

**CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
PARKING AND PUBLIC IMPROVEMENTS COMMISSION
MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING
NOVEMBER 19, 2009**

A. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Parking and Public Improvements Commission of the City of Manhattan Beach, California, was held on the 19th day of November 2009, at the hour of 6:30 p.m., in the City Council Chambers of City Hall, 1400 Highland Avenue, in said City.

B. ROLL CALL

Present: Adami, Vigon, Stabile, Silverman and Chairman Gross.
Absent: None.
Staff Present: Traffic Engineer Zandvliet, Assistant Planner Danna,
Management Analyst Madrid, Lt. Harrod and Sgt. Mason,
Clerk: Weeks.

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

11/19/09 October 22, 2009

Commissioner Vigon revised the Parking and Public Improvements minutes of October 22, 2009 as follows:

Page 6, Paragraph 1 "...with the Parks and Recreation Commission. Therefore, he did not see a basis for approving the staff recommendation. He said that the dune does not need to be closed and could be turned into an ecological reserve with the money that would have been spent on parking measures. Commissioner Vigon reiterated that he could not approve the staff recommendation.

Chairman Gross modified the minutes of October 22, 2009 as follows:

Page 2, Paragraph 3 "...but, any recommendations will be tabled until the joint meeting with the Parks and Recreation Commission."

Page 2, Paragraph 4 "...advising that closing the dune would not be affected by Proposition A funding..."

Page 3, Paragraph 1 "...a permit zone..."

MOTION: Commissioner Adami moved to approve the Parking and Public Improvements Commission minutes of October 22, 2009 as amended. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Stabile and passed by unanimous voice vote.

D. **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

None.

E. **GENERAL BUSINESS**

11/19/09-2 2008 Downtown Parking Management Plan Review of Initial Approved Measures

Planning Assistant Danna introduced this item.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet presented the staff report. Outlining the approved strategies/implementation measures/recommendations, he clarified that the 2008 Downtown Parking Management Plan did not address parking during peak summer months or special events in the Downtown area.

Commissioner Vigon noted that he was not serving on the Parking and Public Improvements Commission when the Downtown Parking Management Plan was considered in 2008. He pointed out that expanding Lot 7 to the south would add parking spaces that could be used by merchants and voiced his hope that everything possible will be done to nurture Downtown businesses.

Commissioner Stabile stated his impression that the cost of permits and requiring merchants to purchase them at a much reduced rate to encourage employees to park in lots is within the Commission's purview and he recalled discussion at a previous meeting with regard to making it mandatory for employers to purchase parking permits for their full-time employees to be used in the Metlox Lot and the upper level in Lot 3.

Chairman Gross related his understanding that the cost of parking permits is outside of the Commission's purview.

At the Commission's request, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that the Commission has indicated that a residential override program will be denied; that the current striping configurations in Downtown parking lots were examined in hopes of obtaining additional parking spaces, but it is not possible; that dismissing parking citations for patrons of the Downtown area would be considered preferential treatment, which would not be allowed by the Coastal Commission, but some type of discount for shopping could be considered; and that allowing only Downtown patrons to use Lot M could be explored.. He provided information on: the idea of allowing overflow merchant permit parking on busy days on the 3rd floor of Lot 3; the success of increased Police Department enforcement and the bulk rate/monthly permit parking programs; the minimal change in on-street parking subsequent to the implementation of the measures; the idea of a trolley system in the Downtown area; the proposed directional signs; the

City's plans to test advanced technology parking meters that accept debit cards and have wireless communications for parking enforcement; and the idea of raising parking meter rates in the future.

Lt. Harrod offered updated information on enforcement efforts in the Downtown area.

Audience Participation

Bob Blanchard, 600 Block of 9th Street, discussed the lack of good solutions for parking problems during special events. He recommended against portions of streets opting out of permit parking programs and related his surprise that he was not given the opportunity to vote on a permit parking program for his street. Mr. Blanchard commended staff's study with regard to a residential override program and he questioned how far out parking will have to be restricted before employees do not park in residential areas.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained procedures for opting out of residential permit parking programs.

