police, talking about firetruck infrastructure. You're protecting what we have so that's why the word Protect MB. You're going to have 50 cities out there, folks, and remember using the word, funding, move, whatever's going to say. But I don't think anybody's going to say the word Protect MB anywhere in their ballot designation. So, I'm thinking about November, I'm thinking about today. Think about who's going to vote and what they're going to look at in November. What are they going to read? We're going to bury presidential, congressional senate races, you name it. The county are all going to come out and pummel us with 50 mailers a day, so think of what you're going to look about, what's going to grab your attention? The word 'protect.' That's why I'm preferencing the word, protect.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: The acronym's a little off-putting though.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yeah, PMB sounds good.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: PMB.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes, Councilmember Lesser.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I'm in favor of the third option, MMB, Move MB Forward or some iteration of that. I agree with how Councilmember Montgomery has articulated the Protect MB. But all of a sudden in my mind, I'm thinking of, are we going to have to put tanks at the outside of the city because we're under some form of attack? Protect MB. Are we talking about getting our pitchforks out? I'm just not sure if how you intend the idea of protect is necessarily going to be interpreted by all those who might read it. And that's why I'm in favor, I think, of the third option or any other iteration that you suggest consistent with that.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: No, it's tough. It's a tough one.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Mr. Mayor?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I'll go for MMB as well.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: So, fails, talk to these four people.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: That's right. So, the weight of the decision. So, I make a motion that we go with MM, what?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I'm just laughing.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I know. I know. Thanks, buddy.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: You're welcome.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I make a motion that we, well, first of all, we have to do two, I believe, right, George, because we ask for things and then the county says no, or somebody else gets it in first. So, I say So I would say first choice is number 3, which is MMB, Move MB Forward. And then number, and then I'll say number 2, PMB, Protect MB. So, it would be our number two choice. That would be my motion.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I'll second that motion.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Can we have a vote? Oh, I'm sorry. So, it's a motion by Mayor Pro Tem Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Montgomery.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Correct.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Call for a vote. Oh, did you want to read?

CITY MANAGER MOE: I'm sorry. The council can select up to three options and on the off chance at MMB and PMB are taken, it would be good if we have a third one.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Then, what do you say, KFL?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Sure. Friendly amendment.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: To get to that point.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Thank you for the clarification.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Kentucky Fried, okay.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: What's that? Did he just curse? What? Oh, Kentucky Fried Local. That's strange. That's really strange. Okay.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Kentucky Football League.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Okay.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: You bet.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yes.

Motion passes, 5-0.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Nothing else. So, moving on to item number 9, consider request by Mayor Franklin and Councilmember Montgomery for a waiver.

ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER GABRIEL: I'm sorry. Council, I'm sorry, one of the additional thing that was mentioned in the staff report was whether Council would like to,

we want a direction whether Council wanted to file an argument in support of the measure, whether Council would like to individually or collectively. And that would just be direction and the City Attorney and the City Clerk would finalize that form.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I like that, you know, I would probably want some strategic advice. I mean, I would think it would be powerful to see, you know, one message from the council, but maybe it's more powerful to have five individual messages. I don't know the answer. So.

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Collectively.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Collectively. Yeah, I think it's collectively.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I was going to say we voted 5-0. So.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I think it's collective. There's your answer. Do we have to make a motion?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Direction's good. Direction is fine.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Excellent. Alright.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. There we go.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Good stuff.

Move on to item number 9. Consider request by Mayor Franklin and Councilmember Montgomery for a waiver of third-party public safety costs for the 2024 Manhattan Beach 10K.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Yes, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Is it Director Layman or?

CITY MANAGER MOE: Actually, Melissa McCollum from the Parts and Rec Department would make a brief presentation.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. I think they got to turn on or something.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Still working the kinks out in our temporary quarters.

SENIOR RECREATION MANAGER MCCOLLUM: Testing? There we go. So, good evening, Mayor and City Council. As mentioned, the item before you results from a request from Mayor Franklin and Councilmember Montgomery at the City Council meeting on July 16th to discuss third party expenses for the Manhattan Beach 10K. Before council's discussion and direction, we do want to provide a bit of background about the City's special events policy as well as fee waiver request associated with legacy special events for fiscal years 2021 to 2025. As noted in the staff report, the Special Events Policy approved by the City Council in July of 2018 states that fee waivers for special event costs do not apply to any third-party cost incurred to support an event and that all third-party costs incurred by the city to support an event will be billed to an event organizer. In addition, at the City Council meeting on June 9, 2020, City Council approved fee waiver request for legacy special events