Bill Berks, 500 Block of 14th Street, suggested that hang tags not contain license plate numbers so they can be used by guests. He shared information about technology that advises drivers of the number of empty parking spaces on each floor of a parking structure.

George Sterling, 14th Street, noted the difficulties resulting from Downtown employees using parking spaces in front of his home and he agreed with the idea of moving the restricted zone up to the end of 14th Street.

Bridget Batkin, 1000 Block of Highview, voiced her concern over problems resulting from Downtown employees parking next to her home, such as her trash not getting picked up.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that the above speaker's property would be within the new permit parking zone.

Luis Serano, 700 Block of 11th Street, emphasized the importance of extending the two-hour parking zone east of its current location and, at the least, to Pacific Avenue, and he advised that a majority of residents living between Pacific Avenue and Highview signed a petition to do so.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet verified that the 700 block of 11th Street is outside of the two-hour parking zone.

Clarence Brauer, 600 Block of 14th Street, commented on the employee overflow parking near his home. He agreed with extending the two-hour parking zone to the 600 Block of 14th Street.

Muriel Berks, 500 Block of 14th Street, asked if employee passes are good for parking all day long and what type of pressure is being put on employers to deter employees from parking in residential areas.

Assistant Planner Dana affirmed that employees with parking passes are able to park the entire day.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that many employers consider the purchase of employee parking passes as part of their cost of doing business and some require employees to purchase the permits.

A Speaker Whose Name Was Inaudible, 200 Block of Manhattan Beach Boulevard, asked how to determine how many employees will park in Lot 1 and Lot 2 and how the merchants allowed to park there will be chosen. He voiced concern that merchant parking in Lot 2 was taken away.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet offered information on staff's recommendations for merchant parking spaces in Lots 1, 2 and 3. He clarified that employees with permits who cannot find parking spaces in Lots 1 and 2 could park in Lot 3.

Todd Dipaola, 100 Block of 14th Place, expressed his appreciation of the Commission's efforts. He supported the proposed signage; technologically advanced parking meters; and adding parking meters with residential override.

Mary Ann Varni, Downtown Business and Professional Association (DBPA), No Address Provided, explained her understanding that the purpose of the parking permits was to open up parking for businesses, but this has not happened, particularly in Lot 1. She voiced concern that merchant permit spaces in Lot 2 were eliminated and that Lot 2 cannot be used even when it is under utilized. She related the DBPA's support of the staff recommendation for Lot 1; returning to 22 merchant spaces in Lot 2; and having a cut off time of 5:00 p.m. for permit overrides.

Chairman Gross clarified that, after 5:00 p.m., anyone could use an empty parking space on a first-come, first-serve basis. However, those with permits would not have to feed the meters.

Jim Wagner, DBPA, No Address Provided, pointed out that parking in the Downtown area continues to be difficult, even with the empty businesses. Mr. Wagner stated his agreement with staff's recommendation for Lot 1 and he offered input on the difficulty of parking there. Mr. Wagner related his opinion that merchants who provide revenue to the City should be given priority in parking.

RECESS AND RECONVENE

At 9:03 p.m., there was a recess until 9:10 p.m., when the meeting reconvened with all Commissioners present.

Commission Discussion

The Commission considered the approved strategies/implementation measures/recommendations as follows:

Recommendation No. 17: Provide 20 merchant only permit spaces in Lot 1 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., and 11 merchant only spaces in Lot 2 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m.

MOTION: Commissioner Silverman moved to recommend approval of the staff recommendation for Lot 1 to provide 20 merchant permit only spaces in Lot 1 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Stabile and ultimately passed by unanimous voice vote.

Prior to voting on the motion, Commissioner Vigon asked if Commissioner Silverman would have a conflict of interest since he is a merchant in the Downtown area.

Commissioner Silverman advised that Lot 1 does not affect him and that he parks in the Metlox Lot. He extended empathy to merchants for the difficult parking situation in the Downtown area.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet confirmed that Commissioner Silverman would not have a conflict of interest.

The motion to approve the staff recommendation for Lot 1 was passed by unanimous voice vote.

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend approval of the staff recommendation for Lot 2 to provide 11 merchant permit only spaces in Lot 2 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Commissioner Adami seconded the motion.