including the Manhattan Beach 10K for 5 years. So, again, covering from fiscal year 2021 to fiscal year 2025. The proof fee waiver for the Manhattan Beach 10K was 100% of City cost with third party cost being the responsibility of the event organizer. The Manhattan Beach 10K was charged \$2,558 for third party cost in 2022 and \$5,159 for last year. Projected third party cost for 2024 are not expected to exceed \$6,000. The Manhattan Beach Police Department determines the amount of crowd management services that are needed for all special events in this city. Third party costs for CSC may be reduced based on the number of volunteers that are provided by the event organizer to help staff an event. Staff plans to bring consideration a fee waiver request for legacy special events for the next five years. So, for fiscal year 2026 to fiscal year 2030 to City Council at the beginning of 2025. We do definitely want to take a moment to recognize the MB10K, the iconic race that began in 1978, has a high percentage of participation by local residents, is ranked as one of the top 100 road races in the country, and runs without a title corporate sponsor or a paid race director. In addition, the MB10K has made many generous community donations over the years including financial support to help improve recreation facilities in town. Most recently, they paid for the new exercise equipment on the strand and committed \$30,000 to help fund the upgraded NFC fitness court that's

currently being Polliwog Park. Senior Management Analyst Linda Robb, who heads the City's special events committee, and I are available if you have any questions for us. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Thank you. Public comments? Oh, I'm sorry. Questions?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I had one, and maybe it's to the chief, but maybe we'll start with you, Melissa. Am I right to read that the costs have increased 43% in 2 years?

SENIOR RECREATION MANAGER MCCOLLUM: So, the costs have increased and that is a mixture of public safety costs but also public works and a little bit from community development and parks and rec. The biggest difference in that cost is some of the cost for public safety have been outsourced to the CSC.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I wanted to confirm something you mentioned in your staff report, and that is that if the 10k race committee is able to come up with volunteers to fulfill some of that role, would that reduce some of this cost that might be attributed to them?

SENIOR RECREATION MANAGER MCCOLLUM: It would. And I did confirm, today that that certainly, Linda, who is the head of the special committee, and the Police Department and the event organizer would have that conversation and, and would come up with a staffing level that the Police Department is

comfortable with but that could be enhanced with the use of volunteers.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Okay. That's it for now. And that's for the chief. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Steve? No?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: No questions. Thank you.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. You covered that well. It's all the items that I had on there as well. So, it is true that they don't have a paid race director, right? Everybody's strictly volunteer?

SENIOR RECREATION MANAGER MCCOLLUM: That's my understanding yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. And they've, donated how much to the city?

SENIOR RECREATION MANAGER MCCOLLUM: So, in a letter that we received as public comment, it was, you know, 700 over \$700,000 to the community. Most recently for Parks and Rec facilities. There's a 30,000 committed for NFC. I believe 18 to 20,000 perhaps for the strand equipment, and then other projects over the many decades.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: All right. Great. No further questions. Public comments? Seeing none here. How about online?

ASSISTANT CITY CLERK ALVAREZ: There's no request on Zoom.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, we're going to close public comments.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: As you can see, folks, for years, this race has been giving back to the community. No one doubts the dollar amount, what they've given back to us in the past. The strand park course was the last year, year before, and then 30,000 committed for the next one they're doing. So, it's not a matter of them not having the money to do it. They look in the city. They're getting all of this to us to waive \$6,000 where it's going to be going forward. So, it's not a matter of dollar for dollar. It's the right thing it's the right thing to do going forward. That's our motion that we take this up and conclude it to our waiver for them going forward.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Do you accept? Were you going to second it, Mr. Mayor? If not, I will.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: I was going to ask some questions. So, if you want a second, we can have a group.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Sure. I'll second for any discussion.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I can't second my own.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I was waiting for you to do it.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Well, I was waiting for questions.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: No. Because you can second and then have questions. I wish you would. I want you to.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Thank you. I'll second that.

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: The comments I'd make are this. First of all, full disclosure, my wife and I over the last 20, 25 years on and off have volunteered for the 10K race either the beginning or the end, and we're going to do it again this year. So, I guess I have an interest in this, although it's for giving up of our time. I'm very much a supporter of the 10K race and its committee and how much it's given back to our community over all these years. The numbers and projects are really substantial. What I worry about is what this means for the other legacy, non-profit events. What do we say to our 10Kk race when they come to us and ask also for a waiver of their fees that we pay as a city out of costs for the public safety, elements of these events. I look forward to that discussion in connection with the upcoming legacy event policy. I think the amount involved is relatively small here. I think the willingness of the race committee's, representative to work with the Police Department to see where they can provide volunteers to offset the costs of the Police Department, I think, are in its favor. And that's why I'm in favor of allowing this waiver. But I do think we need to be mindful of how this impacts all the other events. We have multiple events that do wonderful things for our

communities, also our non-profit, and give them time, and they also will give back to our community. So, we need to just think about the precedent of this.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Your honor, let me restate the motion before you second. I want to make sure everybody's clear what I'm talking about here. The motion is to waive third party public safety costs for the 2024 Man Beach 10k. They reset in 25. They go all over again. That's the only two legacy events for folks. 10K. Hometown Fair. They've been there since 1987. That's a minimum year. 87 or more, they continue every year past that point. That makes them a legacy event. So, we should be glad that we have two that'd been going on this long. This is one of the two. That's my motion.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Great.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Is that still your second?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And then I'll second if you can.

Thank you. Appreciate it.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yeah. Me too.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: So, we're ready for the vote?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Did Councilmember Napolitano?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Sorry?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Did Councilmember Napolitano?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Oh. I thought I asked him. Did I ask you Steve?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Let's vote. Let's vote.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Let's vote.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Napolitano?

COUNCILMEMBER NAPOLITANO: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Lesser?

COUNCILMEMBER LESSER: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Franklin?

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Mayor Pro Tem Howorth?

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Councilmember Montgomery?

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

CITY CLERK TAMURA: Motion passes, 5-0.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Good.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Thank you for bringing that forward.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Of course. Pleasure. I don't want them to throw things at me when I'm running.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: That doesn't guarantee.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Exactly. Pro quo. Okay. Item number L, City Council request and reports, including AB-1234.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Not from me, your honor.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Anything? Okay. Item number 11, request by Councilmember Montgomery and Councilmember Napolitano to consider waste management requests for an extraordinary rate increase and modifications.

CITY MANAGER MOE: So, we are looking for a third vote to bring this forward.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Can I ask what it would be, so bringing forward, we're going to investigate why or do a little back and forth figuring out why? Okay.

CITY MANAGER MOE: We'll bring that request forward to you.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yeah. I'll do it.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: There's your third vote.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: There's a third vote.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: I mean, it's just to bring it forward.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Yes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, item M, future agenda items? Seeing none, we can go to the City Manager report.

CITY MANAGER MOE: Now, the end is near. So, I face the final curtain.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Not that final.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Wow.

CITY MANAGER MOE: In deference to that song in Old Blue Eyes, I just want to say, hopefully, I did it our way, not my way. I felt as though I was working certainly for the council, wanted to do it your way, and adopt that and make it our way, the Manhattan Beach way. So, with that, I you know this, you know, I've been here. I've attended probably a thousand council meetings. I am so appreciative and so grateful for the opportunities the community has given me, that all of you have given me, these past years. And, I know you're in good hands. The department head team will do great work, continue to do great work. Talyn will do a fantastic job as acting, but I just want to say thank you. I really appreciated it. I can't think of a better way to go out. I appreciate you. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: I'll stand for that.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Yeah. Me too. You're one of a kind, Bruce. Didn't know you could sing. That was awesome. Actually, I heard it. I thought I did catch it.

COUNCILMEMBER MONTGOMERY: Blue eyes and blue shirt. That's why I didn't change clothes.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: I was going to say don't give up your day job, but you are.

MAYOR PRO TEM HOWORTH: Too late.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Well done. And a song from City Attorney.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: How can I follow that? Although, he did sound better than the person at the Polliwog Park.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Ouch.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: So, Bruce is going to be sorely missed, both as a great City Manager and as a friend. And that's my only report today.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. Great. Thank you. And, that's it. And so, we are going to adjourn, help me here please.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: No. Actually, we're going to go back in the closed session.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Go back in the closed or special?

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: Yeah. Closed. Yeah. It was closed.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, we're going to adjourn to back to closed session. Okay. Thank you.

[RECESS INTO CLOSED SESSION]

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, we're going to adjourn our special meeting.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: We're going to reconvene the special meeting.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Reconvene the special meeting.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: And I'll make an announcement.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: And you'll make an announcement.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: So, the City Council went into closed session to discuss five separate items. With respect to items A, B, and D, the City Council gave direction. With respect to item C, by a three to two vote with Councilmembers Montgomery and Napolitano voting no, the City Council gave direction to special council, and with respect to item E, that's the City Manager item, the City Council gave direction to the City Attorney and also to our City Manager recruitment firm, Bob Murray and Associates. At this time, it'd be appropriate to adjourn the special meeting.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Okay. So, we're going to adjourn the special meeting.

CITY ATTORNEY BARROW: And then reconvene in the regular meeting.

MAYOR FRANKLIN: Reconvene in our regular meeting. And now we're going to adjourn to 4:30 on August 20th. Thank you.