Before voting on the motion, Commissioner Silverman stated his disagreement with the recommendation for Lot 2 due to his feeling that merchants should have an opportunity to override the meters with a permit. He emphasized the importance of supporting Downtown merchants.

Chairman Gross explained his feeling that merchant permits should override meters and, therefore, he, too, could not support the motion. He indicated that he could approve an increase in the number of merchant permit only spaces.

Commissioner Stabile voiced his agreement with increasing the number of merchant permit only spaces in Lot 2. He noted that there did not appear to be much support from residents for changing Lot 2.

Commissioner Silverman indicated that he could approve the staff recommendation for 11 merchant permit only spaces in Lot 2 as long as merchants could override the meters.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that merchants having the capability to override the meters would provide more flexibility for the merchants and that the Downtown Business and Professional Association has received complaints about the parking situation in Lot 2.

Commissioner Adami withdrew his second to the motion to approve the staff recommendation for Lot 2. The following motion was offered:

MOTION: Commissioner Silverman moved to recommend amending the staff recommendation for 11 merchant permit only spaces in Lot 2 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. to include an override for merchant parking permits in only the parking structure. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gross and passed by a 4-1 majority roll call vote, with Commissioner Stabile dissenting.

Ayes: Adami, Vigon, Silverman and Chairman Gross.
Noes: Stabile.
Abstain: None.
Absent: None.

Recommendation No. 1: At such time as the City Council finds appropriate based on the economic climate and comparable meter rates, the on-street parking meter rate should be increased to \$1.50 per hour.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet related staff's opinion that raising the on-street parking meter rates to \$1.50 per hour would be an effective tool in changing behavior to encourage use of the parking lots in the Downtown area, thereby resulting in the availability of increased on-street parking.

Commissioner Stabile voiced his opinion that the staff recommendation to wait to raise parking meter rates until the economic climate improves does not make sense; that identical on-street and lot parking rates would not accomplish the goal of reducing on-street parking; that on-street rates should be raised; and that advanced parking meter technology with the ability to alert parking enforcement of violations should be utilized to help open up on-street parking spaces. He offered the following motion:

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend that on-street parking meter rates be increased to \$1.50 per hour and to instruct staff to explore advanced parking meter technology that would permit flexibility in payment and efficiency in enforcement. The motion died for lack of a second.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that the City is already examining advanced parking meter technology, which will be installed in the Pier Lots and could be extended to other parking spaces in the Downtown area, and that the parking meter rate increase could be implemented as the meters are changed out.

Commissioner Vigon agreed that increasing on-street parking meter rates to \$1.50 would encourage the use of parking lots; however, this should be deferred until such time as the economy improves, at which time advanced technology will be in place.

Chairman Gross suggested the alternative of raising on-street parking rates to \$1.50 per hour as soon as possible to achieve a higher turn over and more customer availability of parking spaces, taking into account both the economy and forthcoming advanced technology in parking meters.

Commissioner Stabile pointed out that there is no empirical information suggesting that people will not patronize the Downtown area if the parking meter rates are increased and that, if the Commission's objective is to modify behavior and increase turn over of parking spaces in the Downtown area, it should stand by its convictions and increase the on-street parking meter rates.

Commissioner Adami favored deleting this recommendation until such time as the economy improves.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that the lack of a motion to recommend increasing on-street parking meter rates would indicate to the City Council that this is no longer one of the objectives; that the Council makes its own determinations; and that the main question is whether the Commission feels increasing the rates will change behavior.

Commissioners Vigon and Silverman related their support for the staff recommendation as written. The following motion was offered:

MOTION: Commissioner Vigon moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 1 as written that, at such time as the City Council finds appropriate based on the economic climate and comparable meter rates, the on-street parking meter rate should be increased to \$1.50 per hour. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Silverman and passed by a 4-1 majority roll call vote, with Commissioner Adami dissenting:

Ayes:	Vigon, Stabile, Silverman and Chairman Gross.
Noes:	Adami.
Abstain:	None.
Absent:	None.

Recommendation No. 2: Continue parking rate differential when on-street meter rates are increased.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that, until the parking meter rate is increased to above \$1.50, the lot rate will remain at \$0.75 and, if there is a differential, it will go up accordingly.

Commissioner Vigon noted that, if the on-street parking rate goes up and the differential decreases, there will not be a deterrent to parking on the street.

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend that the parking lot meter rate shall be one-half of the on-street parking rate, but no less than \$0.75. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Vigon and passed by a 4-1 majority roll call vote, with Commissioner Adami dissenting:

Ayes: Vigon, Stabile, Silverman and Chairman Gross.
Noes: Adami.
Abstain: None.
Absent: None.

Recommendation No. 3: Encourage the DBPA to distribute a notification to all business owners of the potential to change the on-street parking time limits adjacent to their businesses.

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 3 to encourage the DBPA to distribute a notification to all business owners of the potential to change the on-street parking time limits adjacent to their businesses. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Adami and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 4: No change (Increase in parking time limits in the upper level of the Metlox Lot from two hours to three hours).

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 4 for no change to increasing parking time limits in the upper level of the Metlox Lot from two hours to three hours. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Adami and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 5: No change (Increase in parking time limits in the lower level of the Metlox Lot and upper level of Lot 3 from eight to ten hours).

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 5 for no change to increasing the parking time limits in the lower level of the Metlox Lot and upper level of Lot 3 from eight hours to ten hours. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Adami and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 6: (A) Encourage the DBPA to expand the consignment program for cash key sales; and (B) Conduct a multi-payment parking meter pilot program and consider permanent installations. Pursue smartcard system for all metered spaces with the ability for remote recharging and special rate discounting.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that this recommendation essentially asks the DBPA to take more responsibility in moving forward and pursuing a smartcard system.

Commissioner Stabile related his preference that the pilot program for a smartcard system be expanded to include on-street parking meters.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that the pilot program would include the Pier Lots and that, due to the lack of upfront funding for a permanent installation at this time (which was not necessary for the Pier Lots), the City has not a pilot program for on-street parking.

Chairman Gross commented that the results of the pilot program could be presented to the Commission as soon as they are available in order for the Commission to consider expanding it to on-street parking.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that a multi-payment parking meter pilot program could be conducted.

The Commission agreed to amend Recommendation No. 6 to include directing staff to review the findings of the pilot program with the Commission.

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 6 to encourage the DBPA to expand the consignment program for cash key sales; to conduct a multi-payment parking meter pilot program and consider permanent installations, and to pursue a smartcard system for all metered spaces with the ability for remote recharging and special rate discounting, adding a recommendation that staff be directed to review the findings of the pilot program with the Commission. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Vigon and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 7: Install parking meters on the south side of 15th Street west of Highland Avenue (two spaces), 12th Street west of Manhattan Avenue (four spaces) and the north side of 10th Place east of Morningside Drive (three spaces).

Chairman Gross indicated that he could support the staff recommendation, particularly since there were apparently no objections to installing meters on 12th Street west of Manhattan Avenue.

The Commission discussed whether parking meters should be installed in the Civic Center Lot.

Commissioner Stabile related his opinion that this should be re-visited when new parking meter technology becomes available.

MOTION: Commissioner Adami moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 7 to install parking meters on the south side of 15th Street west of Highland Avenue (two spaces), 12th Street west of Manhattan Avenue (four spaces) and the north side of 10th Place east of Morningside Drive (three spaces). The motion was seconded by Commissioner Stabile and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 9: No change (Encourage the DBPA to promote the Monthly Merchant Permit Program through distribution and publication of City flyers.

MOTION: Commissioner Silverman moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 9 for no change to encouraging the DBPA to promote the Monthly Merchant Permit Program through distribution and publication of City flyers, with the inclusion of wording that merchant overflow permit parking shall be allowed on the third floor of Lot 3. The motion was seconded by Chairman Gross and passed by a 4-1 majority roll call vote, with Commissioner Stabile abstaining.

Ayes: Adami, Vigon, Silverman and Chairman Gross.
Noes: None.
Abstain: Stabile.
Absent: None.

The Commission agreed to staff investigating the feasibility of a mandatory merchant permit program and the following motion was offered:

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend directing staff to investigate the feasibility of a mandatory merchant permit program. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Silverman and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 10: No change (Encourage DBPA to promote and distribute program information about volume discounts for five biannual parking permits purchased at one time, at a cost of \$500.00 for five permits).

Chairman Gross voiced his preference to add that overflow merchant permit parking shall be allowed on the third floor of Lot 3.

MOTION: Commissioner Adami moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 10 for no change to encouraging the DBPA to promote and distribute program information about volume discounts for five biannual parking permits purchased at one time, at a cost of \$500.00 for five permits. The motion was seconded by Chairman Gross and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 11: Expand Downtown Residential Parking Override Program to include a buffer permit zone where participation in the Program would be subject to verification of employee parking impact.

Chairman Gross and Commissioner Stabile favored expanding the buffer zone eastward.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet provided information on the proposed boundaries for the buffer zone.

MOTION: Chairman Gross moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 11, adding that the buffer zone shall be expanded to Pacific Avenue south of Manhattan Beach Boulevard. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Adami and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 13: No change (Public Works Department to install four disabled parking spaces on a trial basis at Highland Avenue and 13th Street; Highland Avenue between 12th and 13th Streets; Manhattan Avenue near 11th Place; and Manhattan Avenue on 11th Street).

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 13 for no change to the Public Works Department installing four disabled parking spaces on a trial basis at Highland Avenue and 13th Street; Highland Avenue between 12th and 13th Streets; Manhattan Avenue near 11th Place; and Manhattan Avenue on 11th Street. The motion was seconded by Chairman Gross and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 14: No change (Public Works Department to install “smart” and small vehicle parking spaces at locations approved by the Commission as recommended by staff.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet confirmed that the parking spaces in front of Commissioner Silverman’s office can be re-striped to be better defined.

MOTION: Commissioner Silverman moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 14 for no change to the Public Works Department installing “smart” and small vehicle parking spaces at locations approved by the Commission as recommended by staff. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Vigon and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 15: Recommend that the City Council approve the purchase and installation of both non-illuminated and illuminated directional signs.

At the request of Chairman Gross, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet provided information on the prioritized locations for illuminated signs, should funding become available: Manhattan Beach Boulevard at Morningside; Metlox; and Lot 3.

MOTION: Commissioner Stabile moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 15 for the City Council to approve the purchase and installation of both non-illuminated and illuminated directional signs. The motion was seconded by Chairman Gross and passed by unanimous voice vote.

Recommendation No. 18: Continue enhanced enforcement of parking violations.

MOTION: Commissioner Adami moved to recommend approval of Recommendation No. 18 to continue enhanced enforcement of parking violations. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Silverman and passed by unanimous voice vote.

F. **COMMISSION ITEMS**

11/19/09-3 Parking Meter Revenues and Traffic Violation Revenue Report

.Chairman Gross and Commissioner Stabile commented on the decreased number of violations and parking fines.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that this depends on where enforcement resources were utilized and how busy the Police Department becomes with other matters.

11/19/09-4 Chairman Gross Re Holiday Fireworks

Chairman Gross extended invitations to his annual party to view the Holiday fireworks at 5:00 p.m. on December 13, 2009.

G. **STAFF ITEMS**

11/19/09-5 Staff Re Joint Meeting with the Parks and Recreation Commission

Assistant Planner Danna and Traffic Engineer Zandvliet provided information about the procedures for considering parking problems around Sand Dune Park at the joint meeting with the Parks and Recreation Commission tentatively scheduled on January 7, 2010.

11/19/09-6 Staff Re Crosswalk at Manhattan Beach Boulevard between Sepulveda Boulevard and Meadows

In response to a request from Commissioner Adami at the last meeting, Management Analyst Madrid advised that the only location for a crosswalk at Manhattan Beach Boulevard between Sepulveda Boulevard and Meadows Avenue would be on the west leg; that the improvement would require minor traffic signal modifications etc., at a cost of approximately \$25,000; and that this will be added to the capital improvements project list for future funding.

11/19/09-7 Commissioner Silverman Re Flourney and Rosecrans

Commissioner Silverman asked about the status of his previous request for staff to examine the poor sight line at the intersection of Flourney and Rosecrans.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that this is on-going.

H. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 10:40 p.m.